

He is Omniscient
A Course on the Knowledge and Science of Islam
- 2 -

Knowing the Imams

Volume 11

The Knowledge of Imam Ali and His Judgments

Allamah Sayyid Muhammad
Husayn Husayni Tihrani

Translated by
Rahim P. Dawlati and Salim Rossier

Editor
Sayyed Khalil Toussi

Series Editor
Seyyed Hossein Nasr

Great Books of the Islamic World

The Eleventh Volume of Knowing the Imams contains:

1. Knowledge of God is the first and the most important condition for leadership and governing the people.
2. From an Islamic point of view, the most important condition of leadership is knowledge.
3. Assigning the most learned person as leader is an absolute duty to the Messenger of God.
4. On the basis of the great narrations from the Prophet, all Muslims, including the famous theologians have considered Imam Ali to be the most learned one among the nation.
5. Both the Shia and Sunni authentic narrations introduce Imam Ali as the Gate of divine Knowledge.
6. The narration invites all the nations to refer to Ali's vast knowledge in many subjects.
7. The existence of the Immaculate Imams and adhering to them; and seeking permission to enter the Messenger's house.
8. Numerous examples of Imam Ali's solving the most difficult problems and his extraordinary judgments.
9. Omar's admitting to the vast knowledge of Imam Ali and his right to the caliphate.
10. The strangest cases and judgments of Imam Ali.

Allamah Sayyid Muhammad Husayn Husayni Tihirani (1926-1995) was a respected intellectual, jurist, mystic and philosopher who trained and guided many students during his lifetime. He was an eloquent speaker and prolific writer, and left numerous books and treatises for later generations.

Published by
Great Books of the Islamic World
for the Institute for the Translation and
Publication of Works on Islamic Knowledge
Distributed by
Kazi Publications, Inc.
3023 W. Belmont Avenue
Chicago IL 60618

ISBN-13: 978-1-56744-624-1

ISBN-10: 1-56744-624-8

90000



9 781567 446241

A Course on the Knowledge and Science of Islam

- 2 -

He Is Omniscient

Knowing the Imams

Volume 11

The Knowledge of Imam Ali and His Judgments

‘Allāmah Sayyid Muhammad Ḥusayn Ḥusaynī Ṭihirānī

Translated by Rahim P. Dawlati and Salim Rossier

Editor: Seyyed Khalil Toussi

Series editor: Seyyed Hossein Nasr

Great Books of the Islamic World

© 2018 Great Books of the Islamic World

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the written permission of the publishers.

Printed in the United States of America.

Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Allamah Hajj Sayyid Muhammad Husayn Husayni Tihrani

Knowing the Imams, Volume 11

• 1. Islam. 2. Shiism. I. Title II. Author

Volume 11

ISBN 10: 1-56744- 624-8

ISBN 13: 978-1- 56744-624- 1

Note: While it is common in Persian or Arabic to place blessings on the Prophet or the Imams (you may find an "as," "s" or "pbh" or something similar after the names of the Imams), it is not common practice in an English text. Readers should just say the phrase of blessings in their heart when they see reference to the Prophet or Imams.

Published by
Great Books of the Islamic World
Distributed by
KAZI Publications, Inc.
3023 W. Belmont Avenue
Chicago IL 60618
Tel: 773-267-7001; FAX: 773-267-7002
email: info@kazi.org www.kazi.org

*Teachings based on the wisdom of the Glorious
Qur'an and reasoning based thereon,
and hadiths both common and particular,
in addition to definitive and critical discussions
concerning governorship.*

The most important topics and selected titles.

The Eleventh Volume of *Knowing the Imams*

1. Knowledge of God is the first and the most important condition for leadership and governing the people.
2. From an Islamic point of view, the most important condition of leadership is knowledge.
3. Assigning the most learned person as leader is an absolute duty to the Messenger of God.
4. On the basis of the great narrations from the Prophet, all Muslims, including the famous theologians have considered Imam Ali to be the most learned one among the nation.
5. Both the Shi'a and Sunni authentic narrations introduce Imam Ali as the Gate of divine Knowledge.
6. The narration

انا مدينه العلم وعلی بابها

invites all the nations to refer to Ali's vast knowledge in many subjects.

7. The existence of the Immaculate Imams and adhering to them; and seeking permission to enter the Messenger's house.
8. Numerous examples of Imam Ali's solving the most difficult problems and his extraordinary judgments.
9. Omar's admitting to the vast knowledge of Imam Ali and his right to the caliphate.
10. The strangest cases and judgments of Imam Ali.



Contents

LESSONS ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-ONE AND ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-TWO 3

The Messengers, Who Were the Most Learned among the Nations, Were Assigned to Establish Islamic Governments 4
The Messenger Who Knew the Unseen Chose Saul as the Army Chief 6

According to Islam, Leadership Belongs to the One Who Is Most Learned 8

It Is the Certain Duty of the Prophet to Choose the Most Learned of the Nation to Govern 9

The Words of Salmān Fārsī, Imam Ali, and Imam Hasan about the Need for the Best Government 10

A Discussion between the Author and a Sunni Man on Following Ali Because of His Vast Knowledge 13

Imam Ali's Knowledge Is Like That of the Prophet 16

Ḥakīm Sanā'ī's Elegy Concerning the Status of Imam Ali 17

None Had Knowledge of the Book of God like Imam Ali 19

Imam Ali Was the Most Learned of the Nation in Knowledge of Both the Seen and the Unseen 22

With His Unique Perfection, Imam Ali Is the Assured Beloved in the World of Existence 30

LESSONS ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-THREE TO ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-SIX 35

The Words of the Author of *Majma' al-Bayān* in the Commentary on *وَأَوَّالَ الْيُوتِ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا* 35

The Words of Mullā 'Abd al-Razzāq and the Author of the Qur'anic Commentary of *Bayān al-Sa'āda* Concerning This Verse 37

The Existence of the Immaculate Imams Permits Entry to the House of the Messenger of God 39

The Reasoning of Ibn Shahr Āshūb Concerning "the City of Knowledge" with Respect to the Purity of the Imams 42

The Elegies of the Scholars Concerning the Imam Ali as the Gate to the City of Knowledge 46

Shi'a and Sunni Narrations 57

Sunni Shaykhs Who Have Recounted the Narration 63

Similar accounts of the narration 73

In *al-Mustadrak*, Ḥākim Maintains That the Narration
Is Authentic 76

Abū Ṣālt Harawī as One of the Greatest Shaykhs of
Authentic Narrators 78

Ḥāfiz ‘Alā’ī and Suyūfī Authorize the Veracity of
the Narration 81

Ibn Ḥajar ‘Asqalānī and Ḥāfiz ‘Alā’ī reject Abū
al-Faraj’s Opinion 82

Abū Ṣālt Harawī as a Shi‘ī Narrator. 85

The Invented Hadiths about Abū Bakr, Omar, and Othman 89

The Rejection of Ibn Ḥajar Haythamī, the Reasoning, and the
Fabricated Hadiths 90

The Elegies of Ibn Fahd Ḥāshimī and Shaykh Kāzim Ozrī 93

LESSONS ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-SEVEN TO

ONE HUNDRED SIXTY 99

The Hadith of the Shi‘a and Sunni Where the Verse *al-ladhina
ya‘lamūn* Refers to the Immaculate Imams 99

Words of the Prophet Concerning the Knowledge of
Imam Ali 102

The Discussion of Imam Ṣādiq with Ibn Abī Laylā on the
Knowledge of Imam Ali 104

Scholars Who Have Mentioned Imam Ali’s Cases
and Judgments 106

The Prophet’s Supplication for Imam Ali 108

Imam Ali’s Judgment in the Story of the Newborn Child 108

By Weighing the Milk, He Made It Clear to Whom the Boy and
the Girl Belonged 111

Omar’s Confession of Ali’s Right to the Caliphate 112

Distinguishing a Master from a Servant 113

Two Men Who Fought over the Price of Eight Loaves
of Bread 114

Four Men Who Fell into a Ditch Where There Was a Lion
and Died 117

Imam Ali’s Verdict on the Threefold Compensation to Qāriṣa,
Qamiṣa, and Wāqīṣa, the Three Performing Women 123

Imam Ali’s Verdict Concerning a Cow That Had Killed
a Donkey 125

The Confession of the Woman Who Denied Her Son 128

- The Verdict on Two Men Who Had Entrusted a Woman with Something to Keep for Them, and Their Intention to Cheat Her 131
- Overturning the Verdict on an Adulterous Woman Whom Omar Had Ordered to Be Punished 132
- Imam Ali Annuls the Stoning of a Pregnant Woman That Omar Ordered 136
- Imam Ali Annuls the Stoning of a Woman with a Six-Month-Old Baby 138
- Othman Had an Innocent Woman Stoned 141
- The Evil Results of Usurper Governments 142
- The Elegy of Khuzaymat Ibn Thābit Anṣārī in Paying Homage to Imam Ali 144
- Abū Bakr Did Not Know the Meaning of *Abb* 145
- Abū Bakr Did Not Know the Meaning of *Kalālah* in the Qur'an 151
- The Objection of a Jewish Scholar to Abū Bakr's Being a Representative of God, and the Answer of Imam Ali 154
- The Position of Imam Ali and Position of Abū Bakr 155
- The Ignorance of the Two Shaykhs on Religious Matters 157
- Quddāma's Reasoning That Alcohol Is Lawful for the Believers and Omar's Accepting It 160
- The Blood Money for Abortion and Beheading the Dead 162
- On the Ornaments of Mecca and Imam Ali's Command to Retain Them 164
- The Case of Tubba' and His Non-Interference with the Jewels at the Ka'ba 166
- The Wahhābī Attack on Karbalā to Destroy the Graves of the Imams in Baqī 172
- Pahlavi Reduced the Darvāzeh Qur'an (the Entrance to Shiraz) to Dust 174
- Permission to Rebuild the Graves of the Imams 175
- In Baḥr al-ʿUlūm's Elegy, Praying by the Grave of the Pure Imam Is Introduced as One of the Best Forms of Worship 177
- On Omar's Statement about the Black Stone of the Ka'ba: "Do Not Call upon It; There Is No Benefit in It" 180
- Bukhārī and Muslim Ibn Ḥajjā Have Omitted the Virtues and Attributes of Imam Ali from Their Hadith Collections 182
- Khārazmī's Elegy and His Hadith about Imam Ali 183

LESSONS ONE HUNDRED SIXTY-ONE TO ONE HUNDRED
SIXTY-FIVE 189

The Meaning of the Wisdom Mentioned in the Qur'an 189

Imam Ali's Knowledge Was Like That of Adam 190

The *Nahj al-Balāghah* Sermon on the Necessity of the Gate to the
City of Knowledge 194

An Explanation of the Hadiths Concerning the Priorities
of Ali 197

Lack of Knowledge about Imam Ali's Lofty Position Was the
Main Reason He Was Cast Aside 211

Imam Ali Divides the Meat of Seventeen Camels in Halves,
Thirds, and then Ninths 211

Imam Ali's Quick Answer Regarding a Number Divided by
Two up to Ten 212

Questioning Imam Ali on the Pulpit about the Inheritance of a
Woman and Other Questions 214

A Woman's Question Concerning Her Inheritance and the
Question about the Dinar 216

Imam Ali's Prohibition of Urinating in Running Water or the
Open Air 218

Assigning Compensation for Shortness of Breath 222

Imam Ali's Verdict Concerning a Man about to Be
Punished Twice 222

Imam Ali's Verdict on Permission for a Woman to Remarry If
Her Husband Is Impotent 224

Fiqḍa's Rejection of Intercourse and Omar's Statement 226

Imam Ali's Judgment Concerning the Expiation of Pilgrims Who
Had Hunted an Ostrich's Egg 228

**Lessons One Hundred Fifty-One
and One Hundred Fifty-Two**

**Knowledge of God Is the First and Most
Important Condition for Leadership and
Governing the People**



LESSONS ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-ONE AND ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-TWO

In the Name of God, the most Compassionate, the most Merciful

And blessings be upon Muhammad and his pure Household, and may God's curse be upon his enemies from now until the Day of Resurrection. And there is no power or strength except for the High and Most Glorious Allah.

God, the Wise, has stated in His Noble Book:

قَدْ أَفَاءَ اللَّهُ إِلَهُ إِلَّا إِلَهُهُ وَالْمَلَائِكَةُ وَأُولُو الْعِلْمِ قَانِمًا بِالْإِصْطِ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا هُوَ الْعَزِيزُ الْحَكِيمُ.

God bears witness that there is no God but He, and the angels and those of knowledge maintaining creation in justice; there is no God but He, the Almighty, the Wise (3:18).

In this wonderful verse, the one God bears witness to Himself, with everlasting justice and judgment, the One to Whose Oneness the angels and men of knowledge bear witness, for the angels on high and the creatures, whether men, *jinn*, or any kind of moving creature or plant, can pray to none other than His holy being and His loftiness and bear witness to His Unity, and know Him as it is His right to be known. Other than Him, the only exceptions are those who have been given knowledge and the searchers on the path of peace who have reached the boundary of *tawhīd*.

The owners of such knowledge and the learned who have found their ways to the source of *tawhīd*, and tasted the sweetness of God's presence with no uneasiness or bitterness, can be leaders of others to such a state. Only they can be the banner-bearers for the caravan of humanity—to save people from danger, to teach them how to walk along the smooth path to the true Creator, to direct them away from temptation and desire and to move forward in happiness and good cheer to the source of peace and serenity.

The religion provides us with comprehensive commands and laws that invite us to fulfil our religious duties. It is clear that the leaders of this divine institution must be the most learned, with vast knowledge and wisdom, and be aware of the fundamental behavior. They must have already passed along the way and be familiar with it, so as to be able to direct man without error along the path.

A religious government is a government for both this world and the next—that is to say, a divine government. It must be based on

knowledge and awareness; otherwise it is like a government for animals or wild beasts, based on the power of wealth, injustice, and invented sedition that hand in hand lead man to Hell, but not to Heaven.

The main reason for establishing a government for human society is to guide people to a straight path, enabling them to live in peace and enjoy their lives. They can benefit from the facilities at their disposal and use their talents in whatever way they want to.

The leader of such a nation, with his strong power and facilities, must be able to motivate and direct the people in religion, thereby removing the grasp of alien aggressors and thieves, and in so doing bring peace to his country and its citizens. Otherwise, if the leader is unwise, he will not only govern improperly and lead the people to corruption, but will himself become an adversary and a means of corruption. He will not only lead the people according to his own passions and desires, but waste the talents of his people and lead them up a blind alley.

Such leaders are like a large rock blocking the water in a stream, for it not only does not enjoy drinking the water itself, but also does not let others use the water by letting it flow into their gardens. Or he is like a weak and ailing physician who has disguised himself as a doctor, who not only cannot cure himself, but turns all his patients' states into his own abject state by making them suffer from the same sickness as himself.

The Messengers, Who Were the Most Learned among the Nations, Were Assigned to Establish Islamic Governments

The power of government according to all the revealed religions was at the disposal of God's messengers, who governed the nations through their knowledge and wisdom, and were the only leaders who could govern justly. As it is stated:

قُلْ أَمَرَ رَبِّي بِالْقِسْطِ

Say, my Lord enjoins justice... (7:29).

لَقَدْ أَرْسَلْنَا رُسُلًا بِالْبَيِّنَاتِ وَأَنْزَلْنَا مَعَهُمُ الْكِتَابَ وَالْمِيزَانَ لِيُتَمَرَّقَ النَّاسُ بِالْقِسْطِ، وَأَنْزَلْنَا الْحَدِيدَ فِيهِ بَأْسٌ شَدِيدٌ وَمَنَافِعُ لِلنَّاسِ وَلِيَعْلَمَ اللَّهُ مَنْ يَنْصُرُهُ وَرُسُلَهُ بِالْغَيْبِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ قَوِيٌّ عَزِيزٌ.

We verily sent a foretime Our messengers with clear proofs, and revealed with them the Scripture and the Balance, that mankind may observe right measure; and He revealed iron, wherein is mighty power and (many) uses

for mankind, and that God may know him who helps Him and His messengers, though unseen. For God is Strong, Almighty (57:25).

In this verse we clearly see that the reason God has sent the messengers with many signs, miracles, and scriptures is to establish a divine religion of justice on earth, and to be the bearers of the banners of His religion, thereby saving mankind and leading them on the straight path.

It is a messenger who takes a sword in hand and goes to *jihād* in front of his nation, and in this way saves the land from the hands of the corrupt, smoothing the way of servitude, acquainting the people with God, and bringing justice into their lives.

This is the effect of the important decision that the supporters of the messengers must be occupied with, so that they are ready to help them. As it is stated:

وَكُنْ مِنْ نَحْيٍ قَاتِلٍ مَعَهُ وَرِيعُونَ كَثِيرٌ قَمَا وَمَنُوا لِمَا أَصَابَهُمْ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ وَمَا ضَعُفُوا وَمَا اسْتَكَانُوا وَاللَّهُ يُحِبُّ الصَّابِرِينَ وَمَا كَانَ قَوْلُهُمْ إِلَّا أَنْ قَالُوا رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا ذُنُوبَنَا وَإِسْرَافَنَا فِي أَمْرِنَا وَثَبِّتْ أَقْدَامَنَا وَانصُرْنَا عَلَى الْقَوْمِ الْكَافِرِينَ فَآتَاهُمُ اللَّهُ ثَوَابَ الدُّنْيَا وَحُسْنَ ثَوَابِ الْآخِرَةِ وَاللَّهُ يُحِبُّ الْمُحْسِنِينَ

And how many a prophet have there been a number of devoted men who fought (beside him). They quailed not for aught that befell them in the way of God, nor did they weaken, nor were they brought low. And God loves the steadfast. And their words were only that they said, "Our Lord! forgive us for our sins and wasted effort, make our foothold sure, and give us victory over the disbelievers." So God gave them the reward of the world and the good reward of the Hereafter. God loves those whose deeds are good (3:146-48).

In these verses we see that the messengers, along with their disciples and those sincere to God, have struggled in the way of God to wipe out those who fought against mankind and God. They struggled to destroy the impure ones who would stand against the progress of the nations. They tried to prepare the way for sincere and competent people to forge ahead.

The verses clearly show that struggling in the way of God, or the *jihād*, is not only an Islamic concept, and that previous messengers also did the same. Of course, each of them had his own way and was different from those who followed after, but on the whole, a messenger's invitation to the people to a religion is the basis for a well-planned government as a center for making wise decisions. This not an easy task, because every era has its own different corrupt and aggressive people, and they naturally stand against such governments.

Therefore, without *jihād*, struggling in the way of God, this invitation would be of no avail.

Therefore, the leader and commander in this struggle must be a religious leader of the nation, and the central figure of the government in all public affairs. He should assign the commander of the army, since this follows the verses of the Qur'an where we see how Saul was assigned as the commander of the army by his messenger.

The Messenger Who Knew the Unseen Chose Saul as the Army Chief

أَفَرَأَى إِلَى الْمُلْكِ مِنْ بَنِي إِسْرَئِيلَ مِنْ يَدِ مُوسَى إِذْ قَالُوا لِمُوسَى اذْهَبْ لَنَا مَلِكًا نَقَاتِلَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ قَالَ هَلْ عَسَيْتُمْ أَنْ تَكُونَ عَلَيْكُمْ الْقِتَالُ أَلَّا نَقَاتِلُوا قَالَوَا مَا لَنَا أَلَّا نَقَاتِلَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ وَقَدْ أَخْرَجَنَا مِنْ دِيَارِنَا وَأَبْنَاءِنَا فَلَمَّا كُتِبَ عَلَيْهِمُ الْقِتَالُ قَالُوا إِلَّا قَلِيلًا مِنْهُمْ وَاللَّهُ عَلِيمٌ بِالظَّالِمِينَ وَقَالَ لَهُمْ نَبِيُّهُمْ إِنَّ اللَّهَ قَدْ بَعَثَ لَكُمْ طَالُوتَ مَلِكًا قَالُوا أَنَّى يَكُونُ لَهُ الْمُلْكُ عَلَيْنَا وَنَحْنُ أَحَقُّ بِالْمُلْكِ مِنْهُ وَلَمْ يُؤْتَ سَعَةً مِنَ الْمَالِ قَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ اخْتَبَاكُمْ عَلَيْكُمْ وَزَادَهُ بَسْطَةً فِي الْعِلْمِ وَالْجِسْمِ وَاللَّهُ يُؤْتِي مَلَكُهُ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَاللَّهُ وَاسِعٌ عَلِيمٌ

Have you not considered the leaders of the Children of Israel after Moses, how they said to a prophet whom they had, "Set up for us a king and we will fight in God's way." He said, "Would you refrain from fighting if fighting were prescribed for you?" They said, "Why should we not fight in God's way when we have been driven from our dwellings with our children." Yet, when fighting was prescribed for them, they turned away, all save a few of them. And God is aware of the wrongdoers.

And their prophet said unto them, "Indeed, God has raised up Saul to be a king for you." They said, "How can he have kingdom over us when we are more deserving of the kingdom than he is, since he has not been given wealth enough?" He said, "Indeed God has chosen him above you, and has increased him abundantly in wisdom and stature. God bestows His Sovereignty on whom He will. God is all-Embracing, All-Knowing" (2:246-47).

We see first of all in these two verses that the Children of Israel did not choose their ruler themselves, but they asked their messenger to do so for them, so that he could lead them in their tribulation. Secondly, their messenger chose Saul for them, but they objected because of his lack of wealth and property and claimed that they were thereby more competent. But their messenger did not pay any attention to what they said, and from the point of view of divine inspiration, he did not take their objection seriously. And thirdly, he reminded them of the importance for them of Saul and his wisdom, and

that he was strong and had enough knowledge to lead them, for that which a ruler needed was wisdom, knowledge, and strength in order to govern the nation in the most proper way possible.

Therefore, how mean and senseless are those who say that prophethood does not combine with rulership. Prophethood, wisdom, divine knowledge, religious jurisprudence, intelligence, and knowledge of God and religion (but not like that spoken of and believed nowadays, which is a pretense devoid of all understanding, and quite unaware of the divine commandments) are the necessary primary conditions for government.

أَمْ يَحْسَدُونَ النَّاسَ عَلَى مَا آتَاهُمُ اللَّهُ مِنْ فَضْلِهِ هَذِهِ آتَيْنَا آلَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ الْكِتَابَ وَالْحِكْمَةَ وَآتَيْنَاهُمْ
مُلْكًا عَظِيمًا.

Or are they jealous of man kind because of that which God of His bounty has bestowed upon them? For We bestowed upon the people of Abraham the Scripture and wisdom, and We bestowed on them a mighty kingdom (4:54).

With this as an example, we see how Buraydah returned home from a journey during which the Messenger of God passed away, to find that Abū Bakr had nominated himself caliph, inviting the people to pay homage to him. They invited him to pay homage also, but he avoided it and asked: "Why did they not pay homage to Ali, the successor of the Messenger of God?" To his question, Omar said: "Prophethood and government cannot go together in a single family." Buraydah said:

You have played a trick and cheated! Does it not say in the Qur'an:

هَذِهِ آتَيْنَا آلَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ الْكِتَابَ وَالْحِكْمَةَ وَآتَيْنَاهُمْ مُلْكًا عَظِيمًا¹

...For We bestowed upon the people of Abraham the Scripture and wisdom, and We bestowed upon them a mighty kingdom?

And Sayyid Murtaḍā A'lam al-Hudā, with his own chains from Ibrāhīm Thaqafī, reports Sufyān Ibn Farwah quoting his father as saying:

جَاءَ بَنُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ حَتَّى رَكَزُوا رَأْيَهُ فِي وَسْطِ (اسْلَمَ) ثُمَّ قَالَ: لَا أَتَابِعُ حَتَّى يَتَابِعَ عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ. فَقَالَ عَلِيٌّ
عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: يَا بَنِيَّ، ادْخُلْ فِيمَا دَخَلَ فِيهِ النَّاسُ، كُنْ إِجْتِمَاعَهُمْ أَحَبَّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ اخْتِلَالِهِمْ.
الْبُيُوتِ²

Buraydah returned from his mission in Shām. He returned to set up his banner in the midst of the tribe of Aslam (of which he was also a member). He then said: "I will never pay homage unless Ali Ibn Abī Tālib pays homage first." When this happened, Ali Ibn Abī Tālib told him: "O Buraydah, you also should do what the others are doing, because their joining together today is much better for me than their differences."

It has been related through Ibrāhīm Thaqafi's chain from Mūsā Ibn Abdullah Ibn al-Husayn that Ali said to the tribe of Aslam:

إِنْ عَلِيًّا عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ قَالَ لَكُمْ: يَا مَعْزُومُونَ هَؤُلَاءِ غَيْرُونِي: أَنْ يَأْخُذُوا مَا لَيْسَ لَكُمْ، أَوْ أَكْثَرَهُمْ وَافَرَّقُوا أَمْرَ
الْمُسْلِمِينَ.³

"Pay homage, because these usurpers have caused a dilemma for my caliphate: either they take from me my right, or I fight with them, and in this way disturb Muslim society."

Moreover, Ibrāhīm Thaqafi has narrated through his chains that Mūsā Ibn Abdullah said:

أَبَتْ أَسْلَمُ أَنْ يُجَالِسَ، فَهَالُوا: مَا كُنَّا نَجْعَلُ حَتَّى يَأْتِيَ بِنَدْوِ الْقَوْلِ الَّذِي صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ لَيْسَ دَعَا عَلِيٍّ
وَلَيْسَ كُمْ مِنْ بَعْدِي. قَالَ: قَالَ عَلِيٌّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: إِنْ هَؤُلَاءِ غَيْرُونِي أَنْ يَطْلُبُونِي حَتَّى وَابْتِغَاءَهُمْ، وَازْدَادَ
النَّاسُ حَتَّى بَلَغَتْ الرِّدَّةُ أَحَدًا فَاعْتَرِثُ أَنْ أَظْلَمَ حَتَّى وَإِنْ قُضِلُوا أَصْلُوا.⁴

"The tribe of Aslam avoided paying homage, and they said: 'We will not pay homage unless Buraydah does so first.' This was because the Messenger of God had stated during his lifetime: 'After me, it is Ali who is going to take all authority in his hand, and he will be your Guardian.'"

The narrator reported that Ali had said: "This group of usurpers has put me in a dilemma by pressing me to pay homage to them. And now people have turned away from the religion. I have decided to remain unmoving regarding my right, and to let them do whatever they want (because the stability of the religion comes through patience)."

According to Islam, Leadership Belongs to the One Who Is Most Learned

The religion of Islam is based on nature and considered independent, and gives the highest value to knowledge. Therefore, the one who is the most learned of the nation should be considered its leader. Knowledge is like light contrasted with darkness, so there is no

comparison between the two. Can a leader with vast knowledge lead the nation in the most appropriate way, or a blind man who needs a stick with which to walk? See how many excellent verses about knowledge there are in the Holy Qur'an.

The very first verses sent down to the Messenger of God, which, according to all the commentators, comprise the chapter 'Alaq, speak of God's generosity, and praise Him for His attribute of "teaching by the pen":

إِقْرَأْ بِاسْمِ رَبِّكَ الَّذِي خَلَقَ • خَلَقَ الْإِنْسَانَ مِنْ عَلَقٍ • إقرء • وَرَبُّكَ الْأَكْرَمُ • الَّذِي عَلَّمَ بِالْقَلَمِ • عَلَّمَ الْإِنْسَانَ مَا لَمْ يَعْلَمْ

Read: In the Name of your Lord Who created, created man from a clot of blood. Read: And your Lord is Most Bountiful, Who taught by the pen, taught man that which he knew not (96:1-5).

Here we see that after speaking of His generosity, God mentions the attribute of teaching, which is most important. He also states:

اللَّهُ الَّذِي خَلَقَ سَبْعَ سَمَاوَاتٍ وَمِنَ الْأَرْضِ مِثْلَهُنَّ يَتَنَزَّلُ الْأَمْرُ بَيْنَهُنَّ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَلَى كُلِّ شَيْءٍ قَدِيرٌ • إِنَّ اللَّهَ قَدْ أَحَاطَ بِكُلِّ شَيْءٍ عِلْمًا

It is God Who created seven heavens and of the earth similar to them. His command comes down among them slowly, so that you may know that God is able to do all things, and that God surrounds all things in knowledge (65:12).

In this verse, God considers the creation of the heavens and the earth, and the revelation of them by means of His knowledge. And then He states:

كَمَا عَلَى اللَّهِ الْمُلْكُ الْحَقُّ وَلَا تَعْجَلْ بِالْقُرْآنِ مِنْ قَبْلِ يَنْقُضَ إِلَيْكَ وَغِيهِ وَقُلْ رَبِّ زِدْنِي عِلْمًا

Exalted above all is God, the Sovereign, the Truth. And hasten not (O Muhammad) with recitation of the Qur'an, before its revelation has been completed to you, and say, "My Lord, increase me in knowledge" (20:114).

In this wonderful verse, God commands His Messenger to ask in his supplications for an increase in knowledge. So we see the importance of knowledge. It is so important that God, the Honorable and Exalted, commands His Messenger to pray for increase in his knowledge.

It Is the Certain Duty of the Prophet to Choose the Most Learned of the Nation to Govern

After becoming aware that knowledge is the best resource for life, three different states—nature, wisdom, and religion—bear witness to its importance. Therefore, would it not have been wise to choose the one with the most knowledge to govern in place of the Messenger of God upon seeing that he was passing away, thereby leaving things open for someone with lesser knowledge to govern instead? This is contrary to the philosophy of Islam and the basis of true religion.

For Islam, with its foundation in *tawhīd*, all the rungs of the ladder to holiness and righteousness require knowledge, and the only way to know the Book and the traditions is through knowledge. Therefore, God instructed His Messenger to seek knowledge, and then teach the Book and wisdom. Hundreds of verses in the Holy Qur'an invite man to knowledge, praise, and prayer. Is it then possible to completely ignore all these foundational principles and undermine them by trusting the affairs of the nation to someone without knowledge after the demise of the Messenger, who was the most aware of holiness and righteousness? Or to allow the ignorant people to choose a caliph? Anyone acquainted with the spirit of Islam and its philosophy would know that such a system is totally wrong, and contrary to the invitation of the Messenger of God to Islam.

Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib, was the most learned one after the Messenger of God, as all Shi'a and Sunnis unanimously believe, as do the extremists and the *Nawāṣib*, and even non-Muslims, such as Jews, Christians, and untouchables. He was the most familiar with the condition of *tawhīd*, the Divine Names and Attributes, the Holy Qur'an, and the traditions of the Messenger of God. He was also acquainted with the commands and laws of Islam, the rules of governance, judgment, and the settling the disputes, and was connected to the Divine World and had knowledge of its secrets. So is it not a kind of theft to ignore all these attributes by denying them to Ali?

The Words of Salmān Fārsī, Imam Ali, and Imam Hasan about the Need for the Best Government

After the demise of the Messenger, when some of Ali's followers went to the mosque and each one gave a sermon in front of the usurper government, Salmān Fārsī said:

يَا أَيُّهَا الْمَكْرُورُ إِلَى مَنْ تُسَيِّدُ أَمْرَكَ إِذَا نَزَلَ بِكَ الْقَضَاءُ؟ وَإِلَى مَنْ تُفَرِّغُ إِذَا سَبَلَتْ هَذَا لَا تَعْلَمُ أَوْ مَا
عَلَّوْكَ فِي الْقَدَمِ أَوْ فِي الْقَوْمِ مَنْ هُوَ أَعْلَمُ مِنْكَ الْخَطْبَةُ: ⁵

O Abū Bakr! When the herald of death and the command of God come to you, to whom are you going to trust your affairs? Whom are you going to rely on, or take shelter with, when you are asked why you have usurped responsibility for that of which you have no knowledge, while there is one more knowledgeable than you among the nation of the Messenger of God?

And before the Battle of Šiffin, Imam Ali said in a sermon:

إِنَّ الْعَجَبَ كُلَّ الْعَجَبِ مِنْ جَهْلِ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةِ وَطُلَاهَا وَقَادَتَهَا وَتَأَقَّبَهَا إِلَى الْكَارِ إِنَّهُمْ قَدْ تَبِعُوا رَسُولَ
اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ عَوْدًا وَبِنَا: مَا وَكَلْتُ أُمَّةً رَجُلًا قَطُّ أَمْرَهَا وَفِيهِمْ أَعْلَمُ مِنْهُ إِلَّا نَزَلَ
بَيْنَ أَمْرِهِمْ يَنْهَبُ سَفَالًا حَتَّى يَرْجِعُوا إِلَى مَا تَرَكُوا.
قَوْلُوا أَمْرَهُمْ قَبْلِي ثَلَاثَةَ رَهْطٍ مَا يَمْنَعُهُمْ زَجْلُ جَمْعِ الْقُرْآنِ وَلَا يَدْعِي أَنْ لَهُ عِلْمًا بِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَلَا
سُنَّةِ نَبِيِّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَقَدْ عَلِمُوا أَنِّي أَعْلَمُهُمْ بِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَسُنَّةِ نَبِيِّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ
عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَأَقْرَبُهُمْ وَأَفْرَهُمْ لِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَأَقْضَاهُمْ بِحُكْمِ اللَّهِ ⁶

It is surprising, so very surprising, about these ignorant people of the nation! About their perversion and their leaders, the leaders who lead them to hellfire! Though they have time and again heard the Messenger of God say that never has a nation given the reins of government to anyone while there is another wiser among them, unless the situation of that nation was deteriorating. And such corruption and deterioration will continue until they come to their senses and invite a wise man to govern them.

Before me, this nation trusted the affairs of government to three men, but there was not even one among them to help in the completion of the Qur'an, or to claim that he was aware of the Book of God and the traditions of the Prophet.

They knew that I was the wisest and most learned in the Book of God among the nation, and also that I was expert in jurisprudence and the recitation of the Qur'an, and more equitable in judgment and the command of God.

Moreover, we saw that Imam Hasan Mujtabā gave a long and influential sermon in front of Mu‘āwiyah:

وَاقْسَمُ بِاللَّهِ لَوْ أَنَّ النَّاسَ بَايَعُوا إِلَى جِئِنَ قَارَعْتُمْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ لَا غَظَبَ لَكُمْ
السَّمَاءُ قَطَرَهَا وَالْأَرْضُ بَرَكَهَا، وَمَا طَعِمَتْ فِيهَا بَائِعَاتِيهِ،
فَلَمَّا عَرَجَتْ مِنْ مَدِينَةٍ تَارَعَتْهَا قُرَيْشٌ بَيْنَهُمَا فَطَعِمَتْ فِيهَا الطُّلَقَاءُ وَأَبْنَاءُ الطُّلَقَاءِ أَنْتَ وَأَصْحَابُكَ،
وَقَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ:
مَا وَلَتْ أُمَّةٌ أَمْرًا زَجَلًا وَفِيهِمْ مَنْ هُوَ أَعْلَمُ مِنْهُ إِلَّا لَزِمُوا أَمْرَهُمْ يَذْهَبَ سَقَالًا حَتَّى يَرْجِعُوا إِلَى مَا
تَرَكَوا. فَذَكَرْتُ بَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ هَارُونَ وَهُمْ يَعْلَمُونَ أَنَّهُ خَلِيفَةُ مُوسَى فِيهِمْ وَابْتِغَاوُ السَّامِرِيَّ وَقَدْ
تَرَكَتْ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةُ أَبِي وَبَايَعُوا غَيْرَهُ وَقَدْ تَعَيَّرُوا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: أَنْتَ
مِثِّي يَنْزِلُهُ هَارُونَ مِنْ مُوسَى إِلَّا التَّبَوُّدَ⁷

I swear by God, that when the Messenger of God passed away and disappeared from among the people, if they had sworn allegiance to my father, then the rain of divine mercy would have fallen upon them all, and the earth would have presented its blessings to them, and you, O Mu‘āwiyah, would not have been greedy to usurp it!

However, when government and guardianship strayed from their course, the Quraysh continued struggling to get them for their benefit. It was in such circumstances that those who had been freed (by my grandfather, the Messenger of God, in Mecca) and their children became greedy for governance—and that is you, O Mu‘āwiyah, and your companions. It is as the Messenger of God had already said: “Never does a nation give authority to anyone when there is another more wise and knowledgeable among them, without their situation worsening day by day, and they fail to restore it.” The Children of Israel forsook Aaron, Moses’s brother, while they knew that he was the caliph of Moses for them, and followed the Samaritan. This nation, too, forsook my father and paid homage to another, when they had heard the Messenger of God saying to my father, Ali: “Your relationship to me is like that of Aaron to Moses. The only exception is that there is no messenger after me.”

And Majlisī has narrated one of the sermons of Imam Ṣādiq, where he said:

مَنْ دَعَا النَّاسَ إِلَى نَفْسِهِ وَفِيهِمْ مَنْ هُوَ أَعْلَمُ مِنْهُ فَهُوَ مُتَدَعٍ ضَالٌّ⁸

"Whoever calls the people to him, and invites them to obey him, while there is a more knowledgeable person among them, is a misleading and treacherous man."

A Discussion between the Author and a Sunni Man on Following Ali Because of His Vast Knowledge

I remember well how in 1394 AH I made a pilgrimage to Mecca and stayed in the district of Kudā Masfala in the south of Mecca. One day, along with 11 traveler friends, we went to the graveyard of Ma'la in the north of Mecca to visit the graves of the great-grandfather of the Prophet, Abū Tālib, and Khadija.

Because there was a large number of pilgrims that year, after visiting and praying, we could not find a car to return back home. Therefore, we had to hire a luggage-carrier van to take us back. I sat in the cab by the driver, while my friends climbed up in the luggage section behind. As the road was crowded, the vehicle was moving very slowly, and it took almost half an hour to return. On the way I was discussing some matters with the driver, who was a Sunni.

When I first got into the vehicle, I saluted him by saying "Hello," and he, too, answered me by saying "Marhaba." I asked him how he was, and then introduced myself as a Twelve-Imam Shi'a from Iran.

He said: "We find no fault with you, only that you curse the companions of the Prophet." I said:

Never, ever! How can we curse the companions of the Prophet? Those who helped the Messenger of God in battle, those who were martyred, as well as those who were not martyred, were right in their religion. We love the companions of the Prophet and we know the verses of the Qur'an concerning them, such as:

مُحَمَّدٌ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ وَالَّذِينَ مَعَهُ أَشِدَّاءُ عَلَى الْكُفَّارِ رُحَمَاءُ بَيْنَهُمْ تَرَاهُمْ يُسَبِّحُونَ فَضْلًا مِنَ اللَّهِ وَرُوَاهُ أَتَمَّ فِيهِمْ فِي رُجُوعِهِمْ مِنْ أَثَرِ السُّجُودِ...

Muhammad is the messenger of God, and those who are with him are hard against the disbelievers, and merciful among themselves. You see them bowing and falling prostrate (in worship), seeking bounty from God and (His) acceptance. The mark of them is on their foreheads from the traces of prostration...

The verse continues: *Such is their likeness in the Torah, and their likeness in the Gospel is like a seed that sends forth its shoot and strengthens it and rises firm upon its stalk, delighting the sowers, so that the disbelievers are enraged at*

them. God has promised, to such of them as believe and do good works, forgiveness and an immense reward (48:29).

After reciting a few verses concerning the priorities of the companions, I said:

And we always recite this verse, which is also about the priority of the companions of the Messenger of God, in our supplications:

رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا وَلِأَخْوَتِنَا الَّذِينَ سَبَقُونَا بِالْإِيمَانِ وَلَا تَجْعَلْ فِي قُلُوبِنَا غِلًا لِلَّذِينَ آمَنُوا رَبَّنَا إِنَّكَ رَؤُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ

And those who came (into the faith) after them say, "Our Lord, forgive us and our brethren who came before us in the faith, and place not in our hearts any rancour toward those who believe. Our Lord, indeed You are Full of Kindness, Merciful (59:10).

And as for our parents, we pray for the companions of the Prophet, and we even respect them more than we respect our parents.

He, too, then recited several verses of the Qur'an concerning the priorities of the companions. He proved to be an educated man, and was well acquainted with the meaning of the verses.

Then he said: "So why do you not believe in the caliphs after the Messenger of God?"

I said:

It is because Ali Ibn Abi Tālib was better and more knowledgeable than they were, and any wise man would say that we should refer our questions and difficulties to the wisest man, especially on important matters. So what affairs are more important than those concerning religion, upon which depend our happiness or misfortune? Now, I ask you, if this car of yours breaks down, who are you going to refer to in order to repair it? Surely you are going to take it to a man who is expert in repairing cars. Are you going to refer to someone who claims to be an expert in repairing cars, even if you are already aware that he does not know his job? If your child becomes ill and needs an operation, who are you going to refer to? Are you going to take him to a specialist, or just anyone you come across? Assuming both of them are accessible, is it possible that you would choose either one?

He answered: "It is obvious that I would refer to the more expert one."

I said: "The Shi'a believed in the forthcoming caliphate of Ali Ibn Abī Tālib, and on the basis of this belief, they followed him, and so, after the demise of the Messenger of God, they received the rules of their religion directly from him."

The driver said: "But those other caliphs had their priorities, and had long and reliable records of their migrations and *jihād*, and they knew the Qur'an."

So I said:

But we should not undermine the priority, *jihād*, and migration of anyone, or his knowledge of the Book of God, nor have I tried to reject any of them in my words. But what I am trying to say is that Ali has a higher priority and was more knowledgeable. And a man must refer to the more knowledgeable with his problems. That is why the Shi'a followed Ali right from the beginning, but without rejecting the priority, nobility, migration, and *jihād* of the other companions. Moreover, it is recorded in the authenticated books and *Ṣiḥāḥ* of the Sunnis, and is crystal clear to everyone, that the Prophet stated:

عَلِيٌّ أَفْضَاكُمْ، عَلَى أَهْلِكُمْ، وَأَعْلَمُنِي بِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ، وَعَلِيٌّ مَعَ الْحَقِّ وَالْحَقُّ مَعَ عَلِيٍّ حَيْثُمَا ذَا،
وَأَنَا عِدْنَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا.⁹

"Among you, Ali is the best judge; he is the best jurisprudent you have, and he is the most learned among you in the Book of God. Wherever Ali is, he is with righteousness, and righteousness is with Ali; and wherever Ali turns, righteousness turns with Ali. And I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate."

In this case, we are sensible and have a religious proof to follow Ali, and if on the Day of Judgment God questions us as to why we did not follow the other caliphs, we have our reasons to present to Him. We will read to God all the widely known narrations that have been reported from His Messenger, about which there is no doubt, and then we can say: "According to these narrations about the Messenger of God, by following Ali we have actually followed the Messenger himself!"

However, if we do not follow Ali, but take another instead of him, God will take us to task on the Day of Resurrection over why we have followed someone other than Ali. He will ask us why we have abandoned the traditions and the way of Ali, and followed the way of the others. And if God mentions all these narrations to us one by one, then how are we going to answer Him?

The driver did not answer my questions, and almost five minutes passed in silence. He was quiet, and I was sure he was pondering my

words. Before long we reached our district and the car stopped, and after saying goodbye, I got out of the car.

In the meantime, the driver also got out from the driver's side, and while looking at our flat on the second floor of a newly built building, with some shops and confectioners on the ground floor, he turned his face to my friends, who were then getting out the car, and said to them:

هَذَا عَالِمٌ جَلِيلٌ لَا تَتْرُكُوهُ.

"This is a great scholar; do not leave him."

He then told me: "God willing, I will come to see you here." But during the two extra days we were there, we did not see him.¹⁰

I had it in mind that if he came, I would talk to him about the narration that I had read in *al-Mahāsin* of Bayhaqī, but he did not turn up. However, I will now explain it.

Imam Ali's Knowledge Is Like That of the Prophet

Bayhaqī has reported Abū Ḥayyān Taymī's saying:¹¹

I was in the session of Qāsim Ibn Mujaḥḥid, the governor of Ahwāz, when a man told me that a man of the Banī Hāshim was with him, and the Hāshimī man said: "May God bless the Emir. Would you not like me to tell you a narration about the Commander of the Believers, Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib?" and the Emir answered: "Certainly, if you wouldn't mind."

The man continued:

My father narrated to me that he was in the session of Muhammad Ibn 'Āyisha in Basra, when a man stood up from among the people and asked: "O Aba Raḥmān, who was the best companion of the Messenger of God?" My father said: "It was either Abū Bakr, Omar, Othman, Ṭalḥa, Zubayr, Sa'd, Sa'īd, 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn 'Auf, or Abū 'Ubayda Ibn al-Jarrāḥ."

The man said:

فَأَيْنَ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ؟

"Then where is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib?"

Then Muhammad Ibn 'Āyisha said: "O man, are you asking about the companions of the Messenger of God, or the Messenger himself?" And the man said: "I am asking about his companions."

So Ibn 'Āyisha said:

God, the Honorable and Exalted, has stated:

كُلُّ مَاؤَاتَدَعَ أَبْنَاءَهُ وَأَبْنَاءَ كُرْ وَنِسَاءَهُ وَنِسَاءَ كُرْ وَأَنْفُسَهُ وَأَنْفُسَهُمْ¹²

...say: Come! We will summon our sons and your sons, our women and your women, and ourselves and yourselves, then we will pray humbly (to our Lord) and invoke the curse of God upon those who lie! (3:61)

فَكَيْفَ يَكُونُ أَصْحَابُهُ مِثْلَ نَفْسِهِ¹³

How can his companions be as he is?

And it is narrated that Ibn Abbās said:

كَانَ لِعَلِيِّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ خَوَارِسُ قَوَاطِعَ: يَسْطُرُ فِي الشَّيْخَةِ، وَجَمْعُ الرُّسُولِ، وَعِلْمُ
بِالنَّبِيلِ، وَدُخْلُ فِي الثَّأِيلِ، وَصَبْرٌ عِنْدَ الثَّرَالِ، وَمُقَاوَمَةٌ الْأَهْطَالِ، وَكَانَ الذِّدُّ إِذَا اغْتَضَلَ، ذَا رَأْيٍ
إِذَا ائْتَمَلَ.¹⁴

Ali Ibn Abī Tālib had certain attributes that singled him out from the others. In his tribe he had a special status and position, he was honored as the son-in-law of the Messenger of God, he knew the revelation of the Qur'an well, he was expert at commenting on its meaning, and he was also aware of the spirit of the Book. And he was strong and patient in the face of battle, and confronted the most courageous fighter, and whenever there was a complicated problem concerning religion or any other matter, he was the first to deal with it, for he had a solution for any difficult question people might face.

Hakīm Sanā'ī's Elegy Concerning the Status of Imam Ali

Hakīm Sanā'ī, the famous poet of the fifth and sixth centuries, has said the following concerning the Gate of Knowledge of the Prophet: "Go to Medina, search for knowledge, and then take shelter in him. So how long are you going to lack that knowledge? Now, you know well that Ḥaydar [Ali] is the Gate of Knowledge, so it is unfair to refer to anyone else while you have Ḥaydar beside you."

These two verses of his are from his 46-line elegy, all of which he composed in answer Sulṭān Sanjar Saljūqī concerning his invitation to Shi'ism. There follow some more verses:

It is not for a wise man to take away the ring stone of his beloved from his heart, for the ring stone is the inner soul, and the rest is as a twig with no fruit.

As long as the love of Jesus, son of Mary, is with you, it is not lawful for you to love the hoof of a donkey—that is, to ignore the best and take the lesser.

While Joseph from Egypt sits by you in company, it is unfitting for you to cast your glance at the fire burning in the corner.

When Ahmad the Messenger sits by you, dare not to allow thoughts of Abū Jahl.

The sea was filled with ships [i.e., many corrupt people], but all sank in a fearful whirlpool, and Noah could not cross the sea without his (reliable) Ark.

If you want to be secure and save your faith whilst here and forever, like a circle with no angles, no point to be called the head on your corpse,

In safety I show you to the House of Noah, the Messenger, to be secure and live in peace forever.

Journey to Medina, find the source of knowledge and take shelter in him; for how long will you be the doorknob hanging on the door?

As you know Ḥaydar is the Gate to the City of Knowledge, it is unjust to have a master other than Ḥaydar, the Master.

How can it be allowed, by trickery and cheating, to have a demon in the religion in place of the greatest Judge?

That little wisdom of yours will tell you, you can't have drips instead of Kawthar [a river in Paradise].

It is never befitting, according to my belief, to take away the right of Zahra, but still lay claim to the Messenger's religion.

He whom you call Emir in place of Ḥaydar, I am certain cannot even put on the sandals of his sincere servant, Qanbar!

As long as Ḥaydar is foremost like Solomon, it is a scandal to take a demon as the crown upon your head!

While having Khidr, the auspicious, by your side, it is unwise to have a lame ass as leader!

If you want your affection proven real, you must consider the affection of Ḥaydar mixed with your soul.

As the sapling of the religion was planted in the garden of Ḥaydar, then it is unseemly for other than he to be the gardener.

There remained nothing after Ahmad but the Book of God and the Household—reminders to be saved until the Day of Resurrection.

Whom do you expect to be the Sultans of the Religion, to save the pulpit and altar, other than Ali and his Household?

If you consider yourself a pious man, you must always have the love of Ḥaydar with you.

O Sanā'ī, do not forget, it is unreasonable to think that a nurse has the love of the mother for her baby!

Be a slave of the Household until the Day of Resurrection—be not like the feeble unreligious ones.

Take these attributes as ornaments for your recorded book, for there is no remedy for the steed left with no character and adornment.¹⁵

In *al-Manāqib*, Ibn Shahr Āshūb reports Sufyān quoting Ibn Jarīḥ from ʿAtā, back to Ibn Abbās, commenting on the verse:

وَقَالِ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ وَالْإِيمَانَ لَقَدْ لَبِثْتُمْ فِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ إِلَى يَوْمِ الْبَئِثِ هَذَا يَوْمُ الْبَئِثِ وَلَكُمْ كِتَابٌ كَذِبٌ لَا تَعْلَمُونَ

But those to whom knowledge and faith are given will say: "Indeed you have tarried, by God's decree, to the Day of Resurrection, and this is the Day of Resurrection, but you were not aware" (30:56): "Sometimes one is a believer but lacks knowledge, but by God, Ali possessed both faith and knowledge. And he who speaks thus is he who will explain to the wrongdoers that he is none but Ali Ibn Abī Tālib."

None Had Knowledge of the Book of God like Imam Ali

Muḥammad Ibn Muslim, Abū Ḥamzah Thumālī, and Jābir Ibn Yazīd relating from Imam Bāqir; Ali Ibn Faḍḍāl, Fuḍayl Ibn Yaṣār, and Abū Baṣīr from Imam Ṣādiq; Ahmad Ibn Muḥammad Ḥalabī and Muḥammad Ibn Fuḍayl from Imam Riḍā and Imam Mūsā Ibn Jaʿfar and also from Zayd Ibn Ali, Muḥammad Ibn Ḥanafīyyah, Salmān Fārsī Abū Saʿīd Khudrī, and Ismāʿīl Saddī, have all stated in commentaries that the meaning of

مَنْ عِنْدَ عِلْمِ الْكِتَابِ

refers to Ali Ibn Abī Tālib in the following verse:

قُلْ كَفَىٰ بِاللَّهِ شَهِيدًا بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَكُمْ وَمَنْ عِنْدَ عِلْمِ الْكِتَابِ

... Say: "Sufficient as a witness between me and you is God, and such as has knowledge of the Book" (13:43).

Also, it has been related from Ibn Abbās that:

لَا إِلَهَ تَأْهَوُّ إِلَّا عَلِيٌّ مِنْ أَيْمَانِ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ لَقَدْ كَانَ عَالِمًا بِالْمَسِيرِ وَالْقَائِلِ وَالنَّاسِجِ وَالنُّسُوجِ وَالتَّحَالُلِ وَالْمَحْرَمِ¹⁶

"Never, by God, have the words *such as has knowledge of the Book* in this verse referred to Abdullah Salām. The most learned is none other than Ali Ibn Abī Tālib. Surely Ali was expert in commentary, the

interpretation of verses, including the abrogated, as well as what is lawful and unlawful in the Qur'an."

Naṭanzī has this narration in *al-Khaṣā'is*.

Above all, it is rare that God would choose a Jew (Abdullah Ibn Salām) and assign him as second after Him.

Moreover, God's words

قُلْ كَفَىٰ بِاللَّهِ شَهِيدًا بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَكُمْ وَمَنْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ الْكِتَابُ¹⁷

(Sufficient as a witness between me and you is God, and such as has knowledge of the Book) agree with the numerical values of the alphabet. According to Ibn Abbās:

كَأَنَّ، انْزِلَ فِي أَمْرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عَلَىٰ

"[It could never be so; this verse has only been revealed for the Commander of the Believers, Ali], because the total values of the letters in the two clauses is 817."

Also, 'Aunī says:

وَمَنْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ الْكِتَابُ وَعِلْمُهُ مَا يَكُونُ وَمَا قَدْ كَانَ عِلْمًا مَعَهُمَا

"[Ali is one] with him in knowledge of the Book, and of the future, the past and the unseen."

And Abū Muqātil Ibn Dāṭ 'Alawī says:

وَمَنْ حَوَىٰ عِلْمَ الْكِتَابِ كُلَّهُ عِلْمَ الَّذِي بَاقِي وَعِلْمَ مَا مَضَىٰ

"[Ali is] the one who has knowledge of all creation with him; knowledge of that which is to come and knowledge of what has already passed."

And finally, Ali's knowledge surpassed the knowledge of all the companions, which they unanimously agreed upon, and who paid homage to him.¹⁸

Jāhiz says: "People have come to the decision that the companions of the Messenger of God received their knowledge through four persons: Ali, Ibn Abbās, Ibn Mas'ūd, and Zayd Ibn Thābit, and some have also added Omar Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb. And after this unanimous decision, they agreed that these four persons were more knowledgeable of the Book of God and recited it better."

And, as the Prophet has said:

يُؤْتِي النَّاسَ أَفْرَهُمْ

"Leadership of the people is with him who recites God's Book better." Therefore, the other four have priority over Omar.

Also, it is commonly agreed that the Prophet stated:

الْإِمَامُ مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ

"The leaders and Imams are from among the Quraysh." Hence, both Ibn Mas'ūd and Zayd also fail. So there remain only Ali and Ibn Abbās, because both of them are jurists and are from the tribe of Quraysh. And between these two, Ali is older and his migration record is longer than that of Ibn Abbās, so Ibn Abbās fails against Ali, and it is Ali who remains as the leader and Imam of the whole nation.¹⁹

All the Messenger's companions would take their questions and problems to Ali, who never posed a single question to anyone else. The Prophet said:

إِذَا اخْتَلَفْتُمْ فِي شَيْءٍ فَكُونُوا مَعَ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِيطَالِبٍ

"When you have any disagreement about anything, act upon Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib's decision on the matter."

Ibādāt Ibn Šāmit said:

كَانَ عُمَرُ: إِمْرًا إِذَا اخْتَلَفْنَا فِي شَيْءٍ وَأَنْ نَحْكُمَ عَلَيْهِ.

"Omar said: 'We must take Ali as arbiter for whatever we disagree upon, and then act according to his decision.'" And for this very reason, companions such as Salmān, 'Ammār, Hudhayfah, Abūzar, Abī Ibn Ka'b, jābir Ibn Anṣārī, Ibn Abbās, Ibn Mas'ūd, and Zayd Ibn Suhān, who were known for their vast knowledge, would follow Ali's decisions. They never avoided Ali, only Zayd Ibn Thābit, Abū Mūsā, Ma'd, and Othman, and they all concurred with Ali's vast knowledge.²⁰

Naqqāsh says in his *al-Tafsīr*: "Ibn Abbās said that Ali had great knowledge, and that the Messenger of God had taught him his own knowledge. Thus Ali's knowledge is the Messenger's knowledge, and my knowledge is from Ali; and my knowledge, as well as the knowledge of all the companions, is as nothing before Ali's knowledge—it is like a drop in seven vast oceans."

Zahhak says that Ibn Abbās narrated that Ali was given nine-tenths of all knowledge, and that he was nevertheless the best regarding the tenth part.

It is related in the *Amālī* of Ṭūsī that Ali passed by a group amongst whom was Salmān Fārsī. Salmān said to those with him: "Stand up! Appeal to him for help! By God, no one knows the secret of the Prophet more than he does."

And it is narrated in the *Amālī* of Ibn Bābwayh that Muhammad Ibn Mundhar said that he heard Abū Amāma say:

When Ali would say something, we did not doubt it, because we heard the Messenger of God saying:

خَازِنُ سِرِّي بِمَدِينَةِ عَلِيٍّ

"After me, the treasurer of my knowledge is Ali."

And Ḥimyarī said:

وَعَلَى خَازِنِ الْوَحْيِ الَّذِي كَانَ مُسْتَوْدَعَ آيَاتِ الْكُتُبِ²¹

"And Ali is the treasurer of the Divine Revelation; he is the one to whom is entrusted the verses of the Qur'an, and he is the guardian and savior of those trusts."

There is a narration from Yahyā Ibn Muḥīn's chains quoting 'Atā Ibn Abī Riyāḥ, saying that when he was asked: "Do you know any-one more knowledgeable than Ali to follow after the demise of the Messenger of God?" he answered: "By God, I know no one."

There are too many of Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb's statements about Ali's knowledge to mention here, but Khaṭṭīb Baghdādī has recorded them all in his *al-Arba'in*. He says that Omar said: "On the whole, knowledge has six ranges: five ranges are for Ali and the sixth is shared among all people. And I swear that Ali has a share in the sixth part with us, for he is even more expert than we are."

Imam Ali Was the Most Learned of the Nation in Knowledge of Both the Seen and the Unseen

'Ikrama has narrated from Ibn Abbās that Omar Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb told Imam Ali:

"O Abū al-Hasan, you are hasty in answering the questions that are asked of you."

Ali drew out his hand, saying: "How many fingers are on this hand of mine?" Omar said: "Five, of course."

Ali said: "O Abū Ḥaṣṣ, why did you hasten to answer?"

Omar said: "It was not hidden from me to mention it," and Ali answered: "I also hasten to answer whatever is not hidden from me."

وَاسْتَجَمَّ عَلَيْهِمْ قِيٌّ، وَتَلَزَعَ عَهْدَ الرَّحْمَنِ فَكَبَّرَ إِلَيْهِ أَنْ يَجْتَمِعَ بِالسُّورِ. فَكَبَّرَ إِلَيْهِمَا: الْعِلْمُ يُؤْتَى وَلَا بَأَقِي. قَالَ عُمَرُ: شَيْءٌ مِنْ هَاشِمٍ وَءَاكَارُهُ مِنْ عِلْمِ يُؤْتَى إِلَيْهِ وَلَا بَأَقِي، فَصَارَ إِلَيْهِ فَوْجٌ مِنْكُمْ عَلَى مَسَاوِدَ أَلَدِهِمْ أَرَادَهُ أَنْ يَخْرُجَ بِهِ.

قَالَ عُمَرُ: لَقَدْ عَدِلَ عَنْكَ قَوْمُكَ وَأَنْتَ لَا حُجَّةَ بِكَ هَذَا عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: إِنْ يَوْمَ الْقَضَلِ كُلِّ مِيقَاتٍ.²²

Omar faced a difficulty and could not solve it; he had a different idea from that of ‘Abd al-Rahmān Ibn ‘Auf on the matter. Both of them, Omar and ‘Abd al-Rahmān, wrote separate letters to Ali, and they summoned him to be present before Omar. To this Ali responded: “You must be in the presence of knowledge, because knowledge is always there.” So Omar said: “There is a great man among the Banī Hāshim and he has such knowledge; we must go to him, because he is not coming to us.” Therefore, Omar went to Ali (who was busy gardening and irrigating a field outside Medina), and found him leaning against his spade. He presented Ali with his questions and Ali answered them in full.

Omar said: “O Ali, your tribe left you and paid homage to another man, when you really deserved the caliphate.” Ali replied: “The day to sort out our enmity is Doomsday. That will be our appointment.”

Yūnus has narrated from ‘Ubayd that Hasan said that Omar Ibn Khattāb stated:

اللَّهُمَّ إِنِّي أَعُوذُ بِكَ مِنْ عَصِيَّةٍ لَيْسَ لَهَا عَلَيَّ حَاجِرٌ.²³

“O God! I take refuge in You for any falsehood or lie that I commit without Ali’s being there to correct it.”

It has been recorded in *al-Ibānah* of Ibn Baṭṭah that whatever problem Omar encountered, if he asked Ali, it would be unraveled at once, and his difficulty would be resolved. He would then say:

لَا أَبْقَانِي اللَّهُ بَعْدَكَ.²⁴

“May God not prolong my life beyond yours!”. And Balādhari has put in his *History* that he said:

لَا أَبْقَانِي اللَّهُ لِمُصْطَوِّئِهِمْ وَلَا لِمَنْ فِي أَعْيُنِهِمْ.²⁵

“God would have caused me to perish for the difficulties that I face, but for Ali’s being there to solve them!”

Both the

إِلَهُهُ

and the

ثاني

mention:

أَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ مُنْضَلِّهِ لَيْسَ لَهَا أُورَسَن. ²⁶

"I take refuge in You for any falsehood or lie that I commit without Ali's being there to correct it!"

Omar had 23 difficult problems which he referred to Ali in order to solve them, and in the end he said:

لَوْ لَا عَلِيٌّ لَمَلَكَ عَمْرٌ. ²⁷

"If Ali were not here with me, Omar would perish!"

Bayhaqī quotes Abū Othman, the judge of the city of Ray, from A'mash back to Sa'd Ibn Jābir, as saying the following:

Abdullah Ibn Abbās was near the Well of Zamzam in Mecca, reading narrations for the people, and we too were standing among the people. When he finished speaking, a man stood up and said: "O Ibn Abbās, I am a man from Shām, from the Hīmṣ district, and the people of Shām and Hīmṣ try to avoid Ali, and they curse him." Ibn Abbās said:

بَلْ كَسَبْتُمُ اللَّهَ فِي الدُّنْيَا وَالْآخِرَةِ وَأَعَدْتُمْ عَذَابًا مُهِينًا
أَلَيْسَ قَرِيبًا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ (وَأَلِهِ) وَسَلَّمَ؟ وَأَنْتُمْ تَكْفُرُونَ أَوَّلَ ذِكْرَانِ الْعَالَمِينَ إِيَّاهُ بِاللَّهِ وَ
بِرَسُولِهِ؟ وَأَوَّلَ مَنْ صَلَّى وَرَكَعَ وَعَمِلَ بِأَعْمَالِ الْبِرِّ؟

"Then may God curse them in this world and in the Hereafter, and prepare for them a humiliating chastisement! What? Do they curse him and deny his closeness to the Messenger of God, or that he was the first in the world to believe in God and His Messenger? Or that he was the first to pray by bowing down to worship God and to do good?"

The man from Shām said: "The people of Shām do not deny his closeness [to the Prophet] and his record in Islam. It is because they think that he has killed many people."

Ibn Abbās said:

كَكَلَّتْهُمُ أُمَّهَاتُهُمْ

"May their mothers mourn over their corpses!" and "Ali is more awakened to God, the Honorable and Exalted, and to His Messenger than they are. Ali has not killed anyone unless they deserved to be killed."

The man said: "O Ibn Abbās, my tribe has paid me for my journey; I am their deputy and they trust me, so it is not fair for you to send me back without answering me properly. The people of my tribe have been ruined because of the deeds of Ali Ibn Abī Tālib, and now it is for you to solve their problems, and to make things clear for them. I pray that God may solve your problems and attend to your demands."

Ibn Abbās said:

O my brother from Shām. Ali is exemplary among this nation, like the righteous Khidr whom Moses met by the sea and asked:

هَلْ أَتَيْتَكَ عَلَى أَنْ تُعَلِّمَ مَا عُلِّمْتُ وَرُفِدَا؟

"May I follow you, and come with you so that you may instruct me in the knowledge you have been taught, and lead me to the state of perfection?" (18:66).

That learned man, Khidr, answered:

إِنَّكَ لَنْ تَسْتَطِيعَ مَعِيَ صَبْرًا وَكَيْفَ صَبْرٌ عَلَى مَا لَمْ يُحِطْ بِهِ غَيْبًا.

"You will have no patience with me, for how can you show patience for something of which you have no knowledge?" (18:66-67).

Moses told him:

سَجِّدْنِي إِنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ صَابِرًا وَلَا أَعْصِي لَكَ أَمْرًا.

"You will find me patient, if God so wills, and I will not disobey you in anything" (18:69).

And Khidr said:

فَإِنْ أَتَيْتَنِي فَلَا تُسْأَلْنِي عَنْ شَيْءٍ وَتَقْبَلْ خَبْرًا وَذَكَرْنَا خَوْفًا إِذَا زَكَاةً فِي الشَّيْءِ
خَرَقَهَا.

"If you really want to follow me, then do not ask me about anything until I tell you of it" (18:70).

Thence, they set out until both boarded a boat, and then Khidr began boring a hole in the bottom of the boat. He was, of course, doing so for the sake God, but in Moses's sight it was a crime being done to the people on the boat. So Moses could not keep silent, and ignored the promise he had made, saying:

أَعْرَضَ عَنْهَا فَنَزَعَ الْوَقْدَ أَهْلًا لَهَا فَقَدْ خَسَفَتْ بِهَا أُولَئِكَ.

"Have you scuttled her to drown the crew? You have indeed done a frightful thing!" (18:71).

Then Khidr said:

أَلَمْ أَقُلْ إِنَّكَ لَنْ تَسْتَطِيعَ مَعِيَ صَبْرًا؟

"Did I not tell you that you would be impatient and unable to tolerate me?" (18:72).

Moses said:

لَا تُؤَاخِذْنِي بِمَا نَسِيتُ وَلَا تُزِيقْنِي مِنْ أَمْرِي عُسْرًا.

"Do not blame me for what I have forgotten, and do not weigh me down by making my case too difficult for me" (18:73).

Khidr ceased blaming him until

فَاَتَخَلَّفَا حَتَّىٰ إِذَا لَاقِيَا غُلَامًا فَاصْتَلَمَهُ

"They then continued until they met a boy, whom Khidr killed" (18:74).

Of course, the boy was killed for the sake of God, the Honorable and Exalted, and it was for the benefit of his parents. However, it seemed too much for Moses to see a young innocent boy being killed. He could not tolerate it, and said:

قَالَ أَكَلْتَ نَفْسًا زَكِيَّةً بِغَيْرِ نَفْسٍ لَقَدْ جِئْتَ شَيْئًا نُكْرًا.

"Did you kill an innocent boy who was guilty of nothing? You have indeed done a wicked deed!" (18:74).

Khidr replied:

قَالَ أَلَمْ أَقُلْ لَكَ إِنَّكَ لَنْ تَسْتَطِيعَ مَعِيَ صَبْرًا.

"Did I not tell you that you would not have patience with me?" (18:75).

Moses said:

قَالَ إِن سَأَلْتُكَ عَنْ شَيْءٍ بَعْدَ هَٰذَا فَلَا تُجَابِنِي قَدْ بَلَغْتَ مِنْ لَدُنِّي عُذْرًا فَاتَّخَلَّفَا حَتَّىٰ إِذَا لَاقِيَا أَهْلَ قَرْيَةٍ اسْتَطْعَمُوا أَهْلَهَا فَأَتَوْا أَنْ يُسْأَلُوا فَوَجَدُوهَا جُذَاءً رَايِبَةً أَنْ يَكْفُحَ نَارُهَا

"From now on, if I question you about anything, do not let me accompany you. You have found your reasons as far as I am concerned" (18:76-77).

So they continued walking until they came to a town, and they asked the people there for some food, but the people refused to offer either of them hospitality. Then they saw a wall that was about to fall down, and Khidr rebuilt it so that it stood firm. This also was for the sake of God, the Honorable and Exalted, for it was for the benefit of all the people there. However, Moses said:

لَوْ دِيتَ لَأَتَّخَذْتُ عَلَيْهِ أَجْرًا. قَالَ هَذَا فِرَاقُ بَيْنِي وَبَيْنَكَ.

"If you had wished, you might have received some payment for it." And then Khidr said: "This is now the parting between you and me" (18:77-78).

Khidr was indeed most knowledgeable about what he was doing in front of Moses. However, it was too much for Moses to bear, and he considered all these actions grave sins. This was because Moses lacked the knowledge, or gnosis, to understand what was going on, even though he was a great prophet, and was one of the messengers with whom God had made a covenant of prophethood.

After telling this story, Ibn Abbās continued:

In spite of all this, you, O brother of ours from Shām, where are your brothers, tribes, and companions? And how are they faring? What are they thinking? For Ali did not kill anyone unless he deserved to be killed as a criminal, and his killing was lawful; nevertheless I narrate for you a story worthy of attention.

The Prophet was with Umm Salamah, the daughter of Abi Umayyah, at precisely the time when Ali wished to visit the Prophet. He gently knocked at the door, and when the Prophet became aware that it was Ali, he said: "O Umm Salamah, rise and open the door."

Umm Salamah said:

يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ مَنْ هَذَا الَّذِي يُبْعَثُ بِمَنْظَرٍ لِي أَنْ أَتِيَهُ فِي ثِيَابٍ وَمُزِينَةٍ؟

"O Messenger of God! who could this great man be, that he is so important to you that you are asking me to open the door for him, when I am in such a state of informal dress with ornaments and bracelets on my wrists?"

The Prophet said:

يَا أُمَّ سَلَمَةَ إِنَّ كَلَامِي كَلَامَةُ اللَّهِ تَعَرَّوْا جِلِّيًّا! حَيْثُ أَقْبَلْتُ: وَمَنْ يُبْعَثُ الرَّسُولَ هَذَا أَطَاعَ اللَّهَ قَوْمِي يَا أُمَّ سَلَمَةَ قَدْ بَانَ بَابُ رَجَائِي لَا تَرَفُّقَ وَلَا تَرْفِقَ وَلَا بِالْعَجَلِ فِي أَمْرِهِ، يَحِبُّ اللَّهُ وَ

رَسُولُهُ، وَيَحْبُدُ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ يَا أُمَّ سَلَمَةَ إِنَّهُ إِنْ تَفَتَّحَ الْبَابُ لَهُ فَلَنْ يَدْخُلَ حَتَّى يَمِينِي عَلَيْهِ
الوطء

O Umm Salamah, to obey me is to obey God, the Honorable and Exalted, for He states: "Whoever obeys the Messenger, obeys God." So rise, O Umm Salamah, for there is a man at the door who is always calm, with strong determination, but a peaceful attitude. His haste is not because of ignorance. He loves God and His Messenger, so do both God and His Messenger love him. O Umm Salamah, if you open the door for him, he will not enter the house until you have turned away and the sound of your sandals fades. Only then will he enter.

Umm Salamah went to the door and opened it, but the man did not enter until Umm Salamah had turned away and disappeared from his sight and the sound of her sandals was no longer heard. It was then, when he felt there was no one in sight, that he pushed the door open and entered the house. He saluted the Messenger of God, and the Messenger did likewise, and then called to his wife, saying: "O Umm Salamah, do you know this man?" Umm Salamah answered: "Yes, I know him. This is Ali Ibn Abi Talib."

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: تَمَّ هَذَا عَلَى سَبْطِ نَحْمَةِ بَلْعِي، وَدَمُهُ بِدَيْ، وَ
هُوَ مِثِّي بِمِثْرِهِ هَرُونَ مِنْ مُوسَى إِلَّا أَنَّهُ لَا تَبِيَّ بَدَيْ.
يَا أُمَّ سَلَمَةَ، هَذَا عَلِيٌّ سَيِّدُ الْمُحِبِّينَ، مُؤْتَمِلُ الْمُسْلِمِينَ، وَأَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، وَتَوْضِعُ رِجْلِي وَعِلْمِي،
وَبَابِي الَّذِي أُوِي إِلَيْهِ، وَهُوَ الْوَيْسَى عَلَى أَهْلِ بَيْتِي وَعَلَى
الْأَخْيَارِ مِنْ أُمَّتِي، وَهُوَ أَحْسَنُ فِي الدُّنْيَا وَالْآخِرَةِ، وَهُوَ مِثِّي فِي الشَّيْءِ الْأَعْلَى. إِشْهَدِي يَا أُمَّ
سَلَمَةَ: أَنَّ عَلِيًّا يَقَاتِلُ الْفَاسِقِينَ وَالْقَاسِطِينَ وَالْمُتَارِكِينَ

Then the Messenger of God said:

Yes, this is Ali, whose flesh is mixed with my flesh, and whose blood is blended with my blood, and whose relationship to me is as the relationship of Aaron to Moses, except that there is no messenger after me. O Umm Salamah, this is Ali, the greatest Sayyid; he is the refuge for all the Muslims, and he is the Emir and Master of the Believers. And he is the treasurer of my knowledge and secrets. And he is as the gate through which I enter to serenity. He is the successor within my Household and the good ones among my nation. He is my brother in this world

and the next, and he is with me at the highest rank and station. O Umm Salamah, let it be known that Ali will fight with three groups among the people: those who will break their covenant [the Companions of Jamal], the aggressors [the Companions of Siffin], and those who forsake the religion [the Companions of Nahrāwān].

Ibn Abbās has said: "And when Ali killed these people, it was for the sake of God and the benefit of the nation. However, it was due only to hatred and anger on the part of the wrongdoers."

The Damascene asked: "O Ibn Abbās, who are the Nākīsīn?"

Ibn Abbās answered: "They are those who swore allegiance with Ali in Medina, but they broke their covenant and Ali fought them at Basra. They are known as the Companions of Jamal, and Mu'āwīyah's Qasīṭīn are their supporters. And the Māriqīn are the people from Nahrawān and are their partners."

The Damascene said:

مَلَأْتَ صَدْرِي نُورًا وَحِكْمَةً وَفَرَّجْتَ عَنِّي فُرُوجَ اللَّهِ عَنْكَ أَفْهَدَانِ عَلِيًّا مَوْلَايَ وَمَوْلَايَ
مُؤْمِنًا وَمُؤْمِنَةً²⁸

"O Ibn Abbās, you have filled my breast with light and wisdom and increased my belief. May God resolve all your problems! I bear witness that Ali is Imam and my Master, and the Imam and Master of every believing man and woman."

The great mystic Shaykh Farīd al-Dīn Aṭṭār Nishābūrī wrote:

Even if from the East to West were full of Imams, only Ali and his offspring suffice us;

The excellence of the point of his spear is known the world over, and the attributes of his three loaves of bread [which he donated in Ramaḍān in three subsequent days] are beyond this world.

What is the secret in his sincerity for aims? that three verses were sent down for three loaves of bread?

His blessing became a sure habit, so befitting, that he became the rightful Doorkeeper of Paradise.

If his knowledge were an ocean of color, just one drop would become a vast green ocean.

It was not his way to be indebted to anyone, and so he labored for a Jew. Someone asked: "Why have you done so?" He was angry, and opened his mouth like a flame, saying:

"I would rather carry stones from the top of a mountain than be indebted to any man.

"People keep telling me that it is disgrace for me to work, but I say that disgrace is asking someone for help."²⁹

It is here that the elegy of Shāfiʿī is pertinent, when he says: "If my breast should burst open, you would find two things inscribed within, without having to search: one is the sacred religion of the one God, and the other is love for the Household of His Messenger."

With His Unique Perfection, Imam Ali Is the Assured Beloved in the World of Existence

It is in here that the degrees of love and friendship towards Imam Ali rise above intellect and reach the highest point, as he himself has said:

وَأَجِبْ قَلْبِي بِحُبِّكَ مَسْبِيًّا

Strictly speaking, in his case, words such as "love," "affection," and "desire" are inadequate. When genuine love appears in the mind, nothing can explain it.

O you, of such beauty the like of which the eye of the firmament has never seen; a man the like thereof has never been brought forth in the world.

It is not the vocation of the wise man and the sage to be love-struck, but the charm of your eyes removes the strength of the sage.

May God's blessings be upon you, O Commander of the Believers, O Successor to the Prophet, the greatest leader, and the Imam of those who do good and believe.

O you, who are beyond the imagination, beyond what we have heard and read.

Though the session has come to an end, and life too!—yet we only begin to explain your attributes!

May my soul—and the souls of all the world—be your sacrifice.³⁰

Regarding you—most surprising creature in the world—my poor wisdom lacks words! Whenever my thought wishes to approach you, it falls short, far from you, and sinks helpless in lagoons of forgetfulness.

If a thousand enemies decide to kill me, I will never fear them if you are my friend.

The hope of reaching you sustains me, for my death would be at hand if you did not care for me.

My eyes fall asleep in dreams of you; my heart remains patient when you are absent.

Injury from you is better than a cure from others; if you were to poison me, it would be better than the antidote from others.

If I do not feel your perfume, constant on my breath, time and again, like a blossom, I tear at my chest.

How do they see what you are? Everyone knows you according to his own wisdom.

O Ḥāfiz, praise the one who is dear and respected in the sight of the people, who fall prostrating in front of your gate.³¹

**Lessons One Hundred Fifty-Three
to One Hundred Fifty-Six**

Concerning the Narration of

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا

**("I am the City of Knowledge
and Ali Is Its Gate")**

LESSONS ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-THREE TO ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-SIX

In the Name of God, the most Compassionate, the most Merciful

And blessings be upon Muhammad and his pure Household, and may God's curse be upon his enemies from now until the Day of Resurrection. And there is no power or strength except for the High and Most Glorious Allah.

God, the Wise, has stated in His Noble Book:

وَلَيْسَ الْبِرُّ أَنْ تَتْلُوا الْيُتُورَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا وَلَكِنَّ الْبِرَّ مَنْ اتَّقَىٰ وَأَتَىٰ الْيُتُورَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا وَأَتَىٰ اللَّهَ
لَمَّا كُمُ تَقْلِبُونَ. ³²

...And it is not righteousness to enter houses from the back, but the righteous man wards off evil. So go to houses by their doors, and fear God that you may succeed (2:189).

The Words of the Author of *Majma' al-Bayān* in the Commentary on *واتوا اليوت من ابوابها*.

It says in the commentary *Majma' al-Bayān* that there are several interpretations regarding the meaning of the clause

وَلَيْسَ الْبِرُّ أَنْ تَتْلُوا الْيُتُورَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا

(and it is not righteousness to enter houses from the back...).

The first interpretation is that during the season of the hajj pilgrimage in the Age of Ignorance, those who were wearing the white garments in preparation for the pilgrimage would not enter their homes through the main entrances. They would make a passage through the wall at the back of the house through which they would enter. This was subsequently banned in Islam, and has been thoroughly explained by Ibn Abbās, Qutādah, 'Atā', and Abū al-Jarūd, quoting Imam Muhammad Bāqir.

It has been said that the people of Ḥums, who are from the tribes of Quraysh, Kanāna, Khuzā'a, Thaqīf, Jishm, and the Banū 'Āmir Ibn Ṣa'sa'a did not follow the same method. This group was called Ḥums, the sense of which refers to "density," because they were strict in their religion. It has also been said that the Ḥums did practice this

method of entry, because they did not want any barrier above them disconnecting them from the sky when entering and leaving their houses.

This second explanation means "not to enter a house except through the main entrance"; "entering in a permitted way"; "matters to be as they must be"; and that it is "not specific to houses." This meaning has been presented by Jābir, quoting Imam Bāqir.

A third explanation is that requesting and receiving good deeds and welfare should only apply to the right people, and it is not allowed to ask the wrong people for them. The reason is given as

وَأَوَّاهُ الثُّبُوتِ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا

where it states that Imam Bāqir said:

أَنَّ مَصْهَرِيَّ أَزْوَاجَ اللَّهِ وَرَسُولَهُ وَالْدُعَاءَ إِلَى الْجَنَّةِ وَالْقَادَةَ إِلَيْهَا وَالْإِدْلَاءَ عَلَيْهَا إِلَى يَوْمِ الْقِيَمَةِ

"The Household of Muhammad is the doorway to God. They are the means to this way, and they invite us to Paradise; they are the leaders who guide towards Paradise, and are the right guides directly to Paradise until the Day of Judgment."

And the Prophet stated:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا وَلَا تُؤْتَى الْمَدِينَةُ إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا. وَتُرْوَى: أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its gate. A city cannot be entered other than through the main gate. Indeed, I am the City of Wisdom and Ali is its gate."

After long discussions on *Tafsir al-Mizān*, it has been demonstrated through narrations that during the Age of Ignorance, strict observers of the religion at the time would pass through gaps they had made at the back of their houses while wearing their *haji* pilgrimage garments. Regarding this, a narration has been referenced from *al-Durr al-Manthūr* that states that it is related in *al-Mahāsīn* by Barqī, from Imam Bāqir that God said:

وَأَوَّاهُ الثُّبُوتِ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا

which means

أَنْ يَأْتِيَ الْأَمْرَ مِنْ وَجْهِ أَيْ الْأَمْرِ كُنْ

"Each affair must be dealt with in its proper way."

And it has been related in *al-Kāfi* from Imam Ṣādiq:

الأوصياء هم أبواب الله التي منها يؤتى، ولولا هم ما عرف الله عز وجل وبهم أحج الله تبارك وتعالى على خلقه³⁴

It is the successors of the Messenger of Allah, that is, the twelve holy Shi'a Imams, who are the main doors reaching the presence of God. And if they were not, God, the Exalted, could not be recognized. And through them God, the Honorable and Exalted, argues with his slaves.

That is, they are the proofs of God, and their manners, attitudes, and actions are practiced by the people, and God will question His slaves through them.

The Words of Mullā 'Abd al-Razzāq and the Author of the Qur'anic Commentary of *Bayān al-Sa'āda* Concerning This Verse

In *Bayān al-Sa'āda*, it is said that the referring the affairs to Imam Bāqir is implication of the *wilāyat*:

أَنْ يَأْتِيَ الْأَمْرَ مِنْ وَجْهِ أَى الْأُمُورِ كَانَ.

Therefore, the verse means that we should perform our worldly duties and matters pertaining to the Hereafter individually and in their own proper way, just as every particular kind of work should be done by an expert in that particular field, and that learning how to execute such work requires practice and talent. It is the art of skillfully gaining knowledge, which must be studied and practiced in order to reach a higher level. In this way, knowledge of the Divine and suitable actions should be learned from its source.

The main matters in worldly affairs are what have been mentioned, and regarding matters of the Hereafter and knowledge of the Divine, the one who learns should obtain knowledge from the best instructor, and not only hear it from his father or simply through books and the Qur'an.

This is because in the narrations and certain Qur'anic verses, some who have said

إِنَّا وَجَدْنَا آبَاءَنَا عَلَى أُمَّةٍ وَإِنَّا عَلَى آثَارِهِم مُّسْلَمُونَ

"We found our forefathers following a community, and we are (also) directed to follow in their footsteps" have been reproached. Therefore, if one unhesitatingly learns from another without recognizing him as a learned man, such a one should be blamed or considered ignorant.³⁵

Mullā ‘Abd al-Razzāq in his commentary wrote that it is not right to enter into your hearts from behind, that is to say, to receive knowledge through the senses, since “behind the heart” means to receive from the body.

Goodness derives from the avoidance of those actions pertaining to the senses, illusion, and carnal desire. Therefore, it is correct to enter the house of the heart through the inner door, because the door to the heart is the one that opens to righteousness. So be aware of God, and avoid doing things that keep you away from His straight path, in the hope that by doing so, you may become victorious and succeed in life and the Hereafter.³⁶

In Burhān’s commentary, there are other narrations in addition to the two commentaries we mentioned from *Tafsīr al-Mizān*. One of these is from Muhammad Ibn Hasan Ṣaffār through his chains from Aswad Ibn Sa‘d, who said:

I was with Imam Bāqir, who said, without my having asked him anything:

نَحْنُ بُحْبُةُ اللَّهِ وَبَابُ اللَّهِ وَنَحْنُ لِسَانُ اللَّهِ وَنَحْنُ وَجْهُ اللَّهِ وَنَحْنُ عَيْنُ اللَّهِ وَنَحْنُ وَلَاةُ أَمْرِ اللَّهِ فِي
عِبَادِهِ

“We are the proof of God, we are with God, we are the tongue of God, and we are the attributes of God; we are the eyes of God, and we are the guardians of God’s affairs among His slaves and worshippers.”

There is also one from Ṭabarsī in *al-Ihtijāj*, which is quoted from Aṣḥab Ibn Nubātah, who said that he was sitting with Imam Ali when Ibn Kawwā entered and asked Imam Ali to interpret the meaning of God’s words (2:189):

لَيْسَ الْبِرُّ أَنْ تَتَوَلَّوْا الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا وَلَكِنَّ الْبِرَّ مَنْ اتَّقَى وَأَتَى الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا.

And the Imam said:

نَحْنُ الْبُيُوتُ الَّتِي أَمَرَ اللَّهُ بِهَا أَنْ تُتَوَقَّى مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا، نَحْنُ بَابُ اللَّهِ وَبُيُوتُهُ الَّتِي تُتَوَقَّى مِنْهَا، فَمَنْ بَايَعَنَا وَأَقَرَّ
بِوَلَايَتِنَا هَذَا الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا، وَمَنْ خَالَفَنَا وَفَضَّلَ عَلَيْنَا غَيْرَ تَهْذَأُ الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا.

.....And it is not righteous to enter houses through the back, but the righteous man wards off evil. So go to houses by their doors...

Imam Ali answered: “We are those doors through which God has commanded the people to enter. We are the doors that lead to God and must be entered. So whoever swears allegiance to us and accepts our guardianship surely enters the house through us. But he who

rejects us and chooses another [for his leader] instead of us, then he has entered the house from the back of the house.

The Existence of the Immaculate Imams Permits Entry to the House of the Messenger of God

Also among the narrations is one ‘Ayyāshī has from Sa‘d quoting Imam Bāqir, when Sa‘d asked him about the meaning of the verse

لَيْسَ الْبِرُّ أَنْ تَدْخُلُوا الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا وَلَكِنَّ الْبِرَّ مَنِ اتَّقَى وَأَتَى الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا.

And it is not righteous to enter houses through the back, but the righteous man wards off evil. So go to houses by their doors. The Imam answered:

أَلْ مُحَمَّدٌ أَبَوَابُ اللَّهِ، وَسُيْلُهُ، وَالْدُّعَاءُ إِلَى الْجَنَّةِ وَالْقَادَةُ إِلَيْهَا وَالْأَدْلَاءُ عَلَيْهَا إِلَى يَوْمِ الْقِيَمَةِ

“This is the very matter we already explained in *Majma‘ al-Bayān*.” And after explaining the second aspect of a narration that was also in *Majma‘ al-Bayān*, ‘Ayyāshī said:

And Sa‘id ibn Munkhal has related in a separate narration that

الْبُيُوتُ الْأَيْمَةُ وَالْأَبْوَابُ أَبْوَابُهَا.

The word

الْبُيُوتُ

means the Imams, and

أَبْوَابُهَا

refers to the doors of the houses.

After the two items from *Majma‘ al-Bayān*, he has also related from Shaykh Abū Ali Ṭabarsī, from the commentary of Ali Ibn Ib-rāhīm, that he said:

This verse has been sent down regarding the status of Imam Ali, because the Prophet said:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا وَلَا تَدْخُلُوا الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا.

“I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its gate, so do not enter houses other than through their main gates.”

Also among them is one from Sa‘d Ibn Abdullah, who narrated it through his records from Imam Bāqir, who said:

قَالَ: مَنْ أَتَى آلَ مُحَمَّدٍ أَتَى عَيْنًا صَافِيَةً تُجَرِّى بِعِلْمِ اللَّهِ لَيْسَ لَهَا تَقَادُّ وَلَا انْقِطَاعُ ذَلِكَ بِإِذْنِ اللَّهِ لَوْ شَاءَ
لِرَأَاهُمْ نَحْصَهُ حَتَّى يَأْتُوهُ مِنْ بَابِهِ وَلَكِنْ جَعَلَ آلَ مُحَمَّدٍ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ أَبْوَابَهُ الَّتِي يَدْخُلُ مِنْهَا
وَذَلِكَ قَوْلُهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ: لَيْسَ إِلَهِ إِلَّا أَنْتَ يَا أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ مَنْ خَلَّوْا النَّبِيَّ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا وَلَكِنَّ إِلَهِمُ إِلَهُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ وَآلِ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ مِنْ
أَبْوَابِهَا. ³⁸

Whoever comes to the Household of Muhammad has actually come to a pure spring through which God's knowledge runs. It is a spring to which there is no end. If God so wills, He causes His Holiness to appear to the creatures, so that they may enter through the gate of the Holy. Hence He has assigned the Household of the Messenger as gates to Him for people to enter through. This is what God, the Honorable and Exalted, meant when He said:

لَيْسَ إِلَهِ إِلَّا أَنْتَ يَا أَيُّهَا النَّبِيُّ

However, although there are some differences in the explanations, translations and commentaries on these narrations, there is no difference in the sense, and they all mean the same thing: that there is only one door through which to enter and reach what is sought. Therefore, any other way is unfruitful, and brings loss for the seeker of truth. One must enter one's house through the main door while wearing the garb for the hajj pilgrimage, and it is wrong to enter through an opening at the back of the house. Science and its derivatives, such as medicine, mathematics, astronomy, physics, chemistry, mining, agriculture, animal husbandry, building, and many other arts and skills must be learned from an expert in the field. One must refer to an expert in the skill one wants to learn in order to get the desired result. No one becomes an expert on his own. No one can form a piece of iron into a sharp dagger, nor can a confectioner become expert at his work, without serving as an apprentice for a while.

One must also refer to experts to learn the terminology of knowledge regarding jurisprudence, principles, narrations, awareness, humanity, Arabic grammar (which is one of 12 different language disciplines), as well as that relating to commentary, recitation, wisdom, philosophy, gnosis, and so forth. They are the particular gates for those skills, and without them one cannot learn a specific subject.

This is so with other skills, such as ethics, refinement, primary instruction, and practical wisdom. Mysticism must be learned from religious instructors and put into practice. Without these important teachers nothing can be obtained, and one goes astray and achieves nothing.

Follow not this course without Khidr as companion;
It is a dark course, so be afraid of getting lost.
Your sought-after want can blossom, but when
You attend to it—as the dawn breeze pats blossoms—
The Shepherd of the Secure Land comes to your aid,
When you, after some time, have been at His gate.³⁹

To acquaint oneself with faith, belief, goodness, beauty, practices, and laws, one must refer to the Messenger of God; and complete knowledge of Unity, mysticism, the Hereafter, the direction of one's belief, the means of receiving the angels' blessings, and all the knowledge of the Unseen must be learned from him. The Messenger is a door which opens to God, and the way that leads to Him and knowledge of Him.

To acquaint oneself with the interpretation of the minor rules and commands, the meaning of the sacred Book, questions of hatred, enmity, and difference, how to protect one's rights and those of society, safeguarding the affairs of this world and the next, receiving sustenance, improving religious knowledge, being under the guardianship of the Creator, and all other religious matters affecting this world and the next, one must refer to the Prophet and the Household. The Household is the gate that opens to the Creator and to His Messenger. If we do not enter through these gates, we are faced with great loss.

If we now compare the foregoing verse with this verse:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتَ النَّبِيِّ إِلَّا أَنْ يُدْخِلَكُمْ... (33:53)

(*O you who believe, do not enter the house of the Messenger without permission...*), it is understood that the Immaculate Imams are primarily those who permit entry to the Messenger's house. If they did not exist, there would be no means of getting in touch with the Messenger of God. However, they do exist and must be accessed, and their permission sought, to enter to the House of the Prophet, since without them it is impossible to reach him. The entire gate of the Messenger is greatness, the greatest morality, a connection to a higher level and the unseen world of the purest mysticism. It is the station of great intercession, wherein lies all knowledge from beginning to end. Without entering through this gate of certainty, the gate of permission, and the pure knowledge of the Messenger, there is no way. Those who have thought they could find another way have made a big mistake.

O Ali Murtaḍā, unveil the secret to me.
 O you, among the worthy luck [around us] you are the best luck.
 For you are the Gate to that City of Knowledge,
 And you are the rays of the patient sun.
 O Gate, remain open for those who search for you,
 So that through you they reach the main Gate;
 O Gate of Mercy, remain open for ever;
 O the Palace of the One, for there is no partner to Him.⁴⁰

Iṣbahānī says:⁴¹

وَلَهُ يَقُولُ مُحَمَّدٌ أَفْضَاكُمْ هَذَا وَأَعْلَمُ بِأَدْوَى الْأَذْهَانِ
 إِلَى مَدِينَةِ عِلْمِكُمْ وَأَنْبَى لَهُ بَابٌ وَثِيقُ الرُّكْنِ مِصْرَاعَانِ
 فَكُلُّ رَاغِبٍ إِلَى الْعِلْمِ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا كَأَنْ يَكُنَّ لَا يَدْخُلُ مِنْ سِوَاكَهَا⁴²

1. And of him Muhammad said: "Ali is the best and most skillful man in judgment among your nation, and he is your most learned and knowledgeable man, O you who possess knowledge.
2. Indeed, I am the City of Knowledge, and Ali is the gate to that city; such an inclusive door means he is reliable and can be trusted.
3. Therefore, you must enter through the main gate of knowledge, because no one enters a house over the wall!

A consensus agrees that the Prophet stated:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its gate, so whoever is searching for knowledge must enter through the main gate."

This narration has been recorded by Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal in eight chains, by Ibrāhīm Thaqaḥī in seven chains, by Ibn Baṭṭah in six chains, by Qāḍī Jaʿābī in five chains, by Ibn Shāhin in four chains, by Khaṭīb Tarīkhī in three chains by Yaḥyā Ibn Muʿīn in two chains, and by Samaʿānī, Qāḍī Mawirdī, Abū Maṣṣūr Sakrī, Abū Ṣalt Harawī, ʿAbd al-Razzāq, Sharīk, Ibn Abbās, Mujāhid, and Jābir.

The Reasoning of Ibn Shahr Āshūb Concerning "the City of Knowledge" with Respect to the Purity of the Imams

This hadith means that the Prophet has assigned Ali as the door of the city, and the city cannot be entered except through its gate. Then by his statement that the message-carrier of the city must enter through that door, and by the words

قَلِيَاتِ الْبَاب

he makes it incumbent upon all to enter the city through that door.

This hadith also refers to the chastity of Imam Ali. One who is not pure is liable to commit sin, and if that were to happen, it would be inappropriate to follow him. It is absolutely impossible that the Prophet could have been like that. Moreover, the narration demonstrates that he was the most learned of all the nation, and a good proof of this is that we know that the people had differences regarding various matters. Some of them would refer to another to solve their problems. However, Ali Ibn Abī Tālib was an exception, and he never referred to anyone else in order to ask a single question. The Messenger of God accepted him by saying: "Ali is the Imam and the Guardian," because receiving such knowledge and wisdom at the time of the Messenger and after he had passed away was not possible except by his leave. Also, the numerical value of the letters in "Ali Ibn Abī Tālib" is the same as in "the Gate of the City and Wisdom," the total of each being 218.⁴³

Bashnawī⁴⁴ says:

قَمَدِيْنَةُ الْعِلْمِ الَّتِي هُوَ بَابُهَا أَضْحَى قَسِيمَ الْكَارِ يَوْمَ مَاهِدِ 1
فَصَدُّوْهُ أَشَقَى الْبَرِيَّةِ فِي لُكْلَى وَوَلِيُّهُ السَّحْبُوبُ يَوْمَ حِجَابِهِ 452

1. So the City of Knowledge has Ali as its gate
Until the Day when the rightful sun will come into sight. He is the divider of the Fire [who will leave the Fire for the obstinate, but keep the friends away from it].
2. Therefore, his enemies are the wretched ones in Hell; but his friends are those who are most fortunate on the Day when Ali divides them.

Bashnawī also says:

يَا مُضَرِّفَ النَّصْرِ جَهْلًا عَنِ أَبِي حَسَنِ بَابَ الْمَدِيْنَةِ عَنْ ذِي الْجَهْلِ مَقْفُوْلٌ 1
مَدِيْنَةُ الْعِلْمِ نَاعِنٌ بِأَبِيهَا عَوْضُ لَطَالِبِ الْعِلْمِ إِذْ ذُو الْعِلْمِ تَسْؤُوْلُ 2
مَوْلَى الْأَثَامِ عَلَى وَالْوَلَى مَعَا كَمَا تَقْوَةُ عَنْ ذِي الْعَرْشِ جَبْرِيْلُ 346

1. O you, the ignorant, who are candidly trying to turn the caliphate away from Abū al-Hasan, Ali Ibn Abī Tālib! Let it be known that he is the Gate that is locked, barring the way for the ignorant.

2. When they want to question the learned about where they obtained their knowledge, there is one exception; there is only one way for the learned and knowledgeable to enter the City, and that is through the Gate, Ali—if they get their knowledge from elsewhere, then let them pass through there if they can.
3. The Master, the one in authority and the Guardian of all people, is only Ali, as worthy Gabriel told us from God, the Owner of the Throne.

Moreover, Ṣāhib Ibn Abbād says:

لَمَّا سَأَلَ النَّبِيَّ مَدِينَةَ مَوْثِقِهَا لَوَأْنَبَتِ الثُّغَابُ ذَاتَ الْمُرْسَلِ.⁴⁷

The Messenger was a City of which Ali was the Gate,
Against the enemies who assigned a messenger and believed in him.

He also says:

فَكَفَّ عَنْهُمْ فَاعْتَمَدُوا بَابَ الْمَدِينَةِ قُلْ هَٰذَا مِنْ سَأَلِهِ وَمَوْثِقُ رَسَلِ.⁴⁸

He said: "Then tell me who is the Gate of the knowledge of the Messenger?"

So I said: "It is he whom all people refer to in difficulty, to ask about their problems, although he did not ask anyone, or refer to anyone, about a single problem of his own."

Then he says:

بَابُ الْمَدِينَةِ لَا يَتَّبِعُوا سِوَاهُهَا فَتَدْخُلُوها فَعَلُوا جَابِئِ اللَّهِ.⁴⁹

Ali is the Gate of the Messenger's knowledge; you need not look for someone else to enter that City (for you would never enter, for that would be a different city). So stop wandering in the barren desert. If you follow someone other than Ali, he leads you to nowhere but ignorance in that vast, desolate land, and you end by perishing. Enter the City through its main Gate, so that you are delighted by the knowledge you receive.

And Sayyid Ismā'īl Ḥimyarī says:

مَنْ كَانَ بَابَ مَدِينَةِ الْعِلْمِ الَّذِي ذَكَرَ الْقُرْآنُ وَأَسْرَ الْأَهْلَاءِ.⁵⁰

"This one (Ali) is the Gate of the City of Knowledge, he who unveiled the outer and inner revelations of the Qur'an. However, God kept an important secret behind a screen, and He did not mention it (except through the Gate of the Messenger's knowledge—whether apparent or inward, as well as clarification of it)."

And Ibn Hammād says:

بَابُ الْإِلَهِيَّةِ إِلَى تَرْجِيْلِ أَحَدُ الْإِلَهِيَّةِ مِنَ تَابِيْلِ 51

"Ali is triumphant in coming to know God, meeting Him and the Paradise of God, the Honorable and Exalted; and no one will join God except through the Gate that is Ali."

Further he says:

هَذَا الْإِمَامُ لَكُمْ يَهْدِي بِتَدَكُّرٍ وَشَدَاوِيْسَكُمْ عَلَمًا وَأَدَبًا 1
إِنِّي مَدِينَةُ عِلْمِ اللَّهِ وَهُوَ لَهَا بَابُ قَمَرٍ وَأَمَّا فَلْيَقْصِدِ الْبَابَ 252

1. The Messenger said: "This is the Imam who, after me, is going to lead you to the path of perfection and stability, and who will make your footsteps stronger, and increase your wisdom and knowledge.
2. Indeed, I am the City of the Knowledge of God, and Ali is a Gate for that Knowledge; therefore, he who has decided to enter this City, he must enter it though this Gate."

Khaṭīb Manih̄ says:

أَنَا ذَا الْهَدْيِ وَالْإِلَهِيَّةِ فِيكُمْ وَهَذَا بَابُهَا لِلدَّخَالِ 1
أَطِيعُونِي بِطَاعَتِهِ وَكُونُوا بِحَبْلِ وَلَا يَمُوتُ مُتَمَسِكِينَ 253

1. The Messenger said: "I am the House of Guidance and Knowledge among you, and this Ali is the Gate through which to enter.
2. "By following him, you indeed follow me. And always cling to the rope that is he, and hold it fast."

Also, Khaṭīb Kāzārazm says:

إِنَّ النَّبِيَّ مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى الْهَادِي هَذَا الْبَابُ 54

"Verily, the Messenger is a City of Knowledge, and Ali is the guide and leader, a Gate to enter that City."

The Elegies of the Scholars Concerning the Imam Ali as the Gate to the City of Knowledge

Great scholars, both Shi'a and Sunni, such as Sayyid Hāshim Baḥrānī, Shaykh Ṣadūq, Shaykh Mufīd, Shaykh Ṭūsī, Ibn Asākar, Ibn Maghāzili, Ḥamū'ī, Khārāzmī, and many others, have related the narration of

أنا مدينة العلم

through their numerous chains from the Messenger of God. Baḥrānī has 16 Sunni narrations and 7 Shi'a narrations, some of which are included here.

From the *al-Manāqib* of the Shāfi'ī jurispudent Ibn Maghāzili and his recitation to Abū al-Hasan Ibn Muzaffar Ibn Ahmad Aḥṣar, and Abū al-Hasan's report on this recitation in the year 434, with his own chains from 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Nahbān, back to Jābir Ibn Abdullah Anṣārī, it has been narrated that:

أَعْتَدَ اللَّهُ الَّذِي صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَخُذِي عَلِيَّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ وَقَالَ: هَذَا أَمِيرُ الْبَرَّةِ، وَقَائِلُ الْكَفَرَةِ،
مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ، مَحْذُولٌ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ، ثُمَّ مَدَّ بِصَوْتِهِ، فَقَالَ: أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَتَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ
فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ⁵⁵

The Messenger of God held Ali by the arm and said: "This is the Emir of those who do good, the combatant of the unbelievers; may he who assists him be assisted by God, and he who humiliates him be humiliated by God!" Then he raised his voice and announced: "I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so he who desires to be with me must enter through this Gate."

And it has been narrated in the *al-Manāqib* by Ibn al-Maghāzili through the chains therein, that Jābir Ibn Abdullah Anṣārī said:

On the day of the Battle of Ḥudaybiyyah, I heard the Messenger of God state while he held Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib by the arm:

وَهُوَ أَعْدَى بَضْعٍ عَلَى بَنِي إِسْرَافِيلَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ وَقَالَ: هَذَا أَمِيرُ الْبَرَّةِ، وَقَائِلُ الْفَجْرَةِ، مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ،
مَحْذُولٌ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ، ثُمَّ مَدَّ بِصَوْتِهِ، فَقَالَ: أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَتَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ⁵⁶

We should consider how the Prophet introduces Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib in these two narrations as the Emir and Commander of those who do good, as it is said in the *al-Manāqib* of Ibn Shahr Āshūb:

Khaṭīb, in his *History*, which is the history of Baghdad, said on three different occasions that on the Day of Ḥudaybiyyah, the Messenger of God held Ali by the arm and said: "This is the Emir of those who do good, the combatant of the unbelievers. May he who assists him be assisted by God, and he who humiliates him be humiliated by God. Then he raised his voice..."

أَعِزُّدِ عَلِيٍّ وَقَالَ: هَذَا أَمِيرُ الْبِرَّةِ، وَقَاتِلُ الْكُفْرِ، مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ، وَمُخَذَّلُ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ، يَذِّبُهَا
صَوْتَهُ⁵⁷

However, Suyūṭī, Ibn Asākar, Amīr Sayyid Ali Hamedānī, Ibn Ḥajar Haythamī, and Mullā Ali Muttaqī Hindī have narrated it with the phrase

هَذَا إِمَامُ الْبِرَّةِ

Suyūṭī has also narrated it from Ḥākim in *al-Mustadrak*, quoting Jābir, as:

The Messenger of God stated:

عَلِيٌّ إِمَامُ الْبِرَّةِ، وَقَاتِلُ الْكُفْرِ، مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ، وَمُخَذَّلُ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ⁵⁸

"Ali is the Emir of those who do good, the combatant of disbelief; may he who assists him be assisted by God; and he who humiliates him be humiliated by God."

Also, Ibn Asākar has related from Jābir in *Tarikh al-Damishq* (*History of Damascus*) the following:

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: عَلِيٌّ إِمَامُ الْبِرَّةِ، وَقَاتِلُ الْكُفْرِ، مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ، وَمُخَذَّلُ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ⁵⁹

"The Messenger of God stated: 'Ali is the Imam of those who do good, and the combatant of the unbelievers, and the helper of those who help him; and he humiliates those who humiliate him.'"

Nevertheless, Mir Sayyid Ali Hamedānī has related in *Mawaddat al-Qurbā*, in chapter five, that Jābir said:

سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم يقول يوم الحديبية وهو أريد علي: هذا إمام الهدى، وقائل الكفرة، منصور من نصره، مخذول من خذله، يمد بها صوته.⁶⁰

However, Ibn Hajar in *al-Sawā'iq al-Muhriqah*, page 75 says:

Hākim has reported this through his chains from Jābir, but in the printed copies in volume 3, p. 129, Hākim has narrated this from Jābir with the phrase of "Amīr al-Barara" and he has considered it to be right. It might have been "Imam al-Barara" in the manuscript of Ibn Hajar and then been corrected when it was printed. It is the same in the annotation that has been written in bold: "May God bless him, he was Imam al-Barara." Also Dhahabī in *Talkhīṣ al-Mustadrak*, at the bottom of the page, has used the term "Imam al-Barara."⁶¹

On the Day of al-Ḥudaybiyyah, I heard the Messenger of God, while holding Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib by his arm, raise his voice and say: "This is the Imam of those who do good and the combatant of the unbelievers. May he who assists him be assisted by God, and he who humiliates him be humiliated by God."

And Ibn Maghāzili with three chains, and either Ḥamū'ī or Khārazmī with one chain from Abū Mu'āwiyah, have narrated back through A'mash and Mujādi that Ibn Abbās said:

قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم: أنا مدينة العلم وعلي بابها، فمن أراد العلم فليأت الباب.⁶²

"The Messenger of God stated: 'I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever desires knowledge, let him enter that very Gate.'"

And Ibn Maghāzili again, through a chain from Ali Ibn Omar, from his father, quotes Ḥudhayfah relating that Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib said:

قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم أنا مدينة العلم وعلي بابها، ولا تؤمنوا بها، ولا تؤمنوا إلا من أبوابها.⁶³

"The Messenger of God stated: 'I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so do not enter it except by the right Gate.'"

Ibn Maghāzili also, through his chain connected to the chains of Muhammad Ibn Abdullah Ibn Omar bin Muslim of Lāḥaqī Saffar in Basra, dated 244, has narrated that he said:

Abū al-Hasan Ali Ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā told us:

My father narrated to us from his father, Ja'far Ibn Muhammad, and he too from his father Muhammad Ibn Ali, from his father Ali Ibn

al-Husayn, and he also from his father Husayn Ibn Ali, and he too from his father Ali Ibn Abī Tālib, saying that the Prophet had stated:

يَا عَلِيُّ، أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا وَأَنْتَ الْبَابُ، كَتَبَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّهُ يَسِيلُ إِلَى الْمَدِينَةِ إِلَّا مِنْ الْبَابِ.⁶⁴

“O Ali! I am the City of Knowledge and you are the Gate of that City. And you are in that City. He lies who thinks he can enter the City without you.”

And in the first part of the book *Firdows*, it is narrated that Jābir Ibn Abdullah Anṣārī said:

كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ.⁶⁵

“The Messenger of God stated: ‘I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever desires for knowledge, let him enter the very Gate.’”

And it has been narrated in *al-Manāqib al-Fākhira fi al-‘Itrat al-Ṭōhira* from Mubarak Ibn Surūr, by means of his chain from Di‘bil Ibn Sa‘īd Ibn Ḥajjāj, that Ibn Abbās said:

The Messenger of God stated:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ. ثُمَّ قَالَ: يَا عَلِيُّ، أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَأَنْتَ الْبَابُ. كَتَبَ الَّذِي زَعَمَ أَنْ يَسِيلَ إِلَى الْمَدِينَةِ إِلَّا مِنْ الْبَابِ.⁶⁶

“I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever desires knowledge, let him enter the very Gate.” Then he said: “O Ali, I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate, so whoever wants to enter the City must enter it only through the Gate.”

And Ibn Shādhān, by omitting the chain, but through a Sunni chain of Sa‘īd Ibn Junādah, has narrated that he heard the Messenger of God say:

عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِيطَالٍ سَيِّدُ الْعَرَبِ قَالًا: أَنَا سَيِّدُ أَدَمَ وَعَلِيٌّ سَيِّدُ الْعَرَبِ. مَنْ أَحْبَبَهُ وَقَوْلَاهُ: أَحَبَّهُ اللَّهُ وَهَذَا، وَمَنْ أَبْغَضَهُ وَغَادَاهُ، أَصَمَّهُ اللَّهُ وَأَعْمَاهُ عَلَى حُلْمِهِ كَسَحَى، وَطَاعَتُهُ كَطَاعَتِي، غَيْرَ أَنَّهُ لَا يَنْبَغِي بَعْدِي. مَنْ فَارَقَهُ هَذَا فَارَقَنِي، وَمَنْ فَارَقَنِي فَارَقَ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى. أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَهِيَ الْجَنَّةُ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَكَيْفَ يَهْتَدِي الْمُهْتَدِي إِلَى الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا؟ عَلِيٌّ غَيْرُ الْبَشَرِ، مَنْ أَبَى هَذَا كَفَرَ.⁶⁷

Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib is the Master and Sayyid of all the Arabs. I am the Master and Sayyid of all the children of Adam, and Ali is the Master and Sayyid of all the Arabs. So whoever loves him and his guardianship, then God loves and guides him, but he who takes vengeance upon him and considers him an enemy, God will deafen and blind him. Ali's right is like my right, and obedience to him is obeying me, except that there is no messenger after me. He who separates from Ali, in truth separates from me, and whoever separates from me separates from God. I am the knowledge, and Paradise is that same City, and Ali is its Gate, which is wisdom. So how can one find a way to Paradise without entering this main Gate? Ali is the best of men, and whoever denies it has lost belief.

Shaykh Ṣadūq, Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Husayn Ibn Mūsā Ibn Bābwayh Qumī, has narrated in his *Amālī* through a chain from Sa'd Ibn Ṭarīf Kanānī, quoting Aṣbagh Ibn Nubātah, that Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib said to Imam Hasan: "O Hasan. Stand up and climb the pulpit, and then give a sermon in such a way that the Quraysh know of your status and are not negligent of you after me, because they will say: 'Hasan is lacking in the art of speaking.'"

Hasan said: "O father, the most dear. How can I climb the pulpit and speak while you are among the people? You see and hear what I say." Imam Ali said: "I will hide myself from you so that you do not see me, but I can hear what you say."

Imam Hasan climbed the pulpit, and began by effusively reciting praises to God and invoking peace and blessings upon the Prophet. He then said:

يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ سَمِعْتُ جَدِّي رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: إِنَّا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا وَهَلْ
تَدْخُلُ الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا؟

"O people, I heard my grandfather, the Messenger of God, say: 'I am the City of Knowledge, and Ali is its Gate.' Now, is it possible to enter a city except through the gate?"

He then climbed down from the pulpit. Ali rushed out from where he was hiding, held his arm and lifted it high, and rested his head on his chest. Then he told Husayn: "O my darling. Now climb the pulpit and make a speech, so that after my demise the Quraysh know of your status. Let them know that Husayn, the son of Ali, knows something good, but be careful that your words are not like those of your brother."

Imam Husayn climbed the pulpit and began by praising God and offering peace upon the Messenger of God and his descendants. Then he said:

مَتَايِرَ النَّاسِ سَمِعْتُ جَدِّي رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: إِنَّ عَلِيَّامَدِينَةً مُدَى، فَتَنْ
دَخَلَهَا نَجَّى وَتَمَنَّ عَمَّا هَلَكَ.

"O people! I heard my grandfather said: 'Indeed, Ali is a City of Guidance. So whoever enters that City will be saved, but whoever stays away perishes.'"

Ali rushed from his hiding place, held his arm and lifted it high, and showered kisses on his face. He then said:

مَتَايِرَ النَّاسِ اذْهَبُوا الْهَمَّافَرَّخَارَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَوَدَّيْتُهُ أَنِّي اسْتَوْدَعْتِيهَا وَأَنَا
اسْتَوْدَعُكُمْوَهَا، مَتَايِرَ النَّاسِ، وَرَسُولُ اللَّهِ سَائِلُكُمْ عَنْهُمَا.⁶⁸

"O kinsfolk! O people! Let it be known that these two dear ones are as the newborn chicks of the Messenger of God. They are entrusted to me by the Messenger of God, and now I am leaving them to you. O people, know that the Messenger of God will question you about them."

Both Shaykh Ṣadūq and Shaykh Mufid, by means of their chains from Ḥasan Ibn Rashīd, have narrated Imam Ṣādiq quoting his father from his grandfathers, saying that Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib stated:

كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ، يَاعِلِيَّ، أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَأَنْتَ بَابُهَا، وَهَلْ تُوَقَّى الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ
بَابِهَا.⁶⁹

"The Messenger of God said: 'O Ali! I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate. And can it be entered except through the main gate?'"

And Shaykh Ṭūsī in his *Amālī*, through chains related from 'Amr Ibn Shimr, back through Jābir, from Imam Bāqir, from Imam Sajjād, and from Imam Ḥusayn Ibn Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, has a version stating:

كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ، أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَهِيَ الْجَنَّةُ وَأَنْتَ يَاعِلِيَّ، بَابُهَا فَكَيْفَ يَهْتَدَى
إِلَى الْجَنَّةِ وَلَا يَهْتَدَى إِلَيْهَا إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا.⁷⁰

"The Messenger of God said: 'I am the City of Knowledge and he is the Garden; and O Ali, you are the gate thereof. So how can one enter the garden other than through its gate?'"

Also in his *Amālī*, Shaykh Ṭūsī gives a lengthy narration that is all about praise of Imam Ali, through chains related from 'Amr Ibn Shimr, back through Ja'far Ju'fī, from Imam Abū Ja'far Muhammad Ibn Ali al-Bāqir, and he too from Abdullah Anṣārī, quoting the Prophet. He then comes to a point where the Prophet states:

وَفَضَّلَنِي بِالرِّسَالَةِ وَفَضَّلَهُ بِالتَّلْيِغِ عَنِّي وَجَعَلَنِي مَدِينَةَ الْعِلْمِ وَجَعَلَهُ الْبَابَ، وَجَعَلَنِي خَازِنَ الْعِلْمِ وَجَعَلَهُ
الْمُقَبَّسَ مِنْهُ الْأَحْكَامَ وَخَصَّهُ بِالْوَصِيَّةِ⁷¹

“And then God honored me with the precedence of prophethood, and through me He honored Ali with precedence. He assigned me as His City of Knowledge, and Ali as its Gate; and He appointed me to be the treasurer of His knowledge, and made Ali the teacher of the laws and commands, and He assigned Ali as my successor.”

In his *Amāli*, Shaykh Ṭūsī has also narrated that:

A handful of people have narrated to me from Abū Mufaḍḍal, through his chain from ‘Amr Ibn Maymūn Audī, that when they mentioned the name of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib in his presence, he said: “Whoever speaks ill of Ali will, without doubt, be in the Fire of Hell!”

And certainly I heard some of the companions of the Prophet, such as Hudhayfat Ibn Yamān and Ka’b Ibn ‘Ujzah, saying that:

لَقَدْ أُعْطِيَ عَنِّي مَا لَمْ يُعْطَ بَشَرًا: هُوَ زَوْجُ فَاطِمَةَ سَيِّدَةِ نِسَاءِ الْأَوَّلِينَ وَالْآخِرِينَ. فَمَنْ رَأَى مِنْهَا، أَوْ
سَمِعَ أَنَّهَا تَزَوَّجَ بِمِثْلِهَا أَحَدًا فِي الْأَوَّلِينَ وَالْآخِرِينَ؟
وَهُوَ أَبُو الْحَسَنِ وَالْحُسَيْنَ سَيِّدَيِ شَبَابِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ مِنَ الْأَوَّلِينَ وَالْآخِرِينَ فَمَنْ رَأَى الْكَافِرَ مِنْهَا؟
وَرَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ، وَهُوَ وَصِي رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي أَهْلِهِ وَأَزْوَاجِهِ
وَسُدَّتِ الْأَبْوَابُ الَّتِي فِي الشَّجَرِ كُلِّهَا غَيْرَ بَابِهِ، وَهُوَ صَاحِبُ خَيْبَرٍ، وَصَاحِبُ الزَّيْلَةِ يَوْمَ خَيْبَرٍ، وَ
قَتَلَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي عَيْنَيْهِ، وَهُوَ أَرْبَعُونَ مِائَةً فَتَمَّ اشْتِكَامُ بَيْنِهِمْ وَلَا وَجَدَ
خَرًّا وَلَا قَرَأَةً يَوْمَ ذَلِكَ
وَهُوَ صَاحِبُ يَوْمِ غَدِيرِ خُمٍّ، إِذْ نَوَّهَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ بِأَمْرِهِ وَالزَّيْلَةُ لَأَيْتُهُ، وَ
عَرَفَهُمْ بِخَطَرِهِ، وَبَيَّنَّ لَهُمْ مَكَانَهُ، قَالَ أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ مَنْ أَوَّلَى بِكُمْ مِنْكُمْ بِأَنْفُسِكُمْ؟ قَالُوا: اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ
قَالَ: فَمَنْ كُنْتُ مَوْلَاهُ فَهَذَا عَلِيٌّ مَوْلَاهُ وَهُوَ صَاحِبُ النُّبَا وَمَنْ أَذْهَبَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ عَنْهُ الرَّجْسَ وَ
طَهَّرَهُ تَطْهِيرًا.

وَهُوَ صَاحِبُ طَائِفَةِ حِجِينَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: اللَّهُمَّ ابْنِي بِأَحَبِّ خَلْقِكَ إِلَيَّ وَ
إِلَى جَاءَ عَلِيٌّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ فَكُلَّ مَتَعَةٍ وَهُوَ صَاحِبُ سُوْرَةِ بَرَاءَةِ حِينَ نَزَلَ بِهَا جَبْرِئِيلُ عَلَيْهِ
السَّلَامُ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَقَدْ سَارَ أَبُو عَكْبَةَ الشُّوْرِي فَقَالَ لَهُ: يَا مُحَمَّدُ إِنَّهُ
لَا يَبْقَى إِلَّا أَنْتَ أَوْ عَلِيٌّ إِنَّهُ مِنْكَ وَأَنْتَ مِنْهُ فَكَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ مِنْهُ فِي حَيَاتِهِ وَتَمَدَّ وَقَاتَبَهُ وَهُوَ عَلِيمٌ

رَسُولِ اللَّهِ، وَمَنْ قَالَ لَهُ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ: أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا، فَتَرَى إِنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمُ قَلِيلًا
الْمَدِينَةَ مِنْ بَابِهَا كَمَا أَمَرَ اللَّهُ صَلَّاهُ: وَأَتُوا الثُّبُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا، وَهُوَ مُفَرِّجُ الْكَرْبِ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ
صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي الْحَزْبِ. وَهُوَ أَوَّلُ مَنْ آمَنَ بِرَسُولِ اللَّهِ وَصَدَّقَهُ وَاتَّبَعَهُ، وَهُوَ أَوَّلُ
مَنْ صَلَّى.

فَمَنْ أَكْبَرُ مِنْهُ عَلَى اللَّهِ وَعَلَى رَسُولِهِ مِنْ كَلِمَةٍ بِأَحَدٍ أَوْ شَيْءٍ بِهِ يَشْرُ.⁷²

Indeed, Ali has been honored with such things that no one has ever been given: he is the husband of Fāṭimah and Master of the entire world, of the past, the present, and the future. And who has seen anyone such as Fāṭimah? Or where is a man among all the people of the past and the future who witnesses or hears such a one who has married a woman like Fāṭimah?

He is the father of Hasan and Husayn, the two everlasting Masters of the youths in Paradise. O people, where can you find such as these two leaders and nobles? And the Messenger of God is his father-in-law, of whom he is the son-in-law, and he is the successor of the Messenger of God and the guardian of his children and wives.

And all the doors of the houses of the companions that opened to the mosque were shut, except the door of Ali's house. And he is owner of Khaybar, and the owner of the flag hoisted on the Day of Khaybar. And he is the one into whose eyes the Messenger of God rubbed saliva from his mouth when they were sore, and thereafter the pain stopped. From that time on, he never again felt the severe heat or bitter cold.

He is the main reason for Ghadīr Khumm, and the time when the Messenger of God repeated his name and announced his guardianship to all those who heard and those who were absent. He revealed his great task and mentioned his real status, and said: "O people, who among you feels his guardianship more?" They answered: "God and His Messenger." Then he said: "Therefore, whomsoever I have priority over concerning my guardianship, then Ali's guardianship also has priority over him."

And he is the owner of the robe, the Kasā' of Khaybar; and he is of them from whom God, the Honorable and Exalted, has removed all stain, and has led to the state of complete purity. And he the owner of that bird for which the Messenger of God implored God, saying: "O my Creator! Present to me Your best creature in the world," and at that moment Ali came to him and began eating of that bird.

And it is he who is the owner of the chapter of *Barā'a*, of which, when it was sent down to the Messenger of God by Gabriel, and which Abū Bakr had subsequently taken with him to Mecca, Gabriel said: "O Muhammad, other than you or Ali, no one should announce this chapter to the disbelieving people of Mecca, for Ali is with you and you also are with Ali." So the Messenger of God is with Ali, both in this life and the next.

And he is the knowledge of the Messenger of God, about whom the Messenger said: "I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate. So whoever seeks knowledge should enter by the gate of the city." Similarly, God, the Honorable and Exalted, has commanded: "Enter houses through their main gates." And he is the remover of sorrow from the Messenger in battle, and was the first to believe in the Messenger of God—he supported him and followed him. And he was the first man to establish the prayer.

Therefore, whose slander and accusations are harsher against God and His Messenger than the one who considers him to be equal to the common people?

Through his chains related from Sa'īd Ibn Jubayr, Shaykh Ṣadūq quotes Ibn Abbās as saying that the Messenger of God said to Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib:

يَا عَلِيُّ أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَأَنْتَ بَابُهَا وَلَنْ تُؤْتِيَ الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ قِبَلِ الْبَابِ. وَكَذَبَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّهُ
يُخْبِي وَيَتَضَلُّ إِلَّا تَكُ مَنِيَّ وَأَنَا مِنْكَ أَلْحَمَّكَ مِنْ نَحْيِي، وَذَمُّكَ مِنْ دِي، وَرَوْحُكَ مِنْ رَوْحِي،
وَسِرِّيَّتُكَ مِنْ سِرِّيَّتِي، وَعَلَانِيَتُكَ مِنْ عَلَانِيَتِي، وَأَنْتَ إِمَامُ أُمَّتِي، وَخَلِيفَتِي عَلَيْهَا بَعْدِي، سَعِدَ
مَنْ أَطَاعَكَ، وَشَقِيَ مَنْ عَصَاكَ وَرَجِمَ مَنْ تَوَلَّاكَ، وَخَسِرَ مَنْ عَادَاكَ، وَكَازَمَ مَنْ لَزِمَكَ، وَهَلَكَ مَنْ
كَارَكَ، وَمَثَلَكَ وَمَثَلَ الْإِيْمَةِ مِنْ وَلِيِّكَ بَعْدِي مَثَلُ سَفِينَةِ نُوحٍ، مَنْ رَكِبَهَا نَجَّى وَمَنْ تَخَلَّفَ عَنْهَا
غَرِقَ، وَمَثَلُكُمْ مَثَلُ النُّجُومِ كُلَّمَا غَابَ نَجْمٌ طَلَعَ بَيْنَهُمُ إِلَى يَوْمِ الْقِيَامَةِ⁷³

O Ali, I am the City of Wisdom and you are its Gate. Never can one enter the city except through its main gate. And he lies who thinks that he loves me but meanwhile hates you, because you are a part of me and I am a part of you. Your flesh is from my flesh, and your blood is of my blood. Your soul is part of my soul, and you are the Imam of my nation. And you will govern them after me. He who follows you is prosperous, and he who opposes you is wretched. Your companions will succeed, and he who avoids you will perish. Your example, and that of your offspring, is like the Ark of Noah, for he who takes refuge in it will be

rescued, but whoever does not will drown. And your example is as the stars in the sky, for when a star disappears, another will take its place until the Day of Resurrection.

And concerning the following verse:

وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا مِنْ قَبْلِكَ إِلَّا رِجَالًا نُوْحِي إِلَيْهِمْ فَاسْأَلُوا أَهْلَ الذِّكْرِ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ لَا تَعْلَمُونَ.⁷⁴

And We sent not (as Our messengers) before you other than men whom We inspired, so ask the followers of the Remembrance if you know not (16:43), Ḥakīm Ḥaskānī has narrated through his chains related from Ḥārith, that Ḥārith said to Ali:

وَاللّٰهُ إِنَّا نَحْنُ أَهْلُ الذِّكْرِ، نَحْنُ أَهْلُ الْعِلْمِ، وَمَنْ مَعِنُ التَّوْبِيلُ وَالتَّنْزِيلُ، وَلَقَدْ تَمَثَّلَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: إِنَّا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا فَتْرٌ إِنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمُ قَلْبًا تَبَّ مِنْ بَابِهِ.⁷⁵

"By God, we are but adherents of the Reminder. We are the followers of knowledge, and are inwardly and outwardly the treasurers of the Qur'an. And I assuredly say that I heard the Prophet say: 'I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever wants to gain knowledge must enter the city through its main gate.'"

Moreover, concerning the meaning of the verse

وَعَلَّمَ آدَمَ الْأَسْمَاءَ كُلَّهَا

And He taught Adam all the names...(2:31)

Ḥakīm Ḥaskānī has narrated through his chains from Muhammad Ibn 'Abd al-Rahmān Shāmī, back from Abū Ṣalt Harawī, from Abū Mu'āwīyah, from A'mash, quoted Mujāhid and Ibn Abbās as saying that the Prophet said:

إِنَّا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا فَتْرٌ إِنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمُ قَلْبًا تَبَّ الْبَابُ.⁷⁶

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever seeks after knowledge should enter it through the main gate."

Ḥaskānī then says: "Some have reported this narration from Aba Ṣalt, whose name was 'Abd al-Salām Ṣāliḥ Harawī, and whom Yaḥyā Ibn Mu'īn has praised and said was a trustworthy man."

In addition to Aba Ṣalt, others have reported this narration from Abū Mu'āwīyah, who was blind, and whose name was Muhammad Ibn Khāzim. Apart from him, it is quite likely that Abū Abid Qāsim Ibn Salām, Muhammad Ibn Ṭufayl, Ahmad Ibn Khālid Mūsā, Ahmad Ibn Abdullah Ibn Ḥakīm Omar Ibn Ismā'īl, Hārūn Ibn Ḥātām, Muhammad Ibn Ja'far Fīdī, and certain others have also recounted this narration.

Moreover, according to Abū Mu‘āwiyah’s information from Sulaymān Ibn Mahrān A‘mash, a certain group that includes the likes of Ya‘lī Ibn ‘Ubayd, ‘Isā Ibn Yūnus, and Sa‘d Ibn ‘Aqabat has also related it in connection with the Prophet.

It also appears in reliable authentic chains from Sharīk and Salamah Ibn Kuhayl quoting Ṣanābijī from Imam Ali, in one of which the Messenger of God states:

أَنَا دَارُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِهَا مِنْ بَابِهَا.⁷⁷

“I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, and whoever wants to gain knowledge must enter through him.”

Ṣanābijī has said:

وَكُنْتُ أَسْمَعُ عَلِيًّا كَبِيرًا يَقُولُ: إِنَّ مَائِينَ أَضْلَاعِي هَذِهِ لِعِلْمٍ كَبِيرٍ.⁷⁸

“And time and again I heard Ali say: “There is a large amount of knowledge within these bones of my chest.”

This comes directly from Ibn Fars (although a few have narrated it from Sharik), who narrates it from Abdullah Ibn Mas‘ūd, Abdullah Ibn Omar, ‘Aqabat Ibn ‘Āmir Jahnū, Abūdhar Ghaffārī, Anas, Salmān, and certain others.⁷⁹

Moreover, Ḥakīm Ḥaskānī has narrated it in a commentary on the verse

وَتَعْبَهُ الْأُذُنُ وَإِعْيَةٍ

...and that attentive ears might remember [this admonition] (69:12).

In this document he has narrated Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib as saying that the Prophet told him:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ أَمَرَنِي أَنْ أَذْنِيكَ وَلَا أَفْصِيكَ، وَأَعْلَمَكَ قَسَمِي، وَأَنْتَرَكْتَ عَلَيَّ هَذِهِ الْأَمَةُ: وَتَعْبَهُ الْأُذُنُ وَإِعْيَةٍ قَالَتْ
[الْأُذُنُ] [وَالْوَاعِيَةُ لِعِلْمِي، يَا عَلِيٌّ وَأَنَا الْمَدِينَةُ وَأَنْتَ الْبَابُ وَلَا يَدْخُلُ الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا].⁸⁰

God, the Honorable and Exalted, has told me to bring you closer and not keep you afar, and to instruct you in learning. And this verse was also revealed to me:

وَتَعْبَهُ الْأُذُنُ وَإِعْيَةٍ

(...and that attentive ears might remember). So know, O Ali, that I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate, and no one enters the city but through its main gate.

Shi'a and Sunni Narrations Concerning Narrations of

المعلو على بابها انا مدينه

The reader should be aware that the narrations mentioned so far are those in which the Prophet introduces himself as the City of Knowledge and Ali as its Gate. There have also been many Shi'a and Sunni narrations where the Prophet has introduced himself as the City of Paradise with Ali as its Gate. And there are many Sunni narrations such as

انا دار الحكمة وعلى بابها

"I am the House of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate,"

انا مدينة الحكمة وعلى بابها

"I am the City of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate,"

انا دار الحكمة وعلى مفتاحها

"I am the House of Wisdom and Ali is its Key."

These narrations appear in the books of known scholars, some of which we will mention.

In the *Ghāyat al-Marām*, there are three records concerning the narration of

انا مدينة الجنة وعلى بابها

one Sunni and two Shi'a. The Sunni version is in the *al-Manāqib* of Ibn Maghāzili Shāfi'i, by means of his chains from Sa'īd Ibn Jābir, quoting Abdullah Ibn Abbās as saying that the Prophet said:

انا مدينة وعلى بابها فمن اراد الجنة فليأتها من بابها.⁸¹

"I am the Town in Paradise and Ali is its Gate, so whoever desires to enter it, he must enter through its main gate."

Among the Sunnis there is first of all Shaykh Tūsī, who, by means of his chains in his *Amālī*, has narrated it from Sa'īd Ibn Jābir in exactly the same way, quoting Ibn Abbās.⁸²

The second is also from the Shaykh in *Amālī*, through his chains from Aṣbagh Ibn Nubātah, quoting Imam Ali as saying that the Prophet said:

انا مدينة الجنة وانت بابها

"I am the City of Knowledge, and you are its Gate" and

يا علي اكذب من زعم انه يدخلها من غير بابها.⁸³

"I am the City of Paradise and you are its Gate. O Ali, he lies who says he can enter the city through any other door but you."

Concerning the narration of

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَذَاكَ الْبَابُ الْحَكِيمُ

there are four narrations by the Sunnis and five by the Shi'a. The first one from the Sunnis is that of Ibn Maghāzili, who has narrated it by means of his chains from A'mash, back to Mujāhid, who said that Ibn Abbās related that the Messenger of God stated:

أَنَا ذَا الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْحِكْمَةَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ.⁸⁴

"Indeed, I am the House of Wisdom and Ali is the Gate thereof, so whoever is searching for wisdom must enter through the right gate."

The second one is from the *Manāqib al-Ṣaḥāba* of Sama'ānī, who has narrated that Ali said:

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: أَنَا الْحِكْمَةُ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا.⁸⁵

The third is from Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad Ḥamūṭī by means of his chains from Sharīk, quoting Salamat Ibn Kumayl Sanā'ī as saying that the Prophet said:

أَنَا الْحِكْمَةُ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا.

"I am Wisdom and Ali is its Gate."⁸⁶

The fourth one is from Ibn Maghāzili by means of his chains from Sharīk, quoting Salamat Ibn Kuhayl Ṣālihi,⁸⁷ quoting Imam Ali as saying that the Prophet said:

أَنَا ذَا الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْحِكْمَةَ فَلْيَأْتِهَا مِنْ بَابِهَا.⁸⁸

"I am the House of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate, so whoever seeks wisdom must enter the house through the main gate."

It has been narrated by the Sunni Ibn Bābwayh through his chains from Sa'īd Ibn Jubayr, that Ibn Abbās related that the Prophet said:

يَا عَلِيُّ أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَأَنْتَ بَابُهَا وَأَنْ تُوَفِّي الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ قَبْلِ الْبَابِ.⁸⁹

"O Ali, I am the City of Wisdom and you are its Gate, and no one enters the city except through the main gate."

Imam Abū Ja'far has narrated that both his father and grandfather Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib said that the Prophet said:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَهِيَ الْجَنَّةُ وَأَنْتَ يَا عَلِيُّ بَابُهَا فَكَيْفَ يَهْتَدِي الْمُهْتَدِي إِلَى الْجَنَّةِ وَلَا يَهْتَدِي إِلَيْهَا إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا.⁹⁰

"I am the City of Knowledge that is Paradise, and O Ali, you are the Gate for that city. So how can a searcher enter the city without you, the main gate?"

The other is from Ibn Bābwayh through his chain from Abdullah Ibn Faḍl Hashemi, quoting Imam Ṣādiq from his father to his great-grandfathers saying that the Prophet said:

يَوْمَ تَهْدِيهِمْ نَحْمُ الْفَضْلُ أَهْيَا أُمَّتِي، وَهُوَ الْيَوْمُ الَّذِي أَمَرَني اللَّهُ تَعَالَى ذِكْرُهُ فِيهِ يَنْصَبُ أَمِيٌّ عَلَى بَنِي أَبِي طَالِبٍ عِلْمًا لِأُمَّتِي، يَهْتَدُونَ بِهِ مِنْ تَهْدِي، وَهُوَ الْيَوْمُ الَّذِي اكْتَمَلَ فِيهِ الدِّينُ وَأَتَمَّ عَلَى أُمَّتِي فِيهِ الْقِسْمَةُ وَرَضِيَ لَكُمْ الْإِسْلَامَ دِينًا. ثُمَّ قَالَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ مَتَاسِيرَ النَّاسِ، أَتَامِينَ عَلَى وَعَلِيٍّ مِثْلِي، غُلَقِي مِنْ طِلْقِي، وَهُوَ أَمَامُ الْخَلْقِ تَهْدِي، يَتَّبِعُونَ لَمْ يَخْتَلَفُوا فِيهِ مِنْ سُنَّتِي، وَهُوَ أَمِينُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، وَ قَائِدُ الْفِرَاقِ الْحَقْلِيِّينَ، وَغُصْبُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، وَغَيْبُ الْوَصِيِّينَ، وَزَوْجُ سَيِّدِنَا الْعَالَمِينَ، وَأَمِيرُ الْأُمَمِ الْمُتَهِدِّينَ.

مَتَاسِيرَ النَّاسِ مَنْ أَحَبَّ عَلِيًّا أَحَبَّ بَيْتَهُ، وَمَنْ أَبْغَضَ عَلِيًّا أَبْغَضَ بَيْتَهُ، وَمَنْ وَصَلَ عَلِيًّا وَصَلَتْهُ، وَمَنْ قَطَعَ عَلِيًّا قَطَعَتْهُ، وَمَنْ جَنَى عَلِيًّا جَفَوَتْهُ، وَمَنْ وَالَى عَلِيًّا وَالَيْتُهُ، وَمَنْ عَادَى عَلِيًّا عَادَيْتُهُ، مَتَاسِيرَ النَّاسِ أَتَامَتِ بَيْتُهُ الْحِكْمَةُ وَعَلِيٌّ بَنِي أَبِي طَالِبٍ بَابُهَا، وَلَنْ تَوَقَّى الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ قَبْلِ الْبَابِ، وَكَذَبَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّهُ يَمِيزُنِي وَيَنْصُبُ عَلِيًّا مَتَاسِيرَ النَّاسِ، وَالَّذِي يَتَّقِي الْبُتُوءَةَ، وَاصْطَفَانِي عَلَى جَمِيعِ الْأُمَّةِ مَا تَسَبَّهَتْ عَلِيًّا عِلْمًا لِأُمَّتِي فِي الْأَرْضِ حَتَّى لَوْ أَنَّ بَنِيهِ فِي سَمَوَاتِهِ، وَأَوْجَبَ وَلَايَتُهُ عَلَى جَمِيعِ مَلَايِكَتِهِ.⁹¹

The Day of Ghadīr Khumm is the best festival for my nation. It is a day when God, the Honorable and Exalted, commanded me to introduce my brother, Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, as an exemplary person and assign him as the leader and the Imam of the nation, so that through him, after me, the people are guided to the straight path of Islam. It is the occasion of the day when God perfected His religion, and He was satisfied that Islam was to become the foremost religion of the people.

O you the people! I am from Ali and Ali is from me; he has been created from my essence, and after me, he is the Imam and leader for all creatures in the world. He will clarify facts for those who differ in my tradition and will manifest everything for them.

And he is the Commander of the Believers; and the leader of the bright-faced ones whose constant ablutions make their faces, hands, and feet shine on the Day of Resurrection. And he is the sultan and chief of the

pious, and the best successor among the successors of prophethood. He is the husband of the best of all women in the world, the father of the Imams, and the pioneer of the righteous.

O you the people! Whoever loves Ali, then I love him; and he who hates Ali, then I will hate him. And whoever joins Ali, I will join him, and he who departs from Ali, I will depart from him. And he who oppresses Ali has in reality oppressed me. And the one who accepts the guardianship of Ali, I will take responsibility as his guardian. He who becomes the enemy of Ali, I will become his enemy.

O you the people! I am the City of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate, and never can one enter the city except by its main gate. And he lies who says he loves me but in the meantime hates Ali.

O you the people! By Him Who assigned me as a messenger among all the nation, I did not choose Ali as successor and Imam, but his Creator had already raised his name as the successor in the Heavens, and introduced him and made his guardianship known to all the angels.

Another narration is from Ibn Bābwayh, who reports through his chain from Zayd Ibn Mundhar, quoting Abū Ja'far al-Bāqir as saying:

I heard Jābir Ibn Abdullah Anṣārī saying that the Prophet was once at the house of Umm Ibrāhīm, and there were some companions in the presence of the Messenger at the time, when they saw Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib come.

As the Messenger of God caught sight of him in the distance, he said:

يَا مَعْشَرَ النَّاسِ أَقْبِلْ إِلَيْكُمْ خَيْرُ النَّاسِ بَدَىٰ، وَهُوَ مَوْلَاكُمْ، طَاعَتُهُ مَقْرُوءَةٌ كَطَاعَتِي،
وَمَعْصِيَتُهُ مُرْتَبَةٌ كَمَعْصِيَتِي.
مَعَاشِرَ النَّاسِ إِنَّا ذَاكَ الْحِكْمَةُ وَعَلَىٰ مِفْتَاحِهَا وَنَ يَوْصَلُ إِلَى الدَّارِ الْأَلْفِ مِفْتَاحٍ، وَكَذَبَ مَنْ
رَعَمَ أَنَّهُ يُحِبُّنِي وَيَتَّبِعُنِي عَلَيَّا.⁹²

O you, the communities of the people, now the best man who comes after me appears in front of you. He is going to have authority over you. Obeying him is necessary, for it is to obey me; and disobeying him is unlawful, for it is to disobey me.

O you, the communities of the people, I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, and no one can enter the city except by means of its key; and he lies who says he loves me but hates Ali.

There is another narration from Shaykh Ṭūsī in *Amāli*, through his chains from Abdur Raḥmān Ibn Nahmān, quoting Jābir Ibn Abdullah Anṣārī as saying:

أَخْبَأَيْدِ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ وَهُوَ يَقُولُ:
هَذَا أَمِيرُ الْبَرَّةِ، وَقَاتِلُ الْفَجْرَةِ، مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ صَرَّهُ، مَخْدُولٌ مَنْ خَدَّلَهُ، ثُمَّ رَفَعَ بِهَا صَوْتَهُ، وَقَالَ: أَنَا
مَدِينَةُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا، فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْحِكْمَةَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ⁹³

I saw the Messenger of God, and as he held Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib by the arm, he said: "This is the Emir and Commander of the Righteous, and the combatant of oppressors. He will be helped who helps him, and he will be humiliated who humiliates him." Then he raised his voice and said: "I am the City of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate, so whoever is searching for knowledge must enter through this gate."

The next example contains scattered phrases spoken by the Prophet, such as:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْفَقْهِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا

"I am the City of Jurisprudence and Ali is its Gate."

After Sibṭ Juzī explains the narration of

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا

there is one from Ahmad Ḥanbal in *al-Faḍāʾil* that says:⁹⁴

أَنَا ذَا الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا.

"I am the City of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate."

It has been narrated separately as:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْفَقْهِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ

"I am the City of Jurisprudence and Ali is its Gate, and whoever wants to enter the city must pass through him."

⁹⁴Abd al-Razzāq has the second part of this as

فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْحِكْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ

"So, whoever desires for Wisdom must enter through the Gate."

Suyūṭī explains it through the foregoing chains up to Ibn Baṭṭah, and then says: "For us, it was narrated through Muhammad Ibn Qāsim Naḥwi from Abdullah Ibn Nājiya, quoting Abū Maṣṣūr Ibn Shujāʿ." He then quotes ʿAbd al-Ḥamid Ibn Baḥr Baṣārī from Sharīk,

back through Salmat Ibn Kuhayl, from Sanābijī, quoting Ali Ibn Abī Tālib as saying that the Prophet said:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate."

There is also one from Hasan Ibn Ali narrating his father as saying that the Prophet said:⁹⁵

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ

"I am the City of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate, so whoever is searching for knowledge must enter through this door."

Suyūṭī also says that Daylamī said:

My father informed me from Maydānī, quoting Abū Muhammad Ḥallāj, Abū al-Faḍl Muhammad Ibn Abdullah, Ahmad Ibn 'Ubayd Thaqafi, and Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Khalaf Aṭṭar, from Mūsā Ibn Ja'far Ibn Ibrahim Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Abdullah Ibn Ja'far Ibn Abī Tālib, quoting 'Abd al-Muḥaymin Abbās, from his father, and he, too, from his great-grandfather Sahl Ibn Sa'd, quoting Abūdhār saying that the Prophet said:

عَلِيٌّ بَابٌ عَلِيمٌ وَمَنْ يَنْتَبِهُ لِمَا أُرْسِلْتُ بِهِ مِنْ بَعْدِي حُبٌّ إِيمَانٌ وَنُصْرَةٌ نَقَاطٌ وَالْقَطْرُ إِلَى الْدَرِّ رَأْفَةٌ

"Ali is the Gate of the City of my Knowledge, and after me, it is he who is going to explain to my nation whatever has been sent down to me. Affection towards him is a sign of belief, and hatred towards him is a sign of rancor; so turning to him is affection to him."

There are no differences between the Shi'a and the Sunni narrations of

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا

The Shi'a have narrated it in their reliable and authentic books from the Prophet, and considered it a most useful narration, having without doubt connected it to the Prophet.

In so far as the Sunnis are concerned, the relationship of this narration to the Prophet is beyond dispute. Indeed, the late Mir Sayyid Ḥamid Husayn Mūsawī Nishābūrī Lak-hanuwī (d. 1306 AH) discusses this venerable narration in volume 5 of his *'Aqabat al-Anwār*, where he has narrated it according to the chains of the Sunnis as well.

And closer to our time, Sayyid Ahmad Ibn Hasani wrote a separate book on the subject, namely the *Fath al-Malik al-Ali*. The late 'Allamah Shaykh 'Abd al-Husayn Amīnī has assigned three volumes of *al-Ghadr* to the subject.⁹⁷ These two great men covered all the details and explained important points in *'Aqabat al-Anwār* and it is

hoped that their efforts in writing these books are accepted by God, for their services are most valuable for the religion, and their books in Arabic are especially praiseworthy.

In *al-Ghadir*, among other things, the author discusses the beautiful elegy *Ghadiriyyah*, composed by Shams al-Dīn Mālikī,⁹⁸ in which he writes about the boundless knowledge and wisdom of Imam Ali, and makes a comparison with Omar. His book is called *Nawādir al-Athar fi ‘Ilmī Omar*, and he makes it clear that Imam Ali possesses unsurpassed knowledge and wisdom, and that other people lack that of which they boast and are totally ignorant, since they all have to refer to Ali in their need.

In his elegy, Shams al-Dīn Mālikī writes concerning the narration:

وَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ: إِنِّي مَدِينَةٌ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ وَهُوَ الْبَابُ وَالْبَابُ فَاقْصِدِ
وَمَنْ كُنْتَ مَوْلَاهُ عَلَيَّ وَلِيهِ وَمَوْلَاكَ فَاقْصِدْ حُبَّ مَوْلَاكَ تَرْشِدُ
وَإِنَّكَ مِنِّي خَالٍ أَمِنْ نُبُوَّةِ كَهْرُونَ مِنْ مُوسَى وَحَبْلِكَ فَاحْمَدِ⁹⁹

1. And the Messenger of God said: "I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so your main aim must be moving towards that gate.
2. "And of whomsoever I am Master, this Ali is his Master; therefore your only aim must be to think of your Master.
3. "And, O Ali, your relation to me is as the relation of Aaron to Moses, only there is no messenger [after me]; and this is enough for you to have such a position; therefore praise Him."

He has then said: "Among the Sunni scholars, Ṭabarī, Ibn Mu‘īn, Ḥakīm, Khaṭīb, and Suyūṭī have supported this narration." He then mentions the names of 143 Sunni shaykhs who have discussed this narration in their books and with their religious students.

Sunni Shaykhs Who Have Recounted the Narration of

أنا مدينة العلم وعلي بابها.

We now intend to briefly review some of them. One of them is Ḥāfiz Abū Bakr Abdual-Razzāq Ibn Hamām Ṣan‘ānī, who passed away in 211 AH, and about whom Ḥākīm has written in his *Mustadrak*, vol. 3, p. 127.

Another is Ḥāfiz Ibn Yaḥyā Ibn Mu‘īn (d. 233 AH) and also recorded in the *Mustadrak*.

There is also Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Ja'far Fīdī (d. 236 AH), whom Yaḥyā Ibn Mu'īn has written about.

The next is Abū Muhammad Suwayd Ibn Sa'īd Harawī (d. 240 AH), and was one of the shaykhs of Muslim and Ibn Mājih, of whom Ibn Kathīr has written in his *History*, vol. 7, p. 358.

Another is the Imam of Ḥanābilah, Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal (d. 241 AH), of whom it is written in *al-Manāqib*.

Also Abād Ibn Ya'qūb Rawājirī, who is one of the shaykhs of Bukhārī, Tirmidhī, and Ibn Mājih, about whom Ḥāfiz Ganjī Shāfi'ī has written in his *Kifāyat al-Ṭālib*.

Then Abū 'Isā Muhammad Tirmidhī (d. 279 AH), who mentions it in the *Jāmi' al-Ṣaḥīḥ*

There is also Ḥāfiz Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn Omar Baṣrī, the author of *Musnad Kabīr* (d. 292 AH).

Also Ḥāfiz Abū Ja'far Muhammad Ibn Jarīr Ṭabarī (d. 310 AH) has written about it, and most scholars have referenced his book *Tahdhīb al-Āthār*.

And among them is Abū Bakr Muhammad Ibn Omar Ibn Muhammad Tamīmī Baghdadi Ibn Ju'ābī (d. 355 AH) and as he tells us in the *al-Manāqib* of Ibn Shahr Āshūb, vol. 1, p. 261, he has extracted this narration from five different sources.

And Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān Ibn Ahmad Ṭabarānī (d. 1360 AH), who extracted the narration from *Mu'jam al-Kabīr* and *Mu'jam al-Ausaṭ*.

And Ḥāfiz Abū Abdullah Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ḥākim Nīshābūrī (d. 405 AH), who has the narration in the *Mustadrak*.

Ḥāfiz 'Ubaydallah Ibn Muhammad, known as Ibn Baṭṭah 'Ukbarī (d. 387 AH) explains the narration in six ways.

Ḥāfiz Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn Ali Khaṭīb Baghdadi (d. 463 AH) has it in his book *al-Muttafiq wa al-Mutafariq*¹⁰⁰ and the *Tārikh al-Baghdād*, vol. 2, p. 377, vol. 4, p. 348, vol. 7, p. 173, and vol. 11, p. 204.

Ḥāfiz Abū Omar and Yūsuf Ibn Abdullah Ibn 'Abd al-Birr (d. 463 AH) has written about it in *al-Istī'āb*, vol. 2, p. 461.

The jurisprudent Abū al-Hasan Ali Ibn Maghāzilī (d. 483 AH) has mentioned seven versions in his *al-Manāqib*.

Ḥāfiz Abū Muhammad Hasan Ibn Ahmad Samarqandī (d. 491 AH) has it in his *Baḥr al-Asānīd fī Ṣaḥīḥ al-Asānīd* and as Dhahabī has explained in his *Tadhkirah*, vol. 4, p. 28, this narration has been authorized by him.

Abū al-Qāsim Zamakhsharī (d. 538 AH) has it in the *Fā'iq*, vol. 1, p. 28, under the title *Madīnat al-'Ilm*.

Abū Saʿīd Abduḥ al-Karīm Ibn Maṣṣūr Tamīmī Samʿānī (d. 562 AH) has it in his *Ansāb al-Ashrāf*, which was given this title in reference to certain well-known scholars who were killed as martyrs, the first of whom was the son of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, and going on to describe others. The book points out that the Gate of the City of Knowledge narration is one that has been memorized by scholars.

Ḥāfiz Akḥṭab Khārazm Abū al-Muʾayyid Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Makki Ḥanafī (d. 568 AH) has it in his *al-Manāqib*, p. 49, as well as in the *Maqṭal al-Imam al-Sabʿ*, vol. 1, p. 43.

Ḥāfiz Abū al-Qāsim Ali Ibn Hasan, known as Ibn Asākar Damishqī (d. 571 AH), has narrated several versions.

Abū al-Saʿadat Mubarak Ibn Muhammad Ibn Athīr Jazarī Shāfiʿī (d. 606 AH) has it in the *Jāmiʿ al-Uṣūl*, quoting Tirmidhī.

Ḥāfiz Abū al-Hasan Ali Ibn Muhammad Ibn Athīr Jazarī (d. 630 AH) has it in the *Uṣd al-Ghābah*, vol. 4, p. 22.

Muḥy al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn al-Arabī Andulusī (d. 638 AH), according to the *Yanābiʿ al-Mawaddah*, p. 419, has it in *al-Durr al-Maknūn wa al-Jawhar al-Maṣūn*.

Ḥāfiz Muḥibb al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Mahmud Ibn Najjār Baghdādī (d. 643 AH) has it towards the end of the *Tārikh al-Baghdad*.

Abū Salīm Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa Shāfiʿī (d. 652 AH) has similarly described it in the *Yanābiʿ al-Mawaddah*, p. 65, in the *Maṭālib al-Saʾūl*, p. 22, and in *al-Durr al-Munazzam*.

Shams al-Dīn Abū al-Muzaffar Yūsuf Ibn Quzūghlī Ḥanafī (known as Sibṭ Ibn Juzī) (d. 654 AH) has it in his *Tadhkirat al-Khawāṣṣ*, p. 29.

Ḥāfiz Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Yūsuf Ganjī Shāfiʿī (d. 658 AH) has various forms of it in his *al-Kifāya*, pp. 98–102. He says in this regard that it is really the best of narrations and is highly appreciated. After explaining various aspects of it, he writes: "Regarding this narration, the scholars among the Sunnis and their followers, as well as the Household of the Messenger of God, agree about the manifold knowledge of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, his intellect, his abundant wisdom, and his fine judgment and just decisions."

Abū Bakr, Omar, Othman, and other scholars among the companions used to consult Ali about their problems, and ask for his opinion and solutions for difficulties in their daily affairs. They unanimously accepted his great knowledge, his virtue, and his wisdom and right judgment, and this was why they would refer to him.

Therefore, the narration

أَتَعْبُدُونَ الْعِلْمَ وَعَلَىٰ بَابِهَا

does not exaggerate his knowledge and position, since his status is high in the sight of God, the Prophet, the worshipers of God, and high-ranking people.

Continuing with those who mentioned the narration, there is also Ḥāfiz Muḥibb al-Dīn Ahmad Ibn Abdullah Ṭabarī Shāfiʿī Makkī (d. 694 AH), who has it in his *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 1, p. 192, and in *Dhakhāʾir al-ʿUqbā*, p. 177.

Saʿīd al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Faraghānī (d. 699 AH), concerning the exposition of the Arabic elegy *Tāʾiyah* by Ibn Farīd,¹⁰¹ explains:

كَرَاهَاتُهُمْ مِنْ بَعْضِ مَا خَصَّ بِهِمْ بِمَا خَصَّ مِنْ أَزْوَاجِ كُلِّ قَبِيلَةٍ

"[Concerning] the generosity of the Household, some examples are what God has specified for them, because of the very condition that whatever priorities the Messenger of God had, have been passed to the Household as a heritage."

He then mentions the narration of

أَلَا عَيْنَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا

And in his Fārsī explanation of the elegy of Ibn Farīd, he says:

وَأَوْضَحَ بِاللُّغَةِ نَكَاحَ مُشْكَلٍ عَلَى، يَعْلَمُ تَالَهُ بِالْوَحِيدِ

"And Ali, because of the knowledge he was given by the Messenger of God for his successorship, made understanding the meaning of the Qur'an easier."

And Shaykh al-Islam Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad Ḥamuʿī Juwaynī (d. 722 AH) has the narration in his *Farāʾid al-Simṭayn fi Faḍāʾil al-Murtaḍā wa al-Batūl wa al-Sibṭayn*.

Ḥāfiz Shams al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Zahabī Shāfiʿī (d. 748 AH) has mentioned it in his *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*, vol. 4, p. 28, from the *Ṣaḥīḥ* of Ḥāfiz Samarqandī, adding: "This narration is correct."

Ḥāfiz Jamal al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Yūsuf Zarandī Anṣārī (d. around 750 AH) has it in his book of elegies whose complete title is: *Nazm Durar al-Simṭayn fi Faḍāʾil al-Muṣṭafā wa al-Murtaḍā wa al-Batūl wa al-Sibṭayn*.

Ḥāfiz Ṣalāh al-Dīn Abū Saʿīd Khalīl ʿAlāʾī Damishqī Shāfiʿī (d. 761 AH), to whom many Sunni scholars have referred, has narrated it, and he considered it to have been authentically passed on by Ibn Ṭarīq.

None of the opponents have offered any proof against this authentic hadith narrated by Tirmidhī in his book of *al-Jāmiʿ*.

There is also Sayyid Ali Ibn Shahāb al-Dīn Hamedānī, who has narrated it in *al-Mawaddat al-Qurbā* from Jābir Ibn Abdullah Anṣārī,

stating: "This narration has been passed on by Mas'ūd and Anas Ibn Mālik."

Majd al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Ya'qūb Firūzābādī (d. 816 or 817 AH) has it in his *al-Naqd al-Ṣaḥīḥ*. After narrating it from Mu'īn, he states that none of those who supposed there were weaknesses in the narration of

أَتَمِّدَةُ الْعِلْمِ

has found any support from Mu'īn, so their judgment is totally wrong.

He then says that one can gather after consideration of the good points of both Abū Mu'āwiyah and Sharīk that there is no need or reason for trying to find weak points in the narration, let alone saying it is wrong or false.

Another is Shams al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Muhammad Jazarī (d. 833 AH). He has extracted the narration from *Asnā al-Maṭālib fī Manāqib of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib*, p. 14, with the collaboration of Ḥakīm, and emphasized its authenticity. At the beginning of his book, he undertakes to write only authentic narrations about Imam Ali.

Shahāb al-Dīn Abū al-Faḍl Ahmad Ibn Ali, known as Ibn Ḥajar 'Asqalānī (d. 852 AH), has it in his *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb*, vol. 7, p. 337. And in *Lisān al-Mizān* he says: "There are a few ways to clarify this narration, and Ḥakīm has explained it in the *Mustadrak*, but the briefest explanation is, as we say, that there is a source for this narration, so it is unfair to try to find false accusations and then speak about them."

Nūr al-Dīn Ali Ibn Muhammad Ibn Sabbāgh Mālikī Makkī (d. 855 AH) has it in *al-Fuṣūl al-Muhimmah*, p. 18.

Shams al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Yahyā Jilānī Lāhijī Nūr Bakhsh has it in *Mafātiḥ al-Pjāz*, with an explanation in *Golshan-i Rāz*, written in 877.

Ḥāfiz Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Kamāl al-Dīn Suyūfī (d. 911 AH), has it in *al-Jāmi' al-Ṣaḥīḥ*, vol. 1, p. 374, as well as in other books, in many of which he considers it to be among the best. And upholding its authenticity, he also has it in the *Jam' al-Jawāmi'* vol. 6, p. 401, where he says:

For a long time I have considered this narration to be most correct, and I always referred to it as a reliable narration. I came across the narration that Ibn Jarīr had narrated about Ali, as well one that Ḥakīm had narrated from Ibn Abbās, and understood its rightfulness. Thenceforth, I asked God to guide me to the straight path, and then it became known

to me that this narration is among the best and most authentic—and God knows best.

Rouzbehan has it alongside the *Nahj al-Haqq* of ‘Allāmah Hillī, and finding no mistakes in its main document, he considers it the most correct among the other narrations. And rejecting the arguments against the Allāmah concerning Imam Ali’s great knowledge, he refers to the narrations of

أَفْصَحَكُمْ عَلِيٍّ، وَأَتَمِّدِيئَةُ الْعِلْمِ

by Tirmidhī, who has said: “And that whatever the writer has mentioned about Imam Ali is correct and proves that he is one of the scholars of the Ummah, and people need him for his knowledge on this subject. Why should this not be correct while the Prophet said that Ali is the source of all knowledge?”

Hāfiz Shahāb al-Dīn Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Qaṣṭalānī Miṣrī Shāfi‘ī (d. 923) in *al-Mawāhib al-Laduniyya* about the names and titles of the Messenger has included

صِدِّيقَةُ الْعِلْمِ

with the Prophet’s name. For this inclusion, he refers to the narration as Zarqānī explains it in vol. 3, p. 143.

Shahāb al-Dīn Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hajar Haythamī Makki (d. 974) has it in *al-Ṣawā‘iq al-Muḥriqah*, p. 73, and also in the explanation of Hamziya Būṣīrī, where Būṣīrī¹⁰² says:

كَرَاهَاتُ آيَاتِهِ مِنْ عُلُومٍ عَنْ حُرُوفِ آيَاتِهَا عَنْهَا الْحَيَاءُ

“So many of his verses contained an abundance of sciences that unveil the code of the letters of the alphabet.”

Elsewhere he says:

وَوَزِيرَانِ عَمِّي فِي الْمَالِ وَمِنَ الْأَهْلِ تُسَعِدُ الْوُزَرَ

“And with the highest degree and status, Ali was the minister of his cousin. Yes, it is true, the ministers who have a close relationship with the lofty heights are successful.”

On another occasion he said:

لَنْ يَزِيدَ كُفْتُ الْغَطَاءِ يَقِينًا بَلْ هُوَ الشَّمْسُ مَا عَلَيْهِ غَطَاءٌ

“Removing the screens of the Unseen does not increase Ali’s certitude, for he himself is the sun with no screen before him.”

While explaining the elegies of Būṣīrī, Ibn Hajar considers the narration of

أَتَمِّدِيئَةُ الْعِلْمِ

as the best among the other narrations. Also published in the *Taḥīr al-Janān* is what is written in the margin of *al-Ṣawāʿiq*. On p. 74, he mentions it as among the best in *al-Fatāwīʿ al-Ḥadithah*, p. 126, and on p. 197 he says:

هُوَ حَدِيثٌ حَسَنٌ

"It is an authentic and correct narration."

Hāfiz Shaykh ʿAbd al-Raʿūf Ibn Tāj al-ʿĀrifin (d. 1031) has it in *Fayḍ al-Qadīr*, as an explanation of *Jāmiʿ al-Ṣaqīr*, vol. 3, p. 46; and in *al-Taysīr*, in the explanation of *Jāmiʿ al-Ṣaqīr*, at the beginning of which he says: "Muṣṭafā was a city containing all religious meaning and truth, and it is obvious that every city has its gate. Muṣṭafā informed us that his Gate was Ali. He who approaches Ali can enter the city, but whoever does not enter through him falls from the way and goes astray."

Both friends and enemies have unanimously agreed that Ali was the most learned.

Kalābazī has extracted as much from a narration where a man asked Muʿāwiyah a particular question, and Muʿāwiyah answered: "Ask this of Ali; he is more knowledgeable than I am." However, the man said: "But I want to get your answer."

So Muʿāwiyah said:

وَمَعَكُمْ كَرِهْتُ رَجُلًا كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَنْفُذُ بِالْعِلْمِ غَرَا.

"Woe upon you! Do you dislike a man to whom the Messenger of God transferred his knowledge, like a bird putting seeds into the mouth of its chick?"

The great men among the companions of the Prophet have confessed to this. Whenever Omar was in need of help on any question, he would ask Ali. Once, a man went to Omar and asked him about a problem, and Omar said: "There is Ali, so ask him."

The man answered: "But O Commander of the Faithful, I want to hear your opinion on it." Omar said: "Now stand up! May God strike you!" Then Omar erased his share from the book.

And in different versions of authentic narrations, Omar is quoted as saying that he would take refuge in God if Ali were not present. Most of the time he would keep Ali with him, and he approved of Ali's going into battle only because he wanted to consult with him if there were difficulties.

Hāfiz ʿAbd al-Mālik Ibn Sulaymān has quoted from a narration where he was asked if there was anyone more knowledgeable than

Ali among the companions of the Prophet, and he said: "By God, never!"

Ḥarālī has said: "All people, from the first to the last, know that the complete knowledge of the Book of God is only with Ali. Whoever is not aware of this, he actually moves backward in life, for he has missed the main gate in front of him. God will remove the screens from the hearts and then this fact will become clear..."

There is also Shaykh Mahmud Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali Shaykhānī Qādirī, who has the narration in his *al-Ṣirāt al-Sawī fi Manāqib Āl al-Nabī*, quoting from Ahmad and Tirmidhī as true sources, and then saying that it was the custom of Ibn Abī ʿĀs to say time and again:

مَنْ أَرَادَ الْبَابَ وَالْمَوْعِدَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ

"He who is interested in knowledge must come to it through the main gate, and that gate is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib."

ʿAbd al-Ḥaqq Dihlawī (d. 1052) also put it in his *al-Lamaʿāt fi Sharḥ al-Mishkāṭ* after which many narrators mentioned his statement concerning the narration. He finally chose the religion of some of those who were already in it. Moreover, the narration mentioned in the *Madārij al-Nubuwwah* in the same wording, has considered

أَكْمَدِيَّةُ الْعِلْمِ

as a name of the Prophet.

Amīr Muhammad Ibn Ismāʿīl Ibn Ṣalāh Yamanī Ṣanʿānī (d. 1182 AH) has it in *al-Rawḍat al-Nadiyyah fi Sharḥ al-Tuḥfat al-ʿAlawiyyah*, and completely supports the comments of Ḥakīm, Ibn Jarīr, and Suyūṭī on it. After narrating it and having it checked by proofreaders, he said: "So now the claims of those who say this narration is false have become clear to you. It is as Suyūṭī has said, followed by Ḥakīm and Ibn Jarīr in their books."

Omar Ibn Ahmad Kharṣūṭī Ḥanafī has it in his *ʿAṣīdat al-Shuhada fi Sharḥ Qaṣīdat Burda*, followed by an elegy and an explanation:

فَأَقِ الْيَسِينَ فِي عِلْمِي وَفِي عِلْمِي وَلَنْ يَدَاوِي عِلْمِي وَلَا كَرَمِي

Our Messenger is at the pinnacle of creation and moral rectitude, and none can approach his position, neither in knowledge nor in generosity...Let it be known that according to God's words his knowledge is fixed. As He has stated:

وَعَلَّمَكُم مَّا لَمْ تَعْلَمُونَ

...and [God] teaches you that which you knew not (4:113).

Shahāb al-Dīn Sayyid Mahmūd Ibn Abdullah Ālūsī Baghdādī (d. 1270 AH) also discusses in his commentary, *Rūḥ al-Maʿānī*, vol. 27, p. 3, that Ali is known as:

بَابُ مَدِينَةِ الْعِلْمِ

And Shaykh Sulaymān Ibn Ibrāhīm Husayni Balkhī Qundūzī (d. 1293) has written different versions by other narrators and scholars through their own chains in *Yanābiʿ al-Mawaddah*, pp. 65, 72, 73, 400, and 419, referring to Imam Ali, and mentions Ibn Abbās, Jābir Ibn Abdullah, Ḥudhayfat Ibn Yamān, Hasan Ibn Ali, Ibn Masʿūd, Anas Ibn Mālīk, and Abdullah Ibn Omar.

Mawlawī Hasan al-Zamān has it in *al-Qawāl al-Mustahṣan fi Fakhr al-Hasan*, and he singles it out as one of the most authentic. He says: "It has been approved and then narrated by the leaders of the narrators, such as Ibn Muʿīn, Khaṭīb, Ibn Jarīr, Ḥakīm, and Firūz-Ābādī in *al-Naqd al-Ṣaḥīḥ*." He goes on to say: "And people such as ʿAlāʾī, Zarhashī, and Ibn Hajar, as well as others, have praised the narration, which goes back to Ibn al-Juzī.¹⁰³

After much investigation and coming to a decision, the late Allāmah Amīnī mentions the names of some of the Sunni scholars who have agreed on the truth of the narration, such as Yahyā Ibn Muʿīn, Muhammad Ibn Jarīr Ṭabarī, Ḥakīm Nishābūrī, Khaṭīb Baghdādī, Hasan Samarqandī, Majd al-Dīn Firūzābādī, Jalāl al-Dīn Suyūfī, Sayyid Muhammad Bukhārī, Amīr Muhammad Sanaʿānī, and Hasan al-Zamān. He also mentions 10 more whose statements are reliable: Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa Qurashī, Yūsuf Ibn Quzūghlī, Ṣalāh al-Dīn ʿAlāʾī, Muhammad Jazarī, Muhammad Sakhāwī, Rūzbehān Shirazi, Muttaqī Hindī, Mīrzā Muhammad Badakhshānī, Mīrzā Muhammad Ṣadr al-ʿĀlam, and Thanāʾullāh Pānīpatī Hindī.

He goes on to explain different expressions that are used in the narration in 11 different ways:

1. It has been narrated from Hārith and ʿĀṣim, quoting Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib as saying that the Messenger said:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ خَلَقَنِي وَعَلِيَّامِنْ شَجَرَةٍ وَاحِدَةٍ، أَنَا أَصْلُهَا، وَعَلِيٌّ فَرْعُهَا، وَالْحَسَنُ وَالْحُسَيْنُ فَمُرْتَعَا، وَالشَّيْبَةُ وَفَرْعُهَا، فَهَلْ يَخْرُجُ مِنَ الْعَلِيِّ إِلَّا الْعَلِيُّ؟ أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا، فَكَيْفَ إِذَا الْمَدِينَةُ فَلْيَا بَابُهَا
بَابُهَا.

Indeed God created Ali and me from a single tree: I am its trunk and Ali is its branch; Hasan and Husayn are its fruits, and our followers are the

twigs. Then what is the outcome of the pure? Is it not that the pure emerge from the pure? I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate. Therefore, whoever wants to enter the city must enter through the main gate.

It is narrated slightly differently from Ali as:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا: وَلَا تُؤْتَى إِلَّا مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا.

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate; therefore no one can enter the city except by the right gate."

And also as:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَأَنْتَ بَابُهَا أَكْذَبَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّهُ يَدْخُلُ إِلَى الْمَدِينَةِ إِلَّا مِنْ قَبْلِ الْبَابِ.

"I am the City of Knowledge and you [O Ali] are its Gate. He lies who says he can enter the city from anywhere else."

And also as:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَأَنْتَ بَابُهَا أَكْذَبَ مَنْ زَعَمَ أَنَّهُ يَدْخُلُ الْمَدِينَةَ بِغَيْرِ الْبَابِ. قَالَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ: وَأَتُوا أَلْيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا.

"I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate. So he is lying who says he can enter the city without the main gate. God, the Honorable and Exalted, says ...you must enter the houses through their main entrances.

2. It has been quoted from Ibn Abbās as:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا، فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ بِهَاذِهِ الْبَابِ.

"I am the City of Knowledge and you are the Gate to it, so whoever is after knowledge must enter by the main gate."

And Saʿīd Ibn Jubayr's style of narrating from Ibn Abbās is as follows:

يَا عَلِيُّ أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَأَنْتَ بَابُهَا وَلَنْ تُؤْتَى الْمَدِينَةُ إِلَّا مِنْ قَبْلِ الْبَابِ.

"O Ali, I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate. And never can one enter a city except by its main gate."

3. Jābir Ibn Abdullah has been narrated as saying:

I heard the Prophet on the Day of Ḥudaybiyyah say as was holding Ali by his arm:

هَذَا أَمِيرُ الْبِرَّةِ، وَقَاتِلُ الْفَجْرَةِ، مَنْصُورٌ مَنْ نَصَرَهُ، مُحْتُولٌ مَنْ خَذَلَهُ.

"This is the Emir of those who do good, the combatant of the dissolute, the helper of him who helps him, and the humiliator of him who humiliates him."

And then he raised his voice saying:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا، فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْمَدِينَةَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ.

"O Ali, I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate; so whoever wants to enter the city must enter through the main gate."

On another occasion, the following has been narrated:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا، فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ.

"I am the City of Knowledge and you are the Gate to it, so whoever seeks after knowledge, let him enter through the main gate."

Similar Accounts of the Narration of أنا مدينة العلم وعلي بابها

Furthermore, there are other quotations of narrations that learned scholars have put in their most important books, all of which confirm the truth of the narration

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ

such as:

أَنَا دَارُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا¹⁰⁴

1. "I am the House of Wisdom and Ali is its Door."

أَنَا دَارُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا.¹⁰⁵

2. "I am the House of Knowledge and Ali is its Door."

أَنَا مِيزَانُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ كِفَاةُ¹⁰⁶

3. "I am the Balance of Knowledge and Ali is its Pans."

أَنَا مِيزَانُ الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ لِسَانُهُ¹⁰⁷

4. "I am the Balance of Wisdom and Ali is its Tongue [i.e., pointer]."

أَنَا الْمَدِينَةُ وَأَنْتَ الْبَابُ، وَلَا يَدْخُلُ الْمَدِينَةَ إِلَّا مِنْ بَابِهَا.¹⁰⁸

5. "I am the City and you are the Gate, and they do not enter the city except through the gate."

It has also been mentioned as:

هُوَ بَابُ مَدِينَةِ عِلْمِي.¹⁰⁹

6. "So he is the Door of the City for my Knowledge."

عَلِيٍّ أَيْحَى وَمَيِّ، وَأَنَا مِنْ عَلِيٍّ فَهُوَ بَابُ عَلِيٍّ وَوَجِيئِي.

7. "Ali is my brother, so he is from me, and I am from him. Therefore, he is my successor and the Gate to my Knowledge."

عَلِيٍّ بَابُ عَلِيٍّ وَمَتَّيْنُ لَا مَقِيَّ مَا زِلْتُ بِهِ مِنْ بَعْدِي.¹¹⁰

8. "Ali is the Door of my Knowledge, and after my demise he will be the revealer of that which I have been assigned to fulfil."

أَنْتَ بَابُ عَلِيٍّ.

9. The Prophet stated: "You are the Door of my Knowledge" in a certain narration concerning Ali, and Khargūshī, Abū Naṣīm, Daylamī Khārazmī, Abū al-ʿAlā Hamedānī, Abū Ḥamīd Ṣāliḥāt, Abū ʿAbdullah Ganjī, Sayyid Shahāb al-Dīn, the writer of *Tawḍīḥ al-Dalāʾil*, and Qundūzī have extracted it and used it in their narrations.

يَا أَيُّهَا سَلَمَةُ أَشْهَدِي وَأَتَقِي هَذَا عَلِيٍّ أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، وَسَيِّدَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ، وَغَيْثَ عَلِيٍّ وَغَاءَ عَلِيٍّ، وَ
بَابُ الَّذِي أَوْقَى مِنْهُ

10. "O Umm Salamah, listen and bear witness. This is Ali, the Commander of the Believers and Chief of the Muslims, and the Chest for [holding] my Knowledge, and the door through which people enter."

This narration has been recorded by Abū Naṣīm and Khārazmī in *al-Manāqib*, Rafīʿ in the *Tadwīn*, Ganjī in the *al-Manāqib*, Ḥamūʿī in *Farāʾid al-Simṭayn*, Husām al-Dīn al-Maḥallī and Shab al-Dīn in *Tawḍīḥ al-Dalāʾil*, and Shaykh Muhammad Ḥafnū in the explanation of *Jāmiʿ al-Ṣaḡhīr*. In the margin of *Sharḥ ʿAzīz*, vol. 2, p. 417, it states: "*Ḥadīth al-Ghabah*," which means "The Bowl for My Knowledge and Its Protector," because the Messenger was the City of Knowledge, and for this reason the companions referred to Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib with their problems. On this basis, in times of difficulty, Muʿāwiyah also consulted Ali, who would tell him how to solve his problems.

The companions of Ali would subsequently ask him:

مَا لَكَ يُجِبُ عَدُوَّنَا؟ فَيَقُولُ: أَمَا كُنْتُمْ أَتُبْتَاجُنَا إِلَيْنَا.

"Why do you answer the questions of your enemies?" and Ali would respond: "Is it not enough for you that he has come to us with his problem?"

Time and again there were occasions when Ali solved Omar's problems, and Omar said:

مَا أَبْقَانِي اللَّهُ إِلَّا أَنْ أَدْرِكَ قَوْمًا يَسْأَلُونِي فَيُهْمُّ أَبُو الْحَسَنِ

"I wish for God not to keep me alive to see a nation without Abū al-Hasan."

It is otherwise explained in the margin of *Sharḥ 'Aziz*: "Omar would pray not to be alive after Ali." It is mentioned in some cases as

حَدِيثُ لَكُمْ¹¹¹

such as in a narration called *Ḥadīth al-Laṭm* about Omar's command to stone an adulterer.¹¹² In all these cases Omar said:

لَوْلَا عَلِيٌّ لَمَلَكَ عُتْر.

"If there were no Ali, Omar would perish."

In *Fayḍ al-Qadīr*, vol. 4, p. 356, Manāwī says:

عَلِيٌّ عَيْبَةٌ عَلَيَّ.

"Ali is the Chest for my Knowledge; he is the trustee of my knowledge and secret. And he is closest to me in all my affairs, and even the treasurer of my precious things."

This is because the word

عَيْبَةٌ

means a chest where people hide their valuables.

Ibn Darīd has said that:

These are the specific words of the Messenger of God, and no one before him had used such words. When conveying his purpose to the people, no one except Ali was associated with such phrases, so these expressions are specifically used in praise of Ali. And the attention of his enemies was directed towards obedience to him. Hence, it has been explained in the commentary of *Hamziyya* that Mu'āwīyah used to send people to Ali with certain problems of his, and Ali would answer his questions. One of Ali's sons asked him: "Do you answer to your enemy?" and Ali answered:

أَنَا مَكِينَتَانِ اخْتَلَجْنَا وَسَأَلْنَا!

"Is it not enough for us that he needs us and brings his questions to us?"

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْفَقْدِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا.

11. "I am the City of Jurisprudence and Ali is its Door."

Abū al-Muzaffar, the son of Ibn Juzī, has this narration in *Tadhkira*, p. 29, and Ibn Baṭṭāḥ 'Ukbarī through his chain from Salamat Ibn Khayl, quoting 'Abd al-Raḥmān from Ali, quoting Abū al-Hasan Ali Ibn Muhammad, known as Ibn Iraq, in the *Tanzīh al-Shariah*.¹¹³

**In *al-Mustadrak*, Ḥākim Maintains That the Narration of
أنا مدينة العلم وعلي بابها Is Authentic**

One of those who have testified to the truthfulness of this narration is Ḥākim in his *al-Mustadrak*, and we now wish to translate his exact words in order to make them clear to the reader.

Ḥākim says:

Abū al-Abbās Muhammad Ibn Ya‘qūb¹¹⁴ has narrated to us that Muhammad Ibn ‘Abd al-Rahīm Harawī in Ramlah [a place] has narrated that Abū Ṣalt ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ said that Abū Mu‘āwīyah had quoted the narration from A‘mash and Mujāhid, and also from Ibn Abbās, saying that the Prophet had said:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْمَدِينَةَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ

This comes from an authentic chain that both Shaykh Bukhārī and Shaykh Muslim have used. And I heard Abū Ṣalt Muwaththaq and Ma‘mūn report from the narrator Abū al-Abbās Muhammad Ibn Ya‘qūb that he heard Abbās Ibn Muhammad Dawrī saying: “I heard it from Yahyā Ibn Mu‘īn and asked him about Abū Ṣalt Harawī, and he said: ‘Abū Ṣalt is trustworthy man.’”

I asked Yahyā whether he had narrated

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ

from Abū Mu‘āwīyah, from A‘mash.

Yahyā said: “Muhammad Ibn Ja‘far Fīdī has also narrated it, and he is trustworthy.”

I heard Abū Nasr Ahmad Ibn Sahl, who was a jurisprudent in Bukhara at the time, saying: “I heard Ṣāliḥ Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ḥabīb Ḥāfiz saying that he had arrived as he was asking Abū Ṣalt Harawī how he was, and just then Yahyā Ibn Mu‘īn also came. I said: ‘May God bless him, and what is your opinion of Abū Ṣalt?’ Yahyā said: ‘He is a rightful person, and he passes on narrations correctly.’”

I told Yahyā: “Abū Ṣalt relates the narrations of A‘mash, Mujāhid, and Abbās, where the Prophet says:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِهَا مِنْ بَابِهَا

‘I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, and whoever wants to enter the city must enter it through its gate.’”

Yahyā responded: "That is right, and Fidī also relates it from Abū Mu'āwīyah, and he also from A'mash, in exactly the same way as Abū Ṣalt."

Then Ḥakīm quotes another narration through other chains.

He continues narrating that Imam Dhakariyā had said that Yahyā Ibn Mu'īn told them what Abu al-Hasan Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Tamīm Qanṭarī had related to him. He said:

Husayn Ibn Faham narrated to me from Muhammad Ibn Yahyā Ibn Zarabī what Muhammad Ibn Ja'far Fidī had narrated to him. And he, too, quoted Abū Mu'āwīyah, quoting A'mash and Mujāhid as narrating that Ibn Abbās said that the Prophet had stated:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِهَا مِنْ بَابِهَا.

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, and whoever wants to enter the city must enter it through its gate."

Husayn Ibn Fahim says that Abū Ṣalt Harawī has also narrated this from Abū Mu'āwīyah.

Ḥakīm said that a researcher of the narration should know that Husayn Ibn Fahm Ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān is a trustworthy jurisprudent who can recite the Book.

He then says:

Sufyān Thūri is a witness to this narration with his own authentic chains. Abū Bakr Muhammad Ibn Ali and the jurisprudent Imam Shāshī narrated it to me. When he was asked in Bukhara, he said:

Nu'mān Ibn Hārūn Baladī narrated it to me in the town of Balad by means of his own book, saying that 'Abd al-Razzāq had told him that Sufyān Thūri quoted it from Abdullah Ibn Othman Ibn Ḥuthaym, quoting 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Othman Taymī as saying that Jābir Ibn Abdullah told him that the Prophet said:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ¹¹⁵.

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, and whoever wants to enter the city must enter it through the gate."

Abū Ṣalt Harawī as One of the Greatest Shaykhs of Authentic Narrators

In the translation of the *Tārīkh al-Baghdad* by ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Ibn Sulaymān, Abū Ṣalt Harawī elucidates on a matter, part of which we wish to explain.

Ahmad Ibn Sayyār Ibn Ayyūb has been quoted as saying that Abū Ṣalt ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ was a servant of ‘Abd al-Rahmān Ibn Samarah.¹¹⁶ He used to meet the people and converse with them, and he was always traveling in search of narrations. He was a poor, shabbily dressed, pious man who did good deeds. During Ma’mūn’s caliphate he traveled to Marv and wanted to fight alongside the Islamic army.

They took him to Ma’mūn, and when Ma’mūn heard his way of speaking, he chose him as one of his brother’s attendants. He kept him at his court so that he could take him to battle. He was always respected by Ma’mūn until he wanted to say that the Qur’an was a gloomy declaration to the people. They set up a meeting between him and Bishr Marīsī, and he asked Bishr Marīsī to begin the discussion. However, Abū Ṣalt sat there and rejected their opinions on Murji’ah, Jahmiyyah, Zanādiqah, and Qadariyyah. Time and again he continued his discussion with Marīsī and others in front of Ma’mūn. However, Abū Ṣalt won all the arguments, and he took the side of the Shi’a. He also explained some narrations that mocked the companions. I asked Isaac Ibn Ibrāhīm about these narrations, whether they had already been passed on, if they were about Abū Mūsā, or if they were narrated about Mu‘āwīyah, and Isaac said: “These are the narrations that have been narrated.”

I asked him: “Do you dislike writing or narrating them, or quoting someone who has narrated them?” Isaac said: “I do not like the one who narrates them to make known the conditions of the companions. However, I dislike the one who narrates them in order to base the religion upon them, and then to find mistakes within the tribe.”

Muhammad Ibn Qāsim Nirsī informed us that Muhammad Ibn Abdullah Shāfi‘ī had told him from Isaac Ibn Hasan Ibn Maymūn Ḥarbī, through Abdullah Ibn Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ (that is, Abū Ṣalt Harawī), back to Abū Mu‘āwīyah, then A‘mash, and then Mujāhid, quoting Ibn Abbās as saying that the Prophet said:

أَتَمِدْتُمُ الْعِلْمَ وَعَلَيْهَا

However, it has been related from Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ḥajjāj Marwī that they asked Abū Abdullah about Abū Ṣalt, and he answered:

رَوَى أَحَادِيثَ مَنَاصِيحٍ.

"Abū Ṣalt narrates unauthorized and unknown narratives."

And it has been quoted from Omar Ibn Hasan Ibn Ali Ibn Mālik that he heard his father saying: "I asked Yaḥyā Ibn Muṭīn about Abū Ṣalt, and he said:

ثِقَةٌ صَدُوقٌ إِلَّا أَنَّهُ يَتَّبِعُ

"He is a rightful and trustworthy man, and his only shortcoming is that he considers the statements of the Shī'as correct, claiming them to be right."

Abdullah Ibn Junayd has been quoted as saying that he asked Yaḥyā Ibn Muṭīn about Abū Ṣalt Harawī, and he said:

ثِقَةٌ صَدُوقٌ إِلَّا أَنَّهُ يَتَّبِعُ.

"He is a rightful and trustworthy man. His only shortcoming is that he follows Shī'a path."

And it has been narrated that Junayd said that he asked Yaḥyā Ibn Muṭīn about Abū Ṣalt Harawī, and he said:

قَدْ سَمِعَ وَمَا عَرَفُهُ بِالْكَذِبِ.

"I have just heard [about him], and no one considers him a liar."

And again, when there was a discussion about Abū Ṣalt Harawī, he said:

لَيْسَ كُنْ أَبُو الصَّلَاتِ عِنْدَنَا مِنْ أَهْلِ الْكَذِبِ، وَهَذِهِ الْأَحَادِيثُ الَّتِي يَرْوِيهَا مَانِعَةٌ.

"From our point of view, Abū Ṣalt Harawī is not a liar, but we do not know about the narrations that he is narrating now."

There is a narration from Qāsim Ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān Anbarī claiming that Abū Ṣalt Harawī had narrated to him from A'ṣam, Mujāhid, and Ibn Abbās, quoting the Prophet as stating:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا، فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْعِلْمَ فَلْيَأْتِ بِهَا.

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever desires for knowledge, let him enter through the [main] door."

Here Khaṭīb says:

I say that the function of rightfulness is the truth of the narration from Mu'āwiyah. This narration is not invalid, because most people, in addition to Abū Ṣalt, have narrated it. And Muhammad Ibn Ali Muqri has said that Muhammad Ibn Ali Nishābūrī had informed him that Abū al-Abbās Aṣamm said: "I heard Muhammad Ibn Ya'qūb saying that he

heard Abbās Ibn Muhammad Dawrī saying that he heard Yahyā Ibn Muʿīn prove the rightfulness of ʿAbd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Abū Ṣalt Harawī."

I told him, or he was told, that Abū Ṣalt reported the narration

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا

from Muʿāwīyah.

Yahyā said: "What do you expect from this poor man, when Muhammad Ibn Jaʿfar Fīdī is relating this very narration from Muʿāwīyah?"

And it has been related that Muhammad Ibn Qāsim Ibn Muḥraz said he asked Yahyā Ibn Muʿīn about Abū Ṣalt ʿAbd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Harawī, and he said:

لَيْسَ مِنْ كَذِبٍ

"He is not a false narrator."

And he was asked about the narration of

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا

from Abū Muʿāwīyah, Aʿmash, and Ibn Abbās, and he said: "This narration is one of Abū Muʿāwīyah's. Ibn Numayr told me that in the past Abū Muʿāwīyah would teach this narration to his students, but that he later stopped. Abū Ṣalt was a well-to-do man, who respected the shaykhs and asked them for these narrations, and they also told him of similar narrations."

In addition, ʿAbd al-Muʿmin Ibn Khalaf Nasafī is related as saying that he asked Abū Ali Ṣāliḥ Ibn Muhammad about Abū Ṣalt Harawī, and he said:

I heard Yahyā Ibn Muʿīn saying something good about him, and recounting his good points. I saw Yahyā Ibn Ṣāliḥ was with Abū Ṣalt and asked him about the narration of

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا

that had already been narrated by Muʿāwīyah. When he gave his word, he said that Fīdī had also narrated it in the past. I asked him about Fīdī's real name, and he answered: "Muhammad Ibn Jaʿfar."

In this respect, Khaṭīb also says: "Some of the narrators among the Sunni scholars have weakened this narration of Abū Ṣalt, as well as his other narrations."

And Ibrāhīm Ibn Yaʿqūb Juzjānī had said:

كَانَ أَبُو الصَّلْتِ الْهَرَوِيُّ زَانِعًا عَنِ الْحَقِّ، مَائِلًا عَنِ الْقَصْدِ سَمِعْتُ مَنْ حَدَّثَنِي عَنْ بَعْضِ الْأَيْمَةِ، أَنَّهُ
كَلَّمَهُ: هُوَ كَذَّابٌ مِنْ رُؤْبِ جَمَارِ النَّجَالِ وَكَانَ قَدِ يَأْمُرُكَ بِالْأَقْدَارِ.

Abū Ṣalt Harawī truly had a tendency to be inaccurate and deviate from the straight path. I heard some of the leaders and shaykhs say that he is the worst of liars, and that he is worse than animal dung. Right from the start he would contaminate himself with impurity.

Dhakariyyā Ibn Yaḥyā Sājī has said that Abū Ṣalt Harawī passed on defective narrations, and was considered weak by the Sunni shaykhs.

Khaṭīb says that Baraqānī told him that Abū Ṣalt ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Harawī once started speaking in front of Abū al-Hasan Dār al-Quṭrā, who said: “When I was listening to him, I gathered that he was ugly and had a tendency towards extreme Shi‘ism.”

He also says that Da‘laj told him that he had heard from Abū Sa‘d Zāhir Harawī that when someone questioned Abū Ṣalt Harawī about his opinion of ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ, he answered: “Yes, Na‘īm Ibn Ḥaṣīm is authentic.” They reminded him: “We are asking you about ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ.” Again he answered the same: “Na‘īm is authentic,” without adding anything more.

‘Abd al-Salām Abū Ṣalt died on Wednesday, the 24th of Shawwāl, 236 AH.¹¹⁷

Ḥāfiz ‘Alā’ī and Suyūṭī Authorize the Veracity of the Narration

Suyūṭī has found mistakes in the chain of Ḥāfiz Ṣalāh al-Dīn ‘Alā’ī in answer to the narrations of Sirāj al-Dīn Qazvinī from the book *Maṣābiḥ al-Baghawī*. He has gathered that they are falsified, and says:

Among them is the narration of

أَتَانِيَهُ الْعِلْمُ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا

which is narrated in different ways by Abū al-Faraj Ibn Juzī, and later some, such as Dhahabī in the *Mizān al-I‘tidāl* and others, have recorded it in their books in the same way as he did.¹¹⁸

Ibn Hajar ‘Asqalānī and Ḥāfiz ‘Alā’ī reject Abū al-Faraj’s Opinion

In answer to Ibn Juzī and those who have followed him, and also rejecting Qazvīnī, Ḥāfiz ‘Alā’ī says: "...and even more well-known than this narration is the narration of Abū Ṣalt ‘Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Harawī from Abū Mu‘āwīyah, quoting A‘mash, from Mujāhid, and they too quoting Ibn Abbās. They have said enough about this ‘Abd al-Salām." Nisā’ī has said that he is not a jurisprudent. Dar-Quṭnī and Ibn Adī have said that he was accused of being a Shi‘a, and Dar-Quṭnī added that he was an extremist Shi‘a. Abū Ḥātam said: "In my opinion, he is not a just man." However, Abū Zar‘ah considered his narration correct. Nevertheless, Ḥakīm has said that Ibn Abbās Dawrī asked Yaḥyā Ibn Mu‘īn, and he also rejected Abū Ṣalt, yet after relating a narration from Ḥakīm, he states: "‘Alā’ī says Abū Ṣalt is free of blame regarding this narration, and certain others have also narrated it. Abū Mu‘āwīyah, the jurisprudent, is his trustee and a great shaykh, and everyone agrees with him and believes that this narration is from A‘mash."

In addition, ‘Alā’ī remarked:

Now what has happened? What is wrong with the Prophet’s saying these words about Ali?¹¹⁹

All those who have offered their opinions on this narration and then claimed it was fake have no answer to these words of Ibn Mu‘īn. Apart from that, the narration has a witness, which Tirmidhī has explained in his *Jāmi‘*, from Ismā‘īl Ibn Mūsā Fazārī back through Muhammad Ibn Omar Ibn Rūmī, from Sharīk Ibn Abdullah, then Salamah Ibn Kuhayl, then Suwayd Ibn Ghafalah, quoting Abdullah Ṣanābijī, back to Ali, confirming the statement:

أَنَا ذَا الْحِكْمَةِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا

"I am the House of Wisdom and Ali is its Gate." But Abū Muslim Kajī and others have narrated it from Muhammad Ibn Omar Rūmī, who Bukhārī said was incorrect. However, Ibn Haban considered him to be right, while Ibn Dāwūd considered him weak in narration.¹²⁰

Some have said this narration came from Sharīk and have not mentioned Ṣanābijī, but we do not recognize that it was from anyone but Sharīk, that is, Nakha‘ī Qādī. However, there is contention about Muhammad Ibn Rūmī’s narrating it. Sharīk is Abullah Nakha‘ī Qādī’s son, and Muslim reasoned with him. Bukhārī refers to him, and Yaḥyā Ibn Mu‘īn considers him authentic. Ajalī says: "He is just and rightful in passing on

narrations." And 'Isā Ibn Yunes says: "I have not seen anyone more knowledgeable than Sharik."

Therefore, Sharik's personality indicates the rightfulness of his narration, and in fact makes it the best one, even without adding Abū Mu'āwiyah's narration. Therefore, as far as narrations are concerned, there is no blame on anyone who has rejected Ṣanābijī, because Suwayd Ibn Ghafalah is among the followers of Mukhaḍramīn,¹²¹ who knew all the four caliphs and heard narrations from them. And Ṣanābijī in the chain of narration neither adds any value to the narration, nor damages its authenticity, as neither Abū al-Faraj nor any other could find the smallest problem in Sharik's narration.

'Alā al-Dīn 'Alā'ī's comments come to an end at this point.¹²²

However, Suyūṭī has related Ibn Ḥajar 'Asqalānī's explanation, where he says that they asked Shaykh al-Islam Abū al-Faḍl Ibn Ḥajar about the narration, and he said:

Ḥākim has extracted this narration from the *Mustadrak* and has said that it is right. And he opposed Abū al-Faraj Juzī, who mentioned it in a section of topics and said that it was false, but the facts indicate otherwise. The narration is good, but it cannot be authentic and can never have a place among the authentic ones.

Ibn Ḥajar formed his conclusions from narrations where Sirāj Qazvīnī found mistakes in the *Maṣābilī*. In addition, he said: "Ḥākim has a witness for this narration from Jābir." And after explaining the narration through documentation, he mentions *Lisān al-Mizān* as that with which Dhahabī countered the narration of Ja'far Ibn Muhammad, claiming it was incorrect. Ibn Ḥajar clearly explained: "There are different versions of this narration in Ḥākim's *Mustadrak*. The least we can say is that it has an origin, so it is unfair to say that it is false."¹²³

Moreover, Ibn Ḥajar says that Qāsim Ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān Anbazī said:

I asked Yahyā Ibn Mu'īn about the narration from Abū Ṣalt ('Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Harawī), the servant of Imam Ali Ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā, that Abū Mu'āwiyah had narrated from A'mash, through Mujāhid, where the Prophet said:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلَى بَابِهَا .

I asked him whether it was right, and he had said: "Yes, it is. This narration is quite right."

Nonetheless, we lengthened our discussion in this section with authentic chains from Sunni books of narrations to clarify how much they denied the actuality, even though most of their primary scholars accepted these narrations as correct. Yet a few of them, such as Ibn Juzī, Ibn Adi, Dhahabī, and their companions, did not. Without good reason they said in their books that the narration was an invalid topic. Their malice and disrespect caused their scholars to agree with them, saying: First of all, the communicators of this narration are unreliable, and secondly, it is the repeated mention of Abū Ṣālt that brought the narration to our attention. So we should not say that it is the substance of the narrative, as it can be a matter of discussion along with other narrations, but not on its own.

Nevertheless, the narration was considered when the Sunni scholars sought to prove it, because Yahyā Ibn Muʿīn is a great Sunni scholar whose shaykh, Muhammad Ibn Abdullah Ibn Numayr Hamedānī Khārifi ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Kūfī, as well as his father, is a narrator in the *Ṣiḥāḥ*. The translation of their biographies is in *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb* by ʿAsqalānī, vol. 6, p. 57, and vol. 9, p. 282. Abū Muʿāwiyah Zarīr, Aʿmash,¹²⁴ Mujāhid, and Ibn Abbās are the main authors and narrators of the *Ṣiḥāḥ*.

So why should there be nothing but insulting comments in response to his remarks? Can the animosity and stubbornness of Ibn Juzī, the primary student of Ibn Taymiyyah Ḥarrānī, and his trained puppet, label a large number of scholars and narrators who are known to be honest, such as ʿIsā Ibn Yūnus Ibn Abī Ishāq, Yaʿlī Ibn ʿUbayd, Ibn Numayr, Faydī, and Ibn Muʿīn, as having wrong opinions, and call them mere liars?

The branding of a narration as incorrect and the rejecting of it transgress the rule, and are no more than the illogical remarks of a false government that tried to oppose the facts. There would be no other way to erase a narration that is fully accepted by experts and considered part of the religion.

Above all, even if we overlook the truth of the matter regarding the narration, and consider it weak or unauthorized, it still cannot be called false, but only somewhat weaker. Indeed, if the documentation of a narration seems to be weak, and it clearly does not address the main point, it should be examined further before labeling it false. So what is the reason for considering this narration false? Its only failing is that it concerns the virtue of the Imam of the infallible ones, and explains the truth that Ali is the Gate of Knowledge.

Abū Ṣālt Harawī is only one of the chroniclers of this narration. He was a Shīʿa with a strong ideology and was sensible in

discussion,¹²⁵ and although he was a famous narrator among the scholars, they did not support him, for if they had, they would have had to approve all of what he said about the Household, the Imams, and the poisoning of Imam Ali Ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā, all of which was narrated by Abū Ṣalt. However, instead of approving of him, they branded him as an extremist Shi'a and a malicious liar, and thereby damaged his renown and disgraced him. They did all this to do away with his superb narrations on Imam Riḍā.

Abū Ṣalt was a servant of Imam Riḍā and related many narrations about his guardianship, all of which are recorded in *ʿUyūn Akhbār al-Riḍā*. The Sunnis respected Imam Riḍā and trusted him as a truthful narrator. If a narration is proven one of his, they accept it right away. So why should they disgrace his servant Abū Ṣalt, a pious man with many narrations? They silence him in order to do away with his authentic narrations about monotheism, the guardianship, and the religion of the Shi'a. By condemning him they have somewhat succeeded in getting what they wanted, but what was Abū Ṣalt's crime? He was simply a narrator, and it is the substance of the narrations that matters.

Abū Ṣalt Harawī as a Shi'i Narrator.

This was a brief biography of Abū Ṣalt from the books of Sunni scholars. We shall also explain briefly from the Shi'a books Shaykh Abdullah Māmaqānī has mentioned in the translation of his biography that some people have said that there were two men called ʿAbd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ: one who was Sunni and the other Shi'a. In the section on the companions of Imam Riḍā, Shaykh Ṭūsī considered him to be a Sunni. Allāmah Ḥillī, in the second part of his book, in the section called "Kunā," does likewise by saying: "He is a Sunni, and is of the companions of Imam Riḍā," but this was due to ʿAllāma's writing the book in haste, because, as we already mentioned, his other statement proves that he was a Shi'a.

Anyone who attentively refers to the information from both the Shi'a and the Sunnis becomes certain that there was only one ʿAbd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Abū Ṣalt Khorāsānī Harawī, and similarly, can easily see that he was a Shi'a and believed in the twelve Imams, and that it is a mistake to consider him a Sunni. We include below some statements by the narrators so that this becomes clear.

Najāshī says that he is a reliable man and quite correct in writing the narrations. He also wrote *The Death of Imam Riḍā*. And just that fact alone clearly proves he was a Shi'a, because there is no doubt in

his words about his religion. His rightfulness, his expressions, and his having written the book about the Imam are the best indicators that he followed the Imams. But some scholars have surmised that his truthfulness and belief in the Imams do not mean he was a Shi'a. However, this way of thinking is wrong, because to deny someone's being a Shi'a is the result of forgetting the word *thiqah* in the religion as an expression of Shi'ism. The statement of Ibn Ṭāwūs, which will be examined, explains how he wrote the narrations correctly and was a devout Shi'a.

It has been written of him in the *Tahrir Tāwūsī* that Abū Ahmad Muhammad Sulaymān, who was a Sunni, said that Abbās Dawrī told him that he heard Yahyā Ibn Naṣīm¹²⁶ saying: "Abū Ṣalt is quite honest as a narrator. We saw him and heard some narrations. He was a strong Shi'a, and did not lie about them."

Nazlat Ibn Qays Isfarāyīnī says that he heard Ahmad Ibn Saʿīd Rāzī saying: "Abū Ṣalt Harawī is honest in delivering the narrations. Besides his strong belief in the Messenger of God, this is his religion and he loves it...and there are many similar expressions in the book of Kashshī."

Dhahabī says:

ʿAbd al-Salām Ibn Šāliḥ Abū Ṣalt Harawī is the servant of Imam Riḍā, and he narrates from Ḥammād Ibn Yazīd and Mālik, who said

وَأَوْثَقِي مُتَمِّعَ صَلَاحِهِ

"Although he is a rightful man, he is a Shi'a, so he is not an authentic person."

He also says in *Mizān al-Iʿtidāl*:

رَجُلٌ صَالِحٌ إِلَّا أَنَّهُ شِيعِيٌّ.

"He is a rightful man, but he is Shi'a."

And Jauʿfi said:

رَافِضِيٌّ غَيْبِيٌّ.

"He is an extremist Shi'a and he is malicious." Dar-Quṭnī said:

رَافِضِيٌّ مُتَمِّعٌ.

"He is a condemned Shi'a extremist." And Ibn Juzī said: "He used to be the servant of Imam Riḍā, and although he was a righteous man, he was a Shi'a." And Abū Ḥātam has recorded in *al-Ansāb* by Samaʿānī that:

إِنَّ رَأْسَ مَذْهَبِ الرَّاغِبَةِ.

"He is indeed in the first line of the religious extremists." There are too many examples saying that he was a Shi'a and the follower of the Imams to mention here.

Shahīd Thānī has stated decisively that he gained additional information from Kashshī that Abū Ṣalt had been among the Sunnis and reported their narrations as well. Therefore, he said the Shaykh understood Abū Ṣalt to be a Sunni by mistake. In his book he identified him as a Sunni, and the Allāmah also followed the Shaykh in the second part of the section entitled "Kunā." However, 'Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ is the only one, and he is close to the opposing narrators, but since he had a relationship with all parties, many misunderstood him, along with certain Shi'a scholars such as Muhammad Ibn Ishāq Isfārāyīnī, the author of *al-Sīrah* and famous historian, Sulaymān Ibn Maḥrān Abū Muhammad Asadī A'mash, and others like them. Shaykh Ṭūsī declares that he agrees with him, and mentions Abū Ṣalt in two different places: the sections "Kunā" and "Ayn," in both instances saying that he is a Sunni. This was also Shahīd Thānī's ultimate decision.

Mawlā Muhammad Bāqir Wāḥid Behbahānī says that narrations about Abū Ṣalt are mentioned in the *al-ʿUyūn* and *Amālī*, as well as other books, that prove he was a Shi'a, and even one of the best Shi'a, and they are too numerous to be counted. Sunni scholars have also considered him a Shi'a, and have mentioned most of the Shi'a sayings about him.

In addition, Māmaqānī said: "How can he not be a Shi'a, since he has narrated most of the miracles of Imam Riḍā and Imam Jawād?" He also narrated about the martyrdom of Imam Riḍā. We can ascertain the status of Imam Riḍā from Ṣadūq in his *al-ʿUyūn*, where he says: "To know Abū Ṣalt as a Shi'a is as clear as a light on a hilltop. So that which the Shaykh has said about him is a mistake he made in his writing."

Among those who have comprehended this mistake is Ibn Shahr Āshūb, who said that he believed Abū Ṣalt adhered to "the religion of the Imams." It should be taken into consideration that the 'Allāmah said in the section "Kunā" that he was a Sunni, but Ṣadūq has narrated something about him in *ʿUyūn Akhbār al-Riḍā* that proves he was a Twelve-Imam Shi'a. Apart from that, I have seen in many Sunni books that they understand him to be a Shi'a, even saying that he is

ثِيَمِي رَافِضِي جَلَد

that is, a Shi'a with extreme views, in a similar fashion to what was mentioned in the conclusion of the *Mizān al-I'tidāl*. At this point Ibn Shahr Āshūb's words come to an end.

Also, among the hadiths he has narrated are those about the Imams, which he would not have mentioned but for his close and sincere companionship with them. This also applies to hadiths that have not been passed on, but there is no doubt in the belief that Abū Ṣalt was a Shi'a. So after a discussion of some of the sayings from great men, he overturns certain nonsensical statements. The hadiths that have been narrated by Ṭarā'if from Abū Ṣalt are those which are in *Kashf al-Ghumma*. He then says that Abū Ṣalt Harawī said:

Ali Ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā narrated to me quoting his father, Mūsā Ibn Ja'far, from his father, Ja'far Ibn Muhammad, back through his father, Muhammad Ibn Ali, and his father, Ali Ibn al-Husayn, and then his father, Husayn, and his father, Ali, saying that the Prophet stated:¹²⁷ "Belief consists of promise and action." Then, when we left the meeting, Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal asked: "What are these chains?" Abū Ṣalt said that my father answered: "This is a kind of intoxicating drug given to the mad, because when it is poured into the nostrils of a madman, it improves his health."

By this Abū Ṣalt's father meant that the chain was effective, and that if those words were recited to a madman, they would help him be cured. Our proof is what has been mentioned in Ibn Shahr Āshūb's *al-Manāqib*: that Ahmad Ḥanbal had another derivation from the Household, where there was a hadith from Mūsā Ibn Ja'far saying: "My father, Ja'far Ibn Muhammad, narrated it to me, and he likewise traced it back to the Prophet." Ahmad said: "These chains are such that if they were read to a madman he would recover on the spot!"

In addition, he says that what is narrated in *Tahdhib al-Aḥkamāl* states: "Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ Abū al-Ṣalt al-Harawī was the servant of Ali Ibn Mūsā al-Riḍā, and although Abū Ṣalt was a Shi'a, he was a righteous. He died in year 236."¹²⁸

Abū Ṣalt was consequently in the presence of Imam Riḍā for about two years. He also lived at the time of Imam Muhammad Taqī and for a while during the time of Imam Ali al-Naqī. Because he settled in Marv, in the year 200 AH Ma'mūn invited Imam Riḍā there from Medina. The Imam was martyred at the age of 55 at the end of the month of Safar, 203 AH, and the martyrdom of Imam Muhammad al-Taqī was in 254. The reason that most of the hadiths of Abū Ṣalt are about Imam Riḍā, but there are few about Imam Muhammad Taqī, is that the other two Imams, Imam Jawād and Imam Hādī, used

to live in Baghdad, Medina, and Samira, whereas Abū Ṣalt was in Marv.¹²⁹

Abū Ṣalt Harawī is buried in Mashhad Raḍawī, on the outskirts of the city, some 12 kilometers away,¹³⁰ where there is a shrine venerated by the Shi'a.

The Invented Hadiths about Abū Bakr, Omar, and Othman

No matter how the Sunnis tried to erase the venerated hadiths on the virtues and priority of Imam Ali, they did not succeed, because truthful scholars amongst them rose up and proclaimed the hadith stating "I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so whoever wants to enter the city must take the right gate" in their various books. There is no fault to be found in this, but by inventing another hadith, they found reasons to argue that if Ali is the gate of the city, then Abū Bakr, Omar, and Othman are the walls of the city, or that Abū Bakr is the foundation of the city, Omar is like its walls, and Othman the roof of the city. Some others even went further by also saying that Mu'āwiyah is the hand-ring of the door. These were attempts to diminish the significance of the gate of the city.

Suyūṭī includes this in *Tārikh Ibn Asākar* through his own chains from Hasan Ibn Tamīm back to Anas as: "I am the City of Knowledge and Abū Bakr, Omar, and Othman are the walls around the city, and Ali is its gate; so whoever seeks knowledge must enter the city through the main gate."

Ibn Asākar said that both the meaning of the hadith and its chain are unreliable.

Moreover, Ibn Asākar includes in his *Tārikh* that he was told by Abū al-Faraj Qays Ibn Ali Khaṭīb that Abū al-Faraj Isfarāyīnī said to him:

Abū Sa'īd Ismā'īl Ibn Muthannā Astarābādī once was lecturing to the people in Damascus, when a man stood up among the people and said: "O Shaykh, what is your opinion about the Prophet's words: 'I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate'?"

Abū Sa'īd thought for a short while, and then turned to him saying: "Yes, it is true, but no one knows the whole meaning of this hadith unless he has a high rank in Islam. That which the Prophet said is: 'I am the City of Knowledge and Abū Bakr is its foundation, Omar is the wall around it, Othman is its roof, and Ali is its gate.'"

Those who were present liked and respected his reply. Abū Saʿīd then repeated it, saying: "Abū Bakr is the foundation of the city, Omar is the wall, and Othman is its roof."

When his sermon came to an end, those present there asked him to build up for them the chain of the hadith (that is, to tell them from whom he had heard it, and from whom the narrator had heard it, in order to connect it to the Prophet). But he was worried and did not say where he had found it, mentioning neither the primary narrators nor the source of the hadith.¹³¹

The Rejection of Ibn Ḥajar Haythamī, the Reasoning, and the Fabricated Hadiths

After explaining this hadith in his *al-Fatāwīʾ al-Ḥadithah*, Ibn Ḥajar Haythamī writes: "This hadith is weak, and also, 'Muʿāwiyah is the ring of the door' is false."

Nevertheless, in *al-Ṣawāʿiq al-Muḥriqah*, his insistence on falsehood, the weakening and debasement of rectitude, and his attempt to show the priority of Abū Bakr over Imam Ali have discredited his insight and blinded him. And what he himself describes in his *al-Fatāwīʾ al-Ḥadithah* as void and of no value, he defends here as wholly correct. He then refers to his chain and writings to prove that the phrase referring to Imam Ali, *wa Aliyyun bābuha*, is wrong. It is truly said that a drowning man clutches at straws, since it is quite right in this case.¹³²

Haythamī says that "He who seeks knowledge must enter the city through the main gate" need not refer to the most learned, because sometimes people consult the unlearned who express fine speech. Hence, he has sacrificed his time by abandoning any serious learning, as opposed to a learned man who invests all his time and energy in increasing his knowledge.

Secondly, this report contradicts that of Firdaws Daylamī, whose version is: "I am the City of Knowledge and Abū Bakr is its foundation, Omar is its wall, and Othman its roof and gate," which gives priority to Abū Bakr. In this case, the command to enter the City through its Gate is as described earlier, but not because of any greater nobility, because in this case it is clear that the wall and roof are more important than the gate.

And thirdly, some have taken the hadith to mean quite the opposite, as: "I am the City of Knowledge, and the Gate of this City is most high." This is similar to the case of the hadith stating: "This is the

straight path to Ali," which, by adding vowels to "Ali," is changed in meaning to "This is the straight and lofty road."¹³³

From what we have mentioned, this man's baseless words become clear, because having given credence to a weak hadith in his book, he clings to a worthless chain. With no evidence of an original chain, he has taken it as a proof to rely upon to set against the statement that *Ali bābuhā*. Does this indicate anything other than the weakness of a baseless belief? 'Allāmah Amīnī says:

'Ajlūnī has narrated this hadith from Firdaws, without referring to Ibn Masūd, in *Kashf al-Khifā*, vol. 1, p. 204. He has also recounted from Anas that *Ana madinat al-'ilm wa Ali bābuhā wa Mu'āwiyah ḥalqatuhā*, whereas in *Maqāsīd* he says:

وَالْجَمْلَةُ فَكَلَهَا ضَعِيفَةٌ وَالْقَائِلُ هَازِكٌ

which means: "All these hadiths are weak, and the senseless phrases of most of them are composed of meaningless words."

Sayyid Muhammad Darvīsh al-Ḥūt has declared in *Kitāb Asnā al-Maṭālib*, p. 73, that it is not a right to write this kind of information, especially for Ibn al-Ḥajar Haythamī, in a scholarly book like *al-Ṣawā'iq al-Muḥriqah*.¹³⁴ Secondly, from their translation of *bāb* or *faḥ* *ya'ti al-bāb* they seek to derive a meaning that benefits them. The best way to discover their purpose in translating it so is in Arabic literature, because anyone who is reasonably familiar with the Arabic language knows that the meaning of the word *bāb* (door or gate) in such cases is not merely a structure to pass through, but it demonstrates "exclusivity," meaning that to benefit from receiving the Prophet's secret knowledge, one should pass through this door. And this would not happen unless the gate itself was filled with knowledge and prophetic secrets, the very things with which the Prophet wanted to quench the thirst of his nation. The vast knowledge of prophethood would be transferred to the nation only through its gate, which is particularly emphasized by the phrase following mention of the gate, namely: "Whosoever wants to enter the city must do so through the main gate."

This is found in the literature and is the best way of interpreting the word "gate." However, the unfortunate inventor and translator of the hadith has missed the point by correlating the gate with the walls and roof of the city. He has imagined a city in his mind, where people enter, walk about, and look at the things going on within, and then rest under its roof when they wish to: they even knock at the door with the door-handle. He has constructed this city in his empty

imagination and then written about it. He did not think that this city in fact is not a complete city.¹³⁵

By *wa Aliyyun bābuhā*, the Prophet wants to say that the only means for connecting with endless prophetic knowledge, becoming acquainted with the truth, and quenching one's thirst is through his primary caliph and successor, Imam Ali. Obtaining the Prophet's knowledge is to be done in the same way as using the main gate to enter a town, so the term "gate" here has a symbolic meaning for the nobility of the knowledge of Ali.¹³⁶

Thus, for whoever intends to enter a city and enjoy himself there, there is no other way than through the main entrance. If he wants to enter from another direction, he faces danger or finds it impossible, and perhaps falls into a ditch that has been dug around the city. If he tries to climb up and over the high walls, there is a risk of being captured or falling, for guards may capture him or watchdogs may tear him apart. After being captured, he could be taken to the court and condemned for attempting to steal.

So this is the meaning of the door in the hadith we are discussing, and it is more logical than what has been translated along with the walls and the roof. Imam Ali is the sole exemplary gate through which people are to attempt to enter. He is the banner of prophethood, the Qur'an, and everything necessary for man in this life and in the Hereafter—morality, knowledge, unity, religion, judgment, law, and politics—and he is entrusted with the science of this world and knowledge of the Hereafter. On the other hand, an overabundance of clearly expressed judgments, and the investment of time in the affairs of the people, which Ibn Hajar has rejected as requiring more knowledge, is nevertheless wrong.

The one whom God chooses as leader of all Muslims, or even of all beings, must have vast knowledge and power to solve whatever problems exist within society and to settle disputes between the people, knowledge of jurisprudence and expertise in interpreting the Qur'an, and the ability to explain the different creeds among the people. He must know the traditions of the Prophet and how to distinguish hypocrites from believers. He must be a good orator and associate with the poor and solve their problems.

This is the way of the prophets and God's apostles. If this were not so, everything would revolve around worldly matters, and government would turn into a tyrannical system. The ruler would remain in his palace and consider himself supreme and most learned. He would hand over the affairs of the country to people who know

nothing about such matters, and then things would happen that should not.

This was the policy of Imam Ali, and both his friends and enemies accepted it. Their eyes were opened wide by his extraordinary knowledge, and listeners were overwhelmed by his flowing speech. He would sit with orphans and the poor and needy. He would be like a true father to orphans and feed them with his own hands. He would comfort helpless women and feed the poor at night after darkness had fallen. He carried his leather bag filled with bread and dates on his shoulder, and dealt with the problems of all the needy.

Also, it is an invention to take the name of Ali, as in the lofty phrase "Ali is its Gate," as an attribute that is not factual. No one believes that such exceptional terminology could be invented, let alone accepted, unless he himself is in error.

A strange thing about it is that Ibn Hajar himself has mentioned

أبو بكر أسألهما وعمر حيطانها وعثمان سقها

in his hadith in *al-Ṣawāʿiq*, and he has then added

فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْمَدِينَةَ

after *wa Aliyyun bābuhā*. In this case, how does the attribute come into one's mind?

However, there is a maxim in Persian that "a liar must have a good memory." Those who have decided to depart from the light of guardianship, like bats from sunlight shining from east to west, have forgotten that the phrase *wa Aliyyun bābuhā* is followed by

فَمَنْ أَرَادَ الْمَدِينَةَ فَلْيَأْتِ الْبَابَ

which means that whoever wants to enter the city must enter through the main gate, that is, Ali. This they blindly ignore.

They have repeated a similar mistake regarding the words of *wa ṣāliḥ al-Muʾminin* (the righteous faithful) in the Qurʾanic verse, without considering that if the verse does not refer to Imam Ali, then to whom does it refer? If it meant all the righteous people among the believers, it would have been recorded in the Book as *wa ṣāliḥu al-Muʾminin* [righteous faithfuls].¹³⁷

The Elegies of Ibn Fahd Hāshimī and Shaykh Kāzim Ozrī

There is an elegy from Hāfiz ʿIzz al-Dīn ʿAbd al-Azīz, known as Ibn Fahd Hāshimī Makkī Shāfiʿī, to conclude this discussion. He

composed it before he died in the year 932 in praise of Imam Ali, and his boundless knowledge:

- 1 لَيْتَ الْمُحْرَبِ الْمُنْزِعَ غَمًّا مَنْ بِحُتَامِهِ جَابَ الدَّمَاجِي وَالظُّلَمَ
- 2 صَهْرَ الرَّسُولِ أَخُوهُ بَابَ عُلُومِهِ أَقْصَى الصَّحَابَةِ دُورَ السَّمَائِلِ وَالشَّيْمَ
- 3 الرَّهْدَ وَالْوَرَعَ الشَّدِيدَ شِجَارَهُ وَدِكَاؤُهُ الصَّنَدَ الصَّمِيمَ مَعَ الْكَرَمِ
- 4 فِي جُودِهِ مَا الْجَبَرُ؟ مَا الثَّيَارُ؟ مَا كُلُّ السُّيُولِ؟ وَمَا الْقَوَادِي وَالذُّيُمِ
- 5 وَلَهُ الشُّبَاعَةُ النَّهْمَةُ وَالنَّجْمَا وَكَذَا الصَّاحَةُ وَالْبَلَاغَةُ وَالْحِكْمُ
- 6 مَا عَنَتْنِ؟ مَا غَمِي؟ فِي الْبَاسِ؟ مَا اسْتَدَّ الشَّرَى مَعَهُ إِذَا الْمُحْرَبُ اضْطَلَمَ
- 7 مَا تَجَلَّ سَاعِدُهُ الْخُلُوعُ لَدَيْهِ؟ مَا سُبْحَانُ إِنْ تَرَا الْكَلامَ وَإِنْ تَنْظُمَ
- 8 حَاوِ النَّصَائِلِ تَلَمَّحًا سُبْحَانَ مَنْ مِنْ فَضْلِهِ أَعْطَاهُ ذَاكَ مِنْ الْقَدَمِ
- 9 صَهْرَ الرَّسُولِ وَكَرَفَتَاهُ؟ قِيَالَهُ مِنْ تَجَلَّى عَنْ فَضْلِهِ لِلْعَلَقِ عَمَ
- 10 كُلُّ أَقْرَبَ بِفَضْلِهِ حَقًّا وَذَا أَمْرُ جَلِي فِي «عَلَى» مَا نَهَمَ
- 11 فَضْلِهِ مِنْ أَلْفِ أَلْفِ تَحِيَّةٍ وَعَلَى الصَّحَابَةِ كُلِّهِمْ أَهْلُ الذَّمِّ 138

1. [It was Ali] who as a lion, the Chief, Master, and Champion of the battlefield, with his unsheathed sword in hand tore up the darkness of night.
2. He is the son-in-law of the Prophet, his brother, the gate of his knowledge, and his most stable companion in judgment and ethics.
3. His prime charge is to remove the cares of the world, with his vast justice, generosity, and good behavior.
4. The sea is next to nothing before his generosity; the waves on the sea cease before him. What matter the nourishment of the world, the morning shower, or thunderbolts before him?
5. And courage is his alone, his heart is full of bravery, greatness, and power; and his humility is the treasury of wisdom.
6. What can 'Antar do before him in the conflict of the hardest battle? And what can those other than 'Antar do? Or those lions close to the strand of Euphrates, who are renowned for their courage?
7. What can the son of Sā'idah, considered so famed an orator, do before him? And how can Suhān, the poet of fame, be compared with Ali, when he opens his mouth to utter one word?
8. The Master of the Faithful, without doubt, has all knowledge with him; most Exalted is God Who honored him with such knowledge from the beginning.
9. He assisted God's Prophet in all difficulties; he sacrificed his life for his security; so may the Divine Mercy be upon him who is the

cousin of God's Prophet, such a cousin whose generosity is shared among all nations.

10. Indeed, all people and all religions, without exception, agree and accept his virtues; this is a clear matter concerning Ali that is not veiled from the people.
11. Therefore, from me to him, let there be thousands of salutations and praises; as well as to all the companions who were responsible in supporting God's Prophet and protecting him.

And Shaykh Kāzim Ozrīsays:

عَائِدُ الْمُؤْمِلِينَ يُجِيبُ سَامِعُ مَا تُسْرُ مِنْ نَجْوَاهَا 1
 إِنَّمَا الْمَصْطَفَى مَدِينَةُ عِلْمٍ وَهُوَ الْبَابُ مَنْ آتَاهُ آتَاهَا 2
 وَمَا مَثَلُ الْوَالِدَيْنِ هَاعِلِي، وَاحِدٌ يَمَاهَا. 3

1. The Master sees to the needs of the needy; the holder of mercy is he; and he understands the secrets of those who whisper in silence.
2. This is simply nothing but the reason that Muṣṭafā is the City of Knowledge, and he is its only Gate; therefore, whoever enters the city enters through him.
3. Those two are the eyes of insight, of which the left eye is Ali, and the right eye is Ahmad.¹³⁹

**Lessons One Hundred Fifty-Seven
to One Hundred Sixty**

**The Judgments and Legal Procedures
of Imam Ali**

LESSONS ONE HUNDRED FIFTY-SEVEN TO ONE HUNDRED SIXTY

In the Name of God, the most Compassionate, the most Merciful

And blessings be upon Muhammad and his pure Household, and
may God's curse be upon his enemies from now until the Day of
Resurrection. And there is no power or strength except for the High
and Most Glorious Allah.

God, the Wise, has stated in His Noble Book:

أَمَّنْ هُوَ كَانَتْ آتَاءُ الْإِلِّ سَاجِدًا وَكَانَ يَحْتَدُّ الْأَخِيرَةَ وَيُجَازِ حَمَّةَ رَبِّهِ قُلْ هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ
وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ إِنَّمَا يَتَذَكَّرُ أُولُو الْأَلْبَابِ

Is one who worships devoutly during the hours of the night, prostrate and standing, who takes heed of the Hereafter [like one who does not]? Say, "Are those who know equal to those who know not? But only those of understanding will pay heed" (39:9).¹⁴⁰

The Hadith of the Shi'a and Sunni Where the Verse *al-ladhīna ya'lamūn* Refers to the Immaculate Imams

In the commentary on the above verse in *Ghāyat al-Marām*, there are twelve hadiths from the Shi'a and one from the Sunnis.

The Sunni hadith is from Ibn Shahr Āshūb, quoting Nishābūrī in *Rawḍat al-Wā'izīn* as saying that Urwat Ibn Zubayr said that some of the companions had heard Anas Ibn Mālik saying that the verse below referred to Ali.

أَمَّنْ هُوَ كَانَتْ آتَاءُ الْإِلِّ سَاجِدًا وَكَانَ يَحْتَدُّ الْأَخِيرَةَ وَيُجَازِ حَمَّةَ رَبِّهِ قُلْ هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ
وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ إِنَّمَا يَتَذَكَّرُ أُولُو الْأَلْبَابِ

A companion of the Prophet said:

We went to Ali at sunset and saw him praying, and in his prayer he was reciting the Qur'an; he went on until dawn and the morning prayer. At that time he refreshed his ablution and set out for the mosque, and there he said his morning prayer along with the others in the mosque. Then he prepared to establish some supererogatory prayers, which he did until the sun rose. He remained in the mosque and people went to him with their problems and personal questions, and this lasted until the time for the noon prayer. Again he refreshed his ablution and began the midday

prayer. He then sat to say supererogatory prayers until the evening, and he also said the evening prayer in the mosque. After that, he stood among the people and answered their different questions and solved their problems.¹⁴¹

In the first of the Shi'a hadiths, Kulaynī has narrated by means of his chains from 'Ammār Sābātī, quoting Imam Ṣādiq. After commenting on the earlier verse, he says: "God, the Honorable and Exalted, refers to the attributes of Ali, and by this verse informs men of his priorities." Then Imam Ṣādiq said: "O 'Ammār, this explains that noble verse."¹⁴²

After mentioning this about Imam Ṣādiq, Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm says in his commentary:

أَمْرٌ هُوَ قَدْ رُفِعَ إِلَيْهِ سَاجِدًا وَقَانِيًا يَحْتَدُّ الْآخِرَةَ

has been revealed about Imam Ali.

وَمِنْ جَوَارِحِهِمْ قَوْلُهُ (يَا مُحَمَّدُ) قُلْ (يَا مُحَمَّدُ) هَلْ يَسْتَوِي الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ وَالَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ إِنَّمَا يَتَذَكَّرُ أُولُو الْأَلْبَابِ

This means the people of wisdom and discernment.¹⁴⁴

There are nine hadiths through different chains from Kulaynī, Muhammad Ibn Hasan Ṣaffār in *Basāy'ir al-Darajāt*, and Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Khālīd Barqī in *Maḥāsīn*, and also recorded by Muhammad Ibn Abbās, that Imam Abū Ja'far al-Bāqir and Imam Abū Abdullah al-Ṣādiq said in a commentary on the verse:

مَنْ نَحْنُ الَّذِينَ يَعْلَمُونَ، وَعَدُوُّنَا الَّذِينَ لَا يَعْلَمُونَ، وَيَسْتَأْذِنُوا الْأَلْبَابَ¹⁴⁵

"It is we who know, and those who know not are our enemies, and our followers are the people of wisdom and discernment."

Through his own chains, Ḥakīm Ḥaskānī also has this part of the hadith from Imam Bāqir,¹⁴⁶ and Shaykh Ṭabarsī has mentioned the same interpretation of the hadith with no chain.¹⁴⁷

After explaining the same text from *Kāfī*, 'Allāmah Ṭabāṭabā'ī has narrated it through his chain from Imam Bāqir, and then says: "This analysis has been narrated in different ways by Imam Bāqir and Imam Ṣādiq," which is a translation of sorts without comment.¹⁴⁸

Then, by means of another chain from Ibn Abbās, Ḥakīm Ḥaskānī narrates another hadith, saying: "*Wa al-ladhīna la ya'lamūn*

refers to Ali and his Household from the Banī Hāshim, and *ulul al-bāb* refers to our followers."¹⁴⁹

However, the principle of knowledge is so great that God rhetorically questions the greatness of the matter by asking: *Say [O Prophet], Are those who know equal to those who know not?* This verse, like many others, is so clear that it is used in various schools of thought and will shine until the Day of Resurrection. It is of the first magnitude and the most important example of the value of knowledge, which is what separates man from the animals and other things. The difference between knowledge and ignorance is like light and darkness, nearness and distance, or insight and blindness. It is the difference between happiness and sorrow, Heaven and Hell, and truth and error, and is the secret of creation and being.

From these discussions it appears that Imam Ali was the foremost in knowledge among all the companions of the Prophet, and no other could reach his lofty status. If they had wanted to, they would have fallen and broken their wings. Only he sat at the summit of the mountain of knowledge, not only among the Prophet's companions, but no one among all beings, other than the Prophet himself, had such knowledge.

Ibn Shahr Āshūb says: "During the period of his government, Omar had difficulty answering 23 different questions from the people, so he referred to Imam Ali for the correct answers. He confessed: 'If Ali were not, Omar would perish.'" Other narrators such as Abū Bakr, Ibn Abbās¹⁵⁰ and Abū al-Muzaffar Sam'ānī have reported that Omar said these words.

Concerning this, Ṣāḥib Ibn Abbād says:

مَلْ يَمْلُ كَوَاكِ إِذَا قَالُوا جَاهِلَةٌ لَوْلَا عَلِيٌّ مَلَكْنَا فِي كَلْبَانَا؟

"Has there ever been a command of yours, without its being clearly announced to the nation: 'If there were not Ali, we would have perished for the verdicts we made on different questions'?"

Khaṭīb Khārazmī says:

إِذَا عَمَرْتُ مَخْطُوفِي جَوَابٍ وَتَبَهُ عَلَى الصَّوَابِ
يَقُولُ بِمَنْزِلِهِ لَوْلَا عَلِيٌّ مَلَكْتُ مَلَكْتُ فِي ذَاكَ الْجَوَابِ

"Whenever Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb made a mistake in answering a certain question, Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib would remind him, and he would correct his remark and say: 'If it were not for Ali, I would fail to answer, and I would perish.'"

And the following is attributed to Abū Bakr:

فَإِنْ أَسْتَفْتُ فَأَتَّبِعُونِي وَإِنْ زَعْتُ هُوَ مَوْنِي

"If my command, speech, and action are reliable, then follow me, but if I make a mistake, then correct me."

And concerning the meaning of "the fruit" he said:

¹⁵¹ .أَبَدُ know that, but God knows the meaning of

Also, concerning the inheritance of *kalālah* he said:

أَقُولُ فِيهَا أَيُّ قَوْلٍ أَصَبْتُ مِنَ اللَّهِ، وَإِنْ أَعْطَاكَ فَمِنْهُ وَمِنْ الشَّيْطَانِ: الْكَالَاءَةُ مَا دُونَ الْوَالِدِ وَالْوَالِدِ ¹⁵²

"Concerning *kalālah*, which they inherit in a special way, I command according to my opinion. So, if my opinion is correct, it is from God, but if I make a mistake, then I am guilty—it is from Satan. *Kalālah* applies to the relatives of the deceased, other than the father and son."

Omar was asked by Sabī^c about *al-dhāriyyāt*, and he was unable to answer. ¹⁵³

And Omar also said:

لَا تَعْجَبُوا مِنْ إِمَامٍ أَعْطَا أَمْرًا وَاصَابَتْ، فَأَصَلَتْ أَمِيرًا كَرِهْتُمْ ¹⁵⁴

"Be not surprised about a leader who makes mistakes, or a woman who speaks the truth. This woman fought with your Emir in the field, and she was a victor!"

Words of the Prophet Concerning the Knowledge of Imam Ali

Omar was unable to answer questions about *himāriyyah* ¹⁵⁵ and *kalālah* in the verse, and similar matters related to inheritance. This is sufficient to demonstrate why the Prophet said: "Ali is the chest of my knowledge." It also suffices as an explanation for why he would say: "Ali's knowledge and faith are more than the knowledge and faith of you all."

He also said: "After my demise, the most learned among my nation is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib." Both Ali Ibn Hāshim and Ibn Shīrūyah Daylami have narrated this hadith through their chains.

Moreover, he said:

أَعْطَى اللَّهُ عَلِيًّا مِنَ الْفَضْلِ جُزْءَ الْوَقْفِ عَلَى أَهْلِ الْأَرْضِ لَوْ سَمِعَهُمْ، وَأَعْطَاهُ مِنَ الْقَهْمِ جُزْءَ الْوَقْفِ عَلَى أَهْلِ الْأَرْضِ لَوْ سَمِعَهُمْ

"God, the Honorable and Exalted, has bestowed honor upon Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib such that if He had given it to all the people of the world, it would suffice them; and He bestowed upon him such knowledge and insight that if He had given it to the people of the world it would be enough for all."

It is also sufficient that it says in *Hilliyyat al-Awliyā'*:

فُتِّمَتِ الْحِكْمَةُ عَشْرَةَ أَجْزَاءَ وَأَعْطِيَ عَلَى تِسْعَةِ أَجْزَاءٍ وَالْأَسْرَافُ جُزْءًا وَاحِدًا.¹⁵⁶

"Wisdom has been divided into ten, and nine parts of it have been given to Ali, and the last part is shared among all the nations of the world."

Rabīʿ Ibn K̄uthaym says:

مَا زِلْتُ رَجُلًا مَنْ يَحِبُّهُ أَشَدُّ حُبًّا مِنْ عَلِيٍّ وَلَا مَنْ يَبْغِضُهُ أَشَدُّ بَغْضًا مِنْ عَلِيٍّ. ثُمَّ أَفْهَمْتُ عَمَّا: وَمَنْ يُوْتِ الْحِكْمَةُ هَذَا وَبِئْسَ رَاكِبًا!

"I have not seen such a man as Ali, whose love is more than everything for him who loves him; and whose rancor towards him who begrudges him is more than all others, but then turns his face, saying: *and he unto whom wisdom is given, he truly hath received abundant good*" (Qur'an 2:269).

It has been scientifically reasoned that the phrase *a'lam al-umma* is numerically the same as the name Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, both being a total of 218, and the values of *a'lam al-umma jamāl al-umma* and *Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib Sayyid al-nuḥabā* both come to 370.

Dik al-Jinn says:

هُوَ الَّذِي سُمِّىَ أَبَا الْيَاقِينِ صَدَقْتَ قَدْ أَصَبْتَ بِالْيَقِينِ 1
وَهُوَ أَبُو الْعِلْمِ الَّذِي لَا يَنْعَلَمُ مِنْ قَوْلِهِ قُولُوا وَلَا تَمْتَحِنُوا. 2

1. He it is who has been named the Father of Knowledge; you stated it right, you used the best language!
2. And he is source of knowledge which has not come to light yet. So receive his words and accept them; do not turn over your voice in your mouth like animals that look for fodder.

All agree that the Prophet said: "The best judge among you is Ali."¹⁵⁷

The Discussion of Imam Ṣādiq with Ibn Abī Laylā on the Knowledge of Imam Ali

It has been narrated to us by Saʿīd Ibn Abū al-Khaḍīb and others, that Imam Ṣādiq asked Ibn Abī Laylā: "O ʿAbd al-Raḥmān, do you issue instructions and decisions among the people?"

He answered: "Yes, O the son of the Prophet."

The Imam then asked: "By what means do you instruct and give your decisions?"

He answered: "By the Book of God."

So the Imam asked: "Then what if you could not find your answer in the Book of God? By what means are you going to answer?"

He answered: "By the traditions of the Prophet. And if I do not find the answer in the traditions of the Prophet, then I take it from the statements of the companions wherein they all agree and have no differences regarding it."

The Imam asked: "Then what would you do if the companions did not unanimously agree upon a matter? Which one are you going to choose?"

He said: "In that case, I would choose one, and by doing so, reject the rest."

The Imam then asked: "Have you ever disagreed with Ali's instructions and judgments through which he gave a verdict on a matter?"

He answered: "Yes, I have done so. I have disagreed with Ali and taken the verdict of others."

So the Imam said: "Then, on the Day of Resurrection, how are you going to answer to God when His Prophet says to Him: 'O my Creator, this man heard my decision, but he rejected it?'"

He said: "O son of the Prophet, why would I have rejected the decision of the Prophet?"

The Imam said: "Have you not heard that the Prophet said: 'The best judge among you is Ali?'"

Then Ibn Abī Laylā's face turned pale and he said no more.¹⁵⁸

And in *Ibānah*, Abū Amāma informs us that the Prophet had stated:

أَعْلَمُهَا لَشَيْءٍ وَأَعْلَمُهَا بِشَيْءٍ عَلَى بَنِي إِسْرَافِيلَ.

"The wisest, the most aware man, among the people in my traditions after I am gone is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib."

In the books of *Jilā' wa Shifā' wa Iḥān wa Miḥān*, it states that Imam Ṣādiq said:

It so happened that a matter occurred in Yemen, and Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib resolved it in such a way that the people there went to the Prophet and said: "Ali has indeed oppressed us in this case."

The Prophet said:

إِنَّ عَلِيَّائِسَ بِطَالٍ وَلَمْ يَخْلُقِ لِلْعَلَمِ وَإِنْ عَلِيًّا وَلَكُمْ يَمْدِي وَالْحُكْمَ حُكْمُهُ وَالْقَوْلَ قَوْلُهُ لَا يَرُدُّ حُكْمَهُ إِلَّا الْكَافِرُ وَلَا يَرْضَى بِهِ إِلَّا الْمُؤْمِنُ.

"Ali is never an oppressor; he was not born to oppress anyone. Indeed, Ali is to be your master and guardian after me. The command will be his command, and judgment his judgment. None will disobey him except the disbeliever, and none approve of him but the believers."¹⁵⁹

As these matters are quite evident facts; no one is entitled to refer to anyone besides Ali for his needs. The term

قَضَاءُ

that occurs in the phrase includes all religious affairs. Therefore, according to *Aliyyun a'lam*, no one is permitted to favor anyone other than Ali, and they should refer to him for their needs, for he is the most knowledgeable and learned.

The famous poet 'Aunī said:

أَمِنْ سِوَاهُ إِذَا إِلَى بَعْضِيهِ طَرَدَ الْفُكُوكَ وَأَغْرَسَ الْحُكَمَاءُ؟ 1
كَذَا رَأَى رَأْيَهُ خَالَفَ رَأْيَهُ قَوْمٌ وَإِنْ كُنُوا لَهُ الْأَهْلَاءُ؟ 2
نَزَلَ الْكِتَابُ بِرَأْيِهِ فَكَيْفَ عَقَدَ الْإِلَهُ بِرَأْيِهِ الْحُكَمَاءُ؟ 3

1. Has there ever been [a judge] apart from Ali, who, when a case was taken to him, resolved it properly and without doubt, bewildering all other judges?
2. Has there been, apart from Ali, anyone who, when deliberating a case, had all other judges come together and give their opinions to prove his decision wrong?
3. Based on his opinion, the verses of the Glorious Qur'an are sent down, as if God has fixed His commands upon his opinion.

And Ibn Ḥammād says:

عَلِيمٌ بِمَا قَدْ كَانَ أَوْ هُوَ كَائِنٌ وَمَا هُوَ دِقٌّ فِي الشَّرَائِعِ أَوْ جِلٌّ 1
مُسْتَعِيٌّ جُلًّا فِي الصَّحَائِفِ كُلِّهَا فَتَسَلُّ أَهْلَهَا وَاسْتَمِعْ تِلَاوَةً مَنْ يَتْلُو 2
وَلَوْ لَا قَضَائَاهُ الَّتِي شَاعَ ذِكْرُهَا لَمَطَلَتْ الْأَحْكَامُ وَالْقُرُصُ وَالْأَنْفُلُ. 3

1. [Ali] is aware of the final events, and thereby aware of future ones; and he is aware of the religions of the earlier prophets, the greater and the lesser.
2. [Ali] has been introduced as the most great and pure, and is free from any misunderstanding of all sacred books and scrolls; so ask the People of the Book, and listen to those who recite them.
3. And if there were not commands and verdicts issued by him, which are now mentioned by all, surely all divine commands, obligations, and recommendations would be neglected.

Sayyid Ismāʿīl Ḥimyarī said:

مَنْ كَانَ أَغْلَمَهُمْ وَأَقْضَاهُمْ وَمَنْ جَلَّ الرَّعِيَّةَ وَالرِّعَاءَ سَوَاءً. ¹⁶⁰

"[Ali] is the one who is most learned among the nation of the Prophet, and he is the most astute in judgment and making decisions. It is he who gives the same status to rich and poor, leaders and the rank and file."¹⁶¹

In fact, his knowledge was so vast and deep that one puts oneself to shame by attempting to write about him, for life would come to an end before finishing such a project. As the poet says: "The water of the sea is not enough to wet the fingertip and count the pages of the book written about your precedence."

Scholars Who Have Mentioned Imam Ali's Cases and Judgments

There are countless books of hadiths, commentaries, and histories on ethics and other topics from the Shi'a and Sunnis that benefit from the knowledge of Imam Ali. Numerous books have been written about his judgments, commands, and answers to questions, including Kulayrī's *al-Kāfi*, Shaykh Ṣadūq's *Man lā Yahdurhu al-Faqih*, Shaykh Mufid's *Irshād*, Shaykh Ṭūsī's *Tahdhīb*, Sayyid Raḍī's *Khaṣṣā' is al-A'imma*, and Ibn Shahr Āshūb's *al-Manāqib*, all of which have descriptions of Imam Ali.

Earlier scholars have written separate books on this subject, some of which have still not reached us. Either they have been neglected and lost over time, or have been placed in libraries without being

indexed separately, like the books of Ismā'īl Ibn Khālid and Abdullah Ibn Ahmad Ibn Āmir, which are recorded in the index under Shaykh and Najāshī. And according to Najāshī, the books of Muhammad Ibn Qays Asadī and Muhammad Ibn Ghays Bajalī are indexed under Tūṣī and Najāshī, as well as certain hadiths and so on.

Both Majlisī's *Biḥār al-Anwār* and Shaykh Ḥurr Āmilī's *Wasā'il al-Shi'a* provide separate sections mentioning Ali Ibn Abī Tālib's commands and judgments, and Ibn Shahr Āshūb says that Muwaffaq Makkī, a Sunni, has written a book on this subject.

Recently, 'Allāmah Amīnī has referred to Imam Ali's cases in *al-Ghadr*, vol. 6, in the section "The Rare Effect in Omar's Knowledge," and there is also Shaykh Muhammad Shūshtarī's *Qadā' Amīr al-Mu'minīn*. Shaykh Dhabihullah Maḥallātī has written about judgments of Imam Ali in *Ḥaqq al-Mubīn*, and Sayyid Muḥsin Āmilī has written a separate book called '*Ajā'ib Aḥkām Amīr al-Mu'minīn Ali Ibn Abi Tālib*, quoting Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm Qumī.

The late Amīnī says at the beginning of this book:

Among the books that have been published on the cases and commands of Imam Ali Ibn Abī Tālib is a bulky book that Shaykh Bahā'ī says, in his 28th hadith from *al-Arba'in*, that he got in Khorasan.

Another book is that of Muhammad Ibn Qays Bajalī, from the companions of Imam Kāzim, which is entitled *Qadāya Amīr al-Mu'minīn*, which Shaykh Najāshī and Shaykh Tūṣī have narrated.

A third one is from Mu'allā Ibn Muhammad Baṣrī, of which Najāshī says: "These are the cases of Imam Ali."

Another book is that of Muḥaddith Shahīr Tirmidhī, the author of *Ṣaḥīḥ*, which has a description of Imam Husayn in the first part. The next best one of the recent century is that of Shaykh Abdullah 'Alāyalī, who writes on p. 142 that Imam Tirmidhī gave priority to the cases of Imam Ali, and gathered them in a commendable collection. And 'Allāmah Ibn Qayyim Juzī has much of this in *al-Siyāsāt al-Shar'iyyah*, quoting Tirmidhī.

Yet another contains exceptional instructions from Imam Ali, the main manuscript copy of which is with us now. All the hadiths it contains are from the many varied chains of Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm Hāshim, which go back to Aṣḥab Ibn Nubātah,¹⁶² Imam Muhammad Bāqir, Imam Ja'far Ṣādiq, and Imam Hasan Askarī, as well as Ḥārith A'war Hamedānī and 'Addī Ibn Ḥātam Tā'ī.

All throughout this collection, Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibrāhīm quotes his father, and narrations through the above chains.¹⁶³

Shaykh Mufid, after referring to some of the verses of the Qur'an¹⁶⁴ that deal with the virtue and stature of knowledge, reasons for the necessity of following Imam Ali due to his vast knowledge. He considers him the most learned and the rightful one for the caliphate and imamate. He then dedicates some sections of his book to Imam Ali's judgments and commands.

The Prophet's Supplication for Imam Ali

It is narrated that when the Prophet decided to entrust Ali as his envoy to Yemen, and send him there to instruct the people, to make clear the lawful and the unlawful for them, and to teach them the commands of the Qur'an, Imam Ali said:

تَدْبِيْرِي يَا رَسُوْلَ اللهِ الْقَضَاءُ وَأَنَا شَابٌ وَلَا عَلَيَّ بِكُلِّ الْقَضَاءِ

"O Messenger of God, you have chosen me for this important task requiring judgment, but I think I am too young for it; and in addition, I have not enough knowledge concerning the different matters that I may face."

قَالَ لَهُ: اذْنُ مِثْلِي أَفْتَايْنُهُ، فَضَرَبَ عَلَى صَدْرِهِ يَدَيْهِ، وَقَالَ: اللَّهُمَّ افْهَمْ قَلْبَهُ وَثَبِّتْ لِسَانَهُ

The Prophet told him to come closer, and he touched Ali on the chest, saying: "O my Lord and Creator, broaden his thoughts and bestow upon him the skills of leadership. And may his tongue speak the truth."

قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ: فَمَا شَكَّكَ فِي قَضَائِهِ بَيْنَ الْمُذْنِبِينَ بِمَدِّ ذَلِكَ الْقَامِ¹⁶⁵

Imam Ali later said: "After being in the presence of the Prophet at that time, I had no doubts about bringing peace between two people and assuredly settling everyone's problems."

Imam Ali's Judgment in the Story of the Newborn Child

When Imam Ali Ibn Abi Tālib went to Yemen and established himself there, he began fulfilling his duty as the Prophet had instructed him. Regarding his judgments and commands, two men came to him with a conflict over a child, a boy that was born to a girl who was a slave to both of them. Each claimed the child was his own. The main point was that they were both owners of the slave girl, and they did not know that intercourse with her was unlawful at a certain time after the end of her period. As they had only recently embraced Islam, they were unaware of the law, and they believed that intercourse by either

of them with the girl at that particular time was lawful, and this they did. The woman subsequently became pregnant and gave birth to a child.

The two men went to the Imam, each claiming the child as his own. The Imam cast lots between them to decide who was the real father, and then gave the child to him and made him pay half the price of the child to the other man, as it was a custom at the time to put a price on the children of slaves, adding: "If I knew that you did this knowingly, I would punish you."¹⁶⁶

When they informed the Prophet of this decision, he approved, thus establishing it as a tenet of Islam, and said:

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي جَعَلَ فِينَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ مَنْ يَقْضِي عَلَى سَنَنِ دَاوُدَ وَسَيِّلِهِ فِي الْأَعْيَانِ.¹⁶⁷

"Praise be to God for assigning among us, the Household, one who judges in the way that the Prophet Dāwūd did, and solves problems and judges cases in the way that he used to do."

Ibn Shahr Āshūb, from *al-Faḍā'il* of Ahmad Ḥanbal, quoting Ismā'īl Ibn 'Ayyāsh by means of his chains, has narrated that Imam Ali had such superior judgment at the time, that it surprised the Prophet, and he said: "Praise be to God, Who assigned wisdom among us, the Household."

Also, Ibn Shahr Āshūb in his *Sunna*, Abū Dāwūd and Ibn Mājih in their *Sunan*, Ibn Baṭṭah in *Abāna*, Ahmad in *Faḍā'il al-Ṣaḥāba*, and Abū Bakr Mardawayh in his own book have variously narrated Zayd Ibn Arqam as saying:¹⁶⁸

They informed the Prophet that shortly after the Age of Ignorance [before Islam], three men had untimely intercourse with a slave girl who then gave birth to a child. The three men then went to Ali in Yemen, and each one claimed that the child belonged to him. The Imam said: *Shurarakā' al-mutashākisūn* ("These are partners who differ in their demand"). So he cast lots between them, and the winner was given the child. He put the child at the man's disposal and told him he had to recompense the other two for the value of the child. The Imam then prohibited them from doing such a thing any more. When this news reached the Prophet, he said:

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي جَعَلَ فِينَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ مَنْ يَقْضِي عَلَى سَنَنِ دَاوُدَ.¹⁶⁹

"Praise be to God that He has assigned one among us, the Household, who judges in the way of Dāwūd."

Here the Imam acted on the basis of the religious law, according to which a child cannot have more than one father, and therefore only one of the three could be the father. In addition, as the child's mother

was a slave girl, her child would be hers, but would not belong to a slave who had had intercourse with her. However, since the three men were not slaves, the child of a free man would also be free. Yet since the child was born from a slave, he must be valued as if he had a slave as a father, and two-thirds of his value was to be paid to the other two claimants. Hence, the child was free and given to the man according to how the lots were cast.

This rule is applied in many cases, such as if two parties quarrel over a piece of land, each claiming it as his own, or if two people demand the same thing and they have no advocates. If the matter involves two claimants to several items of property, they are each given an equal right, and the property is shared between them. This kind of judgment corrects imbalances, and the case comes to a close. In this particular case, if the decision had been made by the casting of lots, there would have been the possibility that the rightful claimant would be overlooked. However, in the case of two or three men claiming a child, Imam Ali could not divide the child or hand it over to two or three fathers. According to both science and the religious law, only the sperm of one man can form a child. Therefore, he rightly concluded that these partners differed completely in their demands.

In such a case, only the casting of lots is expedient, but in lieu of dividing equal amounts of property, there is a payment according to the value of the child among the parties.

In this particular dispute, the mother of the child was a slave girl, and a certain price had to be given for the child. However, if the mother of the child had been a free woman, then the child's father, who would have been chosen by drawing lots, would not have to pay anything to the other parties.

The judgment of David mentioned in the hadith is a judgment through revelation. That is, when faced with any dispute among his people, the Prophet Dāwūd would refer to his conscience. And this happened with Imam Ali when he was setting out for Yemen.

Among these matters is a command that Shaykh Mufid mentioned in *Irshād*. At the time of Omar, two women disputed over a child, each of them claiming that she had given birth to the child and that it belonged to her. Neither of them had a witness or third party to back them up. This was difficult for Omar, so he referred to Imam Ali, who consulted with the two women. No matter how much he advised them, or even threatened them, it had no effect, and they still continued to argue. When Imam Ali saw how they insisted on fighting, he said: "Bring me a saw." The women asked: "What do you want with a saw?" The Imam said: "I want to cut this child into two

pieces, and then each of you can take half of it for yourselves." One of the women kept silent, but the other said: "O Aba al-Hasan, if there is no way other than sawing it in two, then I give this child to this woman."

Ali said to the first woman: "*Allahu akbar* (God is Most Great)! This child is yours, not hers, for if it belonged to her she would have shown mercy." Then the other woman confessed that the child was not hers. Omar was relieved that Imam Ali had solved the problem and praised him.¹⁷⁰

After narrating this hadith, Ibn Shahr Āshūb adds:¹⁷¹ "And this type of judgment was like that of Solomon in earlier times."

By Weighing the Milk, He Made It Clear to Whom the Boy and the Girl Belonged

Sayyid Ibn Tāwūs says that he came to know of the whole copy that Muhammad Ibn Husayn Marzbān had inscribed, where he narrates that Shurayh Qāḍī said:

I was once adjudicating for Omar Khaṭṭāb, when one day a man came to me saying:

O Abū Umayyah, a man has entrusted me with two women to look after, one of whom is a married woman with a legal dowry, and the other is a slave girl. I looked after them both in a certain house, and today I found out that both of them have given birth to a child, one male and the other female. Each of them claims that the male child is hers, and rejects the female, so I have come to you to judge this matter.

I was unable to solve such a problem, so I went to Omar and told him the whole story. Omar said: "Now tell me, what is your judgment between those two?"

I said: "If I knew how to judge between them, then I would not have come to you."

Omar summoned all the Prophet's companions, and then asked me to explain the story again, which I did, and he then consulted them. They all said: "But this is a matter for you and Shurayh. We know nothing about such things."

Omar then said: "But I know to whom to refer this problem, and where the key to opening it lies."

They said: "Do you mean Ali Ibn Abi Tālib?" and he answered: "Yes. So how do we find him?"

They said: "Send someone after him to find where he is."

Omar said:

لَا لَهْ فَتَنَةٌ مِنْ هَاشِمٍ وَالزُّمَرُ مِنْ عِلْمِي مَا وَلَا بَاقِي، وَفِي يَدَيْهِ زَيْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ، هُوَ مَوَانِئُ الْإِيمَةِ

"No, Ali has inherited his nobility, character, and vast knowledge from Hāshim, and therefore it is right for us to go to him, but not invite him here. He should not come here, but rather the matter should be considered at his home. So take us to him."

We all set out on the way to Imam Ali's house, where we saw him busy looking after his garden and planting there. At the same time he was weeping and reciting this verse: *Does man think that he is to be left aimless [without purpose]? (Qur'an 75:36).*

We waited at a short distance for a while, and then went closer to ask permission to put our question to him. Ali approached wearing a sleeveless shirt and asked: "O Commander of the Faithful, why have you come here to me?" Omar said: "We have come across a problem." Ali asked: "What is it then?" Omar explained the matter and asked: "So what is your solution to this problem? For I could not find one."

Then Ali leaned over and took something from the ground, saying: "The answer to this problem is easier than taking this stone from the earth."

He invited the two women to him and asked for a bowl, which he gave to one of the women, and said: "Milk your breasts into this bowl." This the woman did, and he then weighed the milk. Then he gave the bowl to the other woman, saying: "Now you do the same." She also milked her breast into the bowl, and he weighed it. He then said to the woman whose milk was lighter in weight: "Now, here; take your daughter with you," and he turned to the woman whose milk was heavier, saying: "And you, take this son of yours."

Then Ali turned to Omar and said: "Do you not know that God has created women inferior to men? And He has assigned the wisdom and birthright of women a lower status than that of men? That is why the milk for a female is lighter than the milk for a male."

Omar's Confession of Ali's Right to the Caliphate

Omar said:

لَقَدْ أَرَادَ الْحَقُّ بِأَهْلِ الْحَسَنِ وَلَكِنْ قَوْمَكَ أَبَوَا

"The Most Holy and Exalted created you to be caliph and Imam, but your tribe, the Quraysh, did not want it."

So Ali said:

نَحْنُ عَلَىكَ يَا أَبَا حَسَنِ، إِنَّ يَوْمَ الْقَضَاءِ كَانَ مِيقَاتًا.¹⁷²

"O Abū Ḥafḍ, be calm. Surely, the station of accounting and the separation of good from evil on the Day of Resurrection is certain as a reckoning."

Ibn Shahr Aṣḥūb has briefly narrated this hadith from Qays Ibn Rabīʿ, quoting Jābir Juʿfī from Tamīm Ibn Ḥazām Asadī at the end of which it states:

Omar said: "O Aba al-Hasan, from which source do you say this matter?"

Ali said: "It is because God has assigned twice the enjoyment for a man as for a woman, *lil dhakari mithla ḥazz al-unthayan* (Qurʾan 4:11), for the male share should be equivalent to that of two females." He then said: "The physicians have assigned this as recognition of the difference between the male and the female."¹⁷³

Distinguishing a Master from a Servant

Both Kulaynī in *al-Kāfi* and Shaykh Ṭūsī in *Tahdhīb* have narrated from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, quoting his father, back to Abdullah Ibn Othman, who spoke of a man saying that Imam Ṣādiq related the following story.

When Ali was caliph, a man from the territory of Jabal set out for the ḥajj pilgrimage accompanied by a slave. On the way, the slave disobeyed him and his master beat him. The slave turned to him saying that the man was not his master, but the man told him: "But I am your master, and you are my slave." They continued traveling, but they argued and used strong words, the master threatening the slave and the slave condemning the master. Each of them said to the other: "O you, the enemy of God, let us reach Kūfa, and then I will take you to Imam Ali."

When they arrived at Kūfa, they both went to Imam Ali, and the man who had beaten the slave said: "This man is my slave, and he did something wrong on the way here, and I beat him. Now he argues with me, claiming to be my master."

Then the other man said: "I swear by God that this man is my slave. My father sent him to accompany me and teach me the ḥajj rites, but now he argues with me and claims to be my master. In this way he wants to swallow up my possessions." They constantly swore oaths, one affirming and the other denying, first one and then the other.

The Imam said: "You are to leave here now until tomorrow morning, and during that time, try being friendly. Tomorrow come to me, but as close friends and with honesty."

The next morning, Imam Ali told his servant Qanbar to dig two holes in the wall. The two men returned to Imam Ali, and the people there came together, saying: "Look, there is a new case before Imam Ali; let us see how he is going to solve it."¹⁷⁴

The Imam asked the two men what their conclusions were. One swore: "He is my servant," and the other denied it, saying that he himself was the master. The Imam told them both to stand up, saying: "I see that you will not speak the truth and acknowledge what is right." After they stood up, he told one of them to thrust his head into one of the holes in the wall, and the other one to push his head into the next hole. This being done, he called to his servant Qanbar: "O Qanbar, bring the sword of the Messenger of God." The servant fetched the sword, and then the Imam commanded: "Very well, now be quick, and behead the slave."

The one who was the slave immediately drew himself away, but his friend stayed where he was. Ali turned to the slave, saying: "Was it not you who were saying that you were not a slave?"

He answered; "Yes, but this man was always beating me; he was aggressive towards me."

Hence, while uniting them, the Imam advised his master to behave kindly with him, and not insult him anymore.¹⁷⁵

Two Men Who Fought over the Price of Eight Loaves of Bread

Shaykh Mufid narrates from Hasan Ibn Maḥbūb, who heard 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Ḥajjāj saying: "I heard Ibn Abī Laylā say that Imam Ali adjudicated on a certain case in a way that no one had ever done before."

The story goes that two men were traveling together, and, when it was time for lunch, they sat down to eat something. One of them drew five loaves of bread from his bag, and his friend three. At that

moment a stranger was passing by and saluted them, and they both invited the man to join them for lunch. The man sat next to them and started eating with them. When he had satisfied his hunger, the man gave them eight silver coins, saying: "This is the price of the food I ate here with you."

The two men began fighting over each one's share of the money. The one who had brought three loaves of bread said: "It must be equally shared between us," and the other, who had brought five loaves said: "Five silver coins are mine, and the remaining three are yours." They took their dispute to Imam Ali and told him the whole story.

Ali told them both: "There is meanness and enmity in such a quarrel, and no peace or goodness in it."

The owner of the three loaves said: "I will never accept peace between us unless the judgment between us is carried out justly."

Imam Ali said: "If you are not willing to reconcile with your friend other than by the right judgment, let it be known that there is just one silver coin for you, and seven for your friend." The man said in surprise: "How on earth can that be?"

Imam Ali said: "I will now explain it to you. Did you not have just three loaves of bread and your friend five?" The man answered: "Yes, that is true."

Then Imam Ali said: "So the sum of this amount is twenty-four-thirds of all the bread you had. You have eaten eight-thirds of this amount. Your friend has also eaten the same amount, eight-thirds of it, and so has your guest. As he has given you eight coins, your friend's share is seven coins, and there remains one coin for you." After hearing the judgment, both men understood the matter, and they stopped fighting and went away.¹⁷⁶

Imam Ali's reasoning was as follows: the first man had fifteen-thirds of the total number of loaves, ate eight-thirds of the total, gave seven-thirds of it to the guest, and deserves seven coins; but the second man had nine-thirds of the loaves, ate eight-thirds, and gave only one-third to the guest, and therefore deserves only one of the eight coins.

Kulaynī has narrated this hadith through two chains: the first from Muhammad Ibn Yaḥyā, quoting Ahmad Ibn Muhammad, and the other from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, quoting his father. He narrates the complete hadith from Ibn Maḥbūb, quoting ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn Ḥajjāj from Ibn Abī Laylā, who used to narrate the hadith to his companions.¹⁷⁷

Shaykh Ṭūsī has also related it in the same way, through the first of Kulaynī's chains.¹⁷⁸

From the Sunnis there is Ibn 'Abd al-'Azīz in *Isti'āb*, who related from his own Shaykh, Abū al-Asba'; 'Isā Ibn Sa'd Ibn Sa'īd Muqrī, a teacher of the Holy Qur'an, quoting Hasan Ibn Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Qāsim Muqrī, who retold it in his house in Baghdad; Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn [Yaḥyā Ibn] Mūsā Ibn Abbās Ibn Mujaḥid Muqrī, who related it in his mosque; and Abbās Ibn Muhammad Dourī, quoting Yaḥyā Ibn Mu'īn, from Abū Bakr Ibn 'Ayyāsh, from 'Āṣim, quoting Zirban Hubaysh, who explains the case in even more detail, and we narrated from *Irshād*.¹⁷⁹

It must be said that all the hadiths that we have quoted by Kulaynī and the Shaykh from *al-Kāfi* and *Tahdhib* concerning this case come through authentic chains. And there is Mufīd's hadith in *Irshād* from Ibn Abī Laylā, the judge and clergyman of Kūfa at the time of Imam Ṣādiq, who had many discussions with Abū Ḥanīfa and Sulaymān Ibn Mahrān A'mash (a Shi'a and unique jurisprudent of his time). Also, he was the very man that we know that the Imam objected to over the verdicts of Omar and Abū Bakr, and who lost courage and went pale in the face.

The strangest thing about him is that he narrates Omar speaking of Ali as the best judge (*Aqdānā*), and that Ibn 'Abd al-Birr, 'Abd al-Wārith Ibn Sufyān, back through Ghasim Ibn Aṣbaq, Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn Zuhayr, Abū Khaythamah, Abū Salamah Tabūzakī, 'Abd al-Wāḥid Ibn Ziyād, and Abū Farwah maintain that he said: "I heard 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Abī Laylā say that Ali is the most stable and honest man, and his judgments among us are the most correct, for he is expert in these matters."¹⁸⁰

The explanation of the matter is that Imam Ali added up the loaves of the bread, the silver coins, and the three men, and then calculated that each one had eaten the same amount, and then came to the conclusion that one should receive seven coins and other only one.

The amount of bread that the first one gave to the guest calculates as: $(5 \times 3) - 8 = 7$.

The amount that the second one gave to the guest calculates as: $(3 \times 3) - 8 = 1$.

As eight coins are divided into portions of 7 and 1, the share of the coins becomes 7 and 1.

Four Men Who Fell into a Ditch Where There Was a Lion and Died

The late Sayyid Muḥsin Āmilī has narrated from Ibrāhīm Ibn Hāshim's *ʿAjāʿib al-Aḥkām Anīr al-Muʾminīn Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib*, that it was related from Nufilī, through Sakūnī, quoting Imam Ṣādiq, narrating:

When the Prophet sent Ali to Yemen, he saw there a *zubyah* (ditch)¹⁸¹ into which a lion had fallen.

The next morning, people had gathered around the ditch, rushing to see the lion, and were pushing each other aside to get a good view.

In the chaos, a man was almost toppling into the ditch when he grabbed another man close to him; the second man also seized another standing by him; and the unfortunate third man also took hold of a man gazing at them. Then all four plunged into the ditch in front of the lion, which attacked them, tearing them apart. In that awful condition, the first man found a weapon and killed the lion, and the crowd drew the battered corpses out of the ditch.

After that, the relatives of the three men who had died, whom the first man had dragged into the hole with him, went to his family and told them: "You have to pay us blood money for the crime your man has caused, because if not for him, our men would not have fallen into the ditch."

The family of the first man said: "Our man took hold of just one man to save himself, so we are ready to pay blood money for him." But the families of the other two men were not satisfied, and they raised their voices and a fierce argument erupted. They attacked each other, beating, striking, and kicking—and some even wanted to kill some of the others. A man among them shouted at the top of his voice, asking help from Imam Ali, who was standing at a distance. Ali came closer and admonished them for behaving like that, and since they were still angry, he told them: "Do not kill one another while the Prophet lives among you. And, as you see, I too am among you. You should know that killing one another is not the end of everything, for you would continue killing even more in the future."

When they heard Ali's words, they quieted somewhat, and their anger subsided.

Imam Ali then said: "I am now going to command you to do something that is most effective, and if you accept it, your dispute will come to an

end. If not, none of you can demand any blood money, for this command is sure. Then you would have only one solution, and that is to meet the Prophet and ask him what to do about your difficulty. He has more right to judge your problem than I do."

So they agreed to listen to what Imam Ali had to say.

Ali ordered the tribes and relatives of the four who had gathered around the ditch to watch the lion to collect all the blood money: a half of it, one-third of it, and one-fourth. This they did, and Ali then gave one-fourth of the blood money to the first man's family, because the other three men had died because of his action. He then gave one-third to the family of the dead man who had been standing next to the first one, because two others had died because of him. Then he gave one-half of the blood money to the family of the third man, as one had died because of him. Finally, he gave the full amount of blood money to the family of the fourth man, because he had not caused anyone to die.

Some of them were satisfied with this, but some were not, so Ali told them: "Accept what I have commanded for the time being, and then go to the Prophet and ask his opinion about it."

They found the Prophet during the hajj season at Mecca, where they eagerly drew closer and told him of their problem.

While carefully wrapping his loose robe, the Prophet said: "Now, God willing, I am going to address your queries." Just then, a man shouted from among the crowd: "But Ali Ibn Abi Tālib has already solved our problem." So the Prophet asked what Ali had said about the matter.

They told the Prophet of Ali's verdict, and he said: "Ali has commanded the right thing," and they were all pleased.¹⁸²

A clear explanation of this problem is that since the four men fell into the ditch because of the crush of people pushing one another, blood money must be paid by the paternal relatives.¹⁸³ However, as the first man caused the death of the other three, he receives just one-fourth of the blood money, and the other three-quarters go to the others. It is only the fourth man, who was not the cause of anyone's dying, who receives the full amount of blood money.

From what has been described, we can see that three men had no fault; they had not acted intentionally, and had no choice in what to do. If they had freely decided what to do, then the first one would have had to pay the second one the full amount of blood money, because he would have been the direct cause of the second man's death.

This applies also in the case of the second and third men, as well as the third and the fourth. In fact, the first, second, and third men, each of whom were both killers and victims, neither receive nor pay anything. The result is that the fourth man receives the full amount of blood money.

Thus, the first man basically fell into the ditch, and his blood money is to be paid by the relatives of those who were watching. But although he receives it in effect, he must give it to the fourth man. In other words, the relatives of the bystanders give the money only to the fourth man.

If the other three acted out of free will, their relatives would inherit the full amount of blood money.

Therefore, the first three men killed the fourth one, the first two killed the third one, and the first one killed the second one. Therefore, Imam Ali assigned the full amount of blood money to the fourth man, who was not involved in killing anyone; and the third one, who was responsible for killing one person—that is, the fourth one—was awarded half the blood money. In this case, the other half is deducted for killing the fourth one. And the second man, who killed two others, is permitted one-third of the blood money, and he does not receive the other two-thirds because he killed two others. And finally, the first man, who has killed three men, is permitted a quarter of the full amount, since the full amount has been reduced by three-quarters.

The amount of blood money in a case of this kind—the total amount, a half, three-quarters, or a quarter—is decided in this way.

Consequently, if we suppose that five men had fallen into the ditch, then the fifth would receive the total amount, the fourth a half, the third a third, the second a quarter, and the first a fifth. It follows accordingly if the number increases. For example, if they were ten people, the tenth one would receive the total amount, the ninth half of that amount, the eighth one a third of it, the seventh one a quarter, the sixth one a fifth, the fifth one a sixth, the fourth one a seventh, the third one an eighth, the second one a ninth, and the first person a tenth of the whole amount. And correspondingly, if there were fifty people, the fiftieth one would receive the total amount, the forty-ninth one a half of the total, and so on until the first one, who would receive one fiftieth of the ransom.

Among the Shi'a who agree are Kulaynī, Shaykh Ṭūsī, Shahīd al-Awwal and Shahīd al-Thānī (Shahīdayn), Ṣāhib al-Jawāhir, and others, and among the Sunnis are Ibn Kathīr Damishqī, Sibṭ Ibn Juzī,¹⁸⁴ Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī,¹⁸⁵ and others.

Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī have extracted the narrative from Sahl Ibn Ziyād, from Muhammad Ibn Hasan Ibn Shamʿūn, quoting Abdullah Ibn ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Aṣamm, from Mismaʿ Ibn ʿAbd al-Mālik, narrating from Imam Ṣādiq.¹⁸⁶ However, in *Jawāhir*¹⁸⁷ and *Sharḥ al-Lumaʿ*¹⁸⁸ it is considered weak, because of Sahl's being a Sunni, and Shamʿūn's being *ghālī* and regarded as a weak source.

Among the Sunnis, Ibn Kathīr has narrated it through two chains from Ahmad Ḥanbal: one from Abū Saʿīd, from Israel, from Simāk, from Ḥanash, and another from Wakīʿ, quoting Ḥammad Ibn Salīmah, from Simāk Ibn Ḥarb, from Ḥanash, quoting Imam Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib.¹⁸⁹

Amālī of Shaykh Ṭūsī has narrated from Ibn Shahr Āshūb, from Ahmad Ḥanbal and Ahmad Ibn Munīʿ, from Hammād Ibn Salīmah, quoting Simāk, from Ḥabish Ibn Muʿtamar, and he mentions Muhammad Ibn Qays regarding the hadith, which has been approved by jurisprudents who have mentioned it in their books.¹⁹⁰

Shaykh Mufīd has also narrated the very same hadith in the *Irshād* as follows:

When Imam Ali was in Yemen, people came to him with the case of a ditch that was dug for hunting lions, and into which a lion had lately fallen. The following morning some people had gathered to look at it. Among those gathered there, a man slipped and suddenly seized another man standing close to him. The second man also grabbed another man standing next to him, and seeing him in danger, a third man held on to his clothes, and while clutching one another, they all fell down into the ditch. The lion waiting in the ditch attacked them and tore them apart, and they died.

Imam Ali's decision was based on the following: the first man who fell into the ditch was the victim of the lion (and would receive no blood money), but he was responsible for the second man, who was to be paid one-third of the ransom. And it was up to the second man to pay two-thirds of the blood money to the third man, and finally, the third man was to pay the full amount of blood money to the fourth man.

When news of the judgment reached the Prophet, he said:

لَقَدْ قَضَىٰ أَبُو الْحَسَنِ فِيهِمْ بِقَضَاءِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ قَوْلَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ

"Certainly Abū al-Hasan has judged according to the Judgment of God, the Honorable and Exalted, Who is established upon the Divine Throne."

"The three Muhammads" (Kulaynī, Ṣadūq, and Shaykh Ṭūsī) have narrated the hadith from Husayn Ibn Saʿīd, quoting Nazr, back through ʿĀṣim, then Muhammad Ibn Qays from Imam Abī Jaʿfar Muhammad Bāqir.¹⁹²

However, their hadith is:

غَرِمَ أَمَلُهُ ثَلَاثَ نَفْسٍ لِأَمَلِ الثَّانِي، وَغَرِمَ أَمَلُ الثَّانِي لِأَمَلِ الثَّلَاثِ ثَلَاثَ نَفْسٍ، وَغَرِمَ أَمَلُ الثَّلَاثِ لِأَمَلِ الرَّابِعِ دِيَّةً كَامِلَةً

"The ransom and blood money of the second man killed must be paid by the family or relatives of the first dead man, and the third one must be paid by the second one; and the ransom of the fourth man killed must be paid by the family of the third one."

This is just as it is expressed by Ibn Shahr Āshūb in two different places in *al-Menāqib*.¹⁹³

The chain of this hadith is authentic, and what Ṣahīd Thānī states in *al-Rawḍat al-Baḥiyya* and *Sharḥ al-Lumaʿa* about Muhammad Ibn Qays contributing to it is rejected by Shaykh Muhammad Hasan Najafi, who says in *Jawāhir*: "This Muhammad Ibn Qays is reliable, as ʿĀṣim has reported from him."¹⁹⁴

The differences between this hadith and the previous ones are quite clear, as it says in the previous hadith that the first man fell into the ditch because of the jostling crowd, whereas in this one the reason given is that he suddenly slipped. Therefore, some narrators, such as Sayyid Muḥsin Jabal Āmilī, have said: "Apparently these two hadiths are about two different cases,"¹⁹⁵ but the likelihood is small. What is clear in this hadith is the differences between the details of the accident itself and the explanation of the accident, in which the accident was due to the man slipping into the ditch and being attacked by the lion, but if nobody was responsible for his fall, he would not be due any blood money.

However, it was the first man who was the cause of the death of the second one, and he, in turn, was responsible for the death of the third man, and he the fourth. Therefore, his blood money should be divided between the second, the third, and the fourth man, with a share of the blood money for him. But two men were the cause of the fourth one's death; therefore, his share of blood money is two-thirds. But the first three men killed the fourth one, so the highest amount of blood money should go to him.

In other words, the blood money for the fourth man is equal to that of the first three men, because they all had a share in his death. And the third one's blood money is due from the two before him, because both the first and second man were responsible for his death. All the blood money for the second man is from the first one, because he alone was responsible for his death. But as the second one was responsible for the deaths of the third and fourth man, the blood money that he receives from the first man is one-third. And as the third one is responsible for the death of the fourth one, he receives blood money amounting to two-thirds of the total, because his death is due to two others, the first and second man, and he is responsible for the fourth one. As the fourth one was not responsible for killing anyone, and he himself was killed by the other three, he should receive three shares of the blood money, making his complete. Therefore, the fourth man receives the blood money shared by three of them, because the outcome decided by the Imam is that one-third of the ransom, which the first one gives to the second, is added to his one-third, which is given to the third man, who also adds one-third, to make the total blood money for the fourth man.

The problem here is that the complete blood money for the first man who killed the second, third, and fourth man; the second one who killed the third and the fourth; and finally, the third one who killed the fourth, should not be decreased. Usually, one who has harmed another, but who has himself been harmed by yet another, should be entitled to the full amount of blood money. For example, if the second man killed another who caused the deaths of the next two, his blood money has nothing to do with the first man.

His killer (the first man), must pay him the full amount of blood money, and his due of blood money remains, but must be passed to the second man. The hadith has pointed out that the ransom for killing someone falls upon the wise relatives of the man responsible, and in this case, the relatives of any of those responsible must pay the ransom to the families of the one who was killed, with nothing deducted from the amount due. It says in *Jawāhir*: "It has been narrated in some of the *Ismā'īlī* books that all the ransom falls upon the one who dug the hole and left it unattended." And in Ahmad Hanbal's *Musnad*, it states that Simāk quoted Habashī as saying that Imam Ali said: "Collect a quarter, a half, a third, and the complete blood money from the relatives and tribes of the man who dug the hole."¹⁹⁶

However, even if the hadith from Muhammad Ibn Qays is considered correct, it is inconceivable that anyone should overlook

Imam Ali's definitive verdict on the matter and its endorsement by the Prophet, of which there is no doubt about the exact date.

Therefore, this verdict should be recognized and applied in any similar case, and acting upon it is the usual practice according to the books of both Shi'a and Sunni scholars. Following this ruling by all jurists is enjoined in *al-Rawḍah*, and it says in *al-Nāfi'* that the rulings of the companions agree, as clearly explained in *Nukat al-Nihāyah wa al-Tanqīh*.¹⁹⁷

We should be aware that there is basically no difference in the meaning of *Masma'* Ibn 'Abd al-Mālik's reasoning and the hadith from Muhammad Ibn Qays, since they both express one general idea, that is, that the ransom for killing must be paid equally. Some amount must be taken from what the one who has been killed is being paid for the one he has caused to die.

Finally, in the hadith of *Masma'*, the ransom is not allocated to the one killed, but is due from the observers, and given to the relatives. And the hadith from Muhammad Ibn Qays says that it was the first man's fault that he fell into the ditch, and he therefore considers him a victim, and that the next one fell because of the previous one, so that they are all responsible for the accident. However, a certain amount is taken from the ransom the relatives receive, because each of them was guilty of pulling the next one down into the ditch. However, the amount of the ransom assigned in both hadiths accords with the characteristics of the accident.

This kind of ransom goes to the wise, or the observers and those who witness the wise—or, according to two hadiths, to the deceased, because, as already explained, one of them grabbed another out of the fear of danger, and it was not done deliberately. Just as someone might turn in his sleep, someone was killed unintentionally. This kind of crime must be considered accidental, and the ransom assigned justly, as mentioned in the foregoing hadiths.

Imam Ali's Verdict on the Threefold Compensation to Qāriṣa, Qamiṣa, and Wāqiṣa, the Three Performing Women

Shaykh Mufīd writes in *Irshād* about some people who went to Imam Ali to ask for his judgment on a case where a woman had another woman sitting on her shoulders during a performance, when another woman approached them and pinched the first woman. She suddenly jerked, and the woman above toppled and fell to her death.

Imam Ali declared that all three women were responsible. The woman who had pinched had to pay one-third of the ransom, the

woman who had been startled was to pay another third, and the other one-third share was for the woman who died. Since the accident happened during a playful performance, the dead woman was a partner in her own death (and consequently, the woman who had pinched and the woman who was pinched were to pay two-thirds of the full blood money to the relatives of the woman who died).

When news of this reached the Prophet he approved, saying: "It is a rightful judgment."¹⁹⁸

A woman who pinched the other was called *Qāriṣa*, the woman who was startled was called *Qamiṣa*, and the woman who fell and died was known as *Wāqiṣa*.¹⁹⁹

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has related this hadith from Abū 'Ubayd in *Gharīb al-Ḥadīth*, and from Ibn Mahdi in *Nazhat al-Abṣār*, as well as from Aṣbagh Ibn Nubātah.²⁰⁰

Ibn Athīr Jazarī also writes about Imam Ali and the root of *Qāriṣa*, i.e. *Qaraṣ*, in *Nihāyat*, where he says: *innahu qaḍā fi al-qāriṣa wa al-qāmiṣa wa al-wāqiṣa athlāthā*, and then carries on with the story as follows:

There were three women performing to an audience, each riding on the shoulders of another. The woman below suddenly pinched the one sitting above her, who was in the middle of the three, and she was startled and jerked, causing the woman below to lose her balance and collapse to the ground, breaking her neck.

Therefore, Imam Ali allocated two-thirds of the ransom to two of the women—the one in the middle and the one below—and subtracted one-third of the ransom of the woman at the bottom, because she was the cause of the accident and the death.

He then said: "Zamakhsharī has also narrated the same story, quoting Ali."²⁰¹

He is actually indicating Zamakhsharī's hadith in *fā'iḳ* that was narrated from the Prophet.

Ibn Bābwayh and Shaykh have narrated the text of the hadith from Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Yaḥyā, quoting Abī Abdullah, through Muhammad Ibn Abdullah Ibn Mahrān, from Omar Ibn Othman, back to Abū Jamīlah, quoting Sa'd Iskāf as saying that Aṣbagh Ibn Nubātah said: "Imam Ali gave a verdict on the woman who was giving a ride to another woman, and another woman who was pinching her or poking her with a sharp stick, startling the woman, so that she jerked and caused the women on her shoulders to fall and die.

Imam Ali reduced her ransom to a half: half of it was for the woman who hurt her, and half for the woman sitting on her shoulders."²⁰²

It is obvious that this verdict is different from the previous one, where the ransom was divided into three. However, this version of the hadith is weak, because Abū Jamīlah is the very same Mufaḍḍal Ibn Ṣālīh in the hadith's chain, whom Najāshī considered a weak narrator, and about whom Ibn Ghadā'irī made it clear that he used to steal people's hadiths or invent them.

Imam Ali's Verdict Concerning a Cow That Had Killed a Donkey

There was a disagreement between two men over a cow belonging to one of them that had killed the other one's donkey. Shaykh Muḥīd says that the narration is about when they took their dispute to the Prophet.

One of them said: "O Messenger of God, this man's cow has killed my donkey."

The Prophet responded: "Take your dispute to Abū Bakr and ask him what to do." They went to Abū Bakr and explained their problem.

Abū Bakr asked: "Why did you leave the Prophet and then come to me?"

They answered: "That is what the Prophet told us to do."

Abū Bakr thought a little, and then said: "Very well, an animal has killed another animal, so there is no compensation. The owner of the cow need not pay any ransom to the owner of the dead donkey."

After hearing what Abū Bakr said, they both returned to the Prophet and informed him of Abū Bakr's verdict. The Prophet then said: "Now go to Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb and tell him about your case, and ask him to judge between you concerning this problem of yours."

They went to Omar and explained the cause of their dispute. Omar asked them: "Why did you not go to the Messenger of God with your problem, but come to me?" They told him that the Prophet had told them to do so. So Omar asked: "Why did the Messenger of God not send you to Abū Bakr?" They said: "The Prophet told us to go, and we carried out his command and went to Abū Bakr." Then Omar asked: "How did Abū Bakr judge between you?"

They told him what Abū Bakr had said, and Omar said: "I have no answer for your case other than what Abū Bakr has told you."

Once again they returned to the Prophet and told him all about what they had heard from Omar.

The Prophet then told them: "Now go to Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib to judge between you both." So they went Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib and explained

Imam Ali said:

إِنْ كُنْتَ الْبَقْرَةُ دَخَلَتْ عَلَى الْحِمَارِ فِي مَأْمِنِهِ صَلَّى رَبُّهَا فِيمَهُ الْحِمَارُ لِصَاحِبِهِ، وَإِنْ كَانَ الْحِمَارُ
دَخَلَ عَلَى الْبَقْرَةِ فِي مَأْمِنِهَا فَتَلَّهُ فَلَا غَرَمَ عَلَى صَاحِبِهَا.

If the cow moved from its place and went to the stable, or any place where the donkey was kept, and killed it there, then the owner of the cow is responsible for paying the owner of the donkey a ransom for the cost of his animal. But if the donkey moved from its place and went to the place where the cow was kept, and it was there that the cow killed it, there the owner of the cow does not need to pay any ransom.

After hearing his verdict the men returned to the Prophet and informed him of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib's judgment.

The Prophet said:

لَقَدْ قَضَىٰ عَلَىٰ بَنِي إِسْرَاطَالَ بَيْنَكُمْ بِقَضَاءِ اللَّهِ تَعَالَىٰ،

"Truly Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib has arbitrated between you according to the judgment of God, the Exalted."

He then stated:

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي جَعَلَ فِينَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ مَنْ يَقْضَىٰ عَلَىٰ سَنَنِ دَاوُدَ فِي الْقَضَاءِ.²⁰³

"Praise belongs to God, Who assigned to us the Household and one who judges in the manner of Dāwūd."

Kulaynī and Shaykh have quoted this hadith from Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Khālid, from Abī al-Khazraj, through Maṣ'ab Ibn Salām Tamīmī, back through Imam Ṣādiq, from Imam Bāqir. And at the end of the hadith he says that the Prophet raised his hands to the heavens saying:

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي جَعَلَ مِنِّي مَنْ يَقْضَىٰ بِقَضَاءِ النَّبِيِّينَ.²⁰⁴

"Praise belongs to God, Who assigned from my Household one who judges according to the judgments of the prophets."

By means of some other chains, this hadith is narrated with slight differences in the phraseology from Sa'd Ibn Ṭarīf Iskāf, quoting Imam Bāqir,²⁰⁵ and Ibn Shahr Āshūb has also reported it from Maṣ'ab Ibn Salām, quoting Imam Ṣādiq.²⁰⁶

Also, Sayyid Muḥsin 'Āmulī, besides quoting it from Mufid, has it from Hāshim Ibn Ibrāhīm's *'Ajā'ib al-Aḥkām*, and Nufilī mentions it, quoting the words of the Prophet.²⁰⁷

Moreover, Ibn Ḥajar Haythamī and Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa Shāfi'ī, by omitting the names of Omar and Abū Bakr and replacing them with the names of some of the companions, have narrated it as follows:

The Prophet was sitting in the mosque with some of the companions sitting close by. Just then, two men came to him, and one of them said: "O Messenger of God, I had a donkey and this man a cow, but his cow killed my donkey." Before the Prophet had said anything, some of the companions said: "There is no responsibility [for a man to pay any ransom] concerning animals."

The Prophet said to Imam Ali: "So judge between these two men."

Imam Ali asked them: "Were these animals untethered?" They answered: "No, they were not."

The Imam asked: "Were they tied up?" They answered: "No."

The Imam asked: "Was the cow tied up and the donkey free?" They answered: "No."

The Imam asked: "Then was the donkey tied up and the cow free? And was the owner of the cow there also?" They said: "Yes."

The Imam said: "It is the owner of the cow who is responsible for paying the price of the donkey."

And in the presence of the Prophet, Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib gave his verdict that the owner on the donkey should receive payment from the owner of the cow. The Prophet approved this judgment.²⁰⁸

After explaining this hadith, Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa says that there is a clear indication in this specific case for those who consider it, and there is a proof for those who acknowledge that Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib had explicit respect in the presence of the Prophet, because the

Prophet asked Ali to give his verdict on the case in the presence of those other great people, and afterwards approved and signed Ali's judgment. This is a most clear proof of Ali's greatness and justice, of which we have spoken. And there are so many clear verses mentioning his constancy, stature, and dignity for those who seek what is right and virtuous.

Jurists have given their verdicts concerning cases like this involving animals based on this prime example, whether an animal attacks and kills another, or if one animal hurts another.

Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī have narrated from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm through a chain from Imam Ṣādiq:

The Master of the Faithful judged a case concerning a man who had entered a house without the permission of its owner, and the owner's dog attacked and wounded him, and declared that the owner of the house was not responsible for the accident. If the man had had permission to enter the house, then the owner of the house would have been responsible for the misfortune.²⁰⁹

Another similar hadith has been narrated from Imam Ṣādiq through another chain.²¹⁰

The Confession of the Woman Who Denied Her Son

This narration was recorded by Kulaynī, and Shaykh Ṭūsī from Kulaynī through his chains narrates that 'Āṣim Ibn Ḥamzah Salūlī said that he heard a youth in Medina saying: *yā aḥkam al-hākimīn*: "O You, the Judge of judges, be now a judge between my mother and me."

Omar asked: "Young man, what have you against your mother?"

The youth answered: "O Commander of the Faithful, this mother of mine bore me nine months in her stomach, and she gave me her milk for two whole years, and now that I have grown up and can distinguish the bad from the worse, she has left me on my own. She denies being my mother; she pretends that she does not know me at all."

Omar asked: "So where is your mother?" The young man answered that she was in the tribe of the Banī X (the name of tribe is not mentioned).

Omar asked his men to bring the young man's mother to him.

They presented his mother along with four of his mother's brothers and 40 witnesses, and they all bore witness, saying: "This woman does not

know this young man at all. The young man is an aggressive liar, and his aim is to disgrace this woman before her dignified tribe. This woman is of the tribe of Quraysh; she has never married and remains a virgin."

Omar turned to the young man and asked: "O young man, what is your answer to this claim?"

The young man said: "O Commander of the Faithful, I swear by God that this woman is my mother. She carried me for nine months in her stomach, and fed me her milk for two years, and now that I have grown up and can distinguish the bad from the worse, she has rejected me. She has totally denied being my mother, and supposes that she does not know me at all."

Omar turned his face to the woman and asked her: "O woman, what is it that this young man says?" The woman answered:

O Commander of the Faithful, by God, Who has veiled Himself with Light so that no eye can see Him, and by Muhammad and his children, I do not know this young man at all. And I do not even know which tribe he is from. He is a youth who does not know who his father is, and now he has stood up to disgrace me in front of my tribe. I am an unmarried woman from the tribe of Quraysh, and I remain a virgin as my Creator created me.

Omar said to the woman: "Do you have any witness to what you claim?" She answered: "Yes, these people here with me."

Then all 40 witnesses came closer to Omar and said: "This woman is from the tribe of Quraysh; she has not yet married and is a virgin sealed by her Creator as she was at her birth."

Omar said: "Seize this man and put him in prison. Keep him there until we have questioned these witnesses well, and if they are found just in their claim, I will have this young man punished with lashes for accusing a woman of being an adulteress (not being virgin) and a filthy woman." They arrested the young man and took him to the prison. On the way, Imam Ali encountered them. The young man shouted: "O cousin of the Prophet, I am an innocent man." He repeated all that Omar had said, and then said: "And now Omar has ordered me to be jailed."

Ali said: "Take him back to Omar." Once there, Omar said: "I ordered you to take him to jail, but now you have brought him back to me." They said: "O Commander of the Faithful, Ali Ibn Abi Talib has told us to bring him back to you, and we have heard you say not to disobey Ali's command."

They were busy talking with Omar when Ali arrived and said: "Bring the mother of this youth here," which they shortly did.

Ali turned to the boy and asked: "Young man, now what is your complaint?" The young man repeated his words.

Ali asked Omar: "Do you permit me to adjudicate between them?"

Omar said: "Glory be to God! How could I not let you, when I have heard the Prophet say: *"a'lamakum* Ali Abī Tālib [The best of you in knowledge is Ali Ibn Abī Tālib]?"

Imam Ali turned to the woman and said: "O woman, do you have any witnesses?" She said: "Yes." All her defenders came closer and repeated their previous testimony in the presence of Ali Ibn Abī Tālib.

Then Ali said: "Today I will judge between you both in a way that satisfies the Creator Who is above the throne. And let it be known that the beloved Prophet taught me this way of judgment." He then asked the woman: "Is there an authority over your affairs?" The woman answered: "Yes, there is," and she pointed to the men standing close to her, saying: "These are my brothers." Ali turned to the men and asked: "Do you think my judgment on your sister would be right and effective?"

They all said: "Yes, O cousin of the Messenger of God. Whatever you decide regarding our sister is accepted by us."

So Ali said: "Now, I call upon God to bear witness, and I call upon all of you in this assembly to bear witness, that I am going to marry this woman to this young man, and her dower is to be four hundred *dirhams*, which I am going to pay myself." He then called out to his servant: "O Qanbar, bring me the prescribed number of *dirhams*."

Qanbar immediately brought the coins, and Ali handed them to the young man, saying: "Now pour these into the skirt of your wife, whom you have just married, and then both of you are to rise and depart from here, and not to return until you are satisfied and have made the full ablution."

The young man poured the coins into the woman's skirt and stood up, and holding her by her dress, he said: "Very well, now let us go together." Suddenly the woman shouted:

"O cousin of Muhammad, this is dire, dire. Do you want my son to marry me? By God, this is my son. It was my brothers who married me to a mean man, and I then gave birth to this boy. When he had grown,

they forced me to forsake him as my child. By God, this boy is my son, and I feel an inward pain seeing that he is separated from me."

‘Āsim Ibn Ḥamzah, the narrator of this hadith, says that the woman then took her son by the arm and left, and Omar cried out:²¹¹ "Woe upon me! If it were not for Ali, Omar would certainly perish!"

This hadith has been related by Ibn Shahr Āshūb from *Hadā’iq* by Abū Turāb, *al-Kāfi*, and *Tahdhib*, and also includes six verses of Ibn Hammād’s poetry.²¹²

From *Kitāb Rawḍah* and *Kitāb al-Faḍā’il*, this narration is recorded in *Biḥār al-Anwār* by Ibn Shādhān from Wāqidī, and Majlisī mentions it from Jābir and Saḥnān with slight differences in the text.²¹³

Sayyid Muḥsin Amīn Jabal Āmilī narrates it in *The Commands of Imam Ali*, from the book *‘Ajā’ib al-Aḥkām*, from Ibrāhīm Hāshim, quoting his father, from Muhammad Ibn Banī Omayr, back through Omar Ibn Yazīd, then Abū al-Mu‘allā, quoting Imam Ṣādiq, in the same way as in Kulaynī’s hadith. And after narrating the hadith from Ibn Shahr Āshūb’s *al-Manāqib*, he says: "Ibn Qayyim Juzī has mentioned this story in the book *al-Siyāsah al-Shar‘iyyah*."²¹⁴

Allāmah Amīnī has also narrated it from Ibn Qayyim Juzī in *al-Turuq al-Ḥukmiyya*, p. 45.²¹⁵

The Verdict on Two Men Who Had Entrusted a Woman with Something to Keep for Them, and Their Intention to Cheat Her

Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī have mentioned this hadith from Husayn Ibn Muhammad, quoting Aḥmad Ibn Ali Kātib, from Ibrāhīm Ibn Thaqafi, from Abdullah Ibn Abī Shaybah, from Harīz, from ‘Aṭā’ Ibn Sā’ib, and from Zāzān. And also Ṣadūq has reported it from Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad Thaqafi.

The story goes that two men entrusted something to a woman, telling her: "Do not trust anyone with this until we return." They then went away for a long time.

After a while, one of them went to the woman and said: "Give back that which we entrusted to you, because my friend has died." The woman refused, so they started arguing fiercely, but in the end she returned the object to him.

Some time later, the other man went to the woman and said: "Give back to me that which we entrusted to you." The woman replied: "But your

friend came to me and took it, saying that you had died." They argued over the matter and then took their dispute to Omar.

Omar said to the woman: "I see no alternative but that you are responsible to this man." The woman said: "Assign Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib as a judge between the two of us." So Omar asked Ali to be an arbiter between the man and the woman.

Imam Ali said: "This trust is with me,"²¹⁶ and he turned to the man and said: "You and the other man told this woman not to return your goods unless you both went to her, but not if one went alone. Therefore, seek your friend and tell him to come here." Hence, the Imam did not make the woman responsible for whatever she had been entrusted with, since he deduced that it was the two men who wanted to take something from the woman.²¹⁷

Ibn Shahr Āshūb narrates this in exactly the same way in the *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*.²¹⁸

Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī, Sibṭ Ibn Juzī, Akḥṭab Khārazm, and Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Khārazmī have narrated from Ḥanash Ibn Mu'tamar that the two men entrusted something to a woman from the tribe of Quraysh. The item was valued at a hundred *dirhams*. A year passed and one of the men went to the woman, and by arguing with her and cheating her, he took away this item. Another year passed when the second man went to her and demanded the hundred *dirhams* from her.

He continues the hadith in a similar way until he says: "When the news reached Omar, he said:

لَا أَبْقَانِي اللَّهُ بَعْدَ ابْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ²¹⁹

"May God not let me live after the son of Abū Ṭālib!"

Allāmah Amīnī has narrated this from qualified sources from Ibn Juzī's books *al-Adhkiyā*, p. 18, and *Akhbār al-Zurrāf*, p. 19.²²⁰ Shāh Val-i-Allah Ḥanafī has also narrated it in *Izālat al-Khifā*.

Overturning the Verdict on an Adulterous Woman Whom Omar Had Ordered to Be Punished

Shaykh Mufid reports in *Irshād* that during Omar's caliphate, a man committed adultery with a mad-woman, and they asked for witnesses.

Omar ordered the woman to be lashed as punishment. Then Imam Ali approached and asked why they were dragging her away, since she was

a member of a certain well-known tribe. They answered: "A man had an affair with her and has run away. There are witnesses who gave proof for Omar for him to carry out his judgment."

Imam Ali told them:

Take her back to Omar and ask him whether he knew that she is a mad-woman from a particular lineage:

وَأَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَدْ رَفَعَ الْقَلَمَ عَنِ الْجُنُونِ حَتَّى يَفْقَهُ؟

The Prophet removed responsibility from those who are half-witted, and this applies throughout their madness or until they recover. In this case, this woman was overcome by her senseless desire and acted irrationally.

They took the woman back to Omar and told him what Imam Ali had said.

Omar said:

فَوَجَّ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ لَقَدْ كُنْتُ أَنْ أَمْلِكُ فِي جَلْدِهَا، فَذَرَأَ عَنْهَا الْحَمْدَ²²¹

"May God remove anguish from Ali and solve his difficulties. Surely I would have perished for my wrong verdict to lash the woman."

Omar then overturned his verdict.

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has also narrated this with the same phraseology from Hasan, ʿAtā, Qatādāh, Shuʿba, and Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal.²²²

In the translation of the section on the status of Imam Ali in *Istīʿāb*, Ibn ʿAbd al-Birr has narrated through his chain from Saʿīd Ibn Musayyib:

كَانَ عُمَرُ يَتَوَدَّدُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ مُغَضَّلِهِ لَيْسَ لَهُ أَبُو حَسَنٍ

"When he had any problem, it was Omar's custom to go to Abū al-Hasan, who was there to solve it for him, and he would beseech God."

Concerning the mad-woman whom Omar had ordered to be stoned, as well as a woman whom Omar had also decided to have stoned who had given birth to a baby who was then six months old, Ali said:

God, the Exalted, has stated:

وَحَمَلَهُ وَفَضَّلَهُ ثَلَاثُونَ سَهْرًا.

He also said: "Indeed, God has lightened all tasks and responsibilities for the mad." Omar said: "If it were not for Ali, Omar would certainly perish."

Ibn ʿAbd al-ʿAzīz said: "A similar case happened with Othman and Ibn Abbās, and Ibn Abbās learned of this judgment from Ali, and God knows best."²²³

Khārazmī has quoted Mahmud Ibn Omar Zamakhsharī through chains from Hasan Baṣrī, saying that Omar Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb mentioned this hadith, where it is recorded that Ali said to Omar:

أَوْ مَا سَمِعْتَ مَا قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ؟ قَالَ: وَمَا قَالَ؟ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: رُفِعَ الْقَلَمُ عَنْ ثَلَاثَةٍ: عَنِ الْجُنُونِ حَتَّى يَبْرَأَ وَعَنِ الْغُلَامِ حَتَّى يَحْتَلِمَ وَعَنِ النَّائِمِ حَتَّى يَنْقِطَ قَلَمُ هَلَى عَنْهَا.²²⁴

"Have you not heard what the Prophet said?" Omar then asked what he had said.

Ali replied: "The Prophet said that it is forbidden to take to task three types: a mad person for as long as he is in such a condition, the young before reaching the age puberty, and a sleeping person for as long as he is asleep."

The narrator says: "Therefore, Omar freed the woman before having her stoned."

Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī has narrated that Abū Zibyan said: "I was a witness to this hadith." The story is the same, and then he mentions the words of the Prophet:

رُفِعَ الْقَلَمُ عَنْ ثَلَاثَةٍ: عَنِ النَّائِمِ حَتَّى يَنْقِطَ وَعَنِ الصَّبِيِّ حَتَّى يَكْبُرَ وَعَنِ الْمُبْتَلَى حَتَّى يَنْقِلَ.²²⁵

"The Pen has forbidden the taking to task of three types: a mad person as long as he or she is in such a state, a young boy before reaching the age of puberty, and a sleeping person so long as he is asleep."

In *Mustadrak*, Ḥākim, through his series of chains from Abū Zibyan, has narrated that Ibn Abbās explained the Prophet's words as:

رُفِعَ الْقَلَمُ عَنْ ثَلَاثَةٍ: عَنِ الْجُنُونِ الْمُغْلُوبِ عَلَى عَقْلِهِ، وَعَنِ النَّائِمِ حَتَّى يَنْقِطَ وَعَنِ الْمُبْتَلَى حَتَّى يَحْتَلِمَ.²²⁶

"The Pen has decreed that it is forbidden to take to task three types: a mad person who is dominated by senselessness, a sleeping person while asleep, and a young boy before the age of puberty."

Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn Husayn Ibn Ali Bayhaqī has narrated this from the Prophet in three different forms with the same meaning, but different pronunciation.²²⁷

Allāmah Amīnī has narrated this hadith in five different ways from different sources, and summing up he says that Bukhārī narrated it in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*²²⁸ with the one difference that he omits the beginning because of his excessive respect for Shaykh Tūsī, which he wanted to preserve.²²⁹ He could simply have removed the term "nation," which was included because of the caliph's ignorance of the true Caliph, and so he briefly mentions the hadith as:

قَالَ عَلِيٌّ لِمَرْ: أَمَا عَلِمْتَ أَنَّ الْقَلَمَ رَزَعَ عَنِ الْمَجْنُونِ حَتَّى يَفْقَ وَعَنِ الصَّبِيِّ حَتَّى يَبْرُكُ وَعَنِ النَّائِمِ حَتَّى يَنْقِظَ²³⁰

"Ali asked Omar: 'Did you not know that the Pen has banned the taking to task of three types: a mad person for as long as he or she is in such a state, a young boy before reaching the age of puberty, and a sleeping person so long as he is asleep?'"

Also, commentators on Bukhārī, such as Ibn Hajar 'Asqalānī in *Fat-hu al-Bārī*,²³¹ and Mahmud Ibn Ahmad 'Aynī in *Omdat al-Qārī*,²³² both of whom are in the account in *Ṣaḥīḥ Bukhārī*, have said that that they have reported the case. And it is mentioned by Abū Dāwūd in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*, in *ḥudūd*²³³ in the section *al-majnūn al-ladhi yasriq*, and by Qāḍī 'Abd al-Jabbār in *al-Mughnī*.

Shi'a and the Sunni scholars have mentioned the hadith about the words of the Prophet spoken by Imam Ali, and consider it the definitive judgment regarding the mad and those who sleep. The primary proof is this very hadith, together with other hadiths from the Imams of the Household.

After Bayhaqī explains three hadiths about annulling the stoning of the woman, he narrates another independent story from Abū al-Hasan Ali Ibn Muhammad Muqri through chains from Hasan, who said that Imam Ali heard the Prophet say:

رَزَعَ الْقَلَمُ عَنْ ثَلَاثَةٍ: عَنِ الصَّبِيِّ حَتَّى يَبْغُلَ، وَعَنِ النَّائِمِ حَتَّى يَنْقِظَ، وَعَنِ الْمَجْنُونِ حَتَّى يَكْتَفَ²³⁴ عِنْدَ

"Responsibility is removed from three types: a mad person who is irrational, a sleeping person while asleep, and a young boy before the age of puberty."

And Hākim, after relating this hadith from Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Mūsā al-Qāḍī says that Abū Abdullah said: "I did not find any differences among the scholars about injunctions against the mad."²³⁵

Imam Ali Annuls the Stoning of a Pregnant Woman That Omar Ordered

Khārazmī has narrated from Mahmud Ibn Omar Zarnakhshari through chains from Zayd Ibn Ali, quoting his father and great-grandfather commenting on Ali Ibn Abi Tālib, that some people took a pregnant woman to Omar during his rule, and she confessed to adultery, and Omar ordered her to be stoned.

Just then, Ali Ibn Abi Tālib approached the woman and asked the people about the case against her.

They said: "Omar has commanded that she be stoned." Ali went back with the woman to Omar, and he asked him: "Have you ordered this woman to be stoned?" and Omar said: "Yes. She herself confessed to adultery." Imam Ali then said:

هَذَا سُلْطَانُكَ عَلَيْهَا، فَمَا سُلْطَانُكَ عَلَى مَا فِي بَطْنِهَا؟
ثُمَّ قَالَ لَهُ عَلَى عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: فَلَمَّا كَانَتْ تَحْتَهُ أَوْ اعْتَدَتْ

"This is your power and authority over her, but tell me what does your command and authority do for the baby in her stomach?" He continued: "Perhaps you have frightened or punished her into confessing to a crime that she never committed."

Omar said: "Yes, it is correct [that I frightened her]." Then Ali said:

هَكَذَا عَلَى عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: أَوْ سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: لَا حُدَّ عَلَى مُعْتَرِبٍ بَعْدَ الْهَلَاءِ. إِنَّهُ قَيِّدٌ أَوْ حَبْسٌ أَوْ يَهْدُثُ فَلَا إِفْرَازَ لَهُ

"Have you not heard that the Prophet said that a confession is invalid after any kind of chastisement, and those who have confessed in this way are not to be punished? Indeed, the confessions of those who have been threatened, frightened, punished, or imprisoned cease to be valid."²³⁶

After hearing this, Omar let the woman go, and said:

عَجَزَتِ النِّسَاءُ أَنْ يَلِدْنَ مِثْلَ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ، لَوْ لَا عَلِيٌّ لَمَلَكَ عُتْرُ.²³⁷

"No woman [in the world] is able to give birth to a child like Ali. If it were not for Ali, Omar would perish."

In *Kashf al-Ghummah*, Ali Ibn 'Isā Irbilī narrated this from Khārazmī, and Majlisī considered it to be the ninth of Omar's sarcasms.²³⁸

In Ibn Shahr Āshūb's narration, he says that Imam Ali said to Omar:

هَبْ لَكَ سَيْلٌ عَلَيْهَا هَبْ لَكَ سَيْلٌ عَلَى مَا فِي بَطْنِهَا وَاللَّهِ تَعَالَى يَقُولُ: وَلَا تَزِرُ وَازِرَةٌ وِزْرَ أُخْرَى.²³⁹

"You may have authority over this woman, but do you have authority over the baby in her stomach? For God, the Honorable and Exalted, tells us that no sinner or pregnant woman is responsible for the burden of another."

Then Omar asked what he should do with the woman, and Ali said:

قَالَ: اخْطِطْ عَلَيْهَا حَتَّى تَلِدَ، فَذَا وَلَدَتْ وَوَجَدْتَ لِوَلَدِهَا مَنْ يَكْفُلُهُ فَأَقِمِ الْحَدَّ عَلَيْهَا فَلَمَّا وَلَدَتْ مَاتَتْ، هَكَذَا عُتْرُ: لَوْ لَا عَلِيٌّ لَمَلَكَ عُتْرُ.

"Take care of her until she delivers the baby, then proceed if you find someone to look after the child and suckle it, and then give lashes to the man."

However, it so happened that the woman died just as she was giving birth to the baby. Omar subsequently said: "If Ali were not here, Omar would have perished."

Isfahani says in this regard:

وَيَرْجِعُ أُخْرَى مُثْقَلَةً فِي بَطْنِهَا حِفْلُ سَوَى الْخَلْقِ أَوْ حِفْلَانِ 1
نُودُوا إِلَّا اتَّخَذُوا قَرْنَ كَلْتِ زَنْتٍ حَبِئَتْهَا فِي الْبَطْنِ لَيْسَ بِزَانٍ 2²⁴⁰

1. And Ali's supremacy was manifested, when Omar wanted to stone a woman who carried a child—or even two—in her uterus: whole and perfect ones;
2. Ali's cry whirled into their ears: "Be aware! Wait! Have patience until the baby is born. If this woman is an adulteress, surely the child inside her is not."

From what we have related from the two hadiths from *al-Manāqib* by Khārazmī and *al-Manāqib* of Ibn Shahr Āshūb, it is clear that Omar judged pregnant women on two occasions. The first was when the

woman confessed because she was threatened and was fearful of punishment. This kind of confession is ineffective, so they freed the woman, and did not punish her even after the baby was born. In the second case, there were no threats, and the proof was the woman's confession. However, as she was pregnant, they allowed her to deliver the child before punishing her.

Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī makes it clear in his two books, *Dhakhā'ir al-Uqḍā* and *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, that both cases were narrated by Zayd Ibn Ali Ibn al-Husayn and Abdullah Ibn al-Hasan Ibn al-Ḥasan.²⁴¹

Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa Shāfi'ī has narrated the story, and said that Omar said in front of some of the companions: "If it were not for Ali, I would have perished."

'Allāmah Amīnī has recorded the first part of the hadith from several later books and Fakhr Rāzī's *Arba'in*, p. 466. He mentions the second part of the hadith from Ganjī's *Kifāya*, p. 105.²⁴² And Muḥibb Ṭabarī mentions in both his books that Omar said three times: *kollu ahaden afqahu minni* (In religious matters, all people know more than I).

Shaykh Mufid mentions the second hadith in *Irshād*, where Omar says: "I wish I were not alive when problems come to me and Abū al-Hasan is not there [to solve them]." It becomes clear by the end of the hadith that Omar's sorrow is lifted from his face after he consults Imam Ali.²⁴³

Imam Ali Annuls the Stoning of a Woman with a Six-Month-Old Baby

In *Irshād*, Shaykh Mufid narrates from Yunas Ibn Hasan that a woman with a six-month-old baby was taken to Omar, who decided to have her stoned. Just then, Imam Ali said to Omar:

إِنْ خَاصَمْتُكَ بِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ خَصَمْتُكَ، إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى يَقُولُ: وَحَلَلَهُ وَفَصَالَهُ ثَلَاثُونَ شَهْرًا وَيَقُولُ جَلْ قَاتِلًا: وَالْوِلْدَاتُ يَرْضَعْنَ أَوْلَادَهُنَّ حَوْلَيْنِ كَامِلَيْنِ لِمَنْ أَرَادَ أَنْ يَنْبِغَ الرِّضَاعَةَ. إِذَا تَمَّتِ الْمَرْأَةُ الرِّضَاعَةَ سَنَتَيْنِ وَكَانَ حَلَلَهُ وَفَصَالَهُ ثَلَاثِينَ شَهْرًا، أَلَمْ يَكُنِ الْحَمْلُ مِنْهَا سِتَّةَ أَشْهُرٍ.²⁴⁴

If this woman disputes with you about God's Book, then she will surely overcome you. God, the Honorable and Exalted, states that she bears the child and then cares for it for thirty months. For He, the Glorified, says: And We have enjoined upon man kindness to his parents: In pain did his mother bear him, and in pain did she give him birth, and the bearing of him and the

weaning of him is thirty months, until, when he attains full growth and reaches forty years, he says: My Lord, arouse me that I may give thanks for the favour wherewith You have favoured me and my parents, and that I may do right acceptable to You. And be gracious to me in the matter of my seed. Truly have I turned to You and truly am I of those who surrender (to You) (46:45).

When Omar heard these words from Imam Ali, he let the woman go, and the command was upheld. Even now it is practiced just as the companions, the followers, and others heard it from Ali.²⁴⁵

And Ibn Shahr Āshūb narrated the following:

Haytham was in the army, and after six months he returned from battle and his wife gave birth to a baby. Haytham considered the newborn baby illegitimate, so he took the child to Omar and told him the whole story. Omar then ordered the woman to be stoned (for adultery). But before the stoning began, Imam Ali met the woman and said to Omar:

Be calm and do not hasten, and give a second thought to the matter. This woman speaks rightly. God, the Honorable and Exalted, states:

وَحَلَمَ وَفَضَلَهُ ثَلَاثُونَ شَهْرًا.

...and the [mother's] bearing of him [the child] and the weaning of him is thirty months.

He also states:

وَالْوَلَدَاتُ يَرْضَعْنَ أَوْلَادَهُنَّ حَوْلَيْنِ كَامِلَيْنِ.

Thus, the parents look after it for thirty months.

Omar then said: "If there were not Ali, Omar would pass away." So he let the woman go, and entrusted the child to the man. The right judgment was carried out.

Ibn Shahr Āshūb subsequently said:

The main point in this story is that as soon as a woman becomes pregnant, that is, when the sperm meets the egg, it is 40 days, and the shortest time before a baby is born is 6 months. This is because the sperm waits in the womb for 40 days, and then after 40 days it changes into a clot. After another 40 days it becomes a hard clot. And again, in the course of the next 40 days, it finds a shape, and 40 days later it gets a spirit. So the whole course is 6 months. Then, as the weaning of the baby is 24 months, the baby is carried in the stomach for 6 months.

Nowadays, it has been confirmed scientifically that a baby in the womb is completely formed in six months, and it can leave the womb and live outside of the mother. However, it remains three more months in the stomach for its growth in comfort and ease.

According to historical accounts, Imam Husayn and Yaḥyā Ibn Zakariyā were born after six months, and this is quite natural and according to the rule.

Nishābūrī, in his commentary on the verse saying that the mother bears the child and weans him for 30 months, says:

Combining this verse with the next one, that the parents bear the child and look after it for 30 whole months, shows that the whole duration of taking care of a child is therefore 30 months. It is understood that the time of pregnancy is 6 complete months, and it is narrated about Omar that a woman gave birth to a child after 6 months, and they took her to him, and he ordered her to be stoned. This was then reported to Ali, who dissuaded him from doing so, and he referred to this verse. Omar then confirmed Ali's words, and said: "If it were not for Ali, Omar would die away."

Jālinūs says: "I had great knowledge about the course of pregnancy in women, and I have witnessed a woman give birth to a child at the end of 148 nights of pregnancy." Ibn Sīnā also had the same experience, having witnessed it with his own eyes.²⁴⁶

Fakhr Rāzī, when commenting on the verse mentioned earlier, has the same explanation as we have already mentioned. But, of course, his comments were prior to Nishābūrī's, because Nishābūrī consulted his commentary.²⁴⁷

In his *Sunan*, in the section *mā jā'a fi aqall al-ḥaml*, Bayhaqī narrates through his two chains from Abī al-Ḥarb Ibn Abī al-Aswad Du'a'ilī and Hasan Baṣrī the story of Omar and the woman and the baby, and how Imam Ali dissuaded him from punishing the woman.²⁴⁸

This hadith is also narrated by Suyūṭī in *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, from 'Abd al-Razzāq, 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd, and Ibn Mundhar from Qatādah quoting Abī al-Ḥarb Ibn Abī al-Aswad Du'a'ilī.²⁴⁹

And in *al-Mizān*, 'Allāmah Ṭabāṭabā'ī narrates it from Suyūṭī, as well as in *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, and from Shaykh Mufid in *Irshād*.²⁵⁰

Moreover, Khārazmī,²⁵¹ Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī,²⁵² Sibṭ Ibn Juzī,²⁵³ Ibn 'Abd al-Birr,²⁵⁴ and Mullā Ali Muttaqī Hindī²⁵⁵ have the same hadith in their books. It has also been added in the final part of the

Khārazmī hadith that the woman gave a birth to a baby after six months. Elsewhere, Sayyid Ibn Ṭawūs mentions it from the Sunnis.²⁵⁶

Mullā Ali Muttaqī, through another chain from Qatādah, reports Abī al-Ḥarb Ibn Abī al-Aswad Duʿailī quoting his father saying that:

They took a woman, who had given birth to child after six months, to Omar to be punished and given lashes. Omar decided to stone the woman. The sister of the woman went to Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib and said: "Omar is going to stone my sister. I have come to you to help us, and I swear by God that you can tell us how to defend ourselves before Omar."

Imam Ali said: "Surely your sister is guilty in this case, but there is an excuse for her." The sister went to Omar, and raising her voice, she cried: "God is Most Great." Her voice was so loud that Omar and all the others present heard her. Then she said: "Ali believes there is excuse for my sister." Omar sent a man to Ali to ask him what the excuse was.

Ali said:

God, the Honorable and Exalted, states:

وَالْوَالِدَاتُ يُرْضِعْنَ أَوْلَادَهُنَّ حَوْلَيْنِ كَامِلَيْنِ.

"And the parents bear it and look after it for 30 whole months'; hence the whole duration of taking care of a child is 30 months."

He added: "And she bears it and weans it for 30 months."

Thus, the course of bearing the baby in her stomach is 6 months, and the period of weaning is 24 months. So Omar let that woman go. And for a second time, the same woman gave birth to another baby after 6 months.²⁵⁷

Othman Had an Innocent Woman Stoned

A similar case happened at the time of Othman, when he also ordered an innocent woman to be stoned. Regrettably, before reporting the case to Imam Ali and asking for his judgment, they stoned the poor woman and the matter was over.

Suyūṭī has explained the case in *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, where Ibn Mundhar and Ibn Abī Ḥātam recount it from Baṣṭat Ibn Abdullah Juhannī, who said:

A man from our tribe (the Juhannī) married a woman from the same tribe. After exactly six months the woman gave birth to a child. The woman's husband went to Othman and told him the story. After hearing what the man had to say, Othman ordered the woman to be stoned. Some people took the news to Ali, who went to Othman and asked him why.

Othman said: "I cannot imagine how this woman has given birth to a baby after six months."

Ali said: "Have you not heard that God, the Exalted, states that she bears it and weans it for 30 months? He also states the complete period, so how much time do you think remains after taking 2 years away from this amount?"

Othman answered: "By God, I did not understand this before. Now fetch the woman to me at once." When they went to bring the woman back to Othman, they found that she had died after being stoned.

When they were taking the woman to be stoned, she was telling her sister:

يَا أُخِيَّةَ لَا تَعْزَنِي قَوْلُ اللَّهِ مَا كُنْتُ فَرْجِي أَحَدٌ قَطُّ غَيْرِهِ

"O sister, do not be sorry. By God, no one except my husband has ever touched me, and I am sure that God will remove the screen and everyone will understand that I am innocent."

The narrator says that Ba'jat Ibn Abdullah Juhannī said: "The same baby grew up, and then the man confessed that he was his child, because among all the young boys, only he looked like his father." The narrator adds: "Therefore, the crime that the man had committed by accusing his innocent wife of adultery ended badly, and he was laid on a bed, and all the members of his body were cut off one after another."²⁵⁸

Mālik,²⁵⁹ Bayhaqī,²⁶⁰ Ibn Kathīr Damishqī,²⁶¹ and 'Aynī²⁶² have narrated this hadith, and 'Allāmah Ṭabāṭabā'ī has also narrated it from Suyūṭī in *al-Durr al-Manthūr*.²⁶³ Sayyid Muḥsin Jabal Amulī has mentioned it in *'Ajā'ib al-Aḥkām*,²⁶⁴ as well as 'Allāmah Amīnī in *al-Ghadir*.²⁶⁵

The Evil Results of Usurper Governments

It is quite true that by usurping the caliphate and taking authority and guardianship in hand, the world eventually comes to know the wrongdoing. The result is that some will go astray until the rising up

of the rightful Caliph, the everlasting Guardian and Holy Monarch of the time.

By God, yesterday, as I was busy writing the story of this woman who was suffered stoning at the command of Othman, I wept so much that I nearly fainted. I stopped writing, but it was not for the innocence of Ali, nor for the innocence of Zahra of Muhsin, but for the innocence of this poor woman—only this woman! This woman who had married according to Islam, under the direction of the Prophet, and had then borne the hardship of pregnancy, and after delivering the baby, she was sentenced to be lashed and stoned! Apart from being punished, she was deprived of seeing her baby being suckled, embracing it in her arms, looking at its smiling face, and being delighted. She suffered to see them separating her from her baby and ruining her hopes and wishes. They stoned the poor mother until she died, and all because they had mistakenly taken her for an adulteress. The poor child was called the fruit of adultery. So what would this woman think of the whole event, her fate, and her new religion?

The hushed words that the innocent woman spoke to her sister: "I have had no affair with anyone, and only God knows my secret. This child is my own legitimate child. I have carried it in my stomach according the command of the Prophet. I have suffered the term of pregnancy, and now that I have given birth to the child and it is time to suckle it, they are going to stone me to death—these claimants to the caliphate!"

This was correct, and Joseph was similarly sent to prison for his chastity, for he was pure and chaste.

However, there is no difference between this case involving Othman and that of Omar, who each ordered a woman to be stoned. In one case the news reached Imam Ali before she was stoned, but both cases are the same.

Othman ordered the stoning, and they stoned her according to his command. Omar, too, gave his command, but it was not carried out, because Ali's command followed on and stopped it. Both commands were mistakes due to their ignorance. Othman's command was carried out, but Omar's was not. Both commands were cruel, with no difference between them. However, as Othman's verdict was carried out and the woman was stoned, he is recorded in history as a cruel man. This stoning was considered one of his ugliest acts. Omar's verdict was not carried out, and he raised his voice, saying: "If it were not for Ali, Omar would perish." These words of his proved his honesty to his followers, since he surrendered to the facts.

However, as we mentioned, there is no fundamental difference between the two cases. After meeting with Imam Ali, Othman also confessed that he did not know the law. These commands were issued by both of them.

On the other hand, if Omar really meant it when he said 23 times: "If it were not for Ali, Omar would perish," then why did he usurp the right to the government, and deliberately take it away from the start?

It becomes clear that his purpose in saying that was superficial, and decreased his position so that it was associated with ugliness in different ways. So this is not a thing of value to say: "If it were not for Ali, I would perish," or "I would prefer not to be in town if Ali is not there." Apart from this, it means nothing. He certainly needed Ali to run his government, but neither desired nor needed Ali with him. He needed Ali only as a means to help him manage his government.

The Elegy of Khuzaymat Ibn Thābit Anṣārī in Paying Homage to Imam Ali

Khārazmī says that by means of these chains [those already mentioned], he was informed by Abū al-ʿAlā Ḥāfiz, quoting Ḥasan Ibn Ahmad Hamedānī, that Khuzaymat Ibn Thābit, with the permission of the Guardianship, stood in front of the pulpit of the Prophet and read this elegy:

إِذَا مَعْنُ بَايَعْنَا عَلِيًّا حَسْبُنَا إِذَا أَبُو حَسَنٍ بِمَخَافٍ مِنَ الْفِتَنِ 1
وَجَدْنَاهُ أَوْلى النَّاسِ بِالنَّاسِ إِنَّهُ أَطْبَقُ قُرَيْشٍ بِالْكِتَابِ وَالسُّنَنِ 2
وَإِنْ قُرَيْشًا مَا شِئْتُ غُبَارُهُ إِذَا مَا جَرَى يَوْمًا عَلَى الضُّمُرِ الْهِنِ 3 266
وَفِيهِ الَّذِي فِيهِمْ مِنَ الْخَيْرِ كُلِّهِ وَمَا فِيهِمْ تَضَعُ الَّذِي فِيهِ مِنْ حَسَنِ 4 267

1. If we swear allegiance to Ali, then Abū al-Hasan will secure us from any danger and sedition that we fear.
2. We found that his Guardianship over the people is more than that of anyone over the rest of the people, because he is the most clever and capable person regarding the Book of God among the tribe of Quraysh, and he is expert in the traditions of the respected Prophet, may blessings be upon him and his descendants.
3. Ali is the most brave and unique in the battlefield, and even when he is riding on a thin animal, no one who encounters him can fight him.
4. And all benevolence is with Ali—benevolence that includes all goodness within it—thus, all integrity and generosity are with him.

Moreover, Khārazmī, with his series of chains from Muhazzab al-A'immah Abū al-Muzaffar and 'Abd al-Mālik Ibn Ali Ibn Muhammad Hamedānī, through whose own chain from 'Amr Ibn Maymūn, quoting Ibn Abbās, narrated that some of the people of Kūfa composed this elegy about Imam Ali at the time of Šiffin:

أَنْتَ الْإِمَامُ الَّذِي نَرْجُو بِطَاعَتِهِ يَوْمَ الثُّورِ مِنَ الرَّحْمَنِ غُفْرَانًا 1
 وَأَوْصَحْتَ مِن دِينِنَا مَا كَانَ مُشْتَبِهًا جَزَاكَ رَبُّكَ عَنَّا فَيَهِّئْنَا 2
 نَفْسِي الْيَتِيمَ الْخَيْرِ النَّاسِ كُلِّهِمْ يَهْدِي إِلَيْهِ عَلَى الْخَيْرِ مَوْلَانَا 3
 أَحِبُّهُ إِلَهِي وَمَوْلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِمَّا وَأَوَّلُ النَّاسِ صَدِيقًا وَإِيمَانًا 4²⁶⁸

1. [O Ali] you are the same Imam and Leader through whose direct protection, on the Day of Resurrection, we will have forgiveness from God, the Compassionate.
2. You made clear whatever was doubtful for us in the religion, may God double your reward on our behalf.
3. May I be made a sacrifice to one who is better than all after the Prophet; who is Ali, our Master and source of blessings and benevolence.
4. It is he who is the brother of the Prophet and Guardian of the Believers; and he was the first to embrace Islam and confirm God's Prophet, may blessings be upon him and his descendants.

The ignorance of the usurper caliphs is immense. They were so confused about religious matters, verses of the Qur'an, and divine knowledge that scholars of theology have recorded their mistakes.

Abū Bakr Did Not Know the Meaning of *Abb*

Shaykh Mufid has recorded that Abū Bakr was asked about God's words *wa fākihātan wa abba*, as he did not know what it meant in the Qur'an, so he said:

أَيُّ سَمَاوٍ يُظِلُّنِي أَمْ أَىْ أَرْضٍ يُعَلِّقُنِي أَمْ كَيْفَ اصْنَعُ إِنْ قُلْتُ فِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ تَعَالَى: أَمَّا الْفَاكِهَةُ
 فَكُفْرُهَا، وَأَمَّا الْأَبُ فَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ بِهِ

"If I, by my own knowledge and opinions about God's Book, say something about which I do not know the meaning, then what sky will shade me, or upon what land will I walk? How to know what to do? I know the meaning of *fākiha*, but God knows what the meaning of *abb* is here."

Then, when they told Imam Ali this, he said:

يَا سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ إِنَّا عَلِمْنَا أَنَّ الْأَبَّ هُوَ الْكَلَاءُ وَالْمَرْعَى، وَإِنَّ قَوْلَهُ تَعَالَى: وَقَاكُمْ وَأَنَا إِبْدَاءُ مِنْ اللَّهِ تَعَالَى بِإِتْمَانٍ عَلَى خَلْقِهِ بِمَا عَزَّاهُمْ بِهِ وَخَلَقَهُمْ وَلَا أُنْعَاهُمْ بِمَا نَعَى بِهِ أَنْفُسَهُمْ وَتَقْوَمُ بِهِ أَجْسَادُهُمْ.²⁶⁹

Ah! Glory be to God! Did he not know that the word

أَب

means grass, the grass for animals? And when God says *fākhitan wa abba*, it means His care, kindness, and mercy for His creatures, by nourishing them, giving them wealth, and letting them use animals for their comfort, physically strengthening them and taking them under His control.

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has reported this from Jāhiz and the commentary of Thaʿlabī. The beginning of this hadith is about Abū Bakr, and he has added the part with Imam Ali's words from the hadiths of the Household.²⁷⁰

The great scholarly commentators, both Sunni and Shi'a, have spoken about the meaning of *al-abb*

الأب

from the Qur'anic verse of 'Abasa and unanimously agree on the shallow knowledge of Abū Bakr. Among those who have narrated on this are Zamakhsharī,²⁷¹ Ibn Kathīr,²⁷² Khāzim,²⁷³ Abū al-Suʿūd,²⁷⁴ and Suyūṭī.²⁷⁵ They have said that Abū Bakr did not know the meaning of

الأب

when he started speaking about it. Omar also did not know its meaning, so once he was speaking about it in the pulpit of the mosque and hesitated, conceding to his ignorance, saying that searching for the meaning of the word

الأب

is interfering with the Qur'an, and we have no right to do so. Therefore, one is to act according to how much we know of its meaning, and whatever is not known is to be left with God. But now we are going to give Suyūṭī's exact words.

It has been narrated by Abū 'Ubaydah in his *al-Faḍā'il*, and 'Abd Ibn Ḥamid from Ibrāhīm Tamīmī, that when Abū Bakr was asked about these things, he said:

وَأَيُّ أَرْضٍ تُقَلِّبُنِي إِذَا قُلْتُ فِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ مَا لَا أَعْلَمُ؟ وَسَعِيدُ بْنُ مَنْصُورٍ، وَابْنُ جَرِيرٍ، وَابْنُ سَعْدٍ، وَعَبْدُ
بْنُ حَمِيدٍ، وَابْنُ مُنْذِرٍ، وَابْنُ مَرْزُوقٍ، وَبِهِتِيُّ دِرْغَمَبِ الْإِيمَانِ.

Khaṭīb and Ḥākim consider this correct, and they have extracted from the copy of Anas that Omar recited these verses from the pulpit:

فَأَنْبَتْنَا فِيهَا عَبَابًا وَعَيْنًا وَضَبًا إِلَى قَوْلِهِ: وَأَبَا، قَالَ: كُلُّ هَذَا قَدْ عَرَفْتُمْ، فَمَا الْأَبُّ؟ ثُمَّ رَفَضَ عَصَاكَانَتْ فِي
يَدِهِ، قَالَ: هَذَا لَمْ نَرَهُ هُوَ الْكَلْبُ فَمَا عَلَيْكَ أَنْ لَا تَنْدِرِي مَا الْأَبُّ، الْإِنْسَاءُ بَيْنَ لَكُمْ هَذَا مِنْ
الْكِتَابِ فَاعْمَلُوا بِهِ، وَمَا زِلْتُمْ تَرْفُوهَ فَكُلُوهُ إِلَى رَبِّهِ

Man must consider his food, for We poured down water from the heavens, then We furnished the land for the grass to grow. And then We made grow grains, grapes, fresh vegetables to be cut constantly, palm trees and gardens full of trees. As well as fruits, there is grass planted to feed your animals (as nourishment for you and for your animals).²⁷⁶

After reciting these verses, Omar said: "We understand all that God has stated, but what does the word *abb* mean here?" Then he dropped his hand-stick in anger and said:

"By God, knowing the meaning of this word takes pains; you are not going to be responsible for not knowing it. You are to try to learn such words from God's Book to put into practice and guide you in your religion and daily life. Whatever you do not know, leave the meaning with God."

Ḥākim mentions in his *Mustadrak* only Omar's lack of knowledge of the word *abb*, and saying that it was not necessary to take pains to know it. And through the chains at his disposal, he has narrated that Anas Ibn Mālik later said: "According to the two shaykhs, this hadith is correct, and they did not investigate about it."²⁷⁷

After narrating the two hadiths from Abū Bakr and Omar, Suyūfī goes on to narrate from 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd and Ibn al-Anbārī's *Maṣāḥif*, from Anas, that when Omar recited the verse with the phrase *fākihātan wa abba*, he said: "We know the meaning of *fākihātan*, but what does *abba* mean here?"

Then he said: "Be quiet."²⁷⁸ We are prohibited from discussing something we have no knowledge about."²⁷⁹

Suyūfī related from 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd and 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Yazīd that a man asked Omar about the meaning of *wa abba*, but as

Omar gathered that he had a purpose in asking such a thing, he drew away from him with a lash in his hand.

Allāmah Ṭabāṭabāʾī, after explaining these hadiths from the commentary in *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, said: "Omar drew away because he asked about certain words of God in the Qur'an."²⁸⁰

However, by referring to different uses of the phrase *matāʾan lakum wa li anʿāmakum*, it becomes clear that the meaning of *abb* must be food for animals such as sheep, cows, and camels, consisting mainly of grass, herbs, and wild growth in the desert. This is because, after describing herbs, grass, and fodder for animals, God mentions berries, grapes, vegetables, olives, dates, and different kinds of fruits. This all means that *abb* as it is mentioned in the Qur'an means vegetables, herbs, and grass, as well as different kinds of fruits for both animals and men.

Ibn Ḥajar ʿAsqalānī, in his *Fath al-Bārī*, where he defends those who claim to be caliphs of the Prophet in order to preserve their status and veil their misunderstanding of God's Book, has stated that the matter is of no importance.

It is said that the young son of a gardener was asked: "How often does your father water the flowers in the garden?" As the young boy had no knowledge about it, he said: "But my father's garden has no flowers to be watered."²⁸¹

And Ibn Ḥajar said: "It has been said that the term *abb* is not Arabic, and this is why its meaning was unknown to Abū Bakr and Omar."²⁸²

It is strange that he felt defensive, and found it easy to say anything.

He should consider why the Qur'an, which is most explicit, contains an unknown word for no reason, such a strange word that two people in the high position of the Prophet's caliph could not make out what it meant.

Secondly, if this word was so unusual in Arabic, then why have authors and scholars not mentioned it, like other words that are easily consulted in a dictionary? In addition, it is mentioned nowhere that it is a foreign word.

And thirdly, there are many hadiths about the meaning of *abb* by Sunnis in the commentary in *al-Durr al-Manthūr* and *Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr*, where it is described as a kind of grass that animals eat. There is also Ibn Mundhar's hadith from Sudday, who said: "The meaning of *ḥadāʾiq* is 'gardens,' the meaning of *qaḍb* is 'old trees,' and *abb* means 'grass.'" And regarding the meaning of

مَنَّا مَا لَكُمْ وَلَا تَمَائِكُمْ

he said: "Fruits are your foodstuff, and *abb* is for your animals (camels, cows, and sheep)." ²⁸³

This is similar to 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd's hadith, quoting Zaḥḥāk, where *fākiha* (fruit) is something that man eats, and *abb* grows in pastures.

It is also like 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd's hadith quoting Akrama, where *fākiha* means food for man and *abb* is food for animals.

There is also 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd's hadith quoting Hasan, where whatever is fresh, sweet, and delicious is for man, and *abb* is for animals.

And there is 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd's hadith quoting Sa'īd Ibn Jubayr, where *abb* stands for herbs and grass, and 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd's hadith quoting Abū Mālik, where *abb* is grass or growth in the desert.

Also, 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd from 'Ata', where whatever grows on the surface of the earth is called *abb*. ²⁸⁴

Fourthly, *abb* has an Arabic meaning, and is used in Arabic poetry, as Suyūṭī says:

Tasṭī has reported from Ibn Abbās that Nāfi' Ibn Azraq asked him about the meaning of *abb*, and Ibn Abbās said: "That which animals prefer as food." Then Nāfi' asked: "Do the Arabs know this word?" Ibn Abbās said: "Yes, they do. Have you not heard the poet say:

تَرَىٰ بِهِ الْأَبَّ وَالْيَطْلِينَ مُخْتَلِكًا عَلَى الشَّرْعَةِ يَجْرِي عَنْهَا الْغُذْبُ ²⁸⁵

"In that fresh and green land you see grass, plants, and pumpkins mixed up together, and a salt-water river runs nearby."

In *Tafsīr al-Kashshāf*, Zamakhsharī mentions that Fakhr Rāzī narrated to him:

Al-abb is a kind of grass growing in pastures. It is called *abb* because animals like it and approach it in order to get it. And the poet says:

لَآ إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ أَيُّ يَوْمٍ وَمَنْ يَنْتَبِغِ، وَالْأَبُّ وَالْأُمُّ أَعْوَانِ أَقَالَ:
جَدُّنَا قَيْسٌ وَنَجْدُ دَارِنَا وَلَقَدْ الْأَبُّ بِهِ وَالْكَرْعُ. ²⁸⁶

"Our origin goes back to Qays, and our house is in Najd, and we also have our own green land and pasture; and we have a source where the animals stretch their necks to drink water."

The poet's intention is to demonstrate his nobility to others, for he is of the lineage of Qays and they have their own pasture and sources of water.

Concerning the word *abab*, Ibn Athīr, after explaining the story of Omar confessing his ignorance and not taking pains to understand the Qur'an, says:

The word *abab* refers to a pasture with fresh green grass that is to be kept short. And it has been said that *abab* for animals is like fruit for man, such as in the hadith of Qays Ibn Sā'idah:²⁸⁷

فَجَلَّ يَرْتَعُ أَبَاؤُا مِثْلُهَا

"My camel started eating grass in the pasture, and I began hunting lizards."

However, Bukhārī, in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*, has completely ignored the beginning of the hadith, where Abū Bakr and Omar are questioned. He has only briefly referred to the end of Omar's hadith, where Anas says:

كَأَنَّ عُمَرَ هَلَّى: نُهِنَّا عَنْ الْكَلَفِ.²⁸⁸

"We were in the presence of Omar, who said: 'We are banned from explaining that which takes effort.'"

Zamakhsharī has decided to defend both the Shaykhs, and with his false philosophy has tried to restore their honor and change their shameful words. As we already mentioned, he has tried in his commentary to respect their opinions concerning the hadiths. He has said:

If you try to find mistakes and then say that these words of Omar are lacking in truth, then I should tell you that his purpose was not that; he just wanted to explain the case explicitly. Omar's purpose was to show that this verse was sent down to honor man with his food, and that man has been asked to give thanks for it. It is clearly understood from the verse that the meaning of *abb* is something that God sent down as food for man or as grass for animals such as camels, cows, and donkeys.

Therefore, Omar says that your responsibility is to do the most important thing, and that is to give thanks to God for those blessings that He has calculated for you, for this is clear and there is no doubt. So try not to occupy yourself with the meaning of *abb*, or with knowing if a certain grass or plant is called *abb*. Therefore, be satisfied with its superficial meaning, so that at the right time its meaning might become clear to you.

He then advised people to do as he has instructed whenever they came across any question about the meaning of a word in the Qur'an.²⁸⁹

This response is also wrong. By accepting the ignorance of the Shaykhs, it is unclear why certain words in the Qur'an require effort. The Qur'an was sent down for us to ponder over and think about. Not only the Arabs, but other nations too, refer to it for answers to basic questions.

We will, God-willing, discuss in the future why the Shaykhs especially avoided speaking about the Prophet's overturning of Omar's verdicts and the pondering over words in the Qur'an. Zamakhshari's aim in relating the hadiths about the Prophet was to change in certain ways how the Sunnis thought, rather than portray facts in the verses that were revealed concerning the status of Imam Ali.

Abū Bakr Did Not Know the Meaning of *Kalālah* in the Qur'an

Shaykh Mufid writes in *Irshād* that Abū Bakr was asked about the meaning of *kalālah* (indirect heirs), and he replied:

أَقُولُ فِيهَا بِرَأْيِي، فَإِنِ اصْبَحْتُ مِنَ اللَّهِ، وَإِنِ اخْطَأْتُ فَمِنْ نَفْسِي وَمِنَ الشَّيْطَانِ.

"Concerning this, I am going to give my opinion, and if it is correct, then it is from God; but if it is incorrect, then it is from me and Satan."

When they told Imam Ali of his answer, he said:

مَا اعْتَاهَى الرَّأْيَ فِي هَذَا الْمَكَانِ، أَمَا عَلِمَ أَنَّ الْكَلَالََةَ هُمُ الْإِخْوَةُ وَالْأَخَوَاتُ مِنْ قَبْلِ الْأَبِ وَالْأُمِّ، وَمِنْ قَبْلِ الْأَبِ عَلَى انْفِرَادِهِ، وَمِنْ قَبْلِ الْأُمِّ إِصْغَاعًا عَلَى جَنْبِهَا (انْفِرَادًا مَعَهَا بَدَلًا)؟ قَالَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ: يَسْتَفْتُونَكَ قُلِ اللَّهُ يُفْتِيكُمْ فِي الْكَلَالَةِ إِنِ امْرُؤٌ هَلَكَ لَيْسَ لَهُ وَلَدٌ وَلَهُ أُخْتُ فَلَهَا مِنْهُ شَرْكَاءُ.

وَقَالَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ: وَإِنْ كَانَ رَجُلٌ يُورَثُ كَلَالَةً أَوِ امْرَأَةٌ وَلَهُ أُخٌ فَلِلكلٍ وَاحِدٍ مِنْهُمَا الشُّمُسُ فَإِنْ كَانُوا أَكْثَرَ مِنْ ذَلِكَ فَهُمْ شُرَكَاءُ فِي الثُّلُثِ.

How free of want is he to give his opinion here? [That is, the matter is not something on which to offer an opinion.] Does he not know that the word *kalālah* refers to the paternal and maternal brothers and sisters? It particularly refers to the paternal siblings. God, the Honorable and Exalted, states: *They ask you for a pronouncement [on the indirect heirs]. Say:*

"God has pronounced for you concerning distant kindred. If a man dies childless and he has a sister, hers is half of the heritage..." (Qur'an 4:176).

And if a man or a woman have a distant heir (having left neither parent nor child), and he have a brother or sister (only on the mother's side), then to each of them a sixth, and if they be more than two, then they shall be sharers in a third. (Qur'an 4:12)

Therefore, we see that God assigns *kalālah* in the first verse to include the sister of the father and the mother, and half the heritage to the paternal sister. In the second verse, *kalālah* amounting to a third of the heritage goes to the maternal brother and sister. Therefore, the word *kalālah* in the Qur'an applies first of all to the paternal and maternal brothers and sisters, secondly to the paternal siblings, and thirdly to the maternal siblings. It is quite clear, and decisions are usually based accordingly. Imam Ali stated how firm he was on the matter, which is quite clear and requires no opinion.

Mullā Ali Muttaqī narrated a hadith in *Kanz al-Ummāl* saying that Abū Bakr and Omar did not know the meaning of *kalālah*. One example of this is in *Irshād*, where Abū Bakr says that he does not know, and then adds: "My opinion is that *kalālah* applies to those other than the father and son."

When Omar became caliph, he said that *kalālah* was for those other than the children, and he mentioned those who have no children. When he was wounded by Abū Lu'lu's dagger, he said: "On this matter I would feel ashamed before God if I said anything different to Abū Bakr. My opinion is the same, that is, that *kalālah* goes to those other than the father and son."²⁹⁰

Mullā Ali Muttaqī has similarly narrated from Sa'īd Ibn Musayyib that Omar asked the Prophet about the amount of *kalālah* for heirs, and the Prophet said: "Has God not made it clear?" He then he recited this verse:

وَأَنَّ كُنْزَ رَجُلٍ يَوْمَئِذٍ كَلَالَةٌ أَوْ تَرَاةٌ...

Omar was in such a state that he could not understand the meaning, so he said to his daughter Hafsa: "Whenever you find the Prophet in good spirits, ask him about the meaning of this."

When Hafsa later asked the Prophet, he said: "What? Did your father ask this? I see that it is hard for your father to understand it."

Omar himself used to say:

مَا زِلْنِي أَعْلَمُهَا هَذَا وَقَدْ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ ذَلِكَ²⁹¹

"I never thought I was able to understand the meaning of *kalālah*. Moreover, the Prophet has already said this about me."

In addition, Muslim, Ahmad, Ibn Mājih, Bayhaqī, Ṭabarī, and Qurṭubī have all narrated from Ibn Abī Ṭālib Yaʿmurī that on a certain Friday, Omar delivered a sermon and mentioned the Prophet and Abū Bakr, and then said:

I will not leave after me anything more significant than the matter of *kalālah*, that I have not consulted the Prophet about anything more important. He was no angrier than when he pointed to my chest saying:

يَا عُمَرُ أَلَا بِكَفَيْكَ آيَةُ الضَّيْفِ الَّتِي فِي آخِرِ سُورَةِ النَّسَاءِ.

"O Omar! Is the verse of al-Ṣayf at the end of the chapter al-Nisā not enough for you?"²⁹²

Then Omar said: "If I keep going, I will make a rule concerning the matter of *kalālah* that is to be carried out, whether one has read the Qurʾan or not."²⁹³

Suyūṭī has quoted Masrūq as saying:

I asked Omar Khaṭṭāb about the *kalālah* inheritance for my own relatives, and he repeated *kalālah*, *kalālah* twice, before reaching his right hand to his beard, which he held as he said: "If I knew this, it would be better for me than anything I have in this world. I asked the Prophet about it, and he told me three times: 'Have you not heard the verse sent down known as *al-Ṣayf*?'"

Hākim has narrated in his *Mustadrak* from Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa that Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb said:

لَأَنْ أَكُونَ سَتَلْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَنْ ثَلَاثٍ أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ خَيْرِ النَّعَمِ: مَنْ الْحَلِيفَةُ بَيْنَ؟ وَعَنْ قَوْمٍ قَالُوا: نَقَرُوا الزَّكَاةَ فِي أَمْوَالِنَا وَلَا نُؤْذِيهَا إِلَيْكَ، أَيْحُلُ قَاتِلُكُمْ؟ وَعَنْ الْكَلَالَةِ.²⁹⁴

"It would be much better for me if I had asked the Prophet about the red wool camels. The first, about who was to be caliph after him, and the second, about the tribe that said: 'We confess to giving alms from our property, but we would never give such to you.' So, is it permissible to kill such people? And the third is about *kalālah*."

Moreover, there is a hadith from Ḥudhayfah Ibn Yamān that states that, when the verse

يَنْتَقِرُونَكَ قُلُوبُ اللَّهِ يَفْتِيكُمْ فِي الْكَلَالَةِ

was sent down, the Prophet taught it to Hudhayfah, who also taught it to Omar. After that Omar once again asked Hudhayfah about it, and Hudhayfah said:

وَاللّٰهُ اِنَّكَ لَا تَعْمَىٰ اِنْ كُنْتَ ظَنَنْتَ اِنَّهُ لَمَّا نَهَا رَسُولُ اللّٰهِ صَلَّى اللّٰهُ عَلَيْهِ وَاٰلِهٖ وَسَلَّمَ فَلَقَيْتُكُمْ كَمَا لَقَانِيهَا
رَسُولُ اللّٰهِ وَاللّٰهُ لَا اَزِيْهُ لَكَ عَلَيَّ شَيْئًا اَهْدًا. ²⁹⁵

"By God, you are a stupid, dull man! So far as I know, the Messenger of God taught it to me, and I, in turn, taught it to you in the same way. By God, to that which I have already taught you—which was exactly what the Messenger of God had taught me—I will never add anything more."

The Objection of a Jewish Scholar to Abū Bakr's Being a Representative of God, and the Answer of Imam Ali

Shaykh Mufid has related in *Irshād* that it is said that some Jewish scholars went to Abū Bakr and asked him: "Are you the Caliph of the Prophet for this nation?" and he answered: "Yes, I am."

They said: "We have found in the Torah that the deputies of the Prophets are the wisest men among their nations. So tell us now where God is. Is He in Heaven or on the earth?"

Abū Bakr said: "God is in heaven upon His Throne."

One of the Jewish scholars said: "According to what you say, we understand the earth to be empty of God; and likewise I gather that He is in a certain place, but not in another."

Abū Bakr said: "These words of yours are like those of the atheist. Go away from me or I will have you killed."

Greatly surprised, the Jew mocked Islam and left Abū Bakr. Imam Ali encountered the Jew on the way, and said to him:

O you, the Jew! I understood your question, and the answer you were given. However, we say:

اِنَّ اللّٰهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ، اَيْنَ الْاَيْنِ، فَلَا اَيْنَ لَدَّ، وَجَلَّ اَنْ يُّخْبِيَهُ مَكَانٌ، وَهُوَ فِي كُلِّ مَكَانٍ يَغْيِرُ
مَمَاسَّةً، وَلَا يُجَاوِزُو، يَحِيْطُ عِلْمًا بِمَا فِيْهَا، وَلَا يَمْلُؤُوْهُ مِنْهَا مِنْ تَدْبِيْرِهِ

Indeed God, Glory be to Him in the Highest, assigned beings their positions, but He has no position for Himself, for He is too great to occupy any place. And although being far from any place, He

dominates them all, and His knowledge encompasses all beings existing in those places, and absolutely nothing is not His Will.

Imam Ali then told the man: "Now I will tell you of what has been written in some of your books, and it will be a good witness to what I have told you. So if you understand and agree with what I say, then will you believe [in Islam]?" The Jew answered: "Yes, I will."

Imam Ali said: "Have you not considered how it is written in a certain book of yours, that one day the Prophet Moses was seated when an angel came to him from the east, and Moses asked him: "Where have you come from?" The angel answered: "I have come from God, Glory be to Him."

Then another angel came from the west, and Moses asked him where he had come from, and he answered: "I have come from God, Glory be to Him."

Once more an angel came, saying: "I have come from the seventh heaven, from God, Glory be to Him." After that a fourth angel descended and said: "I have come from the seventh heaven under the throne. I have come from God, the Most High."

Then the Prophet Moses said:

سُبْحَانَ مَنْ لَا يَمْلُؤُهُ مَكَانٌ وَلَا يَكُونُ مِنْ (إِلَى نَحْوِهِ هَذَا) مَكَانٍ أَقْرَبُ مِنْ مَكَانٍ

"Blessed is the place that is not empty of Him, and is no nearer than another place."

The Jewish scholar said: "Now I will bear witness that this is quite right, and I bear witness that you deserve to be the successor of your Prophet, rather than the man who has now usurped it."

There are many other such cases where Abū Bakr was unable to give an answer in the presence of the Jews and Christians. If it had not been for the Prophet, they would not have received answers to their questions. They would then have put them to shame and ruined Islam.

The Position of Imam Ali and Position of Abū Bakr

How beautifully composed are these words describing All's exaltation above Abū Bakr:

تَبَا لِنَصَابَةِ الْأَنَامِ وَقَدْ تَهَاكُوا بِالَّذِي بِهِ كَانُوا 1
 كَانُوا عَتِيقًا بِحَيْدَرٍ عَمِيثٍ غِيَوْتُهُم بِالَّذِي بِهِ تَاهُوا 2
 كَرِهِينَ مَنْ فَتَكَ فِي هِدَايَتِهِ وَبَيْنَ مَنْ قَالَ: إِنَّهُ اللَّهُ 3
 أَهْلُ الْوَرَى عَجَزُوا عَنْ وَصْفِ حَيْدَرِهِ وَالْعَارِفُونَ بِمَعْنَى وَصْفِهِ تَاهُوا 4
 إِنْ أَدْعُهُ بِشَرِّ الْأَهْلِ يَمْنَعُنِي وَأَخْتِشِي اللَّهَ فِي قَوْلِي هُوَ اللَّهُ 5

1. Let it be the end of those who rose up to be enemies to Ali, for they say the ugliest words against him, and they perish away day by day.
2. They have compared 'Atiq (Abū Bakr) to Haydar, with the attributes of a lion, as if they have become totally blind [to facts], because they have lost the way and gone astray.
3. How far a gap there is between one who has doubted his guidance, and one who has said: "Ali is God, the One God, and needless of anything."
4. No one in the world can see or speak of the high status of Haydar, the only one brave as a lion in the nation, the pioneer of humanity—they are astonished when they count his great attributes.
5. If I want to call him a human being, then my wisdom stops me; and in my conversation, I am afraid to say he is God—I am constantly living in fear of that.

Though Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* and Sayyid Murtaḍā in *Shāfi*, when comparing the status of Omar to that of Abū Bakr, were unwilling to provide details, there is a long story narrated by Haytham 'Addī quoting Banī Abbās Hamedānī from Sa'īd Ibn Jubayr, saying that once when they mentioned the names of Omar and Abū Bakr in front of Abdullah Ibn Omar [the son of Omar], a man who was sitting there said:

"By God, those two were like suns, or two moons among this nation."

Ibn Omar asked the man: "How do you know that?" The man answered: "Was it not so, that they were united and had the same opinions?" Ibn Omar said:

No, never. If only you knew how different they were. I bear witness that I was once with my father on a day when he had told me not to let anyone enter the house, and the son of 'Abd al-Raḥmān came and asked permission to enter. Omar said: "This individual is an ugly-mannered little insect, but he is better than his father." These

words of my father frightened me, and I asked: "Dear father, is 'Abd al-Raḥmān better than his father?" and Omar said: "O you with no one to care for you. Who can be better than his father? Let 'Abd al-Raḥmān enter the house."

'Abd al-Raḥmān entered the house. He had come to plead on behalf of Hutaynah the poet to placate Omar, who had jailed him for an elegy he had composed. Omar said: "He is a little off the mark. Let him remain in prison for a while for him to be straightened." No matter how much 'Abd al-Raḥmān pleaded with Omar, he did not concede. 'Abd al-Raḥmān left us, and Omar then told me:

أَفِي غَفْلَةٍ أَنْتَ إِلَى يَوْمِكَ هَذَا عَمَّا كَانَ مِنْ تَقَدُّمِ أَحَبِّيقِ بَنِي تَيْمٍ وَهَذَا جَدِّي؟

"Have you been negligent of your life up until now, of what has happened on account of the stupid lineage of the Banī Taym, of the usurpation of the caliphate and the oppression imposed upon me?"

I said: "O father, I am unaware of his past, and what happened before and more recently."

My father said: "How reliable is your knowledge?" I said: "By God, Abū Bakr is very popular with the people and most needed by them." My father said: "Apart from your father's being angry with him, it is as you say." I said: "Do you not want to expose Abū Bakr to the people to make everything clear?"

Omar said: "How can I do that when you say he is the nation's beloved? If such is the case, and I say anything against him, the people will break your father's head with rocks."

Omar's son then said: "By God, my father gathered his courage to take a serious step, and about a week later he called the people together and delivered a sermon, saying:

أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ إِنْ تَبِعْتُمْ أَبِي بَكْرٍ كُنْتُمْ تَتَّبِعُونَ قُلَّةً وَقَى اللَّهُ شُرُوءَهَا فَمَنْ دَعَاكُمْ إِلَى مِثْلِهَا فَاقْتُلُوهُ.²⁹⁶

"O people. Your sworn allegiance to Abū Bakr is baseless and outside the law. An evident stumbling block has appeared. However, God has saved you from his devilish acts. From now on, whoever similarly invites you to pay allegiance, you should kill him!"

The Ignorance of the Two Shaykhs on Religious Matters

Ibn Shahr Āshūb says a man came to Abū Bakr with a problem, saying: "A man married a woman in the early morning, and she gave birth to a baby on the first night. So do the mother and child receive

an inheritance from the man if he dies?" Abū Bakr was unable to answer.

Imam Ali stated:

هَذَا رَجُلٌ لَمْ يَجَارِهِ خَتَلَى فَلَمْ تَخْتَسْ مَاتَ الرَّجُلُ.²⁹⁷

"The truth of the matter is that the man had a slave girl who was already pregnant. He freed her and then one morning took her as his wife, and she gave birth to a child the same night. If the man dies, his property goes to the woman and her child as his heirs."

Faḍl Ibn Shādhān, along with his arguments against the Sunnis, says: "You are narrating from 'Abd al-'Alā and Sa'īd Ibn Qatādah that Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb gave a sermon, saying: 'Be aware that if someone comes to me saying a certain man has increased the dowry of his wife as much as four hundred *dirhams*, I will not desist from punishing him.'"

Ibn Qatādah says that a woman then stood up and approached him, saying:

مَاذَا وَلَكَ يَا عُمَرُ؟ قَوْلُ اللَّهِ اِغْدُلْ مِنْ قَوْلِكَ وَأَوَّلَى وَأَوَّلَى أَنْ يَنْهَجَ

"O Omar, what then is your business with us? It is God's words that are fixed and must be carried out." Omar asked: "Then what has God commanded you to do?" The woman replied that God has stated:

وَأَنْ أَوْزُتُمْ أَسْمَاءُ بِنْتُ أَبِي ذَرٍّ مَكَانَ زَوْجٍ وَأَبْدَيْتُمْ أَخَذَ مِنْ قِنْطَارٍ فَلَا تَأْخُذُوا مِنْهُ شَيْئًا أَتَأْخُذُونَهُ بُهْتَانًا وَإِذَا
مُبْتَلَا وَكَيْفَ تَأْخُذُونَهُ وَقَدْ أَفْضَى بَعْضُكُمْ إِلَى بَعْضٍ وَأَخَذْنِ مِنْكُمْ مِيثَاقًا غَلِيظًا.

And if you want to exchange one wife for another, and you have given to one a sum of money (however great), take nothing from it. Would you take it back by the way of calumny and open wrong? (Qur'an 4: 20-21). She said: "So do you want to annul this through slander and obvious sin? How can you take the dowry back when they have a private contract with each other, and have made a solemn agreement?"

She continued: "Qintār means property amounting to the blood money for a man,²⁹⁸ and that is more than four hundred *dirhams*."

Omar said: "Everyone is wiser than Omar when it comes to solving this problem."

He then returned from there to the mosque and gave a sermon, saying:

إِنَّمَا النَّاسُ إِنَّمَا كُتِبَتْ لَهُمْ أَنْ يَتَزَوَّجَ الرَّجُلُ عَلَى أَكْثَرِ مَنْ أَنْ يَجَاهِدَ دِيْنَهُمْ وَإِنْ امْرَأَةً أَهْلَةً مِنْ عُمَرُ
جَاءَنِي فَأَجَبَنِي بِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ فَحُجْتُ وَفَلَجْتُ، وَإِنْ الْمَرْءُ مَا تَرَاهُمْ بِهِ السَّيْلُونَ.²⁹⁹

"O people, I prohibited giving more than four hundred *dirhams* as a dowry. However, a woman who was wiser than Omar came to me and reasoned with the Book of God in my presence. She overcame me and won the debate. Therefore, the dowry is the same as they agree upon when marrying, and it is the decision of the couple."

Allāmah Ṭabāṭabā'ī has narrated from *al-Durr al-Manthūr* that many commentators have narrated this hadith, such as Suyūṭī, 'Abd al-Razzāq, and Ibn Mundhar from 'Abd al-Rahmān Sulammī, and also Sa'īd Ibn Mansūr and Abī Ya'lā through a good chain from Masrūq, and Sa'īd Ibn Mansūr, and 'Abd Ibn Ḥamīd from Bakr, the son of Abdullah Muḍḥinī,²³⁰⁰ narrate the following: "Do not assign dowries more than four hundred *dirhams*. If more is assigned, I will deposit it in the public coffers."

Allāmah Amīnī has commented on this hadith in nine different ways in the context of important historical events from the Shaykhs in the hadiths. In some of his comments he has explained how Omar had said that no more than four hundred silver coins are to be appointed, even if the woman were the daughter of Dhi al-Fiḍḍa, that is, the daughter of Yazīd Ibn Ḥaṣīn Ḥārithī.³⁰¹

In addition, a tall woman called Faṭṣā, with a big flat nose, stood up from among the people and spoke a little, and Omar said: "A woman was right, and a man made mistakes."

Somewhere it is written that Omar said: "All people are wiser on religious matters than Omar," and he repeated this two or three times.

And some have narrated that after these words, he said to his companions:

تَسْمَعُونِيْ اَقُوْلُ بِمِثْلِ الْقَوْلِ فَلَا تُنْكِرُوْنَهُ عَلَيَّ حَتَّى تَرُدُّ عَلَيَّ امْرَاَةً لَيْسَتْ مِنْ اَعْلَمِ النِّسَاءِ

"You heard whatever I said, but you did not point to my mistakes until that woman, who was no wiser than other women, saw my mistake and objected."

And it is said in some of the narrations:

اِنَّ امْرَاَةً خَاصَمَتْ عُمَرَ فَخَسَمَهُ

"A woman began arguing with Omar, [and with her reasoning] she won the argument."

And it is recorded that "Other people [around Omar] are more knowledgeable and better jurisprudents than Omar."³⁰²

Some narrations say:

كُلُّ النَّاسِ أَهْلٌ مِنْ عَمَرَ حَتَّى رَأَتْ الْجُبَالَ، لَا تَجْعَلُونَ مِنْ إِمَامٍ أَسْطَاوًا مَرَادُ أَصَابَتْ، فَاصْلَحَتْ إِمَامَكُمْ.
قَضَيْتُهُ (قَضَيْتُهُ)

"All people have more knowledge of the law than Omar, even the women whose custom it is to sit veiled behind curtains in their rooms. Are you not surprised at a leader who makes mistakes in front of a woman who speaks the truth? This woman is proud to have received her knowledge from your Imam, and she started to argue and won the debate."³⁰³

And it is recorded that:

كُلُّ النَّاسِ أَهْلٌ مِنْ عَمَرَ حَتَّى تُخْتَرَاتِ فِي الْبُيُوتِ

"All of the people have more knowledge of the law than Omar, even women sitting behind screens."

As Hākim Nishābūrī has explained in his *Mustadrak*, vol. 2, p. 177, through his large collection of chains, this hadith is about Omar, and the most authentic chains that relate this sermon of Omar's are from Dhahabī in *Talkhīṣ al-Mustadrak*, which has Hākim's statement as well as Khaṭīb Baghdādī's from his history book *al-Tārikh*, vol. 3, p. 257. They have narrated the hadith in various ways and verified its correctness.³⁰⁴

Quddāma's Reasoning That Alcohol Is Lawful for the Believers and Omar's Accepting It

Faḍl Ibn Shādhān writes against the Sunnis in his *al-Ihtijāj* that they narrate that Quddāma Ibn Maznūn³⁰⁵ had drunk wine, so they took him to Omar. Omar ordered them to give him the appropriate lashes, but Quddāma said:

O Commander of the Faithful, I do not deserve to be lashed, because I am of the category that God speaks of in the verse where He says:

لَيْسَ عَلَى الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ جُنَاحٌ فِيمَا كَانُوا إِذَا مَا اقْتَوُوا وَامْنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ ثُمَّ اقْتَوُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ ثُمَّ اقْتَوُوا وَأَحْسَنُوا وَاللَّهُ يُحِبُّ الْمُحْسِنِينَ

There shall be no blame upon those who believe and do good works for what they may have eaten (in the past). So be mindful of your duty (to God), and believe, and do good works; and again: be mindful of your duty and do right. God loves those who do good (Qur'an 5:93).

Omar stopped the lashing, and Ali said: "The people are evidence to this verse about not eating or drinking anything unlawful. They were among our brothers who died and are gone. Therefore, if Quddāma keeps on drinking wine and does not give it up, you must kill him; and if he considers it right, you must give him lashes."

Omar asked: "How many lashes should I give him?" Ali answered: "As a wine drinker gets drunk because of his drinking, and when he is drunk he begins to speak nonsense, and when speaking nonsense he abuses others, you must give him the same number of lashes as one who makes an accusation of adultery." So Omar had him lashed 80 times.³⁰⁶

Shaykh Mufīd in *Irshād* and Ibn Shahr Āshūb in *al-Manāqib* say that both the Sunnis and the Shi'a have narrated the hadith about Quddāma Ibn Maẓnūn drinking wine, and his reasoning according to the Qur'anic verse, as well as his being released by Omar. They add that when the news reached Imam Ali, he went to Omar and said: "Why did you not punish Quddāma for drinking wine?" Omar said that Quddāma had recited the verse, and he read it for Imam Ali.

Then Imam Ali said:

لَيْسَ لِقَادِمِينَ أَهْلُ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةِ، وَلَا مَنْ سَلَكَ سَبِيلَهُ فِي أَرْصَافِ مَا خَرَّمَ اللَّهُ، إِلَّا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ لَا يَسْتَعْلُونَ خَرَائِمًا.

Quddāma is not the kind of person to whom this verse refers; nor does he recognize the things that God, the Honorable and Exalted, has described as sinful for those who believe and do good works, and never do anything against God's Will. Turn Quddāma back, and make him repent of what he has said. If he does not repent, then give him the due punishment or kill him, because he has become a disbeliever, and has abandoned the religion of Islam.

Omar woke up and understood, and informed Quddāma, who repented and promised not to do the same again. Therefore, they did not kill him, but Omar still did not know how many lashes to give him, and he asked Imam Ali: "Assign for me the number of lashes."

Imam Ali said: "His punishment is 80 lashes. As one who drinks wine becomes drunk, and when he is drunk he begins to speak nonsense, and with his persistent nonsense he abuses and accuses others, so there is a punishment of 80 lashes for such a man." Then Omar carried out Imam Ali's instruction and gave Quddāma 80 lashes.³⁰⁷

Majlisī has narrated a similar story in *Biḥār al-Anwār* from Ibn Shahr Āshūb's *al-Manāqib* and Shaykh Mufid's *Irshād*. It appears with little difference from Kulaynī in *al-Kāfi* through Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm quoting Muhammad Ibn 'Īsā from Yūnus, through Abdullah Ibn Sanān from Imam Ṣādiq.³⁰⁸

Also among Imam Ali's judgments is one concerning the blood money that a woman was going to pay for her unborn child.

The Blood Money for Abortion and Beheading the Dead

Shaykh Mufid has narrated in the *Irshād* that a man beat his wife, causing her to have a miscarriage. Imam Ali said:

The man must pay 40 dinars as blood money, for it was revealed:

وَلَقَدْ خَلَقْنَا الْإِنْسَانَ مِنْ سُلَالَةٍ مِنْ طِينٍ ثُمَّ جَعَلْنَاهُ نُطْفَةً فِي قَرَارٍ مَكِينٍ ثُمَّ خَلَقْنَا النُّطْفَةَ عَلَقَةً فَخَلَقْنَا
الْمَلَقَةَ مُضْغَةً فَخَلَقْنَا الْمُضْغَةَ عِظَامًا فَكَسَوْنَا الْعِظَامَ لَحْمًا ثُمَّ أَنشَأْنَاهُ خَلْقًا آخَرَ فَكَارَكَ اللَّهُ أَحْسَنُ
الْمَخْلُوقِينَ

Verily We created man from a product of clay; then placed him as a drop (of seed) in a safe lodging. Then We made the drop into a clot, then of that clot We made a little lump, then We made from that lump bones, then clothed the bones with flesh, and then produced it as another creation. So blessed be God, the Best of creators (Quran 23:12-14).

So the blood money for the drop is 20 dinars, and the blood money for the clot is 40 dinars. Then, once the clot is shaped as a lump, it is 60 dinars, and when the bones are formed the blood money is raised to 80 dinars. And when the flesh has been given its complete shape, but has not yet received a soul, the blood money is 100 dinars. Once the soul has been given to it, then it is a whole person, and the blood money is that of a man—1000 dinars.

After narrating this, Shaykh Mufid said:

What we have told of these cases and verdicts of Imam Ali so far are just a few of his judgments of which we have yet to say anything. No one among the Sunnis, or even the Shi'a, has heard them except through the Imam. His offspring acted in this way, and if someone wished to say something contrary, one's mistake would be pointed out immediately, and one's ignorance would be revealed to the people, as has happened in the most simple matters.³⁰⁹

Shaykh Mufid intended to demonstrate Imam Ali's decisions in these cases from hadiths derived from the Household, where different kinds of blood money are assigned in different cases.

Among the hadiths is one from Kulaynī through his chains from Saʿīd Ibn Musayyib quoting Ali Ibn al-Husayn, where different amounts of blood money are clarified for an unborn baby at different periods.³¹⁰

Also among the hadiths is one that Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī have narrated from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, quoting his father, through Husayn Ibn Musa, quoting Muhammad Ibn Šabāh and some of the companions saying that, when Manšūr Dawāniqī was caliph, his servant went to him while he was circumambulating the House and said: "O Commander of the Faithful, one of your servants died last night, and another servant of yours beheaded him after his death."

Upon hearing this, Manšūr became furious, and without delay he asked Ibn Šibrama, Ibn Abī Laylā, and some of the other judges and jurists what their opinions were on the matter.

All of them replied: "For such a case we have received no command, and we are completely uninformed regarding it."

Meanwhile, Manšūr was wondering whether he should kill the man or let him go.

Once more Manšūr asked them what to do, but their answer was as before: they knew nothing about such a case.

Some of them said to Manšūr: "A man is here now, and if anyone were to know the answer to your question, it would only be he. He is Jaʿfar Ibn Muhammad, and at the moment he is doing the running at the Kaʿba."

Manšūr told Rabīʿ to go to him and say: "If we did not know what you are doing now [the running between Safā and Marwa], we would ask you to come to see us. However, favor us by telling us what to do about this case." Rabīʿ went to the Imam at the top of the Mount of Marwa and gave him Manšūr's message.

Imam Abū Abdullah told Rabīʿ: "Do you not see that we are busy fulfilling the rites of Safā and Marwah? Tell him to seek the answer to the problem from the scholars and jurists staying with him."

Rabīʿ said: "Manšūr has already asked the scholars and jurists, but none of them could answer properly."

Imam Šādiq tried to send Rabīʿ back to Manšūr, but Rabīʿ said: "I beg you to answer this question of ours, because the scholars staying with Manšūr have no answer."

The Imam told him: "So wait until I finish my prayers and the rites of Safā and Marwah." Rabīʿ obeyed, and when the Imam had brought the prayers to a close and they were walking close by the sacred Mosque, he said to Rabīʿ: "Now go to Manṣūr and tell him that the blood money for the killer is a hundred dinars."

Rabīʿ returned and told Manṣūr and the jurisprudents what he had heard. They said: "Go now and ask Jaʿfar why the blood money for the killer is a hundred dinars."

This he did, and Imam Ṣādiq said:

The blood money for the drop is 20 dinars, for the clot another 20 is added, the formation of the clot is another 20 dinars, another 20 is for when the bones have formed, and finally, when flesh covers all this, another 20 dinars is added, for this is then considered a new creation, as God has stated: *thumma ansha'nāhu khalqan ākhar*. This is a real person, but is without a soul while it is in the stomach of the mother.

Rabīʿ returned and carried his report to Manṣūr. All the scholars with Manṣūr were surprised, and they said to Rabīʿ: "Now do something else. Go once more to Jaʿfar and ask him who should receive these dinars. Should they go to the inheritors of the one who died, or someone else?" Rabīʿ obeyed and went to the Imam with the question.

Imam Abū Abdullah said: "None of this money goes to the inheritors of the dead, because this money is received on behalf of the corpse after the death. They must make a ḥajj pilgrimage on behalf of the dead or pay the money as alms on his behalf, spending it in charity."

The narrator says he understood that Rabīʿ was sent once again to the Imam with another question, and that altogether Abū Abdullah answered a total of 36 of these questions. However, Rabīʿ, who relayed the messages, could not remember all the answers he received.³¹¹

On the Ornaments of Mecca and Imam Ali's Command to Retain Them

One of Imam Ali's commands was to leave the jewels and ornaments at God's Sacred House untouched. Omar said that he was also asked what use the ornaments there were, and it was suggested that they should be used for equipping the army. However, when he asked Ali about this, Ali stopped him from doing so.

Sayyid Raḍī explains in *Nahj al-Balāghah* that:

وَوَيْدِي أَنَّهُ ذَكَرَ عِنْدَ عُمَرَ ابْنِ الْخَطَّابِ، عَلَى الْكَعْبَةِ وَكَمْ ثَمَرُهُ، قَالَ قَوْمٌ: لَوْ أَخَذْتَهُ فَعَمَّرْتَ بِهِ
جُيُوشَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ كُلَّ أَغْطَمٍ لِلْأَجْرِ، وَمَا صَنَعَ الْكَعْبَةُ بِالْحَلِيِّ؟ فَهَمَّ عُمَرُ بِذَلِكَ وَسَأَلَ أَمِيرَ
الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ.

It has been narrated that some people were talking with Omar about the great number of jewels and ornaments at the Ka'ba, and some of them said that they would be of much more use if they were taken away and the proceeds used to equip the army.

Omar decided to take the jewels and spend them on strengthening the army, but he asked Imam Ali for his opinion about it, and Ali said:

إِنَّ الْقُرْآنَ أَنْزَلَ عَلَى النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَالْأَمْوَالُ أُنْزِلَتْهُ: أَمْوَالُ الْمُسْلِمِينَ فَصَفَّاهَا
بَيْنَ الْوَرِثَةِ فِي الْقَرَابَاتِ، وَالْقَبِيَّ فَصَفَّاهَا عَلَى مُسْتَقْبَلِيهِ، وَالْخُمْسُ فَصَفَّاهُ اللَّهُ حَيْثُ وَضَعَهُ، وَ
الصَّدَقَاتُ فَجَعَلَهَا اللَّهُ حَيْثُ جَعَلَهَا.
وَكَانَ عَلَى الْكَعْبَةِ فِيهَا بَوَاقِي، فَزَكَاةُ اللَّهِ عَلَى خَالِهِ، وَلَزِيكُةُ نِسْيَانِهِ، وَلَزِيكُةُ غَيْفِ عَلَيْهِ مَكَانِهِ، فَزَكَاةُ
حَيْثُ أَقْرَأَهُ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ،
فَقَالَ عُمَرُ: لَوْلَاكَ لَا تَخْشَعُهَا، وَتَزَكُّ الْحَلِيُّ بِمَالِهِ ³¹²

Indeed, the Qur'an was sent down to the Prophet, and there are four commands explained therein concerning property. One of them concerns the property of the Muslims, which the Messenger of God has commanded to be divided among the inheritors. The second concerns the booty to be divided among the needy; and the third concerns the one-fifth levy for which God has assigned a proper place and conditions and stated how to use it.

However, the question of the jewels and ornaments of the House of the Ka'ba is not something new, and was so even in times before. God assigned them a place, but not how to use them, yet this does not mean that God has forgotten, although they have remained there in secret and were forgotten by man.

So, you too, O Omar, should leave them safe and sound in their place, as God and His Prophet have left them where they have been from the beginning.

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has this hadith in exactly in the same way in his *al-Manāqib*,³¹³ and Mīr Muhammad Qulī Hindī Nishābūrī, the father

of Mājid Mīr Ḥamīd Husayn Hindī, also has the same thing in *Tashyid al-Maṭā'in*, and section 75 of *Rabī' al-Abrār* of Zamakhsharī.

Bukhārī also has it in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*, in the section *Kiswat al-Ka'ba* from *The Book of Ḥajj*, and also in *al-I'tisām*, where, since he was a Nāṣibī, he refers it to Shibyat Ibn Othman, and avoids saying that the hadith was about Imam Ali.³¹⁴

In *Nahj al-Balāghah* and *Sharḥ Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd*, after confirming that the hadith is authentic, Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd narrates it in two different ways.

The first of these is about possessions and prohibitions. For instance, it is not permissible to possess things other than those the religion permits, and since there has been no permission granted by a religious leader about the jewels and ornaments at the Ka'ba, we should act on the basis of the principle that they cannot be removed.

His second consideration is that the ornaments at the Ka'ba are specific to the Holy House only, like the drapery and the doors. Therefore, as the removal of the drapery and the doors of the Ka'ba is not permitted, the same applies to the ornaments, which likewise cannot be taken away without religious permission.

The outcome of both arguments is that they should be left with those who had donated them at first, who had assigned them as belonging to the Ka'ba. In this way the matter should be fixed.³¹⁵

'Allāmah Amīnī in *al-Ghadir* has narrated this in three ways: from Bukhārī's *Ṣaḥīḥ*, Lāzirqī's *Akhbār al-Makka* and *Sunan Abū Dāwūd*, and *Sunan Ibn Mājih*; and it is also in *Sunan Bayhaqī*, *Futūḥ al-Buldān* of Balādhari, *Nahj al-Balāghah*, *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, *Rabī' al-Abrār*, *Taysir al-Wuṣūl*, *Fath al-Bārī*, and *Kanz al-'Ummāl*.³¹⁶

Jalāl al-Dīn Suyūṭī has narrated it in *'Arf al-Wardī fi Akhbār al-Mahdī*, and Abū Nu'aym Ibn Ḥammād has narrated that:

Omar Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb entered the Shrine of the Ka'ba and said: "By God, I wonder whether to let these jewels and ornaments of the House remain here, or give them away to charity." Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib stated: "You are not the owner of these things. The principal owner of these things is a young man from the tribe of Quraysh, from our tribe, the Banī Hāshim, who will eventually divide them according to God's Will."³¹⁷

The Case of Tubba' and His Non-Interference with the Jewels at the Ka'ba

In his book on history, Ṭabarī explains this event at the time of Qubād and Anūshīrvān, and that the name Tubba' refers to Tubbān Asa'd

Abū Karb, who was returning from one of his battles, when he changed direction from the east to conquer Medina.

Tubbaʿ wanted to ruin Medina and destroy its people. Two Jewish scholars from the Banī Qurṭaba became aware of his intentions and went to him, saying: "O King, desist, for if you really want to kill the people of Medina, we promise you that you cannot succeed in your aim, and you will very soon see the consequence of your actions."

Tubbaʿ asked the two Jewish clergymen and their jurisprudents, among whom were two cousins whose names were Kaʿb and Asad, why they were trying to dissuade him.

Kaʿb and Asad said: "It is because Medina is where the Prophet migrated and now resides, and it is where there are people from the tribe Quraysh who belong to the End of Time."

Tubbaʿ took their advice and changed his mind about attacking Medina and killing the people there. He also observed that the two scholars were very educated. He liked their way of talking, and he took them with him to Yemen. He also followed their religion, but Tubbaʿ and his family and companions were all idol-worshippers, and they prostrated in front of idols.

On his return to Yemen, Tubbaʿ chose a route from Mecca, which was on the way. When he reached Duʿī in the territory of Qumḍān, between Osqān and Amaj on the route from Medina to Mecca, some people from the tribe of Huzayl came to him saying: "O King, do you want us to show you an old treasure and some public property that is even older? The kings before you were unaware of it, but in this treasure house there are pearls, rubies, topazes, and more."

Tubbaʿ said: "Yes, I do!" The people said: "This treasure is in Mecca, and people worship there and pray before it."

Of course, the intention of those people from the tribe of Huzayl was that Tubbaʿ would come to ruin by touching the ornaments, because they knew that previous kings had perished by touching them.

So Tubbaʿ was lured into going to Mecca to take away the jewels, but first he sent for the two Jewish scholars and asked them what he should do. The two learned men said: "The tribe of Huzayl have a strange plot for you. They want nothing but to kill you together with your army. If you do what they have suggested, without doubt you will be killed at once, and all your army will die on the spot."

Tubba' then asked them: "So what is your wise advice for me, for surely I will follow it when I enter Mecca?" They said: "You have to do the same as the people of Mecca. You must circumambulate the House and worship there, shaving your head as they do, and then prostrate in front of the Ka'ba."

Tubba' asked them: "Why then are you also not doing this at the Ka'ba?" The two great learned men, Ka'b and Asad, said: "By God, the Ka'ba is the House of our father, Abraham, and we know that every newcomer must worship there, as we instructed you. However, because of the idols set up all around the House of the Ka'ba, and the sacrifices that the people of Mecca offer to idols, we have been divided from the Ka'ba, for all the people of Mecca are idolaters."

When Tubba' heard what they had to say, he trusted them, and commanded his men to bring him some of the people of Huzayl and had their hands and legs chopped off, before moving forward to Mecca.³¹⁸

Ibn Abbās has narrated that Mustarshid, the Abbasid caliph, took some of the properties from Karbalā and Najaf, claiming that graves need no treasures, and he spent the proceeds on his armies, but then, when he set out for a battle, both he and his son were killed.³¹⁹

And in a later century, it came into the mind of Sultan 'Abd al-Ḥamīd Ottoman to take the treasures from inside God's House and use them for other purposes. He asked the religious leaders whether it was lawful, but they could not give a frank answer until they asked Ākhund Mullā Muhammad Kāzim Khorāsānī, who was a religious leader among the great scholars in the Najaf Ashraf at that time. Ākhund said it was wrong, and he mentioned some relevant references in a letter he sent to the Sultan, who changed his mind.

It is very regrettable that even in our time the accursed Wāhhābīs looted precious items from the Ka'ba, taking away whatever jewels were inside. After that, they made an assault on Medina and took away whatever was in the Prophet's shrine and the property of Sayyida Fāṭimah from around the shrine. These things were so precious that nothing similar could be found anywhere in the land. They had been put there by sultans, emirs, and kings for more than a thousand years, and among them were four superb candlestick holders made of rare rubies, the like of which could not be found throughout the world; four gold chests decorated with costly stones and diamonds that shone in the darkness of night; and a hundred swords with handles encrusted with emeralds and sheaths of pure gold decorated with emeralds.

Where did they take these things? And what did they use them for? Did they use them in the way of Islam, or to strengthen those against Islam? They delivered them all to foreign museums, displaying their servitude. The result was that all these precious things were gathered in these museums and our treasure houses were emptied.

The Wahnābīs killed a great many Muslims and anyone who was not of their creed. They called them unbelievers who deserved to be killed. Their slaughter in different countries was immeasurable, killing more than ten thousand in every town and city.

They attacked Karbalā with a great army and dominated the people there. On the first day, they killed nearly five thousand people, and then looted the precious shrine. After entering the holy shrine, they broke the ancient doors inside, and then made a fire with the broken doors on the grave, where they made tea and coffee to drink and celebrate their victory.

On the eighth day of Shawwāl, 1345 AH, they destroyed all the graves and memorials in the sacred graveyard of Bāqī, such as that of Imam Hasan Mujtabā, Imam Zayn al-Ābidīn, Imam Muhammad Bāqir, and Imam Ṣādiq. They did the same with other graves, such as those of the Prophet's daughters Zaynab, Umm Kulthūm, and Ruqayyah, and the Prophet's aunts Ṣafīyyah and ʿĀtikah, as well as those of Umm al-Banīn, Ismāʿīl Ibn Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq, and the Prophet's son Ibrāhīm. Then they did the same with all the graves of the Prophet's companions and his wives and relatives. They mercilessly demolished the graves of countless companions and righteous men, reducing them to dust.

After ruining these graves, the Wahnābīs had it in mind to destroy the Prophet's tomb as well, and to do the same with the House of the Kaʿba. Their reasoning was that circumambulating the Kaʿba and kissing a tomb were examples of disbelief, and they were to be demolished. However, they stopped only out of fear of other Muslim sects.

But they have it in mind to do away with the Prophet's tomb, and if they had the opportunity, they would carry out their plan.

The Wahnābīs claim that kissing the burial chamber of the Prophet is a kind of polytheism, since it is no more than pieces of iron. Before, they would freely let people kiss it. However, as time passed, they set up a few policemen as guards of the burial chamber, perhaps five or six, with altogether as many as twenty or thirty at the holy shrine. With no respect for the status of the Prophet, they turn their backs to the chamber, lean back onto it, and, with whips in their hands, shout at anyone attempting to kiss the chamber: "*Hādhā ḥajar!*"

Hādhā ḥajar! This is just stone, and kissing stone is unlawful." Their commanders and chiefs also stand in different parts of the shrine, and tell the pilgrims the same thing: "Kissing stones amounts to polytheism."

If a pilgrim wishes kiss a place that the Prophet used to kiss, they attack him, saying: "It is unlawful. It is polytheism."

It would not be surprising if they stopped people from kissing the Black Stone, or even from the circumambulation, which is a major part of the rites of ḥajj pilgrimage, when the pilgrims display their foremost submission to their Creator. As in other cases, they might say that circumambulating the House demonstrates a kind of polytheism.

The Wāhhābīs have changed the two towns of Mecca and Medina, two Islamic sites that attract Muslims from around the world, into European cities. They do not care that one is the birthplace of the Prophet, or that they are towns where he used to live. In both places there are mosques, shrines, and the living history of Islam, reminders of the Prophet and the assignment of guardianship to Imam Ali, but they have almost been transformed into European cities.

They have done away with all the reminders of the Messenger of God and his Household in both Mecca and Medina, and have built modern multi-story buildings in their place. Gardens of palm trees, which were always fresh, have been destroyed and replaced by tall buildings.

No longer is there a district of Banī Hāshim in Medina, nor any signs of the houses of Imam Sajjād and Imam Šādiq. There is no sign of Ayyūb Anṣārī's house. They have demolished the Bayt al-Aḥzān, and covered the walls of the Mosque of Imam Ali and sealed its entrance. The Mashraba of Ibrāhīm has had a similar fate. Once a holy place and a blissful sanctuary and residence of the Prophet, it is now deserted and filled with rubbish. The former homes of the Prophet's Household have also been abandoned and ruined.

The Mosque of al-Faḍiḥ, which was the Mosque of Radd al-Shams for Imam Ali, is now unattended, and no one even knows its name and its association with Ali Ibn Ab Ṭālib, who is not mentioned nowadays in the mosques or any sermons. Instead, one can hear Omar addressed as "Our Master Omar" about a hundred times a day. How lonely Medina is now, a town where every part has a story of knowledge, gnosis, great events, and epics of the guardianship and sacrifice of Imam Ali, the foremost helper of the Prophet. But today all is sunk in darkness and ignorance. The names of the

opponents are heard everywhere, but mention of the name of Ali is forbidden.

Baqi is a dead land without light, gravestones, name, or renown attached to it. They have built tall modern buildings all around the Baqi Cemetery. There are many supermarkets, hotels, offices, organizations, and shops, large and small, that sell any kind of food, drink, or utensil that pilgrims might need. All the shops are decorated to lure the people to buy, rather than worship and be aware of where they are.

The graves of our Imams have no light around them, or tombs to make it clear just who they are, and no one is allowed to impress a name on any of the muddy graves to indicate whether or not it is the grave of al-Imam Ja'far Ṣādiq, for example, or someone else. So what does this mean? It means that it is prohibited to mention the name of Ja'far Ṣādiq. The same applies to the name of Muhammad al-Bāqir. Therefore, all the facts about the spirit of guardianship and the traditions and words of the school of the Household are prohibited.

Wahhābism preserves its existence by banning the ideology of the religion, and tries to save itself by destroying true Islam, since Shi'ism is nothing other than the personification of the true spirit of Islam, the Prophet and the Qur'an.

In the year 1407 AH, I was on the hajj pilgrimage and witnessed things for myself. On the Friday evening of the sixth of Dhul-Hijja, on the main road where God's Sacred Mosque is situated, and also in the month of Muharram at God's Shrine between two of the hajj rites, they were attacking some Iranian Shi'a for the crime of calling out for unity among the Muslims. They had surrounded them and were hitting anyone who raised his voice. There were more than 4000 wounded at the scene, and 322 were killed, 208 of whom were women, and 114 men. There were 14 other men missing, with no news of them. It was unclear whether they had been taken to prison or if they had died on the spot. The dead could not be identified, because the Wahhābīs did not return the bodies.

Even greater than this crime was when the Wahhābīs accused the Iranian Muslims for establishing a *coup d'état* to destroy the Holy House, and they called their inhumane action a duty to save the House of God. It was announced on the radio, on television, and in the newspapers that anti-Muslims wanted to disrespectfully attack the House of God and destroy it. They continued by saying:

We stopped a real revolution in the Land of God; otherwise the Iranians were going to demolish the House of God. These people are Magians, they support the Jews, they have no knowledge of real Islam, and they

do not come to Mecca for the ḥajj pilgrimage, because their only aim is to create differences between the Muslims of the world and establish doubt among them. They superficially fulfil the ḥajj rites.

The Wahnābī schism is similar to that of Bahā'ism, which came to exist from among the Sunnis and the Shi'a. The Wahnābī sect used to be Ḥanbalī, whereas the Bahā'ī came from Shi'a who were previously Ja'fari. Both sects diverged from real Islam. The Wahnābīs were purported to be real Muslims struggling to save real Islam, and the Bahā'īs were presented as the real Shi'a, with the belief that Imam Mahdi had appeared to the world, thus corrupting and distorting history.

In vol. 5 of this series of *Knowing the Imams* it becomes clear that the Wahnābī sect was founded some two hundred years ago under the direct plan of British colonization, at the time of the Bābīyah and Bahā'īyah sects in Iran. The Saudis came into existence and destroyed the cemetery at Baqī after the British invaded the vast Ottoman Empire in the First World War, and it was divided into 19 small countries. The ruler of Mecca, Sharīf Husayn, was removed at the time, and Mālik Saud was nominated in his place, and it was he who dealt a blow to Islam, as we can now see. By inviting all Muslims to unite under the guise of Islam and the Qur'an, they damaged true Islam, and what they imagined to be good divided the Muslims into different factions.

The Wahnābī Attack on Karbalā to Destroy the Graves of the Imams in Baqī

They did more damage to true Islam and the religious rites than can be found in any other religion.

Nowadays, Jews—even Zionists—Christians, Buddhists, the followers of Confucius, idolaters, and all other different creeds, are free to go to their churches and temples and worship their saints and religious leaders. They try to protect their places of worship, and respect them by constantly attending worship, but when a Muslim comes to Mecca from a faraway country such as China, India or Africa, and wants to worship at and kiss the Black Stone (*Ḥajar al-Aswad*), which the Prophet himself had kissed, they prevent him. They do not even allow him to touch the four corners of the Ka'ba, the stations of Black Stone, Rukn al-ʿArāqī, Rukn al-Shāmī, and Rukn al-Yamānī, or to kiss Mustajār, the entrance to the birthplace of Imam Ali. They do not let the pilgrims touch or kiss a single place around

the Holy House, and they turn the pilgrims away with whips, so that they leave with sighs and great lamentation.

Nor can a pilgrim kiss the burial chamber of the Prophet or the graves of the Imams and their successors, or those of the perfect saints, recognized by all. This cannot be done without the direct interference of something alien to Islam, which attempts to diminish respect for Islam and divide Muslims into factions.

The destruction of the graves of the great and esteemed Imams and the Prophet's successors in the cemetery of Baqī happened under the Saudis at a time when every Islamic country had its own irresponsible and traitorous king or ruler. Riḍā Khān Mīr Panj was set up in Iran as commander of the army, then as the chief minister, and was finally nominated as king. The same happened in Turkey with Muṣṭafā Kamāl Pāshā (Ata Türk), in Iraq with Malik Fayṣal, Malik Ghāḍī's father, in Egypt with Malik Fu'ād, Malik Fārūq's father, and likewise in other Islamic countries.

When news of the destruction of the Baqī Cemetery reached Iran, the Shi'a, who loved their land, which was already stricken with calamity, were in a ghastly condition under the domination of their ruler. They wanted to protect it, but they had no power. How could they effectively defend the Baqī Cemetery? Such was the condition of the nation. However, the government was working hand in hand with the Saudis, and did not oppose the wrecking of Islamic monuments and the attempt to break the spirit of true Muslims. The most that the people could do was to take part in assemblies to mourn in the houses of genuine religious scholars, or send telegraphs to Najaf to express their condolences to the Muslims there.

In addition, Riḍā Khān also did his utmost to damage the foundations of Islam. He instigated a mass murder in the Holy Mosque of Guhar Shāh. He either killed the clergy or at least imprisoned them. He robbed the shrine of Imam Riḍā and demolished the shrines of the children of the Imams, as well as the religious and theological schools. He usurped the income and wealth of religious foundations and spent it on Western education and culture, European schools, and swimming pools for boys and girls, and set up music halls and dancing clubs all over the country. All over Iran, the religious schools were in disarray. They were in old buildings with broken walls and windows, roofs almost collapsing, and classrooms that had been changed into storerooms for neighboring shops and unwanted goods.

Ismā'īl Mir'āt, the educational minister at the time, demolished the shrine of Imāmzādeh Yaḥyā, the grandson of Imam Zayn al-

‘Abidīn and one of the foremost jurists of the Household, in Tehran. Imāmzādeh Yaḥyā had been a famous and most respected narrator. There had been a magnificent shrine built eight centuries ago, but after it was reduced to dust, they built a huge football field on the site. They took away all the precious ornaments, along with a pair of gold peacocks, no matter how much Ismā‘īl Mir’āt begged for the demolition to stop and for the ornaments to be returned. He told them that there were already many playing fields in Tehran. He said that he would restore it with his own money, if it could remain as it was. No matter how much he begged, Riḍā Khān did not turn a hair, and they destroyed the shrine.

At the time, there was a very old plane tree in an alley near the shrine, and it was associated with the shrine. A part of its trunk had separated, and it nearly broke and fell just through the weight of the tree. The same Ismā‘īl Mir’āt, the minister of education, spent eight hundred tomans, valued at two hundred grams of pure gold, to make an iron frame to put around the tree to save it. The frame helped bring life back to the tree, and this was one of his best services.

On the eve of the day that Riḍā Khān fled the country from Bandar Abbās after boarding a British ship, the people of the district around Imāmzādeh Yaḥyā’s shrine came together, bringing spades, axes, and bricks to start rebuilding the shrine in conformity with the original architecture.

When the minister of education heard of their plans, he offered to rebuild it for them. He quickly had it rebuilt, and it still remains in its original shape, with a courtyard and an area for a school.

Pahlavi Reduced the Darvāzeh Qur’an (the Entrance to Shiraz) to Dust

The Darvāzeh Qur’an was an ancient gate that was considered an ancient national monument. At the top of the gate was a Qur’an said to weigh approximately 50 kilos.

Whoever was leaving the city of Shiraz—ordinary people, armies, or rulers—had one way to pass through, a gate under the protection of the Qur’an. Their difficulties were eased by the Qur’an by passing under it. And whoever entered the city had to pass through the same gate, seeking help from the Divine Book and saying: “I enter the city with the help of the Divine Book.”

However, Pahlavi ordered the gate to be destroyed, because after passing through the gate on one of his journeys to Shiraz, he found it excessive that he should pass under the Qur’an.

No matter how much the Orientalists said it was a famous and precious historical building known throughout the world, and that it would be better for it to remain as it was, he did not listen and had it demolished. He left nothing there except a sign indicating that something used to be there.

Pahlavi took away the jewels and precious things from the shrine of Imam Ali Ibn Riḍā, as well as those that earlier kings had presented to the museum.

There remained only a large box made of gold below the feet of the Imam, which had been there since his son Muhammad Riḍā married Fuziyeh from Egypt. The box had two beautiful vases weighing 81 kilos, which were presented to the bride and groom at the holy shrine as a wedding gift on behalf of Imam Riḍā.

Pahlavi took away all the precious hand-written Qur'ans, valuable old manuscripts, and whatever else he could hand over to foreign countries, and removing what was left to put in the library of his court. Finally, he packed a large box with the most valuable items to take with him when left the poor, war-stricken country.

What we have explained here so far clearly shows the depravity of the modern Wahhābīs and Bahā'īs, and without understanding the real story they are allowed to go on saying whatever nonsense they can.

Permission to Rebuild the Graves of the Imams

They say that praying at the graves and shrines of the Imams is not permissible, and that kissing the walls and shrines of these sites is no more than kissing wood and stone. And what is the use of these golden domes and doors, and the miniature chests, and so forth? It would be much better if they were spent on charity for the poor. Be-seeching the Imams is a kind of blasphemy, and to visit their tombs is to visit those who are dead and gone.

However, thanks be to God, speaking this kind of nonsense has come to an end. The treachery is quite clear to all, and their inventions have actually become crystal-clear to the people as lies, and therefore, none of the common people, students, businessmen, or even a dustman will listen to what they say.

They should know that kissing the graves of the Imams is like kissing the Qur'an, for it is kissing the spirits of the Imams and respecting their greatness. Praying by graves, especially the graves of the Imams, not only is permissible, but it also has a reward to which nothing can compare.

The matter of the gold domes and valuable doors is similar to that of the precious jewels of the Ka'ba, since they neither belong to the Muslims nor are able to be inherited by them. Nor can the fifth of the tax for the Imam³²⁰ be spent on just anything, and the same applies to the money collected as alms.³²¹ It is not booty, but has a specific designation ordained by Islam, because all these things have been donated by different worshipers to the House of the Ka'ba and the shrines of the Imams and their offspring.

The sacred religion considers donations rightful, and has certified it and accepted gifts. Perhaps someone has lovingly worked to make a carpet or rug and then has willingly bestowed it, or a woman from Isfahan, Yazd, Kashan, or elsewhere has spent a lifetime making an embroidery for the cover of a tomb in a shrine, or some other handmade item for the tomb, suitable for the status of the Imams. Or perhaps someone else has made a Qur'an cover by hand, or produced Qur'anic verses in needlework, such that if they were to be exhibited anywhere in the world they would dazzle the eyes of the beholders, who would praise such unique items and be prepared to buy them at any price that was asked. But instead of selling them, they want to present their wonderful works to their dearest Imams, and as they cannot reach their Imams, they donate them to the Imams' tombs.

Now they say that they must not put their artistic creations on the graves of the Imams or in the shrines. So what should they do with them? Are they advised to sell them to kings or hand them over to presidents, or sell or give them to a similar traitor? Are we to be pleased with this?

The shrines of the Imams are sanctuaries for the people. They take refuge in them in hardship and difficulty, and they like to present them with their best and dearest possessions, such as gold, valuable books, candlesticks, swords, and more.

All these precious items also have benefits for all the pilgrims and believers who visit them, and almost always envision how they have been given by their Muslim brothers to their Imams, to whom they now belong. They are also secure in the shrines, away from the hands of those who are disguised as innocent lambs, who are unable to send them away to their families or so-called friends who are greedy to devour innocent people and decorate their museums and libraries in other countries.

As removing the property of others is unlawful, and such things belong to the shrines, they have to remain there, and no one has the right to touch them or use them as they wish. If someone does so, he openly commits theft. It is as if they were to steal the cover of the

House of the Ka'ba, or take the bricks from the walls. They should know that this also applies to the decorations in the mosques and the shrines of the Imams. The same applies to a simple mosque attached to a shrine, when they say that if the verses of the Qur'an in the mosque are not written in gold, they are not considered decoration and there is no harm in removing them.

Praying in the graveyards close to the graves is abhorred, unless there is at least a five-meter gap between the graves and the one who prays, and it is unlawful to prostrate upon a grave. Even though the graves of the Imams are exceptional, it is, of course, unlawful to prostrate upon them, although one can lay the right cheek on them. The best prayer is by the grave of an Imam, especially on the side of the head, although it is good to pray at the side of the grave or on the lower part of its base. However, it is not right to pray with one's back to the grave of the Imam. All these are related to the religion and are matters of jurisprudence that have been narrated.

In Baḥr al-'Ulūm's Elegy, Praying by the Grave of the Pure Imam Is Introduced as One of the Best Forms of Worship

Sayyid Baḥr al-'Ulūm composed this beautiful elegy on religious devotion:

أَكْثَرُ مِنَ الصَّلَاةِ فِي الشَّاهِدِ غَيْرِ الْبَيْتِ أَفْضَلُ الْمَعَادِ 1
 لِفَضْلِهَا اخْتِصَرْتُ لِيَزِيدَ حَلَّ مُنْجِنٍ قَدْ خَلَّاهَا مِنَ الْحَلِّ 2
 وَالشُّرْفَى فَضْلُ صَلَاةِ التَّجِدِّ قَبْرِ الْمُصَوِّمِ بِهِ تُصَفِّهُدِ 3
 بِرُشْدٍ مِنْ دَمِهِ الْمُطَهَّرُ طَهَّرَهُ اللَّهُ لِيُذَكِّرَهُ 4
 وَهُوَ يُوثِقُ أُذُنَ اللَّهِ بِأَنْ تُزَقَّ حَتَّى يَذْكُرَ نَهْمَهُ الْحَسَنَ 5
 وَمِنْ حَدِيثِ كَرِيلاً وَالْكَعْبَةِ لِيَكُنْ تِلْكَ بَابُ عُلُوِّ الرُّتْبَةِ 6
 وَغَيْرِ هَامِينَ سَائِرِ الشَّاهِدِ أَنْتَظِمُ بِالْأَنْفَالِ ذِي الشَّوَاهِدِ 7
 فَادْفِنِي بِجَمِيعِهَا الْمُفْتَرَحَا وَالْأَنْفَالِ وَأَفْضَلُ مَا عَلَيْكَ مِنْ قَضَا 8
 وَدَاعٍ فِيهِ أَقْرَبُ الرِّسِّ وَأَوْبَقُ الصَّلَاةِ عِنْدَ الرَّأْسِ 9
 وَالنَّهْيُ عَنِ تَقَدُّمِهَا أَدَبٌ وَالنَّصُّ فِي حُكْمِ السَّوَادَةِ اضْطَرَبَ 10
 وَصَلَّ خَلْفَ الْقَبْرِ فَالصَّحِيحُ كَثِيرٌ فِي تَذْيِيلِهَا صَرِيحُ 11

وَالْتَرَى بَيْنَ هَذِهِ الْقُبُورِ وَغَيْرِهَا كَالْأُتُورِ فَوْقَ الطُّورِ 12
فَأَتَى لِلصَّلَاةِ عِنْدَهَا نِدْبَ وَقُرْنَاهَا لِلصُّلُوقِ قَدْ طَلِبَ 13
وَالْأَمَّا ذِكْرُهَا وَإِنْ مَنَعَ فَلَيْسَ بِالْذِّفْعِ إِذَا قَدْ سَمِعَ 14³²³

1. As much as you can, pray and pray at the shrines of the Imams, because these shrines are the best places to pray, for they are prayer houses of virtue.
2. Praying there is to witness the virtues of the Imam: first of all, because the Imam is lying there, and secondly, the shrine remains there for the sake of that Imam, and has become virtuous.
3. And the reason a certain mosque is virtuous among the common mosques is that a martyred infallible has been buried in a grave there.
4. It is because of the pure blood of that infallible martyr in that very spot, that God has made that place pure and holy for the prayers of His slaves.
5. And these shrines and graves of the infallibles are permitted by God to be built in the highest positions, and for the beautiful and mighty Name of God to be mentioned there.
6. And from the hadiths received about Karbalā and the Ka'ba, it becomes clear how superior the status of Karbalā is to the Ka'ba.
7. And the rest of the shrines and graves of the Imams are like Karbalā; the received hadiths are good, and sufficient witnesses to this.
8. So you, O you, the sincere believer, establish all your prayers, with supererogatory prayers, at those shrines and gravesides.
9. And try to pray your prayers close to the pure graves in those shrines; choose the best place by the side, next to the head of the Imam, when praying.
10. And there is no need to avoid praying before the pure grave—it is simply respect; and there is no fixed command concerning praying parallel to the grave—there are different views.
11. So pray behind the Imam, because there are various direct hadiths about praying there.
12. And the difference between these shrines and other common graves is as clear as the Light of God upon the mountain of Tūr.
13. Therefore, trying to go to the shrines to pray by the Imams is recommended; they have invited us to do so, and the closer to the graves we pray the better, for it has the most reward.
14. And concerning the declaration not to take the grave as the direction of prayer (*qibla*), though it has been prohibited, there is no predetermined verdict on this by the jurists.

Therefore, the graves of the Imams are like mosques, or even superior, because we understand from the foregoing elegy that the

nobility of any mosque in the world is due to the value of the blood of a past martyr. This has happened over periods of time. God has blessed their blood and assigned such sites as places of worship, even if years have passed since they were built.

It is a general rule in every mosque that the principal martyrs there must be respected, even if one is unfamiliar with them. Therefore, the blessed shrines of the Imams, who are known to all, remain infallible throughout time and are respected by everyone.

The words on the 26th line of the elegy:

وَمِنْ حَدِيثِ كَرْبَلَا وَالْكَنْبَةِ لَكِنَّ بَلَاءَ بَانَ غُلُوَ الزُّنْبَةُ

apparently point to the hadith that Ibn Qulawayh has in his magnificent book *Kāmil al-Ziyarāt*, which he heard from his father, Sa'd Ibn Abdullah, quoting Abī Abdullah al-Rāzī, from Hasan Ibn Ali Ibn Abī Hamzah, through Hasan Ibn Muhammad Ibn 'Abd al-Karīm Abī Ali, then Mufaḍḍal Ibn Omar, quoting Jābir Ibn Ju'fī on Abū Abdullah's words to Mufaḍḍal:

كَرْبَتِكَ وَبَيْنَ قَبْرِ الْحُسَيْنِ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ؟ يَا ابْنَ آتَى الْيَوْمَ وَبَعْضُ يَوْمٍ آخَرُ قَالَ: قُرُورُهُ؟
هَآلًا: كَمْ هَآلًا: أَلَا ابْتُرِكَ؟ أَلَا أَفْرَحُكَ بِبَعْضِ كُتَابِهِ؟

Imam Ṣādiq asked Mufaḍḍal: "How far is your house from the shrine of Imam Husayn?" He answered: "May my father and mother be a sacrifice to you, it is about a day and a half to walk there." The Imam then asked: "Do you visit Husayn?" and Mufaḍḍal said: "Yes, I do." The Imam then asked: "Do you want me to point out some of the rewards for such visits? Do you want me to make you pleased with your action?"

Mufaḍḍal answered: "Yes, I sacrifice myself to you!" The Imam stated: "When one of you decides to go to Karbalā, and gets prepared and quite ready to set out, the angels in Heaven start giving the good news to one another. Then, when he leaves his house on foot or mounted, God assigns four thousand of His angels to guard him and send peace upon him until he reaches the holy graveyard of Imam Husayn."

Then the Imam instructed him on how to enter the shrine and the text to read on visiting the Imam, as well as how to end the visit:

ثُمَّ تَمْنِي إِلَى صَلَوتِكَ وَأَنَّ بِكُلِّ زَكَاةٍ وَكَمْثَا عِنْدَ كُتَابٍ مَنْ سَجَّ أَنْتَ يَجِدُ وَاعْتَمَرَ أَنْتَ عُمْرُهُ، وَ
أَخْتَقَ أَنْتَ رَجَعْتَهُ، وَكَأَنَّمَا وَقَفَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ أَنْتَ مَرُومَعَ نَبِيِّ مُرْسَلٍ.³²⁴

"And then you begin to establish your prayer. Know that for each unit of prayer you make in the presence of Imam Husayn, you will receive the reward of one who has made the ḥajj pilgrimage a thousand times, and has fulfilled the minor ḥajj a thousand times, and then has freed a thousand slaves, and is as if he were raised up for jihād in the way of God along with a chosen Prophet..."

On Omar's Statement about the Black Stone of the Ka'ba: "Do Not Call upon It; There Is No Benefit in It"

In his *Mustadrak*, Ḥākim quotes Abū Saʿīd Khudrī through his chain from Abū Hārūn ʿAbdī, saying:

We were on the ḥajj pilgrimage with Omar. When we approached the Black Stone, he turned to it and said:

إِنِّي أَعْلَمُ أَنَّكَ حَجَرٌ لَا تَنْفَعُ وَلَا تَضُرُّ، وَأَوَّلَ مَا رَأَيْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَجُودُ بِكَ مَا
يَجُودُ بِهِ نَبِيُّكُمْ

"I know that you are a stone that neither harms nor benefits! And if I had not seen the Prophet kiss you, I would not kiss you either. However, he did."

هَلْ لَكَ عَلَى بَنِي إِسْرَافِيلَ؟ بَلَى يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، إِنَّهُ يَضُرُّ وَيَنْفَعُ

So Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib told him: "In fact, it can either harm [men] or benefit them."

Omar asked: "For what reason?" Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib answered: "It is according to the Book of God, the Blessed, the Most High."

Omar asked: "In which part of God's Book is that?"

Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib said:

God, the Glorified, states:

وَإِذَا أَخَذَ رَبُّكَ مِن بَنِي آدَمَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهِمْ ذُرِّيَّتَهُمْ وَأَشْهَدَهُمْ عَلَى أَنْفُسِهِمْ أَلَسْتُمْ بِكُمْ قَالُوا
بَلَىٰ. ۚ خَلَقَ اللَّهُ آدَمَ وَصَوَّغَ عَلَى ظَهْرِهِ صُورَهُمْ بِأَنَّهُ الرَّبُّ وَأَتَاهُمُ الْفَيْدُ وَأَخَذَ عَهْدَهُمْ
مَوَاقِفَهُمْ وَكَتَبَ ذَلِكَ فِي رَقٍّ وَكَانَ لِهَذَا الْحَجَرِ عِتَانٌ وَلِسَانٌ.
هَلْ لَكَ: افْتَحَ فَكَانَ: فَتَحَ فَاءَ فَاقْتَضَىٰ ذَلِكَ الرَّقِّ، وَقَالَ: أَشْهَدُ بِكَ بِالْمَوَاقِفِ يَوْمَ الْقِيَمَةِ،
وَإِنِّي أَشْهَدُ لَسَمِيعِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَوْلُ:

فَوَقَىٰ يَوْمَ الْقِيَمَةِ بِالْحَجَرِ الْأَسْوَدِ لَيْسَانُ ذَلِكُمْ يَشْهَدُونَ بِتَسْلِيمِهِ بِالْوَحِيدِ
فَهُوَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ يَصْرُفُ نَفْعَهُ

And (remember) when your Lord brought forth from the Children of Adam, from their loins, their seed, and made them testify of themselves, (saying): Am I not your Lord? They said, Yes, verily we testify. God created Adam and touched his back. He made the souls confess that He is the only Creator, and that they are all His obedient servants. He took their covenant and had it recorded. The Black Stone has two eyes and a tongue, and God commanded it: "Open your mouth!" Then the Black Stone opened its mouth, and God placed the covenant in its mouth and it swallowed it, and He said: "On the Day of Resurrection you will bear witness to whoever believes in God and approaches the wall you are within, so say: 'Indeed, he has come to visit me with his strong faith in God and loyalty to his covenant.'"

I heard the Prophet say: "On the Day of Resurrection they will bring the Black Stone and it will speak with a tongue, bearing witness to whoever has touched it and kissed it, saying: *iqrāran bi wahdāniyat Allāh*, and this is the same confession of God's Oneness (that the soul made previously). Therefore, the Black Stone can either harm or benefit."

قَالَ عُمَرُ: أَعُوذُ بِاللَّهِ أَنْ أَعِيشَ فِي قَوْمٍ لَيْسَ فِيهِمْ يَا أَبَا حَسَنَ.³²⁶

Just then Omar said: "I take refuge in God, but I live within a group with whom You are not."

'Allāmah Mīr Muhammad Qulī, the author of *Tashyīd al-Maṭā'ir*, has narrated this hadith from Jalāl al-Dīn Suyūṭī's *al-Budūr al-Sāfirah fī al-Umūr al-Ākhirah*, in the section *Shahādat al-Amkinah*, from Abū Sa'īd Khudrī. He then says that Faqīh Abū al-Layth has narrated in *Tanbīh al-Ghāfilīn*, quoting Abū Hārūn 'Abdī, from Abū Sa'īd Khudrī, how they took a trip with Omar at the beginning of his caliphate. He then goes on to narrate about Omar entering the House, his circumambulation, and his questions to Ali, and how Imam Ali said to Omar: "And if you had recited the Qur'an and learned what is in it, you would not reject my caliphate."

Omar asked him: "O Abū al-Hasan, what is the meaning of this verse in God's Book?" Ali read for him

وَإِذَا أَخَذْنَاكَ مِنْ بَنِي آدَمَ

to the end of the verse, and then said:

When the Children of Adam confessed to the Lordship of God, He recorded their testimony and called this Stone to Him, casting it into its mouth for it to swallow.

هُوَ أَمِينُ اللَّهِ فِي هَذِهِ الْكَافَّةِ وَإِنَّهُ يُؤْمِنُ بِالْقِسْمَةِ

Therefore, the Black Stone set in its place is the trustee of God, to be witness to the one who visits it, believes in God, and is loyal to the covenant made with Him, and it will bear witness on the Day of Resurrection.

Then Omar said:

يَا أَبَا الْحَسَنِ لَقَدْ جُعِلَ بَيْنَ يَدَيْكَ مِنْ الْعِلْمِ غَيْرٌ قَلِيلٌ.

"O Aba al-Hasan, you have been assigned great knowledge."

This is similarly narrated from the following individuals in the following books: Muhammad Ibn Yūsuf Shāmī in *Sabīl al-Hudā wa al-Rushd*, which is known as *Sirah al-Shāmiyya*; Khujandī in *Faḍā'il al-Makka*; and Abū al-Hasan Qaṭṭān in *al-Ṭuwālāt*; both Ḥakīm and Bayhaqī in Abū Sa'īd Khudrī's *Shu'ab*, and we have also explained the same hadith from Ḥakīm.³²⁷

‘Allāmah Amīnī in *al-Ghadīr*, in addition to the references mentioned, records it from Juzī in *Sirat al-Omar (Biography of Omar)* p. 106, and from Azraqī in *Tārīkh al-Makka (The History of Mecca)*, as mentioned in *al-‘Omdah*. It is also recorded from Qaṣṭalānī in *Irshād al-Sārī*, vol. 3, p. 195, and from ‘Aynī in *‘Omdat al-Qārī*, vol. 4, p. 606, in two different styles. In addition, he mentions it from Suyūṭī in *Jāmi‘ al-Kabīr*, and *Tartīb*, vol. 3, p. 35, narrating from Khujandī in *Faḍā'il al-Makka*, Abū al-Hasan Qaṭṭān in *Ṭuwālāt*, and Ibn Hibbān and Ahmad Zaynī Daḥlān in *Futūḥāt al-Islamiyyah*, vol. 2, p. 486.³²⁸

Bukhārī has narrated the hadith through one chain, and Muslim through four. However, because of particular grudges, they have omitted additional parts where Imam Ali criticizes Omar and Omar's reply.³²⁹

Bukhārī and Muslim Ibn Ḥajjā Have Omitted the Virtues and Attributes of Imam Ali from Their Hadith Collections

We see many occasions in books on virtue and jurisprudence where whatever concerns the virtues of Imam Ali and the Household is

omitted. They continue on with matters of jurisprudence, having removed the rest.

We understand by this that Bukhārī and Muslim have side-lined certain facts and have not recorded them. Therefore, they have no standing other than rules for those who act as animals.

However, not all Sunnis have ignored these particulars, and they have narrated the hadiths without omissions. This includes Nisā'ī, Ahmad Hanbal, Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd, Suyūṭī, Bayhaqī, Ḥakīm, Ḥaskānī, Ibn Maghāzili, and Ibrāhīm Muḥammad Hammū'ī. There is also Ḥāfiz Abū al-Mu'ayyid Muwaṭṭa'q Ibn Ahmad Bakrī Makkī Ḥanafī, known as Akḥṭab al-Khārazm, who was born in 484 and died in 568, and is associated with *Kitāb al-Manāqib*, which is a reference book for both Shi'a and Sunni hadiths. There are three superb elegies of praises to Imam Ali in the final part of *al-Manāqib*.

Khārazmī's Elegy and His Hadith about Imam Ali

Part of this elegy is as follows:

- 1 هَلْ أَبْصَرْتُ عَيْنَاكَ فِي الْحِوَارِ كَأَبِي تُرَابٍ مِنْ فَنَى حِوَارٍ
- 2 لِيَدْرَأِي تُرَابًا إِنَّهُ أَسَدُ الْحِوَارِ وَزِينَةُ الْحِوَارِ
- 3 مُوَضَّارٍ وَسُيُوفُهُ كَوَاقِبٍ هُوَ مُطْعَمٌ وَجَفَّاهُ كَسَجْوَابِ
- 4 إِنَّ اللَّهَ مَدِينَةُ لِقُومِهِ وَعَلَى الْمَدَى فَكَانَ الْخَلاَبِ
- 5 لَوْلَا عَلَى مَا فَتَدَى فِي مُشْكَلٍ غَمْرٌ وَلَا يُنْصَى بِجَوَابِ صَوَابِ
- 6 مَا زِلْنَا فِي فَضْلِ الْحَقِّ الْمُتَدَى غَيْرُ الْقَوَى الْخَطِيطِ الْمُرْتَابِ
- 7 كَالشَّهْدِ مَوْلَانَا عَلَى الْمُرْتَضَى لِلْأُولِيَاءِ وَالْمُتَدَى كَالصَّابِ
- 8 إِنَّ الْوَصَى لَمَوْضِعُ الْأَسْرَارِ إِذْ رَمَى اللَّهُ مَطِيئَةَ لِدَعَابِ
- 9 إِنَّ الْوَصَى أَخَا الَّذِي الْمُصْطَفَى زَمَنَ الصَّبَا مَا جَرَّدَ ذِيْلَ صَابِ
- 10 وَلَهُ مَنَاقِبٌ مَدَّ مَدَى صَبْتُهُ فِيهَا وَأَكْثَرُ مَا وَزَّاءَ نِقَابِ
- 11 بِأَعْيَانِي يَهْوَى عَلَى رِذْنِهِ صِدْقًا هَوَايَ فَرِذْ بِمَكِّ عِتَابِ
- 12 إِنَّ كُلَّ أَسْنَابِ السَّعَادَةِ حُجَّةٌ هَوَى عَلَى أَكْثَرِ الْأَسْنَابِ
- 13 وَكَسَوَتْ أَغْطَابِي بِنَظْمِي بِدَعَا خَلَلًا يَجِدُ عَلَى الْأَخْقَابِ
- 14 حَسَنَاءُ، وَهُوَ قَاطِعٌ أَهْوَاهُمْ خَطَاوَا وَمِى الْمَوَى أَغْطَابِي.

1. Have your eyes ever witnessed such a generous man as Abū Turāb?—
a brave fighter, even while praying in the niche.
2. May God bestow His blessings upon Abū Turāb, who was brave like
a lion in the woods, the exemplar of beauty at the altar of worship.
3. He fought with the sword, and his sword was like a shooting star—
effective and burning. He gave food [to the poor], and the portions
were as immense as lakes.
4. Indeed, the Prophet was the City of Knowledge, and Ali was the guide
to that city; he was a door through which to enter.
5. If not for Ali, Omar could not solve one problem nor answer correctly
[the people's questions].
6. No one doubts the virtues and nobility of Ali; he has found his way to
gnosis and the Divine Secret. No one doubts him, except a rogue
and misleader.
7. Our Master is Ali al-Murtaḍā; he is the most beloved to his followers,
yet as bitter as gall to his enemies.
8. Indeed, Ali is the successor of God's Prophet, the center of His secrets;
he reined in his steed and set out on his journey.
9. Verily, the successor is the brother of God's Prophet, the Holy
Muṣṭafā, who did not spoil himself with debauchery in his youth.
10. For Ali has so much virtue and honor, that in my elegy I point to one
tiny bit—most of this is veiled behind a screen.
11. O you who reproach me for my love and affection for Ali, this ex-
treme love is my own will, but you increase your reproach!
12. If the means of prosperity is the proof, then the love of Ali is the most
insightful proof.
13. By composing my elegy of praise for Ali, I protect my offspring for
the years to come.
14. I love Hasan, Husayn, Ali, and Fāṭimah; I love them for their most
honest ways; and I counsel my progeny to love them, and beautify
themselves with their care.

We now address the discussion of the most respected Sunni scholar, Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Khārazmī. He says that Ḥāfiz Abū al-'Alā' Hasan Ibn Ahmad Hamedānī and the great Imam Najm al-Dīn Abū Maṣṣūr Abū Muhammad Ibn Husayn Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali Zaynī informed him that Imam Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Ali Ibn Hasan Ibn Shādhān had narrated from Sahl Ibn Ahmad, from Abū Ja'far Muhammad Ibn Jarīr Ṭabarī, back through Hannād Ibn Sirrī, from Muhammad Ibn Hishām, then Sa'īd Ibn Abī Sa'īd, from Muhammad Ibn Munkar, from Jābir, who said that the Prophet stated:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَمَّا خَلَقَ السَّمَوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ دَعَا مَنْ قَابِجَتَهُ فَعَرَضَ عَلَيْهِمْ نَبُوْنِي وَوَلَايَةَ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ
فَقَبِلْتَاهُمَا، ثُمَّ خَلَقَ الْخَلْقَ وَفَوَّضَ إِلَيْنَا أَمْرَ الدِّينِ، فَالْسَّعِيدُ مَنْ سَعِدَ بِنَاوَالِ الشَّقِيِّ مَنْ شَقِيَ بِنَاؤُنَا، ثُمَّ
الْمُحْلَوْنَ بِحِلَالِهِ وَالْمُحْرَمُونَ بِحُرَامِهِ.

Indeed, when God created the heavens and the earth, He called them to Him and they responded. God, the Exalted, informed them of my prophethood and the guardianship of Ali Ibn Abi Tālib. This they heard and accepted. Then He created the creatures and taught them His laws. Therefore, prosperous is he who is prosperous through us, and most wretched is he who is wretched to us. It is we who consider what is unlawful to God as unlawful, and what is lawful to Him lawful.³³⁰



**Lessons One Hundred Sixty-One
to One Hundred Sixty-Five**

The Extraordinary Cases of Imam Ali



LESSONS ONE HUNDRED SIXTY-ONE TO ONE HUNDRED SIXTY-FIVE

In the Name of God, the most Compassionate, the most Merciful

And blessings be upon Muhammad and his pure Household, and may God's curse be upon his enemies from now until the Day of Resurrection. And there is no power or strength except for the High and Most Glorious Allah.

God, the Wise, has stated in His Noble Book:

يُؤْتِي الْحِكْمَةَ مَنْ يَشَاءُ وَمَنْ يُؤْتَ الْحِكْمَةَ فَقَدْ أُوتِيَ خَيْرًا كَثِيرًا لَا يَأْخُذُ بِالْأَلْبَابِ

He gives wisdom unto whom He will, and he unto whom wisdom is given, he truly has received abundant good. But none remember except men of understanding (2:269).

The Meaning of the Wisdom Mentioned in the Qur'an

Our master, Allāmah Ṭabāṭabā'ī, stated in his commentary that the word

حِكْمَة

with the diacritic vowel under the letter

ح

designates a word that has two meanings. The word

حِكْم

indicates a kind of strengthening, or fixed and invariable matter. It is mostly used with respect to true intellectual knowledge about which there is no doubt. Therefore, the term

حِكْمَة

indicates the rectitude necessary for people to prosper, and is similar to divine knowledge at the beginning and at the resurrection. It makes the facts of the natural world clear, so that man may prosper according to his nature, and is the basis of the religion and the Divine Law.³³¹

This is why enlightened sages have said:

الْحِكْمَةُ هُوَ الْعِلْمُ بِمَقَائِلِ الْأَشْيَاءِ عَلَى قَدْرِ الطَّاقَةِ الْبَشَرِيَّةِ.

"[Wisdom] is the knowledge of the truth about things, according to man's capacity." They have also said:

الْحِكْمَةُ صَيُورَةُ الْإِنْسَانِ عَالَمًا عَلَى أَهْوَائِهِ الْعَالَمِ الْحَارِجِيِّ

which means that man's knowledge can reach to such a height that his existence in the outer world, and his powers of intellect, reason, and insight, become a world of knowledge.

Imam Ali's Knowledge Was Like That of Adam

According to the Qur'an, the Prophet was the teacher of wisdom to man, and his principal student was Imam Ali, who had such great knowledge and wisdom that the Prophet was many times surprised and astonished at his ability, and rejoiced at his intellect. Ahmad Hanbal has narrated through his chains in *Musnad* that Ḥamīd Ibn Abdullah Ibn Yazīd Madanī said:

إِنَّهُ ذَكَرَ عِنْدَ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَضَاءَ قَنْصَى بْنِ أَبِيطَالِبٍ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ فَتَعْجَبَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَقَالَ: الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ الَّذِي جَعَلَ الْحِكْمَةَ قِيَمًا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ.³³²

"When someone repeated in the Prophet's presence what Imam Ali had already said, the Prophet was astonished, and said: 'Praise and thanks be to God, Who has honored us, the Household, with wisdom and knowledge.'"

Khārazmī has narrated through his chains from Zayd al-ʿAmā and Abū Ṣādiq Nājī, that Abū Saʿīd Khudrī said:

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: إِنَّ أَقْسَى أُمَّتِي عَلَى نَبِيِّ أَبِي طَالِبٍ.³³³

"The Prophet stated: 'Indeed, the most reliable and righteous judge among my nation is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib.'"

Through one of his several chains, Khārazmī also quotes Salmān saying that the Prophet stated:

أَعْلَمُ أُمَّتِي مِنْ بَعْدِي عَلَى نَبِيِّ أَبِي طَالِبٍ.³³⁴

"The [wisest and] most knowledgeable of my nation after me is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib."

Unless a man's heart is illuminated with the Divine Light and he comes to know the secrets of the outward world and the Kingdom of Heaven, and feels it, he cannot direct all affairs. God addressed the Prophet Dāwūd as follows:

يَا دَاوُدُ إِنَّا جَعَلْنَاكَ خَلِيفَةً فِي الْأَرْضِ فَاحْكُم بَيْنَ النَّاسِ بِالْحَقِّ وَلَا تَتَّبِعِ الْهَوَىٰ فَيُضِلَّكَ عَنْ سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ إِنَّ
الَّذِينَ يَضِلُّونَ عَنْ سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ لَهُمْ عَذَابٌ شَدِيدٌ بِمَا نَسُوا يَوْمَ الْحِسَابِ

O David, We did indeed make you a vicegerent on the earth, so judge aright between mankind, and follow not desire that it beguile you from the way of God. Surely those who wander from the way of God have a penalty grievous, forasmuch as they forgot the Day of Reckoning (38:26).

Here we see that God commanded what is right, and that this resulted in the caliphate. Insofar as this divinely ordained caliphate is not set up, the command is not fulfilled, and whoever shuns it and follows his carnal desires becomes lost. No door of hope will open for him, because to forget God and the Day of Reckoning is a path contrary to that of the divinely ordained caliphate, which requires awareness, gnosis, responsibility, and servitude.

There are hadiths and other sources of information beyond count from both the Shi'a and the Sunnis concerning the uniqueness of Imam Ali and his judgments and commands. For example, Imam Muhammad Bāqir stated:

لَيْسَ أَحَدٌ يَقْضِي بِقَضَائِهِ سِوَى اللَّهِ إِلَّا مَقَاتِلُهُ قَضَاءُ عَلِيٍّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ

"There is no one to judge and issue a command and obtain the right result, unless the judgment and command have been issued by Ali."

In *Faḍā'il al-Shāhāba*, Abū Muzaffar Sam'ānī has quoted 'Abd al-Rahmān Ibn Abī Qabiṣā, quoting his father, and he too from Ibn Abbās, saying that there is a hadith in which the Prophet stated:

عَلِيٌّ أَفْضَى إِلَيَّ فَمَنْ أَحَبَّنِي فَلِحُبِّي كَانَ الْمُهَيَّجُ لَا يَمُوتُ وَلَا يَبُيُّ إِلَّا بِحُبِّ عَلِيٍّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ³³⁵

"Among my people, Ali's judgment is the most correct and most stable, so anyone who loves me is to love Ali, because no slave has my guardianship except through his affection for Ali."

And in *Musnad al-Ḥanbal*, through chains from Yaḥyā Ibn Sa'īd, there is a hadith from Musayyib saying that:

كَانَ عُمَرُ يَتَوَكَّلُ بِاللَّهِ مِنْ مُضْطَلَّةِ لَيْسَ لَهَا أَبُو الْحَسَنِ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ³³⁶

"It was Omar's custom when he encountered any problem, and Imam Ali was not there, to take refuge in God [regarding it]."

And a hadith from Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Khārazmī, through his chains from Yaḥyā Ibn Sa'īd, quotes Musayyib as relating that:

سَمِعْتُ عُمَرَ يَقُولُ: اللَّهُمَّ لَا تُجِنِّي لِضَلَّةِ لَيْسَ لَهَا ابْنُ طَالِبٍ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ³³⁷

"I heard Omar say: 'O my Lord and Creator, let me not live if I should face a problem and Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib is not [there] to help me.'"

Moreover, Khārazmī, through his chains from Abū Dardā, narrates that Omar said: "There are three learned persons: a man in Shām [meaning himself], a man in Kūfa, that is, Abdullah Ibn Mas'ūd, and a man in Medina, that is, Ali. The one who is in Shām refers to the man in Kūfa for solutions, and the one who is in Kūfa refers to the man in Medina, but the one in Medina does not refer to anyone with his problem."

There are many similar hadiths related by the Sunnis that Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad Ḥammu'ī has recorded in *Farā'id al-Simṭayn*.³³⁸

Ḥākīm Ḥaskānī and Jalāl al-Dīn Suyūṭī have narrated through their chains from Abū Rashīd Ḥabranī, that Abū Ḥamrā reported that the Prophet stated:

مَنْ أَرَادَ أَنْ يَنْظُرَ إِلَى آدَمَ فِي عِلْمِهِ، وَإِلَى نُوحٍ فِي صَبْرِهِ، وَإِلَى إِبْرَاهِيمَ فِي جَلَمِهِ، وَإِلَى يُحْيَى فِي زُفَرِهِ، وَإِلَى مُوسَى فِي بَطْنِهِ فَلْيَنْظُرْ إِلَى عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ.³³⁹

"Whoever wants to observe a man for his knowledge, and to observe Noah for his intellect and insight, and Abraham for his patience, and Yahyā for his piety, and Moses for his rigor, must look to Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib [to find them]."

And Suyūṭī has said that Abū Rashīd Ḥammānī, Abū Hārūn 'Abdī, and Abū Sa'īd Khudrī have narrated that:

كَأَنَّهُ لَوِ اتَّبَعَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ، فَاقْبَلَ عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ، فَأَدَامَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ الْقَبْلَ إِلَيْهِ ثُمَّ قَالَ: مَنْ أَرَادَ أَنْ يَنْظُرَ إِلَى آدَمَ فِي عِلْمِهِ، وَإِلَى نُوحٍ فِي صَبْرِهِ، وَإِلَى إِبْرَاهِيمَ فِي جَلَمِهِ، فَلْيَنْظُرْ إِلَى هَذَا. وَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ.³⁴⁰

"We were sitting with the Prophet when Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib came to us. At that moment the Prophet turned to him, looked at him attentively, and said: 'Whoever wants to observe Adam for his knowledge, and Noah for his command, and Abraham for his forbearance, let him observe this man, and God is the All-Knowing.'"

Ibn Asākar narrates through his two chains that Ibn Shibrāma said:

مَّا كَانَ أَحَدٌ يَقُولُ عَلَى الْمِنْبَرِ: «سَلُونِي»، عَنْ مَاهِدِينَ الْوَحْتِينَ إِلَّا عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ حِينَ.³⁴¹

"None among the people except Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib has ever said upon the pulpit: 'Ask me about anything that exists between the Two Tablets.'"

The Two Tablets are the Guarded Tablet and the Fixed Tablet, that is, the entirety of the absolute Divine Judgment and the lesser Divine Judgment, which encompasses all that happens from the beginning until the Day of Resurrection, from the Divine Heights to the most low.³⁴²

He has also narrated by means of his chains that Saʿīd Ibn Muṣayyib said:

لَمْ يَكُنْ أَحَدٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ: دَسَلُونِي، إِلَّا عَلِيٌّ

"None of the companions of the Prophet welcomes questions except Ali."

Moreover, ʿUmayr Ibn Abdullah said through his chain that:

خَطَبَنَا عَلِيٌّ (بُنْ أَبِي طَالِبٍ) عَلَى مِثْرِ الْكُوفَةِ، قَالَ: أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ سَلُونِي قَوْلَ: لَوْ أَنَّ قُلُوبَنَا قَبَلِينَ الْجَنَّتَيْنِ مَعَى عِلْمِ جَمِّ

"Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib delivered a sermon to us from the pulpit of the Kūfa mosque, in which he said: 'O people, ask me [your questions] while you can. Know that between these two sides of mine there is much knowledge.'"

Saʿīd Ibn Jubayr narrates from Ibn Abbās:

قَالَ: إِذَا دَانَتْ لَنَا الشَّيْءُ عَنْ عَلِيٍّ، لَمْ نَسْئَلْ بِهِ إِلَى غَيْرِهِ.³⁴³

Saʿīd Ibn Jubayr also narrates that Ibn Abbās said: "Whenever we came to completely know a matter because of Ali, we would never forget it."

In addition, Akrama has narrated that Ibn Abbās said:

إِذَا بَلَّغْتَنَا شَيْءٌ، فَكَلَّمَهُ عَلِيٌّ مِنْ خُبْرٍ أَوْ قَضَاءٍ وَبَكَّتْ، لَمْ نَجْأُزْهِدْهُ إِلَى غَيْرِهِ.

"When it comes to us that Ali has commanded a thing or judged an affair, and it is certain and absolute for us, we never disregard his word."

He has also narrated from ʿIkrama that Ibn Abbās said: "When a reliable person narrates to us a hadith from Ali, and his words are certain, we never trespass against Ali's hadith."

In present volume of *Knowing the Imams*, lessons 153–56, we have explained that there are successive authentic hadiths proving that the Prophet stated: "I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate," and that the Holy Qur'an tells us *enter the houses through their [main] gates*. Here, the gates are the Immaculate Imams, and pre-eminently Imam Ali, whose sole guidance must be sought and then obeyed. He alone is like the source of a pure spring. Guidance from others is not genuine guidance, but misleading utterances that lead to the

wretchedness of the Fire. Such guidance not only fails to quench one's thirst, but increases it, and drags one to the abyss of death.

The *Nahj al-Balāghah* Sermon on the Necessity of the Gate to the City of Knowledge

Imam Ali states in *Nahj al-Balāghah*:

وَنَظَرُ قَلْبٍ إِلَيْهِ بِهَيْئَةٍ مُنْجِدَةٍ، وَغَرِثُ غَوْرَةٍ وَنَجْدَةٍ.
 دَاعٍ دَعَا، وَرَاجٍ رَجَى، فَتَقْبَلُوا الدَّاعِيَ وَاتَّبِعُوا الرَّاجِيَ،
 قَدْ خَاصُوا بِمَعْنَى الْجَنَّةِ، وَأَفْضَلُوا بِالْبَدْعِ دُونَ الشَّيْنِ، وَأَزْدَ الْمُؤْمِنُونَ وَنَطَقُوا الصَّالُونَ الْكَذِبُونَ، نَحْنُ
 الشُّعَارُ وَالْأَصْحَابُ وَالْمَرْجُوعَةُ وَالْأَبْوَابُ.
 لَا تَوَقَّى الصُّبُوتُ إِلَّا مِنَ الْإِبْرَاهِيمَا، فَتَمْنِ أَتْلُقَا مِنْ غَيْرِ ابْنَاهُمَا سُمِّي سَارِقًا مِنْهَا فِيهِمْ كَرَامَةُ الْقُرْآنِ، وَهُمْ كَهْوُ
 الرَّحْمَنِ، إِنْ تَطَلَّعُوا صَدَّقُوا وَإِنْ صَمُّوا لَزِمْتَهُمْ.
 فَلْيَضْحَكُوا إِنْ دَاخَلْتُمْ عَقْلَهُ، وَلْيَكُنْ مِنْ أَبْنَاءِ الْآخِرَةِ فَإِنَّهُ مِنْهَا قَدِمَ وَأَلْيَا، يَنْقَلِبُ، فَالْخَاطِرُ
 بِالْقَلْبِ الصَّامِلِ بِالْبَصْرِ يَكُونُ مُبْتَدَأَ عَمَلِهِ أَنْ يَتْلُمَ أَعْمَلُهُ عَلَيْهِ أَمْ لَهُ؟
 فَإِنْ كَانَ لَهُ مَعْنَى فِيهِ، وَإِنْ كَانَ عَلَيْهِ وَقْتُ عَنْهُ، فَإِنَّ الصَّامِلَ يَغْتَرِبُ عَلَى كَالشَّارِعِ عَلَى غَيْرِ طَرِيقٍ، فَلَا
 يَنْبَغُ بَعْدَهُ نَحْنُ الطَّرِيقُ إِلَّا بَعْدًا مِنْ حَاجَتِهِ، وَالصَّامِلُ بِالْعِلْمِ كَالشَّارِعِ عَلَى الطَّرِيقِ الْوَاضِعِ.
 فَلْيَنْظُرُوا نَظِيرًا سَائِرًا هُوَ أَمْرٌ رَاجِعٌ. وَاعْلَمُوا أَنَّ لِكُلِّ ظَاهِرٍ تَاطَلًا عَلَى مِثَالِهِ، فَتَاطَلَتْ ظَاهِرُهُ طَابَ
 بَاطِنُهُ، وَمَا خَبَتْ ظَاهِرُهُ خَبَتْ بَاطِنُهُ، وَقَدْ قَالَ الرَّسُولُ الصَّادِقُ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ: إِنَّ اللَّهَ
 يُحِبُّ الصُّبْدَ وَيُبْغِضُ عَمَلَهُ، وَيُحِبُّ الصَّمَلَ وَيُبْغِضُ بَدَنَهُ.
 وَاعْلَمُوا أَنَّ لِكُلِّ عَمَلٍ تَبَاتًا وَكُلُّ تَبَاتٍ لَا يَغْنِي بِهِ عَنِ الْمَاءِ، وَالْيَاةُ مُخْتَلِفَةٌ فَمَا طَابَ سَقِيَةُ طَابَ
 غَرَسُهُ وَحَلَّتْ فَرَسُهُ، وَمَا خَبَتْ سَقِيَةُ خَبَتْ غَرَسُهُ وَأَمْرُهُ فَمُرُودُ

He who has intelligence looks to his goal. He knows his low road as well as his high road. The caller has called, the shepherd has tended (his flocks) [an allusion to the Prophet and Imam Ali himself], so respond to the caller and follow the shepherd.

They (who oppose) have entered an ocean of disturbance and taken to innovations instead of the Sunnah (the example of the Prophet), while the believers are brought down by the speech of the misguided and liars. We are the near ones, the companions, the treasure-holders and doors

[to the Sunnah]. Houses are not entered other than through their doors. Whoever enters by means other than the door is called a thief.

The subtleties of the Qur'an are about them [the Household and descendants of the Prophet], and they are the treasurers of God. When they speak, they speak the truth, but when they are silent, no other can speak unless they speak. The foremost should speak truly to his people, should retain his wits, and should be one of the children, (a man) of the next world, because he has come from there and will return there.

Before acting, the one who understands with the heart and eyes assesses whether his action will go for him or against him. If it is for him he goes ahead, but if it is against him he avoids it. For he who acts without knowledge is like one who wanders without a path, and his deviation from the path keeps him from his destination. But he who acts according to knowledge is like one who walks a clear path. Therefore, one who can see should discern whether or not one should proceed.

You should also know that the outside (of everything) is like what is inside. Whatever is good outside is also good inside, and whatever is bad outside is also bad inside. The sincere Prophet, may God's peace and blessings be upon him and his progeny, has said that God may love a man but hate his action, and may love the action but hate the man. You should also know that every action is like vegetation, and vegetation cannot do without water. But waters are different. So where the water is good the plant is good and its fruits are sweet, whereas where the water is bad the plant will also be bad and its fruits will be bitter.

Imam Ali continues in this sermon:

Our opponents are oppressors and liars who took the lead and passed us over, and the believers were left alone and secluded themselves in the corners of their rooms. Their instruction to the people is evil and leads the nation to perdition and loss, and wastes talent like contaminated water ruins plants. O people, we are the Household of Muhammad, for whose sake the Qur'an was sent down. It is we whose knowledge is pure, and is from the Source of Light, the Mine of Gnosis. If you act upon our knowledge, your actions will be right and lead you to your destination. However, if you do not, then your actions are void and you move towards the opposite direction, and day by day you stray from the straight path. Alas, you will have no scruples, fairness, justice, rectitude, obedience, gnosis, or monotheism.

O people, learning knowledge from anyone other than us is like climbing a wall into a house without entering through the main door. Such a person can be considered a thief, not a seeker of knowledge. They will

arrest him, put him in prison, and cut his wrist, without his benefitting or taking anything from the house.

In his explanation of this sermon, Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd has said:

The "treasure house and the door" that Imam Ali mentions, and that he considers himself to be, that is, the treasurer and gate of entry of the House of God and His Prophet, might well be *khazā'in al-'Ilm wa abwāb al-'Ilm*, because of the words of the Prophet:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْعِلْمِ وَعَلِيٌّ بَابُهَا فَزَنْزِلُوا الْحِكْمَةَ قَلِيلَاتِ الْبَابِ

"I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate, so let anyone who desires wisdom enter through the main gate."³⁴⁴

Another statement of the Prophet concerning him, that is, *khazā'in al-'Ilm*, indicates that Ali is the gatherer and the treasurer of his knowledge, for on another occasion he said: "He is the chest of my knowledge."

It may be that the Prophet means that he is the treasurer and gate of Paradise. In other words: "No one enters Paradise except through our Guardianship," because there is an authentic report about Ali stating: *Innahu qāsim al-nār* (Indeed, Ali is the divider of the Fire [and Paradise]).

In addition, Abū 'Ubaydah Harawī writes in *Jama' Bayn al-Gharibayn* that a group of Arab imams have interpreted these words as meaning that Ali is the divider of Heaven and the Fire, since Ali's friends are of the People of Heaven and his enemies are of those of the Fire. However, Abū 'Ubaydah says that another group claims that Ali lets some enter Heaven and others the Fire, by his own nature, since he is the divider of Heaven and the Fire,

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd says: "Abū 'Ubayda's comment on this hadith is based on Ali's addressing the Fire: 'This is my friend, he is from me, so let him go. And this one is for you, so take him.'"

Imam Ali then said that houses cannot be entered other than through the main gates.

God, the Most High, states:

وَلَيْسَ الْبِرُّ أَنْ تَأْتُوا النِّبُوتَ مِنْ ظُهُورِهَا وَلَكِنَّ الْبِرَّ مَنْ آتَى وَأَتَى النِّبُوتَ مِنْ أَوْبَانِهَا

...It is not righteousness to enter houses from the back, but the righteous man is he who wards off (evil). So go to houses by the gates thereof (2:189).

Later on, Ali said: "Whoever enters a house other than by the main entrance is known as a thief." This statement is in any case right. Clearly, anyone who climbs up a wall to reach the roof and enter a

house is known as a thief. But inwardly it means someone who searches for knowledge from someone other than the right teacher: since he does not enter the house through the main gate he is like a thief.³⁴⁵

Ibn Abi al-Hadīd here introduces a very good section on the virtues and priorities of Imam Ali. He mentions a great many authentic hadiths concerning Ali spoken by the Prophet. Although most of them have been mentioned earlier in this series of *Knowing the Imams* and sufficiently discussed, since he gathered them all in 24 different hadiths from Sunni references, it is helpful to mention them here in translation without further explanation.

An Explanation of the Hadiths Concerning the Priorities of Ali

Let it be known that even if Imam Ali became proud and exaggerated the number of the virtues and priorities that God has honored him with, and all the eloquent Arabs joined him in praise of himself, they would not manage to speak of even a tenth of what the Prophet said about him. There are not just the reports and well-known hadiths to which the followers of the Imam always refer, such as the events of Ghadīr, the hadith of Manzilat, the stories of the Disassociation (*barā'at*), the narration of Supplication, and the report about the invitation of the clan to Mecca at the beginning of Islam, and similar stories.

Our main focus is Sunni reports narrated from the Prophet about Imam Ali, very few of which have been written by scholars of hadiths, and address them in following the discussion. The scholars are not necessarily Shi'a, and in fact most of them are not, but their hadiths on the virtues of Ali bring serenity and support or argument. Some of these are listed below.

1)

مَا عَلِيَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ فَذَنْبُكَ بَيْنَ يَدَيَّ مَنْزِلَ أَحَبِّ إِلَيَّ مِنْهَا، هِيَ زِينَةُ الْأَنْبَاءِ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ تَعَالَى:
الرُّفْدُ فِي الدُّنْيَا، جَعَلَكَ لَا تَنْزِلُ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا شَيْئًا، وَلَا تَنْزِلُ الدُّنْيَا عَلَيْكَ شَيْئًا، وَوَهَبَ لَكَ حُبَّ
السَّائِكِينَ، لِحُبِّكَ تَرْضَى بِهِمُ الْتَعَا، وَيَرْضُونَ بِكَ إِمَامًا.³⁴⁶

O Ali, indeed God has beautified you with an ornament the like of which He has not bestowed upon His other creatures. This ornament is plenty in the presence of God, the Exalted, and in the world. He has created you in such a way that you never take from this world anything as your own, nor does the world take anything from you. God has bestowed

upon you the friendship and affection of the poor, and has prepared you in such a way that you support their following of you. Hence, the poor respect you as their Imam.

Abū Nu‘aym mentions this hadith in his well-known *Hilliyyat al-Awliyā*, and Abū Abdullah Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal adds in his *Musnad*:³⁴⁷

فَكُلُّ مَنْ أَحَبَّنَا وَتَمَعَّنَ فِيْنَا وَوَلَّيْنَا إِيَّاكَ وَكَلَّبَ فِيكَ

“So how lucky is he who loves you and accepts whatever the verses of the Holy Qur’an and the words of Gabriel and the Prophet have spoken about you; but how wretched is he who opposes you and rejects that which has been sent to you.”

2) Ahmad mentions in *Faḍā’il al-‘Alī* says that the Prophet said:

لَقَدْ مَنَّ بَابِي وَلِيْمَةً³⁴⁸ أَوْلَاهُمْ إِلَيْكُمْ رَجُلًا كَفِيًّا، يَمْنَعُ فِيكُمْ أَمْرِي، يَقْتُلُ الْمَغَابِلَةَ وَيَنْبِي النُّزُمَةَ

“O sons of Walī‘a, you will repent of your behavior and stop it, or else I will send a man to you, who is a part of my soul. He will carry out my command among you; he will fight with your fighters and capture your tribe.”

Abūdhar says: “Nothing drew my attention away at that very moment or frightened me other than the coldness of Umar’s hand touching me on the back, and his asking: ‘In your opinion, what does the Prophet mean by saying this?’”

Abūdhar said:

إِنَّهُ لَا يَمْنِيكَ، وَأَمَّا يَمْنِي خَاصِمَ الثَّلَلِ، وَائِنَّهَ قَالَ: هُوَ هَذَا

“The Prophet did not mean you, but the one who patches his sandals. He said: ‘That person is the one.’”

3)

إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَمِدَ إِلَيَّ فِي عَمَلِي هَذَا، هَلْتُ: يَارَبِّ بَيْتِي لِي

قَالَ: اسْتَمِعْ إِنَّ عَلِيًّا زَاهِدٌ مُتَّقِيٌّ، وَأَمَامٌ أَوْلِيَانِي، وَنُورٌ مِّنْ أَطَاعِي، وَهُوَ الْكَلِمَةُ الَّتِي أَلَزَمْتُهَا الْمُتَّعِينَ، مَن أَحَبَّهُ هَذَا أَحْبَبَنِي، وَمَن أَطَاعَهُ هَذَا أَطَاعَنِي،

فَبَشَّرَهُ بِذَلِكَ، هَلْتُ: قَدْ بَشَّرْتُهُ يَارَبِّ

قَالَ: أَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ وَفِي قَبْضَتِي، فَإِن يَمْنَعْنِي فَيَدْنُونِي لَن يَطْلِمَ شَيْئًا، وَإِن يَمْنَعْنِي مَا وَعَدَنِي هُوَ أَوْلَى وَقَدْ دَعَوْتُ لَهُ، هَلْتُ: اللَّهُمَّ اجْلُ قَلْبَهُ وَاجْعَلْ رِيعَةَ الْإِيمَانِ بِهِ

قَالَ: قَدْ هَلْتُ ذَلِكَ، غَيْرَ أَنِّي مُخْصَصُهُ بِشَيْءٍ مِّنَ الْبَلَاءِ لَمْ أَخْتَصِ بِهِ أَحَدًا مِّنْ أَوْلِيَانِي

هَكَذَا: أَنِي وَصَّيْتُكَ: أَنَّهُ سَقَى فِي عِلْمِي أَنَّهُ كَيْلٌ وَمُبْتَلَى. 349

As for Ali, God has advised, commanded, and informed me of some news. Following this command, I said: "O my Creator, make this clear to me," and God stated: "Take heed. Surely, Ali is the principal banner of guidance, the Imam and leader of My people, and the light of those who obey Me. He is My word of righteousness that I convey to the pious. Whoever loves him, in fact loves Me, and he who obeys him indeed obeys Me. O Prophet, inform Ali of this matter."

I then said: "O my Creator, I gave him the glad tidings, after which Ali said: 'I am the slave of God, and I live according to the Will of God. If He punishes me for my sins, it is right, for He has taken me for my sins, but has not oppressed me at all. And if He fulfils His promise concerning me, He is the Just, and He may do so, for He is the Owner of my guardianship.'"

I said: "I prayed for Ali saying: 'O Lord, lighten his heart, and accept his beautiful spring of life as his faith in You.'" And God stated: "I did this for the sake of Ali, yet I will test him with much calamity, sedition, and hardship, which are specified for him only, such that I have not done with my friends and guardians thus far."

I said: "O my Creator, but Ali is my brother; he is my companion and associate." And God stated: "This is issued from My knowledge, and is not changeable. Ali will be involved in difficulties, and so will the people (who follow him), and they will be tested."

Abū Nu'aym Hāfiz has narrated this hadith in *Hilliyyat al-Awliyā* from Abū Barzā Aslamī, and also through another chain with some differences from Anas Ibn Mālīk as:

إِنَّ رَبَّ الْعَالَمِينَ عَهْدَنِي عَلَى إِلَيَّ عَهْدًا أَنَّهُ زَايَةُ الْهَدَى، وَمَنَارُ الْإِيمَانِ، وَأَعْلَامُ أَوْلِيَائِي، وَنُورُ جَمِيعٍ مِّنْ أَطَاعَتِي، إِنَّ عَلِيًّا أَمِينِي عَهْدًا فِي الْقِيَامَةِ، وَصَاحِبُ زَايَتِي، يَدِينُ عَلَى مَفَاتِيحِ خَزَائِنِ رَحْمَةِ رَبِّي.

Indeed, the Creator of the world has enjoined upon me by informing me of a matter concerning Ali, saying that he is the banner of the guardianship, the highest illuminating minaret of belief, and the Imam and leader of my friends and all who obey me. Indeed, on the Day of Reckoning, Ali is my trustee and owner of my banner, for the keys to the treasures of God's Mercy are with Ali.

4)

مَنْ أَرَادَ أَنْ يَنْظُرَ إِلَى نُوحٍ عَزَمِهِ، وَإِلَى آدَمَ فِي عِلْمِهِ، وَإِلَى إِبْرَاهِيمَ فِي حِلْمِهِ، وَإِلَى مُوسَى فِي فَطْمَتِهِ، وَإِلَى عِيسَى فِي زُهْدِهِ، فَلْيَنْظُرْ إِلَى عَلِيِّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ.

"Whoever wishes to look to Noah for his firm resolve, and to Adam's knowledge, and to Abraham for his patience and forbearance, and to Moses for his intelligence and shrewdness, and to Jesus for his piety and detachment from the world, must look to Ali Ibn Abi Tālib."

This hadith is mentioned in Ahmad's *Musnad* and Bayhaqī's *Ṣaḥīh*.

5)

مَنْ سَرَّ أَنْ يَحْيَى حَيَاتِي، وَيَمُوتَ مِثْلِي، وَيَتَمَسَّكَ بِالْقَضِيبِ مِنَ الْيَاقُوتَةِ الَّتِي خَلَقَهَا اللَّهُ تَعَالَى بِيَدِهِ ثُمَّ قَالَ لَهَا كُونِي فَكَانَتْ فَلْيَتَمَسَّكَ بِوَلَدِ عَلِيِّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ.

"Whoever is pleased to live as I live, and die as I do, and wants to hold a branch of rubies that the Creator has created with His own hand by commanding it: 'Be,' and it came to exist, must attach himself to the Guardianship of Ali Ibn Abi Tālib."

This hadith is narrated by Ḥāfiẓ Nu'aym in *Ḥillīyyat al-Awliyā* and by Abū Abdullah Ahmad Ḥanbal in his two books, *Musnad* and *Faḍḍ al Ali Ibn Abi Tālib*. The words of Ahmad were:

مَنْ أَحَبَّ أَنْ يَتَمَسَّكَ بِالْقَضِيبِ الْأَحْمَرِ الَّذِي غَرَسَهُ اللَّهُ فِي جَنَّةِ عَدْنٍ بِمِثْنِهِ، فَلْيَتَمَسَّكَ بِحُبِّ عَلِيِّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ.

"He who wants to seize the red branch that God has planted with His hand in the Garden of Eden must seize the affection of Ali Ibn Abi Tālib."

6)

وَالَّذِي نَفْسِي بِيَدِهِ، لَوْ لَأَنْ تَقُولَ طَوَائِفُ مِنْ أُمَّتِي فِيكَ مَا قَالَتِ النَّصَارَى فِي ابْنِ مَرْيَمَ، أَلَمْ تَكُنْ الْيَوْمَ فِيكَ مَعَالَا لَا تُزْمَلُونَ مِنَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ إِلَّا أَخَذُوا الثَّرَابَ مِنْ تَحْتِ قَدَمَيْكَ بِالْبَرَكَةِ.

"I swear by Him in Whose power is my soul, that if some tribes among my nation had not said what the Christians have said about the son of Mary [i.e. son of God], I would today announce something concerning you, so that, from now on, you would not pass any group of Muslims without them removing the dust from under your feet as a blessing."

Ahmad Ḥanbal has narrated this hadith in his *Musnad*.

7) On the eve of the Day of 'Arafa, the Prophet went among the people and stated:

إِنَّ اللَّهَ قَدْ بَاهَى بِكُمْ الْمَلَائِكَةَ عَائِمَةً وَغَفَرَ لَكُمْ عَائِمَةً، وَبَاهَى بِعَلِيِّ خَاصَّةً، وَغَفَرَ لَهُ خَاصَّةً، إِنْ
قَاتِلُكُمْ قَوْلًا غَيْرَ مُحَابٍ فِيهِ لِقَرَابَتِي: إِنَّ الشَّعِيدَ كُلَّ الشَّعِيدِ حَقُّ الشَّعِيدِ مَنْ أَحَبَّ عَلِيًّا فِي حَيَاتِهِ
وَبَعْدَ مَوْتِهِ

Because of you all, God surely took pride in His angels, and He forgave all of you. He especially took pride in His angels because of Ali, favoring him above all with His forgiveness. I am now going to tell you something concerning Ali, and my words are not because of Ali's priority and his relationship to me. He is by all means blessed, and blessed is the one who sees all happiness with him, and happy is he for whom righteousness and happiness is specified. So fortunate is he who loves Ali during his lifetime, and loves him after his death.

Abū Abdullah Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal mentions this hadith in his *Faḍā'il Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib* and *Musnad*.

8) This is a hadith that Ahmad Ḥanbal also narrated in the above-mentioned books:

أَنَا أَوَّلُ مَنْ يُدْعَى بِدِيْنِ النَّبِيِّ، فَأَقُومُ عَنْ يَمِينِ الْعَرْشِ فِي ظِلِّهِ، ثُمَّ أَكْسَى خُلْعَةً ثُمَّ يُدْعَى بِالنَّبِيِّينَ
بِمَنْصِبِهِمْ عَلَى أَقْسَى تَحْضٍ. فَيَقُومُونَ عَنْ يَمِينِ الْعَرْشِ، وَهُمْ كَسَوْنَ خُلْعًا، ثُمَّ يُدْعَى بِعَلِيِّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ
لِقَرَابَتِهِ مِنِّي وَمَنْزِلَتِهِ عِنْدِي، وَيُدْفَعُ إِلَيْهِ لَوَانِي لِرِوَاءِ الْحَمْدِ، آدَمُ وَمَنْ دُونَهُمْ ذَلِكَ الْوَاءُ.
ثُمَّ قَالَ لِعَلِيٍّ: كَسِبَ بِكَ حَقِّي وَبَيْنَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ وَالْإِسْمَاعِيلِ، ثُمَّ تُكْسَى خُلْعَةً وَيُنَادِي مُنَادٍ مِنَ الْعَرْشِ:
يَعْمُ الصُّبْحُ أَبُوكَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، وَنَعْمَ الْأَخُ أَخُوكَ عَلِيٌّ، الْبَشَرُ فَكَذَلِكَ تُدْعَى إِذَا دُعِيَ، وَتُكْسَى إِذَا كُسِيَ، وَ
تُحْيَا إِذَا حَيَّتْ.

I am the first to be called on the Day of Resurrection, and on the right side of Divine Throne I shall stand in the shade, dressed in a heavenly garment. Then the prophets will be called one after another, and they too will stand on the right side of the Throne and be dressed in heavenly garments. And then, Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, for his relationship with me and his high position, is called, and the banner with praises to God is put in his hand. Then all the prophets from Adam and those who came after stand under that banner.

Then the Prophet addressed Ali:

You will move forward to stand between Abraham, the Friend, and me, and there you will be dressed with a heavenly garment; and a herald will call out from God's Throne: "How wonderful a slave is your father Abraham; and how good your brother Ali."

Glad tidings, for you are called when I am called. You are clothed when I am clothed, and you become alive when I become alive.

9) "O Anas, prepare water for me to make the ablution."

Then the Prophet stood up and performed two units of prayer. He then said:

أَوَّلُ مَنْ يَدْخُلُ بَعْدِي مِنْ عَمَلِ الْهَابِ إِمَامُ الْمُتَّقِينَ، وَبَعْدُ الْمُسْلِمِينَ، وَبَعْدُ الدِّينِ، وَخَاتَمُ
الْوَصِيِّينَ، وَقَائِدُ الْأَمْرِ الْمُجِيدِينَ.

The first to come to you from this door is the Imam of the pious, the Master and Sayyid of the Muslims, the Emir and head of the religion, the seal of the successors, and the leader and foundation of the bright faces of men whose foreheads and feet shine with the water from their ablutions.

Anas suddenly said: "O God, assign this newly arriving man of the tribe of Anṣār,³⁵⁰ and hide this thought of mine." Meanwhile Ali came, and the Prophet asked: "O Anas, who arrived?" He answered: "Ali arrived."

The Prophet stood up in good cheer and embraced Ali, wiping the sweat from his face and patting it. Then Ali said:

يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْكَ وَآلِكَ، لَقَدْ رَأَيْتُ مِنْكَ الْيَوْمَ صَنْعَ فِي شَيْءٍ مَا صَنَعْتَهُ فِي قَبْلٍ،

"O Messenger of God, may God's blessings and mercy be upon you and your Household. Today, I saw you do something you have never done before."

The Prophet stated:

وَمَا يَمْنَعُنِي وَأَنْتَ تُؤْذِي عَنِّي، وَلَسِمَهُمْ صَوْتِي، وَلَكِنَّهُمْ مَا اخْتَلَفُوا فِيهِ بَعْدِي،³⁵¹

"What can impede my happiness and affection when it is you who are going to take the responsibility of my prophethood? And concerning that over which they will later differ, it is you, and you alone, who will make thing clear for them."

10) "Call Ali, the Master of the Arabs, to me."

‘Āyisha asked: "Are you not the Sayyid and Master of the Arabs?"

The Prophet stated: "I am the Sayyid and Master of all the children of Adam, and Ali is the Sayyid and Master of the Arabs."

When they called Ali and he came to him, the Prophet sent for some of the Anṣār (the Helpers) and asked them:

يَا مُنْفَرِ الْأَنْصَارِ أَلَا أَدُلُّكُمْ عَلَى مَا نَافَعُكُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بِهِذَا؟

"Do you not want me to direct you to a thing that will never lead you astray if you cling to it?" The Helpers said: "Yes, O Messenger of God."

The Prophet stated:

فَإِنِّي أَدُلُّكُمْ عَلَى مَا نَفَعُكُمْ بِهِ لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بِهِذَا؟
جَل. ³⁵²

"It is Ali. Respect and love him with the same affection that you have for me. Honor him, be endeared to him with as much generosity as you have for me. For indeed this truth that I reveal to you now is what Gabriel has commanded me from God, glory be to Him."

Hāfiz Abū Nu'aym has this in *Hilliyyat al-Awliyā*.

11)

مَرَحَبًا بِسَيِّدِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ، وَإِمَامِ الْمُتَّقِينَ

"Congratulations to the Sayyid and Master of the Believers, the Imam and leader of the pious." He asked Ali: "What is your gratitude and appreciation for the Prophet who addresses you with such titles?"

Imam Ali replied:

لَعَنَ اللَّهُ عَلَى مَا آتَانِي، وَأَسْأَلُهُ الشُّكْرَ عَلَى مَا آتَانِي، وَأَنْ يَزِيدَنِي بِمَا عَظَانِي

"I will praise God for that with which He has honored me, and I will ask Him to show me gratitude for the blessing He has given me. And I will also ask Him to honor me with more of that which He has already honored me."

This is included in the *Hilliyyat*.

12)

مَنْ سَرَّهُ أَنْ يَمُتَ حَيًّا وَيَمُوتَ تَمَاتِي وَيَسْكُنَ جَنَّةَ عَدْنِ الْإِلَهِ غَرَسَ نَارِي قُلُوبًا عَلِيًّا مِنْ تَعْدِي، وَلِيُوَالِ
وَلِيَهُ، وَلِيَتَّقِيَ بِالْإِيمَانِ تَعْدِي، فَهُمْ عِزَّتِي، غُلُقُوا مِنْ طِبْعِي، وَزَرُّوا أَهْلاً وَعِلَماً. قَوْلُ الْمُكَلِّبِينَ
مِنْ الْبَنِي، الْفَاطِمِيِّينَ فِيهِمْ صَلَوَاتِي، لَا أَتَلَكُمُ اللَّهُ شَفَاعَتِي

Whoever wishes to be as happy in life as I am, and to pass away as I will do, and to dwell in the Heaven of Eden that my Creator has planted,

must accept the guardianship of Ali after I am gone. He must accept the custody of his Guardian and obey the Imams after me, because they are of my family and they have been created of my nature. They have been given knowledge and wisdom. So woe upon the liars among my nation who cut off my bond with them, for God will not grant them my intercession.

This hadith is also included in *Hilyyat*.
13)

The Prophet sent Khālid Ibn Walid to one battle and Ali to another. Both battles were in Yemen, and the Prophet told them:

إِنْ اجْتَمَعَتَا فَمَنْ عَلَى النَّاسِ، وَإِنْ افْتَرَقَتَا فَكُلُّ وَاحِدٍ مِنْكُمَا عَلَى جُنْدٍ

"If the two groups come together in a certain place, then Ali must be the chief, and he must lead both groups in communal prayer. However, if you are not together, each of your groups must lead separately."

It happened that the two armies met. They fought and looted, captured women, took away property, and killed some of those who resisted. Ali picked out one of the slave girls as his personal companion.

Khālid said to four of the Muslims, among whom was Burayda Aslamī: "You four are to go to the Prophet and inform him of what has happened." He also gave them something more to tell the Prophet against Ali.

The four men hastened to the Prophet and reached him before any of the others. One of them went to the Prophet and told him that Ali has done a certain thing, but the Prophet turned his face away. Then another came and told him that Ali had done something else, and again the Prophet turned away. Then Burayda Aslamī approached the Prophet and said: "O Messenger of God, Ali has done these things, and he has taken a slave girl for himself."

فَغَضِبَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ حَتَّى احْمَرَّتْ وَجْهَهُ، وَقَالَ: «دَعُوا لِي عَلِيًّا، بِكَرْرُهَا، إِنَّ عَلِيًّا رِئْى وَأَتَمُّ مِنْ عَلِيٍّ، وَإِنْ حَطَّ لِي الْخُمْسُ أَكْثَرُ بِمَا أَخَذَ، وَهُوَ لِي كُلُّ مُؤْمِنٍ وَمُؤْمِنَةٍ مِنْ بَعْدِي»

The Prophet became so angry with their words that he turned red in the face. Several times he said: "Let Ali be, and leave him alone! What is your business with Ali? Ali is with me, and I am with Ali. Ali's share of the booty of war is more than that. He has more of a share than what he has taken. Ali is to be the Guardian of every believing man and woman after I am gone."

Abū Abdullah Ahmad mentions various versions of this in *Musnad* and *Faḍā'il Ali*, and most hadith scholars have also narrated it.

14)

كَتَبْنَا وَعَلَى نُورَاتَيْنِ بَدَى اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَخْلُقَ آدَمَ بِأَرْبَعَةِ عَشَرَ أَلْفَ عَامٍ، فَلَمَّا خَلَقَ آدَمَ قَسَمَ ذَلِكَ فِيهِ، وَجَعَلَهُ جُزَيْنَيْنِ لِحُزْنٍ أَنَا وَجُزْءٌ عَلَيْهِ.

"Ali and I were a single Light within the Hands of God, glory be to Him, fourteen thousand years before He created Adam. When God created Adam, He divided that Light into two within Adam—one part was me, and the other part Ali."

Ahmad includes this hadith in *Musnad* and the *Faḍā'il Ali*. It is also in *Firdaws*, where the author has added:

ثُمَّ اتَّعَلَقْنَا حَتَّى جِئْنَا فِي عَبْدِ الْمُطَّلِبِ فَكَانَ لِي النَّبُوءَةُ وَلِلْأُخَيْرَةِ الْوَصِيَّةُ

meaning: "Then we move on until we reach 'Abd al-Muttalib; thus the prophethood is for me and the succession belongs to Ali."

15)

الْقَطْرُ إِلَى وَجْهِكَ يَا عَلِيٍّ عِبَادَةٌ، أَنْتَ سَيِّدِي فِي الدُّنْيَا وَسَيِّدِي فِي الْآخِرَةِ، مَنْ أَحَبَّكَ أَحَبَّنِي، وَحَبِيبِي حَبِيبُ اللَّهِ، وَعَدُوُّكَ عَدُوِّي، وَعَدُوِّي عَدُوُّ اللَّهِ، الْوَيْلُ لِمَنْ أَتَيْتَكَ.

"O Ali, casting a glance at your face is like worship. You are the Sayyid and chief in the world and in the Hereafter. Whoever loves you, in fact loves me, and my beloved is God's beloved. And your enemy is my enemy, and my enemy is God's enemy. Woe upon him who has a grudge against you."

Ahmad has this hadith in his *Musnad*, and has said:

Ibn Abbās was recounting these words of the Prophet:

إِنَّ مَنْ يَنْظُرَ إِلَيْهِ يَقُولُ: سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ مَا أَعْلَمَ هَذَا الْقَتْلَى، سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ مَا أَجْمَعَ هَذَا الْقَتْلَى، سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ مَا أَفْضَحَ هَذَا الْقَتْلَى.

"Whoever casts a glance at Ali says: 'Glory be to God! How knowledgeable is this youth, so glory be to God, and how courageous is this young man, glory be to God, and how fluent is this young man.'"

16) When the eve of the Battle of Qazwa approached, the Prophet said:

مَنْ دَسَخَ لِقَاءَهُ؟ فَاجْتَمَعَ النَّاسُ، هَكَامَ عَلَى فَاحْشَى قَرْيَةٍ، ثُمَّ آتَى بِرَأْسَيْدِ الْقُرَى مُطْلِمَةً، فَخَمَّرَ فِيهَا،
فَأَوْسَى اللَّهَ إِلَى جِبْرِيلَ وَمِيكَائِيلَ وَإِسْرَافِيلَ،
أَنْ تَكُونُوا لِنَصْرِ مُحَمَّدٍ وَأَخِيهِ وَجَنِّبِهِ فَهَبَطُوا مِنَ السَّمَاءِ، لَمْ لَقَطَ يَدْعُرُ مَنْ دَسَخَهُ، فَلَمَّا حَادُوا الْبَيْتَ،
سَلَّمُوا عَلَيْهِ مِنْ عِنْدِ أَخِيهِمْ أَكْبَرُ مَلَأَهُ وَاجْتَلَالًا.

"Who is to bring us water to drink?" All the people stepped back and were silent. Ali stood up, picked up a water-skin, and took it to a well in the pitch darkness. The well was deep, but he climbed down into it.

God informed Gabriel, Michael, and Seraphiel to get ready to help Muhammad and his brother, as well as his army. They descended from Heaven, and they had strange and distinctive voices that frightened those that heard, as they approached the well to offer Ali salutations and greetings and honor him for his position.

Ahmad has this hadith in *Faḍā'il Ali*, and elsewhere from Anas Ibn Mālik the following is added:

كُنْتُمْ بِأَعْلَى يَوْمَ الْقِيَمَةِ بِأَقْدَمِ نَوْحِ الْجَنَّةِ فَزَكَّيْهَا، وَزَكَّيْتُكَ مَعَ زَكَاةِ، وَخَدَّكَ مَعَ خَدِّي، حَتَّى
تَدْخُلَ الْجَنَّةَ.

"O Ali, on the Day of Resurrection they will bring you a camel from the camels of Paradise and you will ride on its back; your knees will be level with my knees and unhindered, and your thighs with my thighs, until you enter Paradise."

17)

أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ قَدْ مَوَافَرِشَاوْ لَا تَقْدُمُوهُمَا، وَتَعْلَمُوا مِنْهَا وَلَا تَهْلُكُوهُمَا،
قُوَّةَ رَجُلٍ مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ تَعْدِلُ قُوَّةَ رَجُلَيْنِ مِنْ غَيْرِهِمْ، وَأَمَانَةُ رَجُلٍ مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ تَعْدِلُ أَمَانَةَ رَجُلَيْنِ مِنْ
غَيْرِهِمْ
أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ أَوْصِيَكُمْ بِحُبِّ ذِي قُرَيْشٍ: أَخِي وَإِنِّي عَمِّي عَلَى بَنِي إِسْطَاطِلٍ لَا يَجِبُهُ إِلَّا مُؤْمِنٌ وَلَا يَنْتَعِضُهُ
إِلَّا مُتَأَنِّفٌ، مَنْ أَحَبَّهُ هَذَا أَحَبَّنِي، وَمَنْ أَنْتَعِضَهُ هَذَا أَنْتَعِضَنِي، وَمَنْ أَنْتَعِضَنِي عَذَّبَهُ اللَّهُ بِالنَّارِ.

O people, consider the Quraysh as foremost, and take not the lead. Learn from them, and do not teach them. The strength of a man of Quraysh is twice that of another, and the trustworthiness of a Quraysh is twice that of another.

O people, I counsel you to be affectionate towards my lineage from the Quraysh, that is, my brother and cousin Ali Ibn Abi Tālib. None but the pious love him, and none hates him except the hypocrites. He who loves him, in fact loves me, and whoever hates him hates me. And he who takes me as an enemy, God will torture in the Fire.

Ahmad includes this hadith in *Faḍā'il Ali*.

18)

الْمُتَّقُونَ ثَلَاثَةٌ: حَبِيبُ النَّجَّارِ، الَّذِي جَاءَ مِنْ أَقْصَى الْمَدِينَةِ يَسْتَعِي، وَمَوْءِنُ آلِ فِرْعَوْنَ الَّذِي كَانَ يَكْتُمُ إِيمَانَهُ، وَعَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ، وَهُوَ أَفْضَلُهُمْ.

"There are three of the truthful: Ḥabīb Najjār, who hurrying arrived from the farthest part of the town, the believer among the offspring of Pharaoh who hid his belief, and Ali Ibn Abi Tālib; and Ali is foremost among them."

19) Ahmad has the following hadith in *Faḍā'il Ali*:

أَعْطَيْتَنِي عَلَى خَمْسَةٍ، مَنْ أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا وَمَا فِيهَا، أَمَا وَاحِدٌ هُوَ كَلْبُ بَيْنَ يَدَيِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ حَتَّى يَفْرَغَ مِنْ حِسَابِ الْخَلَائِقِ. وَأَمَّا الثَّانِيَةُ فَلِرَأْسِ مُحَمَّدٍ بَيْنَ، آدَمَ وَمَنْ وَلَدَ مُحَمَّدٍ. وَأَمَّا الثَّالِثَةُ فَوَاقِفٌ عَلَى عَشْرِ حَوْضِي، يَنْقُ مِنْ عَرَفٍ مِنْ أَهْلِي. وَأَمَّا الرَّابِعَةُ فَسَائِرُ عَوْرَتِي وَمُسْلِمِي إِلَى رَبِّي. وَأَمَّا الْخَامِسَةُ فَكُنْتُ لَسْتُ أَخْفَى عَلَيْهِ أَنْ يَحْيِيَ كَلْفًا بَعْدَ إِيمَانِي، وَلَا زَانِيًا بَعْدَ إِحْسَانِي.

Concerning Ali, I have been given five things, and they are the most favored by me in the world.

The first is that he constantly drinks cups filled with heavenly drinks [he continually worships and prostrates before God] in the presence of the two venerated hands of God, glory be to Him, until God brings the account of the creatures to an end on the Day of Resurrection.

The second is that the banner of al-Ḥamd is in his hand, and Adam and the children of Adam are under it.

The third is that he will stand by the spring of my pond, and he will give water to any of my nation whom he knows.

The fourth is that he is the coverer of my private parts, and thus delivers my body and presents it to my Creator after my death.

The fifth is that I am not afraid that he should become a disbeliever after being a believer, or that he should commit adultery after his chastity.

Ahmad has this hadith in *Fadā'il Ali*.

20) Some of the front doors of the houses of some of the companions of the Prophet opened directly to the Prophet's mosque, and one day the Prophet commanded:

سُئِلَ أَنْ يَأْمُرَ بِإِغْلَاقِ أَبْوَابِ الْمَسْجِدِ إِلَّا بَابَ عَلِيٍّ

"Block all the doors to the mosque except the door of Ali."

They shut all the doors, but some were complaining among themselves until the news reached the Prophet, and he stood up among the gathering and said:

إِنْ قَوْمًا قَالُوا إِنِّي مَسَدْتُ وَلَا فَتَحْتُ، وَلَكِنِّي أَمَرْتُ بِأَمْرِ رَسُولِي

"Some have debated about the blocking of the doors while Ali's remains open. However, I have neither blocked the doors nor let one remain open, for I have been commanded to do so and have obeyed."

Ahmad frequently mentions this hadith in his *Musnad* and *Fadā'il Ali*.

21) During the Battle of Tabūk, the Prophet called Ali to him and spoke privately for a while. The discussion took rather a long time, and it dismayed some of the companions.

A man among the crowd said: "Today he prolongs his discussion with his cousin."

The Prophet was informed of this, so he gathered them together and said:

إِنْ كُنَّا قَالِ: لَقَدْ أَطَالَ الْيَوْمَ نَجْوَى ابْنِ عَمِّهِ، أَمَا إِنِّي مَا نَجَيْتُهُ، وَلَكِنْ اللَّهُ انْتَجَمَ

"Someone has said that I have prolonged my discussion with my cousin today. Be aware that I have not whispered to him anything in secret, but God has whispered to him and said something in secret."

Ahmad has this hadith in his *Musnad*.

22)

أَنْصَحُكَ بِأَعْلَى السُّبُورِ فَلَا تُؤَيِّدُ بَعْدِي، وَتُخَيِّمُ النَّاسَ بَيْنَهُ، لَا يَمْلِكُ فِيهَا أَحَدٌ مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ: أَنْتَ أَوْ لَمْ
إِنَّمَا بِاللَّهِ، وَأَوْقَاهُمْ بَعْدَ اللَّهِ، وَأَقْوَمَهُمْ بِأَمْرِ اللَّهِ، وَأَقْسَمَهُمْ بِالسُّبُورِ، وَأَعْدَتْكُمْ فِي الرِّجْعَةِ، وَأَبْصَرَهُمْ
بِالْقَضِيَةِ، وَأَعْظَمَهُمْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ مِنْهُمْ ³⁵³

O Ali, as for priority and status, I am above you, because no one has the status of prophethood after me, but you are better and far above the

nation in seven attributes, which none of the Quraysh can reject. You are the first among them in belief, and the first among them in your covenant with God; and you are the first to rise up among them by God's command, and you are the best and just divider among them; and you are the best judge among them in the nation in command and statesmanship; and you are the most astute among them in judgment when they encounter difficulties; and you are the greatest and most noble in the presence of God.

Abū Naṣīm Ḥāfiẓ has this ḥadīth in *Hilliyyat al-Awliyā*.

23) Fāṭimah said: "You have married me to a poor man who has no property."

The Prophet told her:

رَوَّجْتُكَ أَقْدَمَهُمْ سِلْمًا، وَأَعْظَمَهُمْ حِلْمًا، وَأَكْثَرَهُمْ عِلْمًا، لَا تَعْلَمِينَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ أَطْلَعَ إِلَى الْأَرْضِ أَطْلَاعَةً
فَاخْتَارَ مِنْهَا أَبَاكَ، ثُمَّ أَطْلَعَ إِلَيْهَا ثَانِيَةً فَاخْتَارَ مِنْهَا بَيْتَكَ

"I married you to a man whose Islam is foremost in all the nation; his forbearance is greater than that of all people, and his knowledge is more than that of all others. Do you not know that God cast a glance over the vast land and chose your father, and then cast another glance and chose your husband?"

Ahmad has also narrated this ḥadīth in *Musnad*.

24) After he returned from the Battle of Hunayn, the verse

إِذَا جَاءَ نَصْرُ اللَّهِ وَالْفَتْحُ

was sent down. The Prophet said

سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ، أَسْتَغْفِرُ اللَّهَ

many times, and then:

يَا عَلِيُّ إِلَهُ قَدْ جَاءَ مَا وَعَدْتُ بِهٖ، جَاءَ الْفَتْحُ، وَدَخَلَ النَّاسُ فِي دِينِ اللَّهِ أَفْوَاجًا، وَإِنَّهُ لَيْسَ أَحَدًا مِنْكُمْ
يَعْلَمُ، لِيُجِدَ بَيْتَكَ فِي الْإِسْلَامِ، وَفَنِيكَ بَيْنِي، وَجِهَتِكَ، وَجِهَتِكَ سَيِّدَةِ نِسَاءِ الْعَالَمِينَ، وَقَبْلَ ذَلِكَ مَا كُنْتُ
مِنْ بَلَاءٍ أَوْ طَالِبٍ يَجِدُنِي حِينَ نَزَلَ الْقُرْآنُ، فَأَتَاخِرُ عَنْ عَلَى أَنْ أُوَاعِي ذَلِكَ يَوْمًا

O Ali, indeed, that which I was promised has come to me. The victory is already here; the people have entered God's religion in groups and throngs. In fact, for me no one in the nation is more competent than you, because you have been long in Islam, and you are related to me as my son-in-law, with Fāṭimah by your side, the most noble woman in the world. And above all, you protected me from the calamity and unease

that befell your father, Ibn Abī Ṭālib, in Mecca when the Qur'an was sent down. It is pleasing to me to acknowledge his rights through his son.

Abū Ishāq Tha'labī has narrated this hadith in his commentary on the Qur'an.

After examining these 24 hadiths, Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd says:

You should know that we mentioned this hadith here for the sake of the many who turn away from Ali when they encounter his sayings in the *Nahj al-Balāghah*, which all include the blessings of God, Who assigned him as the closest to the Prophet and separated him from those who considered him proud and self-centered. Earlier on, some of the companions attributed these sorts of things to Ali. Some said to Omar: "Appoint Ali as chief of your armies when they go to battle." And Omar said: "Ali's desire is for a position much higher than this. His pride does not let him accept this minor position."

And Zayd Ibn Thābit said: "We have seen none more proud than Ali and Osama."

We now reach a commentary on Imam Ali's words where he says:

مَنْ الشَّارُوا الْأَصْحَابَ وَالْحَزَنَةَ وَالْأَنْوَابَ

which explains these hadiths, and is intended to indicate his status in relation to the Prophet. It attempts to clarify how if someone of whose attributes so much has been said were to ascend high into the heavens, and become proud before the angels and the prophets, there would be no blame on him, for he would deserve to be proud and be praised by all.

This is, however, an assumption, for how could Ali be proud of himself, when he is not a man of pride?

Ali was never proud, self-centered, or pompous; nor did he display such behavior in his speech and actions. He was ethical, had the fairest character, was generous by nature, and was most humble and thankful for any good he received. He was always cheerful and had a smiling face, so much so that one man called him a man of jest.

Cheerfulness and jest are attributes that differ from pride and selfishness. Now and then, Ali would do something similar to someone who tries to relieve a chest pain by spitting something out, or like a man expressing sorrow by complaining about something, or like a sad man who wants to be rid of his sorrow, but, undecided about speaking out about his sorrow, gives thanks to God so that the ignorant know what priorities God has given him. This sort of thing was to encourage people to do good, believe what is right, and prevent

evil, by giving precedence to another rather than himself. God, the Glorified, has forbidden the unlearned to replace the learned, for He has stated:

أَقْنِ يَهْدِي إِلَى الْحَقِّ أَشَقُّ أَنْ يَتَّبِعَ أَتَمُّ لَا يَهْدِي إِلَّا أَنْ يَهْدِيَ فَمَا لَكُمْ كَيْفَ تَحْكُمُونَ.³⁵⁴

...so is he who guides to the Truth worthier to be followed or he who does not guide unless he himself is guided? What is the matter with you? How do you judge then?

Imam Ali Ibn Abī Tālib was a limitless ocean with waves full of knowledge and wisdom, and those who kept him from planning and managing society caused irreparable damage and immense loss. Those who attained their position by usurping his place brought no more than ignorance, fear, and loss to humanity.³⁵⁵

Lack of Knowledge about Imam Ali's Lofty Position Was the Main Reason He Was Cast Aside

Abū al-Hasan has written beautifully on this matter:

يَا سَائِلِي عَنِ عَلِيٍّ وَالْأَمَلِيِّ عَمَّ بِهِ مِنَ الشُّؤْمِ مَا قَالُوا وَمَا فَعَلُوا
لَنْ يَرْفُوهَ فَتَادَوْهُ يَجْهَلُونَ وَاللَّهِ كُلُّهُمْ أَغْنَاءُ مَا يَجْهَلُونَ.³⁵⁶

O you who ask me of Ali, know that those who dealt coldly with him said nothing practical, nor did anything worthy of praise.

They knew not Ali, and this was why they resented him; they were ignorant of his state and position. People are usually enemies of what they know not. [That is, they cast Ali aside because of their ignorance of his talents.]

Imam Ali Divides the Meat of Seventeen Camels in Halves, Thirds, and then Ninths

It is narrated from commentary of *al-Badī'iyah* by Ibn Muqrī that three men who were disputing over seventeen camels went to Imam Ali. The first man said that half of the camels were his and the second one that a third of them were his, and the third man claimed one-ninth of them. They wanted to divide the animals among themselves, but each one's share involved a fraction. None of them wanted to divide a camel into shares after slaughtering it in order to settle the problem.

Imam Ali asked the men: "Would you let me add one of my camels to yours and then divide them for you?" They agreed.

Ali added one of his own camels to theirs, and then called the man who claimed half the camels and said: "Of the seventeen camels, eight-and-a-half are yours, so take nine camels from these eighteen as your share." He then said to the man who claimed a third of them: "You say your share is a little less than six camels, but now you can take six whole camels." He then turned to the man whose share was one-ninth of the total and said: "Your share is a little less than two camels, but now you can take two whole camels instead." So they all took their camels without having to divide one up: the first man had nine camels, the second one had six camels, and the third man had two. Moreover, there was one remaining for Imam Ali to keep as his own.³⁵⁷

Imam Ali's Quick Answer Regarding a Number Divided by Two up to Ten

In the explanation in Shaykh Bahā al-Dīn Āmilī's *Khulāsat al-Ḥisāb*, Hājī Farhād Mīrzā says:

It is written in Sayyid Ni'matullah Jazāri's *Zahr al-Rabi'* that a Jew went to Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib and said: "Tell me of a number of which its half, third, fourth, fifth, sixth, seventh, eighth, ninth, and tenth are complete, and not a fraction."

Imam Ali answered: "If I tell you, will you then become a Muslim?" He agreed.

Imam Ali said:³⁵⁸ "Multiply the number of the days in a week by the number of days in the years of your age."

When the Jew calculated this, and saw that the result was a whole number with no fraction, he embraced Islam.

Mas'ūdī has mentioned in his *Murūj al-Dhihab* that, after the Battle of the Jamal, Imam Ali entered the treasury of Basra with some of the Muhājir (Migrants) and Anṣār (Helpers) and caught sight of some gold and silver coins. His companions kept saying: "O yellow gold, cheat those other than me" (and "O white silver, cheat those other than me"). But Ali pondered over the coins for a while, and then said: "Divide these coins among my companions, and give each of them

five hundred *dirhams*." They divided them all up, without a single *dirham* left over.³⁵⁹

The distribution might have been achieved by calculation, but the total amount of gold and silver coins came to more than six million *dirhams*, of which Imam Ali was aware. This might have been a miracle on his part, because there was no way of knowing the amount, but he assigned a share to each of his companions through his knowledge of hidden truth.

This is similar to when Ali, at the beginning of his caliphate, instructed that each Muslim should receive three dinars. Ibn Shahr Āshūb has narrated that ‘Ammār Ibn Yāsir said:

When, at the beginning of his caliphate, Imam Ali climbed the pulpit and told us: "Stand up and walk among the lines of prayer in the mosque, and call out to the people to determine if anyone has paid allegiance unwillingly." The people raised their voices, calling out: "O God, we are all pleased to surrender and obey him; we will obey Your Prophet as well as the cousin of Your Prophet."

Then Imam Ali said: "O ‘Ammār, stand up and go to the public treasury and give each man three *dirhams* from it, and then put aside three *dirhams* for me as well."

‘Ammār and Abū al-Haytham went with some of the people to the public treasury. In the meantime, Imam Ali went to the Mosque of Qubā to pray there. ‘Ammār, Abū al-Haytham, and the others found at the public treasury exactly three hundred *dirhams*, and the number of people who were to receive a share was one hundred.

‘Ammār said:

جَاءَ وَاللَّهِ الْحَقُّ مِنْ رَبِّكُمْ، وَاللَّهِ مَا عَلِمَ بِالْمَلِ، وَلَا بِالنَّاسِ، وَإِنْ هَذِهِ الْآيَةُ وَجَبَتْ عَلَيْكُمْ بِهَا
كَاعَةُ هَذَا الرَّجُلِ. قَابِي طَلْعُهُ وَالزُّمَيْرُ وَغَيْلٌ أَنْ يَقْبَلُوا هَذِهِ الْقَعْدَةَ³⁶⁰

"By God, this is a true sign sent down by your Creator. By God, Ali did not know the sum of the money, nor did he know the number of people. But because of the appearance of this sign, obedience to this man has become incumbent upon you."

However, the story goes that Ṭalḥa, Zubayr, and ‘Aqīl did not concur.

Now, analyze and compare the vast knowledge, perception, and insight of the Imam of the Shi‘a with the knowledge, perception, and insight of the Imam of the Sunnis, the second caliph, who did not

know the meaning of the number eight hundred thousand, even though it was simple, with no divisions, fractions, or additions.

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd says that Abū Hurayrah said:

I had eight hundred thousand *dirhams* with me when I went from Abū Mūsā Ashʿarī to the second caliph. The second caliph asked me how much I had with me, and I told him that it was eight hundred thousand *dirhams*. He was surprised, and started repeating to himself: "Eight hundred thousand."

Finally he said: "Woe upon you, eight hundred thousand *dirhams*."

I began counting it out, from the first hundred thousand, then the second hundred thousand, and so on, until I reached eight hundred thousand. For him, the total number was huge and surprising.³⁶¹

Questioning Imam Ali on the Pulpit about the Inheritance of a Woman and Other Questions

Regarding questioning Imam Ali on the pulpit, Ibn Shahr Āshūb quotes from Ahmad Ḥanbal's *The Virtues of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib*, that Abdullah said: "In Medina, the wisest man one can ask about accounting and the correct assignment of an inheritance is Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib."

And Shaʿbī says:

مَا رَأَيْتُ أَفْضَلَ مِنْ عَلِيٍّ وَلَا أَحْسَبَ مِنْهُ، وَقَدْ سِيلَ عَنْهُ وَهُوَ عَلَى النَّبِيِّ مَخْطُبٌ:
عَنْ زَيْدِ مَاتَ وَتَرَكَ امْرَأَةً وَابْنَيْنِ وَابْنَتَيْنِ، كَرْتَصِيبِ الْمَرْأَةِ؟
فَقَالَ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: صَارَ لِمُتْنَاهَا سِتْعًا. فَلَقَّبَتْ بِالنَّبِيرَةِ³⁶²

I have not seen anyone more able than Ali in calculating the shares of inheritors and incumbents, or anyone better than he in accounting. While he was preaching on the pulpit, he was asked: "A man has died, and has left behind his wife, his father and mother, and two daughters. So how much is his wife's share of the inheritance left behind?"

Ali quickly answered: "In this case the woman's share of an inheritance is one-eighth, so it will be one-ninth." This is why it is known as the "question on the pulpit."

Ibn Shahr Āshūb then explains that the share for the father and mother is two of six, the share for the two daughters is two of three, and the share for his wife is one of eight. In this case, sustenance is needed for the woman, because the share for the woman—which is

three shares out of twenty-four—is the same as her one-eighth, and in this way it changes into three shares out of twenty-seven shares. And this is one-ninth of the total.

There then remain twenty-four shares: sixteen for the two daughters, and eight for the father and mother combined.

Imam Ali answered the question straight away, but he was asked how the wife's one-eighth can be one-ninth. However, according to the Sunnis who believe the maintenance will decrease the share of a woman to one-ninth, this depends on the person's religion, in this case Sunni. Or perhaps he wanted to ask how a command could be like this according to the religion of those who believe in sustenance for the woman. Therefore, he answered the question regarding the amount of the shares.³⁶³

Ibn Shahr Āshūb's intention is to show that according to the general opinion of the Shī'a, the question of sustenance is void. That is, in the case of the share increase, the woman is not affected, and she should get one-eighth as her right. A third goes to the parents, which includes eight shares out of twenty-four. The remainder belongs to the two daughters, that is, thirteen shares out of twenty-four.

The total shares of the wife, father and mother are:

$$\frac{1}{8} + \frac{1}{3} = \frac{3}{24} + \frac{8}{24} = \frac{11}{24}$$

The total shares of the two daughters are:

$$\frac{24}{24} - \frac{11}{24} = \frac{13}{24}$$

However, the Sunnis, according to religious duty, raise the obligation and then decrease the defect from the shares of all the parties. Therefore, in this example, they calculate the religious obligation according to the number twenty-seven. They allot three shares to the wife, and eight shares to the parents, and the remaining sixteen shares go to the two daughters.

Imam Ali issued this instruction for the satisfaction of the Sunnis, but not as the correct interpretation of his verdict.³⁶⁴ Our evidence for this is Imam Ali's strange and swift response, of which Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd says: "If someone is aware of the knowledge of the ritual canonical obligations and the amount of the shares in an inheritance, and after much thought answers Imam Ali's question, then he has, of

course, answered correctly. But what can we assume about one who answers immediately, without a second thought?"³⁶⁵

This takes us to where Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa Shāfiʿī, in *Maṭālib al-Saʿūl*, has compared this case to that of an ordinary mind, which he says has no relevance in this respect, for it is established for someone honored by God with knowledge and clear judgment.³⁶⁶

A Woman's Question Concerning Her Inheritance and the Question about the Dinar

Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa Shāfiʿī also mentions an example of Imam Ali's miraculous knowledge in the well-known question of the dinar. The story goes that there was a time when Imam Ali left his house and was about to mount his horse, when a woman approached him and said: "O Imam Ali, my brother has just died, and he has left behind six hundred dinars, but they have given me only one dinar of that money. So I beg you to be just to me by giving me my rightful share."

Imam Ali asked her: "Has your brother left behind two daughters?" She answered: "Yes, he has."

Ali stated: "Then two-thirds of this property—four hundred dinars—are for them." He then asked: "And has your brother left his mother behind?" She answered: "Yes." Ali responded: "One-sixth of it—a hundred dinars—is for her."

He continued: "Has your brother left behind a wife?" She answered: "Yes, he has." Ali said: "One-eighth—seventy-five dinars—is for her."

Then he asked: "Has he left twelve brothers along with you?" She said: "Yes, he has." Ali said: "Now, each brother must receive two dinars, and for you there is just one dinar. So you have received your rightful share, so go about your business."³⁶⁷

After saying this, Imam Ali mounted his horse and moved on. This matter is known as "the case of the dinar," and the description *masʾala al-rikābiyah*, which explain the occasion of the hadith.

However, in this case, Imam Ali also answered favorably to benefit the communal spirit of the Sunnis. According to all the Imams, fanaticism is not part of the Shiʿa school. It is said to exist in a case where, if there is some of the decreed inheritance left over from the total, the Sunnis divide it among the close relatives of the dead who are not rightful heirs. This is called *taʿṣīb*. This is exactly like this hadith where, after the main heirs, the mother and two daughters, and

the wife (who is next after the mother and the daughters), the remaining amount of 25 dinars goes to the siblings of the dead.

However, according to the agreed verdict of the Household, any of the remaining property must be shared among those who are more or less of the same status as the other main heirs after the wife and the mother. In this case also, a large amount goes to the two daughters. The wife gets her share of 75 dinars, that is, an eighth of the total amount, and the mother also gets her share, 100 dinars, that is, a sixth. The rest is divided between the two daughters, and they receive 400 dinars as their legal right, and are then given 25 dinars extra. Therefore, together they receive $212 \frac{1}{2}$ dinars, but nothing is given to the brothers and sisters of the dead.

Once again, our best observation and proof in this hadith (called *dināriyyah*) is the skillfulness, awareness, and vast knowledge of Imam Ali, who was aware of all the details of inheritance and how it should be divided, so that all the rightful heirs would receive the exact legal share, as well as other issues not immediately apparent. He was, of course, quite aware of the mother, the daughters, the brothers, and the sisters. He was so familiar with the matter that he could give the appropriate answers in the time it took him to mount his horse. Although his answer did not accord with his own opinion, it was for the benefit of the people, and to avoid contention by conforming with the verdicts of the earlier caliphs to which the people were accustomed.

Abū Shuʿayb Muḥāmīlī has related that Imam Ṣādiq said:

A man agreed to dig a well as deep as the height of ten men for ten *dirhams*. When he had dug the depth of one man's height, he became too weak to continue. They took the case to Imam Ali to determine the man's wage, and he said: "The initial amount of ten *dirhams* must be divided by fifty-five. One of the fifty-five shares is for the height of one man, two shares are for the height of two men, three shares for three men, and so on up to ten shares for the height of the ten men."³⁶⁸

The matter can be clearly explained. No matter how difficult the first part of the digging is, the second part is twice as difficult, the third part three times, and so on until the digging of the tenth part, which is ten times as difficult as the first. Therefore, the total amount of ten *dirhams* must be divided in this way:

$$1 + 2 + 3 + 4 + 5 + 6 + 7 + 8 + 9 + 10 = 55$$

Hence, one part of the fifty-five should be paid for digging the first part. In other words, the man should not receive one *dirham* out of the ten *dirhams*, because the most difficult parts were the remaining ones.

Of course, this kind of calculation would also depend upon the density of the soil, because areas where it might be softer or harder would then affect the wage.

Imam Ali's Prohibition of Urinating in Running Water or the Open Air

The hadith called Four Hundreds (*Arba' Ma'a*) mentions Imam Ali's saying the following:

وَلَا يَلِ أَحَدُكُمْ عَلَى سَطْحِ الْمَوَاءِ، وَلَا فِي مَاءٍ حَارٍّ، فَمَنْ فَعَلَ ذَلِكَ فَاصَابَهُ شَيْءٌ، فَلَا يَلُومُنِ الْإِنْسَانَ، كُنْ
لِلْمَاءِ أَهْلًا وَلِلْمَوِّ أَهْلًا³⁶⁹

"None of you should urinate in the open air or warm water. If someone does so and is then harmed, he must blame himself, because there are things we should care about in the water, and living things within the air that we should look after."

It has been proven that insects live in the air and running water. Urinating in the open air or in water could kill them, or at least damage them, and so it is enjoined upon us not to urinate there.

When cursing the enemies of Islam, Imam Sajjād would say:³⁷⁰
"O God, contaminate their water with cholera."

It has now been proven that some water contains cholera bacteria, but these words of the Imam were long before that discovery, either in the air or in water. This is similar to how his great-grandfather, Imam Ali, explained for us through a prophetic source how things exist in the air and water.

Muhammad Ibn Ya'qūb Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī have narrated through their chains that Aṣḥab Ibn Nubātah said:

The Master of the Faithful was asked about a man who was bitten on the head by another man, and who claimed that, as a result, he could not see clearly or feel anything, and had lost the power to speak.

Imam Ali said: "If this is true, he must be given three times the blood money."

They asked: "How can we find out if he is right?"

Imam Ali said:

If they claim that he has lost his sense of smell, they should present him with some pungent stuff such as pepper, onion, or the like. Then, if it so, nothing will happen, for otherwise he would turn his face away and tears would run from his eyes. As for his eyesight, he should stand in bright sunlight, and then if the claim is untrue, he will not be able to fully open his eyes. However, if it is true, his eyes will remain open. And if he cannot speak, his tongue should be pricked with a needle, and if the blood is red, it is untrue; but if it is black, it is correct.³⁷¹

As mentioned above, Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī narrated this hadith from Aṣḥagh, and in some copies of *al-Kāfi* it has been used as a reference. It has also been said that Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm discovered it and referenced these copies when writing his *Wasā'il*, and at the bottom of one of the pages it states that it is from Shaykh Ṭūsī and Aṣḥagh.³⁷²

Various cases involving Imam Ali are recorded in *Mustadrak al-Wasā'il* and *Biḥār al-Anwār* from *Maqṣad al-Rāghib*.³⁷³

Kulaynī, through chains from Muhammad Ibn Yaḥyā, from Ahmad Ibn Muhammad and some of his companions, back through Abān Ibn Othman, quoting Hasan Ibn Kathīr from his father, have all narrated that:

In a case where someone's eye had not changed in appearance and seemed to be sound, but he had lost the power to see, Imam Ali ordered a test. A man held up an egg and asked the claimant if he could see it, and if the injured man said he could, the man with the egg stepped back a little until the other could not see it, and placed a sign there. Then he shut the injured eye and let the sound one remain open, and the egg was brought closer to affirm whether he could see it. Then it was moved away until he could not see it, and the place was marked. The distance between the two marks was then measured, and after calculating the distance, blood money was assigned accordingly.³⁷⁴

In *Mustadrak al-Wasā'il*, from the book *Da'ā'im al-Islam*, it is related that Imam Ali said that if a man is hit and loses his sense of hearing, he must be paid the full blood money. But if he is believed to be lying, a sudden sound should be made in his presence. He should not be able to hear the sound unless he can actually hear.³⁷⁵

Similarly, in *al-Mustadrak*, from the book *Ja'fariyyāt*, it is narrated through the author's chains that Imam Ali judged a case concerning a man who was bitten and had a partial loss of hearing.

Imam Ali told him to cover his good ear while a coin was repeatedly struck against the ground. If the man could hear it, they gradually moved further away and continued striking the ground with the coin until he could not hear the sound, and the distance was then calculated. Returning to the initial position, he covered the other ear, and the coin was again hit against the ground and moved further away until he could not hear it, and the distance was again measured. If the two distances were the same, they would assume he was lying. If the first distance was shorter, his claim would then be accepted, and he would be paid compensation in accordance with the different distances by the standard measurement of *dhirāʿ*,³⁷⁶ having acknowledged that his hearing had been damaged.³⁷⁷

Shaykh Ṭūsī has narrated from Husayn Ibn Saʿīd, Hasan, Zarʿah, and Samāʿah, that Imam Ali had adjudicated on the case of a man who had bitten his slave on the head, causing him to lose the ability to pronounce certain words, although he could pronounce others properly. The amount of blood money for an adult man was to be divided into the number of letters in the alphabet, and the blood money was calculated according to this division. He was then paid according to the number of letters he could not pronounce properly.³⁷⁸

Sayyid Ibn Ṭāwūs has narrated from Muhammad Ibn Husayn Marzbān's *al-Majmūʿ*, that a certain man was taken to Omar claiming that someone had bitten him, and he had lost part of his tongue, causing his speech to change, but Omar was unable to decide what to do about it.

فَكَتَمَهُ عَلَىٰ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ أَنْ يَنْظُرَ مَا أَفْسَدَ مِنْ حُرُوفِ ابْتِثَابِ وَهِيَ ثَمَانِيَةٌ وَعِشْرُونَ حَرْفًا، كَوْنَهُ
مِنَ الدِّبْيَةِ يَقْدِرُهَا.³⁷⁹

However, Ali pronounced that the man should be tested to see how many letters of the alphabet he was unable to pronounce, and then work out the appropriate compensation due to him.

Kulaynī has narrated from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, from his father, through Ibn Faḍḍāl, then Sulaymān Dahān, quoting Rufāʿa as saying that Imam Ṣādiq said that during Othman's caliphate, a man from the tribe of Qays took another man, who was just freed from his master, to Othman and said: "This man slapped me on the face, and now water, not tears, is running from my eye. Although it looks intact, and there is no sign of injury or damage to it, it has lost the power of sight."

The second man said: "I am prepared to pay compensation for what I have done, but this man refuses to accept it, and claims that I should be punished in the same way." Othman did not understand how to judge between them. The man's eye looked intact, but it had lost the sense of vision, so Omar took both men to Imam Ali and asked him to judge between the two.

The man who had committed the act was ready to pay for the damage he had done, but the one who was assaulted did not accept it. They tried increasing the compensation by doubling it, but the man still did not accept, saying: "I seek nothing but his punishment."

Imam Ṣādiq said:

Just then, Ali asked for a mirror. He heated it, and asked for some cotton, which he dampened and put on the eyes of the man who had slapped the other. He then made him stand directly facing the sun, and told him to look into the mirror. When the man looked into the mirror, the tallow of his eyes melted, and without any apparent change in his eyes, he lost the power of sight.³⁸⁰

Explaining this hadith, Majlisī says:

In *al-Nihāyah*, Shaykh Ṭūsī says that the reason the wet cotton was placed on his eyes was to prevent his eyelashes from burning or catching fire. And when Imam Ṣādiq said that the man was made to stand in front of the sun, it seems to mean that the man himself was made to stand in front of the sun, but without the mirror, as it is written like that. However, some have said that he held the mirror up to the sun, and this is more likely than holding the mirror against the sun, and the man was then asked to look in the mirror.

It has been said in *Rawḍa* that if sight disappears while the pupils of the eyes are intact, as retaliation, some wet cotton must be laid on the eyelashes of the accused, and he must be kept standing before the sun while he looks in a hot mirror until his vision fades away.

The companions accepted that the aggressor should be punished in this way, and there is good evidence for this in the hadith of *Rufā'a*. Now, we should see what the intention of the author is where he says: "It has been said this judgment in this case"; is it his uncertainty about this verdict or it means that there is more than one way of discovering a cause of blindness that leaves the pupils intact.³⁸¹

Assigning Compensation for Shortness of Breath

Ibn Shahr Āshūb says that a man went to Imam Ali and claimed that someone had struck him so hard in the chest that he became short of breath. The Imam told him: "Breath is sometimes in the right nostril, and sometimes in the left. At dawn, it is in the right nostril until the sun rises." So they made the claimant sit from early dawn until sunrise and counted each breath he took.

The next day they made the accused sit from early dawn to sunrise, counting his breaths, which were found to be more. Therefore, after calculating the difference, the accused was ordered to pay for the number of extra breaths he had taken as compensation to the claimant.³⁸²

Imam Ali's Verdict Concerning a Man about to Be Punished Twice

Kulaynī has narrated from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, and he from his father, back through some of the companions, as well as Shaykh Ṭūsī from Ali Ibn Mahzīyār, back through Ibrāhīm Ibn Abdullah, and also Shaykh Ṣadūq from Abān Ibn Othman, quoting someone who had informed him from Imam Bāqir or Imam Ṣādiq, that they took to Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb a person who had killed the brother of an individual. Omar surrendered the man to the brother of the murdered man for him to deal with in his own way. This brother of the murdered man gave such a hard blow to the murderer that they thought he had killed him.

They carried the man's body to his house, but once there they realized he was not dead. Although he was close to death, he was still breathing, so they took care of him and he recovered after a while.

Later on, the man went out from his house to the road, and the brother of the murdered man seized him by the collar and said: "You are the murderer of my brother, and you deserve to die by my hands." The murderer begged him, saying: "But you have killed me once already."

The brother took the murderer to Omar, and Omar told him to kill him. They then left Omar, but the murderer kept saying: "By God, you have already killed me once." They were still arguing when Imam Ali happened to see them. The murderer jumped upon the chance, approached Ali, and told him the whole story. Imam Ali turned to the man who was ready to kill him, and said: "Do not rush into this, but allow me a few minutes and then I will resolve this."

After saying this, he went to Omar and told him that his verdict concerning the murderer was not correct.

Omar asked: "Then what should it be, O Aba al-Hasan?"

Imam Ali said: "This man was nearly beaten to death. So first of all, the brother of the murdered man must pay compensation for what he has done to him; that is, he must be beaten likewise. And then the brother of the murdered man should punish him for the crime he has committed against his brother."

The brother was told that if he wanted to punish the other man, he himself should first receive a similar harsh beating, and then he could punish the killer for his crime. After this was decided, he forgave the man and they both went away.⁵⁶³

Ibn Shahr Āshūb narrates the same ḥadīth in a similar way from Ahmad Ibn Āmir Ibn Sulaymān Tā'ī and Imam Riḍā:

A man confessed that he had killed the son of a certain Christian. Omar delivered the murderer to the murdered son's father, who struck him twice with a sword, believing him to be dead. When they took him to his house, they found that he was still alive, although the wounds took six months to heal. After getting his health back, he left his house and went outside for the first time. Suddenly the father of the murdered boy saw him and took him to Omar to ask what he should do with him. Omar said that the father could punish him, but the man went to Imam Ali and asked his opinion on the matter. Ali went with him to Omar and asked: "What is this judgment you made on this?"

Omar said: "It is a soul for a soul." Ali asked: "Has he not killed him once before?" Omar answered: "Yes, he killed him, but he is still alive."

Imam Ali then asked: "Must this murderer be killed twice?" Omar was astonished, and said: "So now you should judge between them as you like."

They left Omar, and on the way back, Ali asked the father of the murdered son: "Did you not kill him once?" He answered: "Yes, I did, but do you mean I should overlook the blood of my son?"

Imam Ali said: "No, I do not mean that, but a fair judgment would be that you first surrender yourself to the father of the murdered son, and he should do to you what you have done to him. Then you can kill him as retribution for killing of your son."

The man said: "That which you say, by God, means death, with no way of escaping it."

Imam Ali stated: "There is no other way, for this man wants his right, and he must punish you."

Then the father of the murdered son said: "If I surrender my right, he should forsake punishing me."

Imam Ali wrote a letter for them to the effect that they should accept his decision as fair, if they were both prepared to forgive each other. Later, when Omar got to know of the matter, he raised his hands to heaven, imploring:

الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ أَنْتُمْ أَهْلُ بَيْتِ الرَّسُولِ وَالْإِيمَانِ الْمُسْنِ أَمْ قَالَ: لَوْلَا عَلِيٌّ لَمَلَكَ عَمْرٌ.³⁸⁴

"All praise is for God, and you are of the Household of sympathy, O Abū al-Hasan." He added: "If it were not for Ali, Omar would perish."

Similarly, Ibn Shahr Āshūb has narrated from Abū al-Faṭḥ Rāzī's *Tafsīr Rawḍat al-Jinān* that at the time of Omar al-Khaṭṭāb, forty women went to him asking about the lust of men. Omar said: "A man has a small amount of lust, but a woman has nine times more." They asked: "So why is it that men can have permanent wives, plus temporary ones, as well as girl slaves to enjoy, if their lust is one-ninth of that of women? Whereas a woman cannot have more than one husband, even though you say she has nine times more lust." Omar had been quick to answer, but did not answer them properly, so he asked Imam Ali to respond to them.

Imam Ali told each of the 40 women to fetch a bottle of water, and then to empty the bottles into a big earthen pot. He then told them to separate their share of the water and show it to him. They said in surprise: "But the water is mixed, and our shares of the water cannot be recognized."

On seeing their confusion, Ali said: "If a woman were to have more than one husband, there would be no distinction between the children of the different men. The lineages of mankind would be confused, and one's heirs would fade away."

According to Yaḥyā Ibn 'Aqīl's hadith, it was just then that Omar said: "May God not let me live after you, O Ali."

Imam Ali's Verdict on Permission for a Woman to Remarry If Her Husband Is Impotent

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has narrated that a woman went to Omar, and expressed her plea by reading these three lines:

مَا تَرَى أَصْلَحَكَ اللَّهُ وَأَنْتَ لَكَ أَهْلًا 1
فِي قَاوِذَاتٍ يَتَلِ أَصْبَحَتْ تَطْلُبُ بَعْلًا 2
بَعْدَ إِذْنٍ مِنْ أَبِهَا أَتَرَى ذَلِكَ حَلًا 3

1. May God advance you, and enlarge your family. What is your verdict and opinion
2. About a young woman who has her own husband, but she is in such a state that she needs another?
3. After getting her father's permission on this matter, do you consider it lawful for her to marry another man?

All those who heard this disapproved and censured the idea of having a second husband.

But Imam Ali told her to fetch her husband, and she went and brought him. Ali told him to divorce his wife, and without further ado, the man divorced her at once. Ali then turned to those sitting around, and said: "This man is impotent,"³⁸⁵ and the man admitted that this was so.

Then, after the woman was divorced and the legal waiting period was over, she married another man.³⁸⁶

Abū Bakr Khārazmī says:

إِذَا عَجَزَ الرَّجُلُ عَنْ الْإِمْتَاعِ (الِإِبْقَاعِ نَحْنُهُ بَدَل) كَطَلِيقِ الرَّجَالِ إِلَى النِّسَاءِ.³⁸⁷

"If a man is impotent and cannot satisfy his wife, the woman has the right of divorce."

And Ibn Shahr Āshūb says:

In the case of a married woman who had an affair with a young boy,³⁸⁸ Omar ordered the woman to be stoned. However, Imam Ali said:

إِنَّمَا يَجِبُ الْحَدُّ لِأَنَّ الَّذِي جُرِّهَا لَيْسَ بِمُنْدَرِكٍ.³⁸⁹

"Indeed, this woman should not be stoned, but given (a hundred) lashes, because the affair was not with a mature man."

There is another narration about a married Yemeni who committed adultery in Medina. Omar ordered him to be stoned, but Imam Ali said:

لَا يَجِبُ عَلَيْهِ الرِّجْمُ لِأَنَّهُ غَائِبٌ عَنْ أَهْلِهِ وَأَهْلُهُ فِي بَلَدٍ آخَرَ، إِنَّمَا يَجِبُ عَلَيْهِ الْحَدُّ

"He must not be stoned, because he lives far from his wife and family. His wife is in another town, so he must only be given lashes."

Omar said: "By God, may I not live to address problems if Abū al-Hasan is not here, for I could not solve them."

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has also narrated from ‘Amr Ibn Shu‘ayb, A‘mash, Abū al-Dhuḥā, Qāzī, Abū Yūsuf, and Masrūq that they took a woman to Omar whom someone had married to restrain her from remarrying. Omar ordered them to be separated. He also asked for the dowry that the man had given her, which he sent to the public treasury. He said that it was not a real marriage and was unlawful, and such a marriage should never happen.

When Imam Ali was informed of Omar’s verdict, he said:

إِنْ كُنْتُمْ أَجَلُوا الشَّيْءَ الَّذِي نَهَى اللَّهُ عَنْهُ مِنْ فَرْجِهَا وَيَعْرِقُ بَيْنَهُمَا فَإِذَا انْقَضَتْ عِدَّتُهَا فَخَوَّ خَاطِبٌ مِنْ
الْخُطَابِ³⁹⁰ قَطِبَ هُمُ الرَّاغِبُ فَقَالَ: رُدُّوا الْجَهَالَاتِ إِلَى الشُّنَّةِ وَرَجِعْ عُمَرَا إِلَى قَوْلِ عَلِيٍّ.³⁹¹

If these two [the man and the woman] were ignorant of the tradition of the Messenger of God according to which they should not marry during the restricted time, then the dowry belongs to the woman and the man may sleep with her. However, as the marriage happened during the restricted time, they must separate until that time has elapsed. The man may then ask her to marry him.

After this happened, Omar announced to the people during a long sermon: "Whatever you have done in ignorance of the law, you should change to suit the tradition, and then continue in the correct way." Thus, he accepted Ali’s opinion and verdict.

Fiḍḍa’s Rejection of Intercourse and Omar’s Statement

This is the same as what Jāḥiẓ narrated from Naẓẓām’s *Futyāy*, where he says that ‘Amr Ibn Dāwūd quoted Imam Ṣādiq as saying that Sayyidanā Fāṭimah had a slave girl called Fiḍḍa who, after Fāṭimah was martyred, went to Ali as part of Fāṭimah’s estate, and he married her to Abū Tha‘laba Habashī, by whom she gave birth to a son. Abū Tha‘laba died after the child was born, and a man called Abū Mālik Ghaṭṭānī married the widow. However, her son from Abū Tha‘laba died shortly after as well, so she did not let Abū Mālik Ghaṭṭānī sleep with her.

Abū Mālik took his complaint to Omar, who was caliph at the time. Omar asked the woman: "O Fiḍḍa, why is this man complaining about you? Have you decided on something about which you have no knowledge? I find no reason for you to do this."

Fiḍḍa said: "O Abū Ḥaḥṣ, your thinking has misled you with diverse imaginations. My son, who was by another, has died. I wanted to cleanse myself by waiting the prescribed time for menstruation so that I would know whether there was a sibling of my dead son in my stomach, for if I had been pregnant, the child would have been the brother or sister of the one who died."

Omar said: "She is only a hair's-breadth less learned in religious jurisprudence than the children of Abī Ṭālib."³⁹²

Similarly, Ibn Shahr Āshūb has narrated from 'Amr Ibn Dāwūd, quoting Imam Ṣādiq as saying that when 'Aqabat Ibn Abī Aqaba passed away, Ali and some of the companions took their places in his funeral procession, with 'Amr also among them. Ali said to a man in the cortege: "Now that Aqaba has died, your wife is prohibited for you, so be careful not to approach her."

Omar said:

كُلُّ قَضَائِكَ يَا أَبَا الْحَسَنِ عَجِيبٌ، وَهَذِهِ مِنْ أَجْزَائِهَا يَمُوتُ الْإِنْسَانُ فَتَحْرُمُ عَلَى آخِرَاتِهِ

"O Abū al-Hasan, every decision of yours is strange, and this one is the strangest of all. How can a man die, and because of his death, a woman become unlawful for her husband?"

قَالَ: كَيْفَ إِنْ هَذَا الْعَبْدُ كَانَ لِعَقِبَةٍ، تَزَوَّجَ امْرَأَةً حُرَّةً، وَهِيَ الْيَوْمَ تَرِثُ بَعْضَ مِيرَاثِ عَقِبَتِهِ هَذَا صَاحِبُ بَعْضِ زَوْجَتَيْهِ الْفُتَيَاتِ، يُرْثُ الْمَرْأَةَ حُرًّا عَلَى عَبْدٍ مَا حَتَّى تُعْتَقَ وَتَزَوَّجَهَا.

Imam Ali stated:

That is how it should be. This man was Aqaba's slave and he married a free woman. And today, that free woman, because of the death of Aqaba, inherits something of his estate, because she is one of the inheritors. The husband's estate is somewhat less because he was a slave. But it is unlawful for a free woman to marry her own slave before he is freed, and then she can marry him.

Omar said: "In order to remove doubts in a case like this, which was unknown before, and about which we do not know the answer, and regarding things of which we have different opinions, we refer to you for the right solution."³⁹³

It is narrated from Aṣḥab Ibn Nubātah that five adulterers were ordered by Omar to be stoned, but Imam Ali changed the decision, having found a fault. He beheaded one of them, ordered the second one to be stoned, and gave lashes to the third. He ordered the fourth one to be given fifty lashes instead of a hundred, and the fifth one only a few lashes.

Omar asked Imam Ali about this, and Ali said:

The first one was not a Muslim and he could live in Muslim community in peace because he was paying the tax, but he committed adultery with a Muslim woman, so he failed in his compact with Islam because of his behavior. But the second one was a married man and had to be stoned. The third was an unmarried man and deserved to be lashed. The fourth man was a slave who had committed adultery, and a slave receives only a half of the whole punishment. And the fifth man was a senseless man who was mad, so by giving him a few lashes we corrected him.

Then Omar said:³⁹⁴ "I do not wish to be with a nation in which you are not, O Abū al-Hasan."

Imam Ali's Judgment Concerning the Expiation of Pilgrims Who Had Hunted an Ostrich's Egg

Ibn Shahr Āshūb has narrated from the books of both Aṣḥab Ibn Kūfī and Qāḍi Nu'mān, through Omar Ibn Ḥammād's chains from 'Ibādāt Ibn Ṣāmit, that a group of people in Shām decided to visit the Sacred House and set out for Mecca. On the way, while they were in the state of consecration, they came upon the nest of an ostrich where there were five eggs.

They took the ostrich eggs, boiled them, and ate them. But soon after, they suddenly realized: "Surely we have made a mistake, because we should have known that we took the eggs while we were in the state of consecration."

After they returned to Medina from their pilgrimage, they explained the whole story to Omar.

Omar said: "Go now and ask some of the companions of the Messenger of God if they know the solution to this. Ask them to tell you their opinions about it." They did as Omar told them, asked some of the companions, and received different answers.

Omar said: "As the companions of the Messenger of God differ in their opinions, we should do something else. There is a man here to whom we refer our misunderstandings, and then wait upon his opinions." Then Omar sent for a woman called 'Aṭṭiyah, and asked her to entrust him with her she-ass for a while. The woman sent the animal to Omar, and he mounted it and led the pilgrims to Ali, who was at Yanbu' at the time. Ali approached Omar and asked: "Why did you not send someone to summon us to you?"

Omar replied: "One must go to the judge for a judgment, rather than the judge going elsewhere."

The pilgrims then explained the whole story of how they had taken the eggs and eaten them.

Imam Ali said to Omar: "As they took five eggs, command them to allow a camel to mix among five young she-cameis, and after the females have given birth, send the young to Mecca to be sacrificed."

Omar said: "O Abū al-Hasan, sometimes a pregnant camel miscarries her young."

Imam Ali responded: "So it is sometimes with eggs that do not produce chicks."

Omar said: "We have been commanded to ask you a similar question."³⁹⁵

Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī has narrated this hadith in both his *Dhakhā'ir al-Uqba* and his *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara* in the following way:

Muhammad Ibn Zubayr said: "I entered the mosque of Damascus, and saw there a very decrepit old man with a crooked back. I asked him: 'O Shaykh, which of the Prophet's companions have you seen so far?'"

He answered: "I have seen Omar." I asked: "Have you fought alongside him?" He said: "In the Battle of Yarmūk."

I asked: "Please tell me if you have heard anything from him." He said:

I once made the ḥajj pilgrimage with some youths, and on the way we happened to find some ostrich eggs. Although we were engaged in the sacred pilgrimage, we ate them. When we brought up the matter of the pilgrimage rituals with Omar, the Commander of the Believers, we told him of this. He turned from us and started moving away, telling us to follow him, and we followed him until we reached the Prophet's residence. He knocked on the door of the chamber and a woman inside answered.

Omar asked: "Is Abū al-Hasan here?" The woman answered: "No, he is not. He has gone to Miqtāt."

Again Omar turned from us and told us to follow him. This we did, and we reached Abū al-Hasan and found him busy flattening out an area of dry, uneven earth. He greeted Omar, and Omar said: "These people ate

ostrich eggs while on the pilgrimage." Abū al-Hasan said: "Why did you not call me to come to you?" Omar said: "It was my duty to come to you." Then Ali Abū al-Hasan said:

بِضُرُونِ الْفَحْلِ فَلَا يَبْصُرُ إِلَّا بِهَكَذَا بِعِدِّ الْبَيْضِ فَمَا تَجَّ مِنْهَا أَهْدَوْهُ

"Let them gather as many male and female camels together as there were ostrich eggs, and then whatever young they produce should be sent to Mecca to be sacrificed."

Omar said:

فَإِنَّ الْإِبِلَ تُخْذِلُهَا ۖ وَالْأَيْضُ يَمْرُضُ ۖ

"Sometimes a camel miscarries her imperfect young."

Ali responded: "Eggs are also sometimes infertile."

Then Omar said:

اللَّهُمَّ لَا تُتْرِكْ فِي شَيْءٍ إِلَّا وَأَبُو الْحَسَنِ إِلَى جَنْبِي ۖ

"O God, do not entrust us with such difficult matters unless Abū al-Hasan is with us."

The religious law states that if someone engaged in the pilgrimage hunts an ostrich egg, he must sacrifice a camel in Mecca as expiation. Obviously, anyone who hunted an ostrich egg while on the hajj would have to send ahead for such a camel as expiation. Therefore, Omar expected Ali to say that the expiation for five ostrich eggs would be to send five young camels to Mecca. However, Ali reasoned differently, and his instruction was to send five young camels if five female camels produced them. Omar was surprised and said: "They took five eggs, but suppose there are less than five young camels and the amount of expiation is less than the number of eggs."

Imam Ali responded: "Of the five eggs they ate, it is not certain that all of them would have hatched, because some eggs are infertile."

It was because of this wonderfully precise reasoning that Omar said: "O God, please do not entrust me with such difficult problems unless Abū al-Hasan is by my side (to solve them)."

Similarly, Ibn Shahr Āshūb says that Ismāʿīl Ibn Ṣāliḥ has quoted Hasan as saying that Omar was told that some men had secret affairs with a woman, so he sent some men to her to come to him.

When the men arrived, the woman was frightened and miscarried her baby. The baby fell to the ground alive, cried for a short while, but died

soon after. The men went back to Omar and reported this to him. Omar asked his companions what he should do about this, and they all said: "Your purpose in this matter was only to punish the woman, but you wanted what was good for her. Therefore, you are not responsible for this."

Omar turned to Imam Ali and said: "O Abū al-Hasan, for the sake of God, tell me what your opinion is on this matter."

Imam Ali said: "If you think that this group has not exaggerated the case, and has come to you honestly, then they have all beguiled and misled you, and having explained their opinions to you, they have made a big mistake. The blood money for this deceased child rests with you, for it happened because of your mistake, and you are responsible for the consequence."

Omar said: "By God, you tell the truth and really wish me well. I beg you not to leave until you share the blood money among the sons of 'Adiy." So Imam Ali shared the blood money among the sons of 'Adiy, who were relatives of Omar.

Ghazzālī refers to this in *Iḥyā' al-ʿUlūm*, saying: "In this case, the obligation to pay expiation is with the Imam, for the woman miscarried her child out of fear of Omar."³⁹⁹

And Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd says in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*: "When Omar passed away, Ibn Abbās's opinion on the verdict of the heritage surfaced, for he had not revealed it before. And people kept asking him why he had not revealed it at the time of Omar."

In answer, Ibn Abbās said:

هَيْبَةُ وَكُنْ امْرَأَةً أَمِيَّةً. وَاسْتَدْعَى عُمَرُ امْرَأَةً لَيْسَ لَهَا عَنِّ امْرُؤٌ وَكُنْتُ حَامِلًا فَلَيْسَ لِي فِيهِ عَنٌّ مَا فِي بَطْنِهَا فَاجْتَهَضْتُ بِهِ جَنَابَتَهَا. فَاسْتَفَى عُمَرُ أَكْبَارَ الصَّحَابَةِ فِي ذَلِكَ، هَالُوا، لَا شَيْءَ عَلَيْكَ إِنَّمَا أَنْتَ مُؤَدَّبٌ هَلَّا عَلَى عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ: إِنْ كَلُوا وَاقْبَحُوا هَذَا عَشْرُكَ، وَإِنْ كُنْ هَذَا جَهْدَ رَأْيِهِمْ هَذَا أَخْطَاؤًا. عَلَيْكَ عَزْرٌ، بِعَنْ رَجَبَةٍ فَرَجَعَ عُمَرُ وَالصَّحَابَةُ إِلَى قَوْلِهِ ⁴⁰⁰

I was afraid of Omar, because he was a frightful man.⁴⁰¹ Omar summoned a pregnant woman to ask her about an affair. She miscarried the child out of fear of Omar, and the child died on the spot. Omar asked the great men among the companions what to do about this, and they answered unanimously: "You did nothing wrong. You did it only to correct her." However, Ali said: "If these people say this to please you, then they have completely cheated you. If what they believe is right, they

have made a big mistake and gone astray. Your duty now is to free a slave." Then Omar and the companions took Ali's decision seriously, and did what he told them to do.

Ibn Shahr Āshūb similarly says that it is narrated from Abū 'Ubayd in *Gharib al-Ḥadith* that Abū Ṣubra reported the case that follows.

Two men went to Omar and asked him how long a slave girl should wait after a divorce. Omar stood up from his seat and went over to a group sitting in circle, and pointing to one of them, asked him his opinion about it. The man answered "two" in sign language. Then Omar turned to the two men and told them that she should wait for two of her periods before remarrying. One of the men told Omar that they had come to him as the Chief of the Believers, to ask about a slave girl's divorce, and that instead of answering the question, he had consulted someone else. And to make matters worse, the other man did not answer directly, but did so in sign language.

Omar replied:

وَبَلَّكَ أَتَدْرِي مَنْ هَذَا؟ هَذَا عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ سَمِعْتُ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَقُولُ:
لَوْ أَنَّ السَّمَوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ وَجِئَتْ فِي كَهْدٍ وَوُضِعَ إِيْمَانُ عَلِيٍّ فِي كَهْدٍ لَرَجَحَ إِيْمَانُ عَلِيٍّ.

"May Heaven save us! Do you know who this man is? He is Ali Ibn Abī Tālib. I heard the Messenger of God say: 'If the heavens and the earth were in one balance, and the faith of Ali in the other, then surely Ali's faith would be greater.'"

Maṣqalat Ibn Abdullah has also narrated this hadith.

'Abdī, the poet of the Household, wrote:

إِنَّا رَوَيْنَا فِي الْحَدِيثِ خَبْرًا يَعْرِفُهُ سَائِرُ مَنْ كَانَ رَوَى 1
أَنَّ ابْنَ خَطَّابٍ أَتَاهُ رَجُلٌ قَالَ: كَرِّعْ عَلَيَّ الْإِمَامَ 2
قَالَ: يَا حَبِيبُ كَرِّعْ تَطْلِيْقَهُ لِلْأَمَةِ أَذْكَرُ قَاوِي الرِّئَاضِ 3
يَا ضَبْبِيهِ كَفَى الْوَجْهَ إِلَى سَائِلِهِ قَالَ: الْكَلْبَانِ وَالنَّعَى
قَالَ لَهُ: تَمَرِفُ هَذَا؟ قَالَ: لَا قَالَ لَهُ: هَذَا عَلِيٌّ ذُو الْمَلَأِ 5402

1. In the collections of hadiths, there is one for us all, of which other narrators are aware.

2. That hadith says that a man went to the son of Khaṭṭāb, asking how long a slave girl should wait after divorce.

3. The son of Khaṭṭāb said: "O Ḥaydar, how long does a slave girl wait after divorce? Do explain it," yet Murtaḍā gave only a sign,
4. With two of his fingers (meaning two). The son of Khaṭṭāb then turned to the man and said: "Two," and turned away.
5. And he then asked the man: "Do you know this man?" The man answered: "No." He said: "This is Ali, who has the most lofty and high position."

Sayyid Ali Ḥamedānī has narrated this hadith in *Mawaddat al-Qurbā*,⁴⁰³ and Khārazmī narrates it in *al-Manāqib*.⁴⁰⁴

‘Allāmah Amīnī narrates the complete hadith in *al-Ghadīr*, and from Ḥāfiz Darāqutnī and Ibn Asākar. It is also reported from Shaykh Ganjī in *Kifāyat al-Ṭālib*, p. 129, and he says it is authentic and established. Khaṭīb al-Ḥaramayn, Khārazmī, has it in *al-Manāqib*, p. 78, and Sayyid Ali Ḥamedānī has narrated it from Zamakhsharī in *Mawaddat al-Qurbā*.⁴⁰⁵

We should be aware that in the previously mentioned hadith from Ibn Shahr Āshūb, there was the expression "that man said to Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb," and that this man did not answer verbally, but with a sign. However, the expression "this man did not answer you verbally" is in Khārazmī's version, and means: "By God, I am not going to speak to you, because you say that you are the Commander of the Believers, but you then ask someone else, who answers you with two of his fingers."

Imam Ḥāfiz Ganjī Shāfi‘ī narrates through his chains that Sa‘īd Ibn Musayyib said that when Omar and Ḥudhayfat Ibn Yamān had a meeting, and Omar asked him how he was, he replied:

How do you believe I should be?

أَصْبَحْتُ وَاللَّهِ أَكْرَهُ الْحَيَاةَ، وَأَحِبُّ الْيَقِيْنَةَ، وَأَشْهَدُ بِمَا تَرَاهُ، وَأَحْفَظُ غَيْرَ الْمُحْلُوقِ، وَأَصْلَى عَلَى غَيْرِ
وُضُوْعٍ، وَلِي فِي الْأَرْضِ مَا لَيْسَ لِلَّهِ فِي السَّمَاءِ.

I have come through the night to the morning, and now I feel I dislike what is right and have a tendency toward sedition; I willingly or unwillingly bear witness to that which I have not witnessed; I have memorized things that do not exist; I pray without making the ablution; and I possess on the earth that which God does not possess in heaven.

Upon hearing Ḥudhayfah say this, Omar became angry, but as he had something urgent to deal with, he set off leaving Ḥudhayfah on his own. He had it in mind to punish him for saying such things. On the way he

met Ali Ibn Abi Tālib, who read the anger on his face, so he asked Omar: "What has made you so angry?"

Omar said: "I met Ḥudhayfat Ibn Yamān and asked him how he was, and he answered: 'I have come through the night to the morning, and now I feel I dislike what is right and have a tendency toward sedition.'"

To his surprise, Imam Ali said: "He has spoken the truth, because he dislikes death, which is an actuality."

Omar said: "But he said: 'I have tendency toward sedition.'" Again Ali said:

He is right.

يُحِبُّ الْمَالَ وَالْوَلَدَ، وَقَدْ قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى: إِنَّمَا أَمْوَالُكُمْ وَأَوْلَادُكُمْ

He likes his property and children, and God has stated: *Indeed, your wealth and your children are a trial.*

Omar said: "O Ali, he says: 'I bear witness to that which I have not witnessed.'"

And Ali answered: "He is quite right, for he bears witness to God's Unity, to death, to the Resurrection, and Heaven and Hell, though he has not witnessed any of them."

Once again Omar said: "But he said: 'I have memorized something that does not exist.'" And Ali said: "He is right, for he has memorized God's Book, which is not of the created."⁴⁰⁶

Omar said: "He says: 'I pray without making the ablution.'"

Imam Ali answered: "He is right, for he has offered peace and blessings to my cousin, the Messenger of God, without making an ablution, and blessing someone without the ablution is permissible."

Omar said, "O Aba al-Hasan, Ḥudhayfah said something even more shocking." Imam Ali asked: "What was it?" Omar replied: "He said: 'I have something on the earth that God has not in Heaven.'" Ali answered: "This is also right, for he has his wife and children, whereas God does not have such things."

It was then that Omar said:

كَذَبْتَكَ ابْنَ الْخَطَّابِ، لَوْلَا عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ⁴⁰⁷

"If it were not for Ali Ibn Abi Tālib, the son of Khaṭṭāb would die."

There is another similar hadith from Hudhayfah, where a man went to Omar with a problem, which Imam Ali later solved. The hadith is told by Ibn Šabbāq Mālikī, and at the end Omar says: "I take refuge in God for a problem I face, for Ali is not here to help."

Saīd Ibn Musayyib has been quoted as saying:

اللَّهُمَّ لَا تُعْنِي لِمَحَلَّةٍ لَيْسَ فِيهَا أَبُو الْحَسَنِ، وَقَالَ مَرَّةً: لَوْلَا عَلِيٌّ لَمَاتُكَ النَّجْمُ. ⁴⁰⁸

"Omar was in such a condition that he would say: 'O God, take my life if I face a problem and Ali is not by my side to help me solve it.' And once he said: 'If Ali were not here, Omar would perish.'"

Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd reports that a woman once went to Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb and said: "O Commander of the Believers, my husband goes on fasting for days and stays awake at nights to pray till morning. Although I see he is busy praying all the time, I am reluctant to complain about him."

Omar said: "But your husband is quite a good man." The woman repeated her words once more, and Omar answered the same as before.

Ka'b Ibn Sawr was standing nearby, and he said: "O Commander of the Believers, this woman is complaining about her husband's lack of consideration for her." It was then that Omar understood what the woman had in her mind, so he said to Ka'b Ibn Sawr: "I now put this case before you to resolve the problem." Ka'b said: "Invite her husband here."

They fetched the husband and Ka'b told him: "This wife of yours has a complaint against you." The man asked: "What is her complaint about? Does she complain of the food, clothing, or any of the necessities of life?" Ka'b answered: "None of these." Just then, the woman said:

أَيُّهَا الْقَاضِي الْمُحْكِمُ رَفَعْتُ إِلَى خَلِيلِي عَنْ فُرَاشِي مَنَاجِدَ
رَمَلَةٍ فِي مَجْتَبَىٍّ مَكُونٍ تَهَارُهُ وَلَيْلُهُ مَا يَرَقُونَ
فَلَسْتُ فِي أَمْرٍ أَشَاءُ لِمَعْنٍ

"O you who judge with wisdom and steadfastness based on your knowledge, my close friend and husband has taken the mosque instead of me—the prayer hall has taken him away from my bed. His constant praying has made him lose interest in me. Therefore, as a wife, I am not pleased with him."

Then her husband said:

رَمَعْتَنِي فِي فَرْشِهِمَا وَفِي الْمَجْلِ أُنِي أَمْرُهُ أَذْغَلَنِي مَا قَدَّرَ لِي

فِي سُورَةِ التَّنْزِيلِ وَفِي السَّمْعِ الطَّوِيلِ وَفِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ تَعْلَى جَلَّ

"The verses have made me forget about being a man and I live in forgetfulness. Reciting and pondering on the verse of *Naml* and the seven long⁴⁰⁹ chapters in God's Book have kept me from entering the ornamented bridal room, for there are many frightening verses therein."

Ka'b said:

إِنْ لَمْ تَخُطِّ عَلَيْكَ بِأَرْجُلٍ تُبَيِّنُهَا مِنْ أَنْ تَعْرِضَ عَنْهَا
فَأَعْطِهَا ذَلِكَ وَدَعْهَا فَتَكُنَ الْوَيْلُ

"She has a right, and it is upon you and every thinking person to give her right, so give her what she deserves and make no more excuses."

Then Ka'b Ibn Sawr said to Omar:

O Commander of the Believers,

إِنَّ اللَّهَ أَحَلَّ لِمَنْ الشَّاءَ مَتْنًى وَثَلَاثَ وَرَبَاعَ فَلَهُ ثَلَاثَةُ أَيَّامٍ وَلَيَالٍ يَنْهَضُ فِيهَا نَائِدًا وَلَهَا يَوْمٌ وَ
لَيْلَةٌ.

God has allowed man to marry four women. Therefore, he is allowed to stay with them for three days and nights to pray and thank God, yet this woman's right is to be with her husband for one day and night.

Omar said:

وَاللَّهِ مَا أَعْلَمُ مِنْ أَى أَمْرٍ أَنْجَبَ؟ أَمِنْ قَهْمِكَ أَمْ رَمَا، أَمْ مِنْ حُكْمِكَ بَيْنَهُمَا؟ أَذْهَبَ صَدْرُكَ
فَضَاءَ الْبُصْرِ؟⁴¹⁰

"By God, I do not know which of your two statements is more strange. I do not know whether this problem as you understood it is strange, or your conclusion. Therefore, I entrust you with jurisprudence in the province of Basra. So go there and take it under your control."

In *Arba'in*, Khaṭīb has narrated that some witnesses told Omar that they had found a woman they claimed had unlawful intercourse. Omar immediately ordered her to be stoned, but the woman cried out: "O God, You know that I am innocent!"

Omar became angry, and said: "What? Apart from having intercourse with a stranger, you claim that the witnesses are lying?" He then asked Imam Ali to investigate the case.

The woman said:

My husband has a camel, and I left home with it. The camel was not producing milk, so I took some drinking water with me to drink on the way. A man in our neighborhood also set out in the direction I was going, and his camel had milk. After a while my water ran out, so I asked the man for some water to drink. He refused to give me any water unless I had intercourse with him. I ignored him and we continued riding our camels for a while. It was hot and I was thirsty. I was on the point of dying of thirst. This was why I had intercourse with him for a bowl of water.

After hearing what the woman had to say, Imam Ali said: "O Heavenly God, the Most Great. Whoever suffers hunger and danger and consequently sins, should not be considered a sinner."

And on this basis, Ibn Isfahani composed the following short elegy:

لَا يَهْتَنُونَ لِأَفْتَدَى الْمَلْدَى لَهُ بِمَا بِهِ الْخُكَّانِ يَهْتَبَانِ 1
فِي رَجْمٍ جَانِبُهُ زَنْتٌ مُضْطَرَّةٌ خَوْفُ الْمَتِّ بِعِلَّةِ الْمَطْلَانِ 2
إِذْ قَالَ: رُدُّهَا قَدْ تَبَدَّدَا كَلَدَتْ نَحْلُ عَسَاكَرِ التَّوْبَانِ 3
وَبِرَجْمٍ أُخْرَى وَالْبَاعِغِ يَشْتَوِ قَاتِي بَقْعَيْهِمَا مِنَ الْقُرْآنِ 4
إِذَا بَلَغَتْ جَرَى إِلَيْهَا اخْتِطَا حَنْدَرًا عَلَى حَدِّ الْقَوَادِحِ خَصَانِ 5⁴¹¹

1. In any affair wherein the judgment was not clearly assigned, and there was something wrong between two decisions, Imam Ali judged it in such a way that there was no misunderstanding.
2. Such was the case of a woman who sinned due to acute thirst and hunger.
3. At the very moment that the Imam ordered her not to be stoned, but returned, they returned her very close to the time of punishment.
4. And such was the case of a woman who gave birth to a babe within six months, and Imam Ali proved her innocence by the Qur'an.
5. It was just as her sister was going to the woman in fear that her innocent sister might be chastised.

In his *al-Uyūn*, Ibn Qutayba narrates by quoting Madā'inī, that at the time of Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb, while Omar was leading the communal prayer, one of the congregation suddenly broke wind and interrupted the prayer. Omar heard the sound, and when the prayer was over, he turned to the crowd and asked for the guilty man to stand up and renew his ablution, and then pray again. But no one responded.

Then Jarīr Ibn Abdullah said: "O Chief of the Faithful, first you must tell yourself and then us to renew our ablutions and then repeat the prayer. In that case our prayers would be supererogatory prayers, and the prayer of the man who has broken wind would be his canonical prayer." After Jarīr had said this, Omar said: "May God bless you. You were a noble man in the Age of Ignorance, and now you are a jurisprudent for Islam."⁴¹²

Suyūṭī, in *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, from Kharāʾiṭī in *Makārim al-Akhlaq* by Thawr Kindī, has found that Omar Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb would walk around and guard Medina at night. Once, while at his post, he heard a man singing in one of the houses. He climbed the wall, jumped down on the other side, and went into the house. Straight away he noticed a woman sitting with the man, and there was some wine of different sorts in front of them. Omar approached and said to the man:

يَا عَدُوَّ اللَّهِ اَخْتَلَفْتَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ يَسْتُرُكَ وَأَنْتَ عَلَى مَعْصِيَةٍ

"O you, the enemy of God, do you think that God will hide your behavior, now that you commit sins against His will?"

The man said:

يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ لَا تَجْعَلْ عَلَيَّ أَنْ أَكُونَ عَصِيَّةَ اللَّهِ وَاحِدَةً مَعْدَ عَصِيَّةِ اللَّهِ فِي ثَلَاثٍ: قَالَ اللَّهُ: وَلَا تَجَسَّسُوا وَقَدْ نَجَّسْتُمْ وَأَقَالَ اللَّهُ: وَأَتُوا الْبُيُوتَ مِنْ أَبْوَابِهَا وَقَدْ نَسَوْتَ عَلَيَّ: وَأَدْخَلْتَ عَلَيَّ بَغِيْرًا ذَنْ. وَقَالَ اللَّهُ: لَا تَدْخُلُوا بُيُوتًا غَيْرَ بُيُوتِكُمْ حَتَّى تَسْتَأْذِنُوا وَتُسَلِّمُوا عَلَى أَهْلِهَا.⁴¹³

O Commander of the Believers, do not rush to a conclusion about me. If I have committed sins against God in one thing, you have done so three-fold, for God states: *Investigate not, however you have investigated*. God also states: *So go to houses by the gates thereof* (2:189), and nevertheless, you climbed the wall to enter my house. And to make matters worse, you have come to me directly, while God says we are not to enter houses without gaining permission first, and then we are to greet those inside.

Hence, the drunk man tried to put Omar to shame by referring to three Qur'anic verses, and make him leave them to themselves.

Tha'labī says that the man was Abū Miḥjan Thaqaḥī, and he said to Omar: "This action of yours is inadmissible, because God has prohibited this kind of investigation." Then Omar said: "Who on earth says my action is any kind of investigation?"

While they were arguing, a few men gathered around, and among them were Zayd Ibn Thābit and Abdullah Ibn Arqam, who,

after some thought, said: "O Chief of the Believers, in this case, Abū Mihjan is right. This action of yours is a type of investigation." It was then that Omar left and went outside.⁴¹⁴

Regarding this kind of dispute, one scholar said that it was very strange that Abū Mihjan knew the Islamic law and Omar did not understand what Abū Mihjan meant, until Zayd and Abdullah explained it to him.

It is said that Abū Mihjan was addicted to alcohol, which he always drank at gatherings. He composed an elegy of two lines about his condition:

إِذَا مِتَّ فَادْفِنِي إِلَى جَنْبِ كَرْمِي تَرَوِي عِظَائِي بِمَدْمُونِي حُرُوقَهَا 1
وَلَا تَدْفِنِي فِي الْقَلَادِ فَأَكْفَى أَخَافُ إِذَا مِتُّ أَنْ لَا أَذُوقَهَا. 2⁴¹⁵

1. When I die, bury me by a vineyard, so that my bones, after my death, may quench their thirst;
2. But try not to bury me in a desert, for I am afraid of not being able to drink wine after death.

The hadith shows that Omar was unfamiliar with the verse describing investigation and its religious significance until two ordinary men, Zayd and Abdullah, explained it.⁴¹⁶

Now, compare this and many other hadiths to the vast illuminating knowledge of Imam Ali, who was kept back from the caliphate and went to the surrounding fields to work on the land.

We have recorded some of Ali's unusual judgments, all of which accorded with the Qur'an, and to conclude our discussion there is one more hadith about him. We should pay close attention here to how he makes his decision according to the Qur'an.

‘Ayyāshī narrates in his *Tafsīr* from Abdullah Ibn Qaddāh, quoting Imam Ṣādiq as saying that his father spoke of a man who went to Imam Ali and said: "I have a stomachache." Ali asked him if he was married, and the man answered that he was. So Imam Ali said:

Then ask your wife to willingly give you some of her money. Then purchase some honey with that money, and add some rain water to it and drink it. Because I see what God has stated in His Book, when He says:

وَكُلُّ الشَّيْءِ مَاءٌ مُهَارَكٌ⁴¹⁷

And We send down from the sky rain (50:9–11). He also says:

يَخْرُجُ مِنْ بَطْنِهَا شَرَابٌ مُخْتَلِفٌ أَلْوَانُهُ فِيهِ شِفَاءٌ لِلنَّاسِ⁴¹⁸

...there issues from within their bodies a drink of varying colours, wherein is healing for men (16:68–69). He also states:

إِنْ طِبْنَ لَكُمْ عَنْ شَيْءٍ مِنْهُ نَفْسًا فَكُلُوهُ هَنَاءً مَبْرُورًا.⁴¹⁹

...but if they of their own good pleasure remit any part of it [the wife's dower] to you, take it and enjoy it with right good cheer (4:4).

Imam Ali then told the man that if he drank the mixture, he would, God-willing, get better. Imam Bāqir, the narrator of this hadith, says that the man drank it and got better immediately.⁴²⁰

And in the final part of the hadith in *Majma' al-Bayān*, it is narrated that Imam Ali said:

هَذَا اجْتَمَعَتِ الْبَرَكَةُ وَالشِّفَاءُ وَالْهَيِّ الْمُرِيُّ شُعَيْتُ إِنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى.⁴²¹

"When blessings, healing, and wholesomeness are together, a cure is possible, God-willing."

However, according to documented history, none of the other caliphs read the Qur'an accurately, and they generally referred to Ibn Mas'ūd, Zayd Ibn Thābit, and Obay Ibn Ka'b. Omar did this when he recited the Book to the Anṣār. As it says in the chapter of *Tawbah* in the Qur'an:

الشَّابِقُونَ الْأَوَّلُونَ مِنَ الْمُهَاجِرِينَ وَالْأَنْصَارِ وَالَّذِينَ اتَّبَعُوهُمْ بِإِحْسَانٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ وَرَضُوا عَنْهُ وَأَعَدَّ لَهُمْ جَنَّاتٍ تَجْرِي مِنْ تَحْتِهَا الْأَنْهَارُ خَالِدِينَ فِيهَا أَتَىٰ ذَٰلِكَ الْقَوْمَ الصَّغِيرَ

...The vanguard (of Islam) — the first of those who forsook (their homes) and of those who gave them aid, and (also) those who follow them in (all) good deeds—well-pleased is God with them, as are they with Him: for them He has prepared gardens under which rivers flow, to dwell therein forever; that is the supreme Felicity (9:100).

It is obvious that in this verse the word

الْأَوَّلُونَ

is the adjectival form of

الشَّابِقُونَ

and forms a statement, and

الْأَنْصَارِ

refers to the Migrants.

الشَّابِقُونَ الْأَوَّلُونَ

refers to both the Migrants (*Muhājir*) and the Supporters (*Anṣār*), and

رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ وَرَضُوا عَنْهُ

states that

الْمُتَابِعُونَ الْأَوَّلُونَ

and is also a predicate for

وَالَّذِينَ اتَّبَعُوهُمْ بِإِحْسَانٍ

Thus, the term

الْمُتَابِعُونَ الْأَوَّلُونَ

refers to the Migrants and Supporters as well as those who helped and were benevolent, all of whom were equally blessed by God.

However, when Omar recited the verse, he omitted

و

from between the words in

الْأَسَارِ وَالَّذِينَ اتَّبَعُوهُمْ

and simply read

الْأَسَارِ الَّذِينَ

He also read the word

الْأَسَارِ

with an upper vowel as

الْأَسَارَ

Therefore, he considered the word

الْأَوَّلُونَ

as the predicate or adjective for "the Migrant." In this case, only the first pioneers were specified and the Helpers were separate, but God was satisfied with them because they followed on. In this way it becomes clear that the Migrants had a status higher than others, and although the Helpers follow closely on, they are not of the same rank.

In *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3, p. 350, Hākim quotes Abū Salamah through his chains, as well as Muhammad Ibrāhīm Taymī, as saying the following:

Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb walked past a man and noticed him reciting:

وَالْمُتَابِعُونَ الْأَوَّلُونَ مِنَ الْمُهَاجِرِينَ وَالْأَسَارِ وَالَّذِينَ اتَّبَعُوهُمْ بِإِحْسَانٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ وَرَضُوا عَنْهُمْ...

Omar stood in front of the man and told him to stop reciting. The man stopped, and Omar then asked him: "Who has taught you this verse?" He answered: "Obay Ibn Ka'b taught me to recite so." Then Omar said: "Take me to him." They went to Obay Ibn Ka'b and they saw him sitting down and leaning back on a cushion while combing his hair. They greeted each other, and Omar said: "Aba Mundhar." He said: "Yes, what is it?" Omar said: "This man claims that you have taught him to recite a verse in a particular way." Obay said: "He is quite right, because I learned it from the Prophet, who recited it like that, and I do so in the same way." Omar asked: "Are you sure you learned it like this from the Prophet?" Obay repeated three times: "I learned it this way from the Prophet." Finally, he became angry and said:

نعم، والله لقد أتىني جبريل، وأمرني أن أجعل على محمد، فلم يستأمرني في الخطاب ولا أبنته

"Yes, by God, for God sent this verse as it is to Gabriel, and Gabriel brought it down unchanged to the Messenger of God. In sending it down, God did not consult with Khaṭṭāb or his son."

Omar left Obay Ibn Ka'b, and on the way back he raised his hands up and said: "God is the Most Great."

This same hadith is in *Tafsīr al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 3, p. 269; *Tafsīr Rūḥ al-Ma'ānī*, vol. 11, p. 8; and Suyūṭī's *Ālūsī*. In *Tafsīr al-Kashshāf* by Zamakhsharī⁴²² in reference to this verse, it is narrated that Omar heard a man adding the letter

3

to the word

الْهُمُومُ

reciting it as

وَالْهُمُومُ

He asked the man: "Who taught you to recite it like that?" He answered: "Obay taught me." Omar summoned Obay to him and asked him if the man was right. Obay answered: "Yes, he is right, because the Messenger of God taught me to recite this verse like that. It was when you were selling *qaraz* [the leaves from giant *salam* trees] in Baqī's graveyard."

Omar said: "You speak the truth. But you could mention that we were in the presence of the Prophet, but you were absent, and we helped the Prophet, but you did not, and we offered him a dwelling place, but you overlooked this." (This refers to the Quraysh of Mecca).

This was why Omar said: "I considered that we were in a position that no one would ever reach."

Moreover, Suyūṭī's *al-Durr al-Manthūr*; Qurṭubī's *Tafsīr*, vol. 8, p. 238; Zamakhsharī's *Tafsīr al-Kashshāf*, vol. 1, p. 408; Ṭabarī's *Jāmi' al-Bayān*, vol. 11, p. 8; Ibn Kathīr's *Tafsīr*, vol. 3, p. 444; and Sayyid Muhammad Ālūsī's *Rūḥ al-Ma'ānī*, vol. 11, pp. 8-9, all have the hadith where Omar took the man who was reciting the Qur'an by the hand and asked: "Who has taught you in this way?" He answered: "Obay Ibn Ka'b." Omar said: "Do not depart before I take you to Obay." They then set out to meet Obay, and Omar asked him: "Was it you who taught this man to recite the Qur'an like this?" He answered: "Yes, it was me. I taught him to recite like that." Omar said: "In fact, I thought that we were in such a lofty position that no one could reach us."

Obay said that the accuracy of this verse is confirmed by the Surah al-Jum'ah (chapter 62), which says:

وَالَّذِينَ مِنْهُمْ لَمْ يَلْحَقُوا بِهِمْ...

...others of them, who have not already joined them (62:3), and the Surah Hashr (chapter 59):

وَالَّذِينَ جَاءُوا مِنْ بَعْدِهِمْ يَقُولُونَ رَبَّنَا اغْفِرْ لَنَا وَلِإِخْوَتِنَا الَّذِينَ سَبَقُونَا بِالْإِيمَانِ...

And those who came after them say, "Our Lord, forgive us and our brethren who came before us into the faith" (59:10), and also the chapter *Anfāl*:

وَالَّذِينَ آمَنُوا مِنْ بَعْدِهِمْ جَاءُوا وَقَالُوا مَا كَانَ بِالْغَائِبِينَ...

...and those who believed afterwards, and migrated and struggled alongside you, they are part of you (8:75)

Moreover, Suyūṭī, Ṭabarī, Zamakhsharī, Qurṭubī, and Ālūsī have narrated on this verse from Abū 'Ubayd, Sa'īd, Ibn Jarīr, Ibn Mundhar, and Ibn Mardawayh, and from Ḥabīb Shahīd, quoting 'Amr Ibn Āmir Anṣārī, that Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb recited it as:

وَالسَّابِقُونَ السَّابِقُونَ مِنَ الْمُهَاجِرِينَ وَالْأَنْصَارِ الَّذِينَ اتَّبَعُوهُمْ بِالْإِيمَانِ.

That is, he pronounced the word *anṣār* with an upper vowel sound, and he did not add the letter

to *al-ladhina*. Then Zayd Thābit told him it was not *al-ladhina*, but *wl-ladhina*, but Omar disagreed. Zayd said: "Of course, the chief knows better." Omar then summoned Obay Ibn Ka'b, and when Obay presented himself, Omar asked him about the verse. Obay said: "It is *wl-*

ladhīna, not *al-ladhīna*.” Then Omar said: “All right, then we are going to recite it in the same way as you.”

NOTES

1. Ibn Shar Āshūb, *al-Manāqib* (Qum: Maktabat al-ʿIlmiyya), vol. 1, pp. 546 and 547; Sayyed Hāshim Baḥrārū, *Ghāyat al-Marām* (Tehran: Dār al-Ṭibāʿa Ali Qulī Khān Qājār, 1372 AH), p. 21, narration 40. He received this narration from Ibrāhīm Thaqafī and Sarī Ibn ʿAbdullah, both of whom have their own chains from Imrān Ibn Ḥaṣīn and Abū Burayda. This is related in *Knowing the Imams*, vol. 8, lesson 113.
2. Shaykh al-Ṭūsī, *Talkhiṣ al-Shāfi* (Najaf: 1383 AH), vol. 3, p. 78; *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 557, narration 28.
3. ʿAbdullah Ibn al-Ḥasan is correct, as in the next narration.
4. *Talkhiṣ al-Shāfi*, vol. 3, pp. 78 and 79; *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 557, narration 29.
5. *Kitāb al-Naqd*, p. 659, which Shaykh Ahmad Ibn Ali al-Ṭabarsī has in his *al-Ihtijāj* (n.p., Islamiyya, 1384 AH), vol. 1, p. 100. It explains how Salmān refused to pay homage and they twisted his neck and injured him.
6. Salīm Ibn Qays, p. 148.
7. *Amālī* (Najaf: lithograph, 1384 AH), vol. 2, p. 172; *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 298, narrations 26 and 27.
8. *Bihār al-Anwār* (Rawḍa) (Company edition, 1302 AH), vol. 17, p. 188; Shaykh Abbās Qumī, *Safinat al-Bihār wa Madīnat al-Ḥukm wa al-Athār* (Najaf: lithograph, 1355 AH), vol. 2, on the subject of

علم

(ʿalima), p. 230.

Here we introduce some of Omar's words about his usurpation of the caliphate, being the most learned among the nation, and then the priority of Imam Ali, in order to hear his claims in his own words and make everything clear to the readers.

According to the claim in Abdul al-Husayn Amīnī, *al-Ghadir fi al-Kitāb wa al-Sunnat wa al-Adab* (Tehran, Maṭbaʿa Ḥaydarī, 1373 AH), vol. 6, p. 269, from Ḥāfiz Āsimī in the book of *Zayn al-Fatā fi Sharḥ Sūrat hal Atā*, Abū Ṭufayl is quoted as saying:

I was present at the ritual service to pray over the body of Abū Bakr, and we then came together to pay homage to Omar. Several days passed during which we went to see Omar in the mosque, and this was so until they summoned Omar as the Caliph. One

day while we were sitting with him, a Jew, who was said to be one of the grandchildren of Aaron, suddenly entered the mosque. He stood before Omar and said: "O Commander of the Faithful! Which of you knows his Messenger better, and is most aware of the Book of his Messenger?" Omar pointed to Ali and said:

هَذَا أَعْلَمُ بِرَسُولِنَا وَكِتَابِنَا

(this man has knowledge about our Messenger and his Book). Then the Jew said:

أَكُنَّاكَ أَتَى عَلَى

"Is this so? Are you more knowledgeable, O Ali?" Ali answered: "Ask whatever you want." This goes on to the end of the narration, which is quite lengthy. However, this same Jew believed in him and embraced Islam.

But the great narration is the one that Ḥāfiz Nūr al-Dīn Ali Ibn Abū Bakr Haythamī has narrated in *al-Majma' al-Zawā'id wa Manba' al-Fawā'id* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Arabi, 1967), vol. 5, p. 211, in the section

حَقُّ الرِّسَالَةِ وَالشَّعْرُ لَهَا

where Ibn Abbās has quoted the Messenger of God stating:

وَمَنْ تَوَلَّى مِنْ أَمْرِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ شَيْئًا فَاسْتَعْمَلَ عَلَيْهِمْ رَجُلًا وَهُوَ يَلْمُ أَنْ فِيهِمْ مَنْ هُوَ أَوْلَى بِذَلِكَ وَأَعْلَمُ مِنْهُ بِكِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَسُورَةِ رَسُولِهِ قَدْ خَانَ اللَّهَ وَرَسُولَهُ وَجَمِيعَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ.

"And he who takes some of the responsibility for the Muslims' affairs and then assigns another man to take care of the problems of the nation, while there is another most knowledgeable one among the people, has cheated and been treacherous."

By examining these two narrations together, we can see how, according to the claims of Omar, Imam Ali was the most knowledgeable person among the nation, and Omar's taking responsibility for the Muslims was an open treachery towards him, and in addition, towards the Messenger and the whole of Muslim society.

9. In *Farā'id al-Simṭayn* (Beirut: Mu'assissat al-Mahmud, 1400 AH), vol. 1, p. 97, section 18, Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad Ibn Mu'ayyid Ḥamū'ī has related a narration from Naṣīr al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hasan Ṭūsī, by means of two chains—one from Imam Burhān al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Muhammad Hamedāni Ghazvīni, and another from his cousin, Imam Nūr al-Dīn Ali Ibn Muhammad Sha'bi—both of which are from

authentic chains from Abbād Ibn Abdullah, quoting Salmān Fārsī, who reported that the Prophet stated:

أَعْلَمُ أَتَقَى مِنْ يَتَدَيَّ عَلَى بَنِي أَبِي طَالِبٍ

"After my demise, the most knowledgeable and wise person among my nation is Ali Ibn Abi-Ṭālib." Khārazmī also has this narration in his *al-Manāqib* (lithograph), p. 49, and the formal edition, p. 40. It is also in Khārazmī's *Maqāt al-Husayn* (Najaf: Maṭba'at al-Zahrā, 1367 AH), vol. 1, p. 40.

10. Ḥakīm has narrated in

مستدرک

vol. 3, p. 135, through his own chains, that he said:

كَأَنَّهُمْ إِذَا أَقْبَضُوا أَهْلَ الْمَدِينَةِ عَلَى بَنِي أَبِي طَالِبٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمْ

"Our custom in discussions was that when we were talking stability in judgment, we would say: 'The most righteous, firm, and stable man in judgment in Medina is Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib.'" And after this narration he says: "This narration is correct, but the Shaykhs have not extracted it."

11. Ahmad Ibn Ali Ibn Ḥajar al-Asqalānī in his *Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb* (Indian: Dārī'at al-Ma'ārif al-Nizā'iyya, 1325 AH), vol. 11, p. 214, writes that Abū Ḥayyan Taymī and Yaḥyā Ibn Sa'īd Ibn Ḥayyān were from Kūfa.

12.

فَمَنْ خَالَكَ فِيهِ مِنْ يَتَدَيَّ مَا جَاءَكَ مِنَ الْعِلْمِ قُلْ تَمَالَوْا نَدْعُ أَبْنَاءَنَا وَنِسَاءَنَا وَنُفُسَنَا
وَأَنْفُسَكُمْ ثُمَّ نَبْعُولُ قَبْلَ لَعْنَةِ اللَّهِ عَلَى الْكَاذِبِينَ

And whoso disputes with you concerning him, after the knowledge which has come unto you, say (to him): "Come! We will summon our sons and your sons, our women and your women, and ourselves and yourselves, then we will humbly pray (to our Lord) and invoke the curse of God upon those who lie!" This verse refers to the Messenger's discussion with the Christians of Najrān who said that Jesus was the son of God. The Messenger arranged for them to discuss their claim with his closest ones, Ali, Fāṭimah, Hasan, and Husayn, present. But the Christians were afraid, and avoided the matter. And here, the point being made is that the Messenger considered Ali to be of one soul with him. Hence, God considers Ali to be as the Messenger himself.

13. Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad Bayhaqī, *al-Maḥāsīn wa al-Masāwī* (Egypt: Maṭba'at al-Nihḍat, n.d.), vol. 1, pp. 63 and 64.

14. bid. p. 7.
15. There are here some 25 lines of the elegy. The whole work is on pp. 250–52 of his book, printed by the Amīr Kabīr Printing House. In the *Majālis al-Mu'minīn* (Tehran: lithograph, 1299 AH), Qāḍī Nūrallāh Shūshtarī considers him to be a Twelve Imam Shī'a, and 'Abd al-Ghadīr, the son of Mulūk Shah Badvānī has explained in his *Mukhtalaf al-Tawārīkh* that he was a Shī'a, but did not declare it because of the Sultāns of Ghaznavī.

Sanā'ī demonstrates his sincerity to the Household in his *al-Hadiqah*, particularly with the following: "Sanā'ī sincerely and in all ways praises Ḥaydar, after Othman has gone, with the definitive words: 'The wrong disappeared and the right took its place!'"

He was exposed to the derision of the people of his time and the anger of the Sultan, because they could not put up with his apparent objection to Othman. It has been said that he was born in 463 or 473 AH and died in 525 or 535, and there are many documents saying that he was 62 years old when he died. His real name was Majdūd, and his father was Ādam, and this is why he is mainly known as Majdūd Ibn Ādam, with the title Abū al-Majd. Amīr Dawlat Shāh Samarqandī has explained in the *Tadhkirat al-Shu'arā* (lithograph) that he was one of the greatest men of religion of his time. The widely known Mawlānā Jalāh al-Dīn considered himself a follower of Shaykh Sanā'ī, and he wrote: "Aṭṭar was the spirit and Sanā'ī his two eyes, and we appeared after those two: Sanā'ī and Aṭṭar."

16. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 258.
17. Ibid.
18. Ibid.
19. Ibid.
20. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 258 and 259.
21. Ibid.
22. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib* vol. 1, p. 259.
23. It says in the annotations that Majlisī states after the narration in his book *Biḥār al-Anwār* that the term

كاذب

means "to lie." This is strange, as it is said that it must be about

مصدق

He then quotes Ibn al-Athīr al-Jazarī as saying in *al-Nihāyah fi Gharīb al-Ḥadīth wa al-Athar* (Qum: Mu'assisah Ismā'īliyyah, 1367 AH) that ʿOmar's words were:

أَعُوذُ بِاللّٰهِ مِنْ كُلِّ مَعْضَلٍ لَيْسَ لَهَا أَبُو حَسَنٍ

He goes on until the discussion continues by saying that the term

المعضية

rhyming with

عضه

means "lying" or "astonishing," as explained in *al-Nihāyah* in the narration concerning paying homage:

I did not find such a meaning for

لَا يَعْضُهُ بَعْضُنَا بِمَعْضَايَ لَا يَرِيهِ بِالْمَعْضِيَةِ

other than in Jazarī.

24. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib* vol. 1, p. 259.
25. Ibid.
26. Ibn Asākar has this narration in *Tārikh al-Damishq* (Beirut: Dār al-Taʿāruf lil-Maṭbūʿāt, 1395 AH), ed. M. Bāqir Mahmudi, the section on Imam Ali, part 3, p. 39, narration 1071.
27. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 260.
28. *al-Maḥāsīn wa al-Masāwī*, vol. 1, pp. 65–66.
29. Muḥaddith Qumī, *Ḥadīyyat al-Aḥbāb* (Najaf: Maṭbaʿat al-Murtaḍawīyya, lithography, 1349 AH), p. 199, translated from Aṭṭār.
30. This was said by Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd about Imam Ali.
31. Ḥāfiz, *Dīwān* (1318 AH), ed. H. Pejmān, pp. 137–38.
32. The second part of verse 189, Surat al-Baqarah.
33. Faḍl Ibn Hasan Ṭabarsī, *Majmaʿ al-Bayān* (Ṣaydā: Maṭbaʿat al-ʿIrfān, 1333 AH), vol. 1, p. 284.
34. Muhammad H. Ṭabāṭabāʾī, *al-Mizān fi Tafsīr al-Qurʾān* (n.p, Islamiyya, 1386 AH), vol. 2, p. 59.
35. Sulṭān Muhammad Janābidhī, *Tafsīr Bayān al-Saʿādah fi Maqāmāt al-ʿIbād* (lithograph), p. 97.
36. Part 1, p. 117, of the commentary published under the name of al-Shaykh al-Akbar al-Ārif bi Allah Muḥy al-Dīn Ibn Arabī. However, our great master ʿAllāmah Ṭabāṭabāʾī says that the late Ḥajj Mīrzā Ali Qāḍī has stated that this commentary belongs to Mullā ʿAbd al-Razzāq Kāshānī, because the phraseology is not that of Ibn al-Arabi.

Our own opinion is that whatever is in Mulla ʿAbd al-Razzāq Kāshānī's commentary is similar to this narration. A good proof of this is from the commentary of Kāshānī, where

وَلَا تَتَمَوَّأُوا فَضَّلَ إِلَهُكُمْ بِهِمْ عَلَى بَعْضِ

is mentioned word for word.

37. Ibn Shahr Āshūb has related this narration in *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 261, from Imam Bāqir and Imam Ali in the comments on the verses below:

وَلَيْسَ الْبِرُّ بِأَنْ تَأْكُلُوا الْحَبُوتَ

and

وَإِذْ قُلْنَا ادْخُلُوا هَذِهِ الْقَرْيَةَ

However, for the phrase

فَمَنْ تَابَعَنَا

they put

فَمَنْ تَابَعَنَا

in their comments.

38. *Tafsir al-Burhān*, lithograph, vol. 1, p. 119.
 39. All these elegies are by Khājah Ḥāfiz Shīrāzī, in whose book there are many different lyrics on a similar theme.
 40. Mawlawī Rūmī, *Masnavī* (Tehran: Intishārāt Javidān, 1371), vol. 1, p. 98.
 41. Iṣbahānī appears to be Ibn Ṭabāṭabā Iṣbahānī (b. 212, d. circa 320), whose biography is in *al-Ghadir*, vol. 3, p. 347. His *Ghadiriyyah* is as follows:

ما بهال عينك نزه الأجفان عبري المحاط سقيمه الانسان
 صلى الإله على ابن عم محمد منه صلوة تنمذ بمحان
 وله إذا ذكر القدير فضيلة لمرتسها مدامت الملوان
 قام النبي له بشرح ولا يؤزل الكتاب بهامن الذمان

The above-mentioned elegy is apparently a part of this one. It is not clear that this Iṣbahānī is Ibn Ṭabāṭabā Iṣbahānī (d. 322),

and his circumstances have been explained in *al-Ghadir*, vol. 3, p. 340.

42. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, lithograph, vol. 1, p. 261.

43. *Ibid.*, pp. 261–62.

44. Bashnawī Kurdī (d. 1380 AH) was the same Abū ‘Abd Husayn Ibn Dāwūd Kurdī, from the Kurdistan of Iraq. He was one of the poets who praised the Prophet’s Household, and was well known for his elegies about them. Ibn Shahr Āshūb has a good biography of him in the *Ma‘ālim al-‘Ulamā*. He composed several elegies called *Ghadiriyyah*, among which is:

وقد شهدوا عهد القدير وانفقوا مقال رسول الله من غير كتمان
أنت هم أولى من الناس كلهم فقالوا: بلى بأفضل الإنس والجن

It continues:

وشال بعطديه وقال وقد صنى إلى القول أقصى القوم بالله والدين
على أنسى لافرق بيني وبينه كما روى من موسى الكليم ابن عمران
ووارث علمي والخليفة في غدٍ على اتقى بهدى إذا زرت جثمانى

al-Ghadir, vol. 4, p. 35. The middle verse is in *al-Manāqib* of Ibn Sharh Āshūb, vol. 1, p. 262.

45. Ibn Sharh Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 261–62.

46. *Ibid.*, 262.

47. *Ibid.*

48. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 4, p. 40, in a lengthy elegy which begins with

قالت

and ends in question form. The other part of each verse responds with

قلت

and they are all about the status of Imam Ali, and altogether there are 25. We mentioned some of them in vol. 10, lessons 149 and 150.

49. Ibn Sharh Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 261 and 262.

50. *Ibid.*

51. *Ibid.*

52. *Ibid.*; the first one is also in Ḥimyarī’s poetic works, p. 58.

53. *Ibid.*

54. Ibn Ṣabbagh Mālikī has referred to the following words of the Messenger as a proof and witness:

فصارت الحكمة من أفاضله ^{والمعطة}، والعلوم الظاهرة والباطنة بفوايده مرتبطة، ليرتد بحار العلوم تتجبر من صدره، ^{ويعلم} ^{أخبارها} حتى قال (ص) أنا مدينة العلم وعلي بابها

55. See *al-Fuṣūl al-Muḥmmah* (Najaf: Maṭbaʿat al-ʿAdī, n.d.), p. 18.
 56. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, section 29, p. 520, the first Sunni narration; Ibn Maghāzili, *al-Manāqib* (Tehran: Maktaba Islamiyyah, 1394 AH), p. 80, narration 120, where he introduces the narrator as ʿAbd al-Rahmān Ibn Bahman. See also Suyūṭī's *al-Laʾālī al-Maṣnūʿah* (Beirut: n.p., 1395 AH), vol. 1, p. 330.
 57. Ibn al-Maghāzili, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 548–49.
 58. Jalāl al-Dīn Suyūṭī, *Jāmiʿ al-Ṣaḡīr* (n.p: Maṭbaʿ al-Muṣṭafa al-Bābī, n.d.), section on the letter

عين

p. 66.

59. Ibn Asākar, *Tārikh al-Damishq*, section of Imam Ali's life-history. According to one narration, this is mentioned under the entry of *al-Imam Muhājir* by Muhammad Ḍiyā' Shahāb and Abdullah Ibn Noah, which is about Ahmad Ibn ʿIsā Muhammad Ibn al-ʿArīḍī Ibn al-Imam Jaʿfar Ṣādiq. See also *Tārikh al-Damishq*, p. 154, quoting Jābir.
 60. This book is mentioned in the *Yanābiʿ al-Mawaddah* by Sulaymān Ibn Ibrāhīm Qundūzī, first edition (Istanbul, 1301) p. 250, and second edition (Najaf, 1384), p. 296.
 61. Mullā Ali Hindī has narrated it from Jābir in the second edition of *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl* (Ḥaydarābād: Dāʾirat al-Maʿārif al-Uthmaniyya, 1378 AH), p. 203, p. 12.
 62. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 520, narrative 2, and narratives 4, 5, 8, and 9 from the Sunnis. See also Ibn Maghāzili, *Tārikh al-Damishq*, pp. 81–83, narrations 121, 123, and 124.
 63. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 520, narrative 3 from the Sunnis, and Ibn al-Maghāzili, *al-Manāqib*, p. 82, narration 122.
 64. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 520, narrative 7 from the Sunnis, and p. 522, narrative 4 from the Sunnis; and Ibn al-Maghāzili, *al-Manāqib*, p. 85, narration 126, where there is the phrase

وعلى بابها.

65. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 521, narrative 10 from the Sunnis.
 66. Ibid., p. 520, narrative 11 from the Sunnis.
 67. Ibid., p. 521, narrative 12 from the Sunnis.

68. Ibid., p. 521, narrative 1 from the Sunnis.
69. Ibid., pp. 521–22, narrative 2 from the Sunnis.
70. Ibid., p. 522, narrative 3 from the Sunnis.
71. Ibid., p. 522, narrative 5 from the Sunnis.
72. Ibid., p. 522, narrative 6 from the Sunnis; see also *Amāli*, under the section of

وهو غيجه علم رسول الله.

73. Ibid., pp. 522–23, narration 7 from the Sunnis.
74. Surat 21, verse 7 also states:

فَاتَّبِعُوا أَمْرَ الذِّكْرِ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ تُحِبُّونَ
وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا قَبْلَكَ إِلَّا رِجَالًا نُوْحِي إِلَيْهِمْ.

75. Ḥākim Ḥaskānī, *Shawāhid al-Tanzīl li Qawā'id al-Taḥṣīl* (n.p., Majma' Ihyā' Thiqāfat al-Islamiyya, 1411 AH) vol. 1, section 82, p. 334, narration 459.
76. *Shawāhid al-Tanzīl*, vol. 1, section 8, pp. 80–81. Also, Shaykh al-Islam Ḥamū'ī, in *Farā'id Simṭayn*, vol. 1, p. 98, narration 68, states that the following is in this narration:

فَمَنْ أَرَادَ بِهَا فَلْيَاتِ عَلِيَّ

“So whoever seeks after knowledge should follow Ali.”

In *al-La'ālī' al-Maṣnū'a*, vol. 1, pp. 329–30, Suyūṭī gives five narrations related from Abū Mu'awīyah, back through A'mash, quoting Mujāhid from Abbās, with the same sense and meaning. On pages 334–35 he reports two other narrations in the same words from Ḥārith and 'Āṣim Ibn Ḍamara from Imam Ali. Aṣbagh Ibn Nubātah has also narrated the same from Imam Ali. It is also narrated in *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 15, p. 129; Khārazmī also has it in his *al-Manāqib* (lithograph), p. 40. Khaṭīb also has the same narration in the *Tārikh al-Baghdad*, vol. 11, pp. 304–5, by means of two documents. Moreover, Ṭabrānī has narrated it through his own chains in *Mu'jam Kabīr* (Beirut: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-Arabi, n.d.) from the *Musnad* of Abbās, vol. 3, p. 110. Ibn Asākar has narrated it in the *Tārikh Damishq* on Imam Ali, part 2, p. 470, narrations 990, 991, and 992, through his chains from Abū Ṣālt Harawī. 'Abd al-Salām Ibn Ṣāliḥ has also narrated it, and it is also in Sanābijī's narration 984 from Imam Ali, and also in narrations 985, 986, 988, 989, and 993 to 998. Ibn Athīr has also narrated it in the *Uṣd al-Ghābah* (Beirut: Dār Ihyā' al-Turāth al-Arabi), vol. 4, p. 22.

77. *Shawāhid al-Tanzil*, vol. 1, pp. 81–83. The first part from Imam Ali is in *Tārikh al-Damishq*, part two, p. 464, narration 984, and Abū Naʿīm Isfahani from Imam Ali in *Maʿrifat al-Ṣaḥāba*, p. 22, and Ibn Kathīr *Damishqī* in *al-Bidāyat wa al-Nihāyah fi Tārikh* (Egypt: Maṭbaʿa, 1351 AH) vol. 7, p. 358.
78. *Shawāhid al-Tanzil*, vol. 1, pp. 81–83.
79. *Ibid.*, vol. 1, pp. 81–83.
80. *Shawāhid al-Tanzil*, vol. 2, section 181, pp. 72–74, narration 1009.
81. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 523, section 31, narration 1 from the Shiʿa; *al-Manāqib* of Ibn Maghāzili, p. 86, narration 127 (this narration has been explained).
82. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 523, section 32 from the Sunnis.
83. *Ibid.*; he has the second narration concerning Imam Ali in *Tārikh al-Damishq*, vol. 2, p. 457, narration 982.

In *Tārikh al-Damishq*, vol. 2, pp. 457–58, concerning Imam Ali, from Ibn Asākar's book with his chains from Ajlaḥ Ibn Abdullah Kindī, it is related that he said:

I heard from Zayd Ibn Ali, Abdullah Ibn Hasan, Jaʿfar Ibn Muhammad, and Muhammad Ibn Abdullah Ibn Hasan that when they mentioned the names of the martyrs, they would mention them along with the martyrs among the companions of the Messenger and those of Imam Ali. All those who understood this would narrate from their forefathers that the Messenger had said:

إِن عَلِيًّا آيَةُ الْجَنَّةِ وَذُلِيلُهَا فَمَنْ لِي بِتَبِعِهِ ضَلَّ عَنْ طَرِيقِ الْجَنَّةِ

"Ali is the sign and the guide of Paradise, so whoever obeys him will not lose the Gate of Paradise." I have also heard from someone else who mentioned their names, among whom was ʿAmr Ibn Hamaq Khazākh, who said that the Prophet had told him:

إِي غَمْرُوا أَتُحِبُّ أَنْ أُرِيكَ آيَةَ الْجَنَّةِ؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، فَمَرَّ عَلِيٌّ فَقَالَ: هَذَا وَقَوْمُهُ آيَةُ الْجَنَّةِ

"O ʿAmr, would you like to see a sign of Paradise?" He said: "Yes, O Messenger of God." Just then Ali was passing by, so he said: "This man and his Household are the signs of Paradise."

84. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 523, section 32, narration 1 from the Sunnis; in Ibn Maghāzili's *al-Manāqib*, pp. 86 and 87, narration 128, there is the phrase:

أَنَا مَدِينَةُ الْمَكَّةِ

and he has recorded it with the same phrase in *Lisān al-Mizān*, vol. 4, p. 144.

85. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, section 33, narration 2 from the Sunnis; *Tārikh al-Damishq*, the narration of Imam Ali, vol. 2, p. 459.
86. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, section 33, narration 2 from the Sunnis; *Farā'id al-Simā'ayn*, vol. 1, p. 99, narration 68; *al-La'āl al-Maṣnū'a*, vol. 1, pp. 328–29 with chains from Zāghūnī and Abū Ahmad.
87. The narration concerning Imam Ali, vol. 2, p. 459, narration 983; Abū Naṣīm Ahmad Ibn Abullah Isfahani, *Ḥilliyat al-Awliyā' wa Ṭabaqāt al-Aṣfiyā'* (Egypt: Maṭba'at al-Khānjī, 1351 AH), vol. 1, p. 64; *al-La'āl al-Maṣnū'a*, vol. 1, p. 329.
88. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, section 33, narration 4 from the Sunnis; Ibn Maghāzilī, *al-Manāqib*, p. 87, narration 129.
89. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, section 34, narration 1.
90. *Ibid.*, section 34, narration 2.
91. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, pp. 523–24, section 34.
92. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, vol. 2, p. 524, section 34, narration 4.
93. *Ibid.*, narration 5.
94. This narration is in *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 15, p. 129, and in the *Musnad* of Ali Tirmidhī and Ibn Jarīr. Both are from Ismā'īl Ibn Mūsā, quoting Muhammad Ibn Omar Rūmī from Sharīk, back to Salmat Ibn Kuhayl, through Suwayd Ibn Ghafila, from Sanābijī, from Imam Ali.
95. *al-La'āl al-Maṣnū'a*, p. 329.
96. *al-La'āl al-Maṣnū'a*, vol. 1, p. 335; *Kanz al-'Ummāl*, vol. 6, p. 156, from Daylamī, from Abūdhār Ghaffārī; see also Ismā'īl Muhammad 'Ajlūnī Jarrāhī, *Kashf al-Khifā*, vol. 1, p. 204.
97. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 3, pp. 92–101; vol. 6, pp. 58–355; and vol. 7, pp. 197–99.
98. Abū Abdullah Shams al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Ali Hawārī Mālikī Andulusi Naḥwī (698–780 AH) was from Marriyyah, and was known as Ibn Jābir A'mā. He was a great poet, writer, historian, and grammarian. The details of his biography, education, and teachings are in *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, p. 350.
99. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, p. 58.
100. *al-muttafiq* and *al-muftariq* in the nominative case are expressions in 'ilm al-dirāya, where *al-muttafiq* is a noun and *al-muftariq* refers to a person. See Shahīd Thānī, *al-Dirāya*.
101. Ibn Farīd was a high-ranking Islamic mystic and the student and contemporary of Ibn al-Arabī who lived in the seventh century. Ibn Farīd composed elegies on Islam and morality, and the stations of man and his perfection, which are peerless examples of Arabic poetry.

There are a great many accounts written about the poems of Ibn Farīd, among which is one from Shaykh Hasan Būrīnī and Shaykh ʿAbd al-Ghabī Nāblusī in *Nazm al-Sulūk*. There is also that of Mulla ʿAbd al-Razzāq Kāshārī in the *Kashf al-Wujūh al-Ḥurr li al-Maʿānī al-Durr*. There is another known to some as the *Kashf al-Wujūh al-Ghurr li al-Maʿānī al-Durr*, which is, however, not from Mullā ʿAbd al-Razzāq, but from Shaykh Sharaf al-Dīn Dāwūd Ibn Mahmud Ibn Ghaysarī. In the preface it states that Mullā ʿAbd al-Razzāq called the book *Kashf al-Wujūh al-Ghurr li al-Maʿānī al-Durr*, but this assertion does not seem to be correct. There are two accounts from Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Maʿrūf and Saʿīd ad-Dīn Faraghānī, one of which is in Arabic, called *Muntahā al-Madārik* and the other in Fārsī, called *Mashāriq al-Darārī*, both of which have been published.

102. Sharaf al-Dīn Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Saʿīd Dalāṣī Miṣrī Būṣīrī (d. 694) was the most learned poet of his era. His famous elegy *Maymīyah* begins with these verses:

أَمِنْ تَذَكُّرٍ جِيرَانٍ بَدَى سَلْمٌ مَزَجَتْ دُمُوعًا جَرَى مِنْ مَقْلَةٍ بَدَمٍ
أَمْ هَبَّتِ الرِّيحُ مِنْ تَلْقَاءِ كَاظِمَةٍ وَأَوْمَضَ الْبَرْقُ فِي الظُّلُمَاءِ مِنْ أَضَمٍ

It is one of the best poems about the Prophet, the Seal of the Prophets, and is a useful exposition in a superb binding.

103. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 1, pp. 58-77.
104. Tirmidhī, *Jāmiʿ al-Ṣaḥīḥ*, vol. 2, p. 214; Abū Naʿīm Isfahani, *Ḥilyat al-Awliyāʾ*, vol. 1, p. 64; Baghawī, *Maṣābiḥ al-Sunnah*, vol. 2, p. 275. Some 60 others who can recite the Book by heart, the Imams of the narrations from different sources, along with 6 others, have taken it from *al-Ghadīr*.
105. In the *Maṣābiḥ al-Sunnah*, Baghawī's version is similar to Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī's in the *Dhakhḥāʾir al-ʿUqbā* (Cairo: Maktabat al-Qudṣī, 1356 AH), p. 77. Others have related the same thing.
106. Daylamī has it in *Firdaws al-Akhhār*, quoting Ibn Abbās and some other narrators who followed him, such as ʿAjlūnī in *Kashf al-Khiṭāʾ*, vol. 1, p. 204.
107. Ghazzālī has this narration in his *Risālat al-Aqliyyah*, and Maybudī has also narrated it in the *Divān* related to Imam Ali. See *The Poetic Works of the Commander of the Believers*.

108. Abū Muhammad ʿĀsimū has it in his *Zayn al-Fatā fi Sharḥi Sūrat Hal-atā*.
109. The jurisprudent Ibn Maghazilī and Abū Muʿayyid Khārazmī have used it, as well as Qundūzī in the *Yanābiʾ al-Mawaddah*, p. 71.
110. *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 6, p. 156. Moreover, Suyūṭī has extracted and used in *al-Qawl al-Jalī fi Faḍāʾil al-ʿAlī*, narration 38.
111. See Abū Jaʿfar Aḥmad Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī, *al-Riyāḍ al-Nadāra* (n.p., Shirkat al-Ṭibāʿa al-Mutahidha al-Faniyya), ed. Shaykh Muḥammad Muṣṭafā Abū al-ʿAlā, vol. 3, p. 210, where he has narrated from Muḥammad Ibn Ziyād that Omar was on the ḥajj pilgrimage when a man who had been slapped in the face went to him. Omar asked him who had slapped him in the face, and he answered: "Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib." Omar said:

لقد رقت عليك عين الله

"Certainly, God has caught sight of you—and He sighted you through His guardian." Then the man did not question any more what had happened, or why Ali had slapped him in the face. The man was still with Omar when Ali arrived. Ali said: "This man was on the ḥajj and circumambulating when I saw that he was looking at the women's faces." Omar said to Ali: "Yes, but you are watching with the Light of God."

There is another narration where Omar was circumambulating the House of God while Ali was a few steps ahead of him. At that very moment a man came closer to Omar and said: "O Commander of the Faithful, obtain my right from Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib." Omar asked him: "What has Ali done to you?" He answered: "He has slapped me in the eye." The narrator then says that Omar stopped where he was until Ali reached him, and then asked him: "O Abū al-Hasan, have you hit this man in the eye?" Ali answered: "Yes, O Commander of the Faithful." Omar asked: "What for?" Ali answered: "I saw him gazing at the faces of the believing women while circumambulating." Omar said: "Well done, O Aba al-Hasan," and then turned to the man saying: "I am sure a watcher from God has caught sight of you; therefore you have no right with your claim." And while Omar was helping Ali to turn his face toward the House, he said:

من جواهر الله ولي من أولياء الله

"Ali is a pearl of God's treasure house, and one of God's masters among the masters."

112. This story is explained in the next lesson.
113. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, pp. 78–81.
114. In *A'lām*, vol. 8, p. 17, Zarkalī says that Muhammad Ibn Ya'qūb Ibn Ma'qil Ibn Sanān was from the Omawi of Nishābūr, in the lineage of Abū al-Abbās and Aṣamm. He was born in 247 AH, and died in 346 in Nishābūr.
115. *al-Mustadrak ala al-Ṣaḥīḥayn fi al-Ḥadīth* (published in Ḥaydar Ābād Dakan) by Ḥāfiz Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Abdullah, known as Ḥākim Nishābūrī, who died in the month of Sa-far, 405, vol. 3, pp. 126–27; *al-La'ālī al-Maṣnū'a*, vol. 1, p. 331.
116. The spelling of this word indicates that he was one of 'Abd al-Raḥmān's slaves.
117. Abubakr Ahmad Ibn Ali al-Khaṭīb Baghdadi, *Tārīkh al-Baghdad* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah), vol. 11, pp. 46–51; *al-La'ālī al-Maṣnū'a*, vol. 1, pp. 331–32. Moreover, Ibn Hajar 'Asqalānī has it in the *Tahdhib al-Tahdhib*, vol. 6, pp. 319–22, in the section "The Condition of Abū Ṣalt."
118. Dhahabī, *Talkhīs al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3, p. 126. This book is printed in the margin of *al-Mustadrak* by Ḥākim.
119. Sayyid Sharaf al-Dīn 'Āmulī in *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād*, page 180 says:

Ḥākim has endorsed this hadith to be correct, and Imam Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ṣādiq Maghribī speaks of the authenticity of this hadith in *Fathī al-Malik al-Ali bi Ṣiḥḥat Bāb al-Madīnat 'Ilm al-Ali*. It is printed in 1324 AH, in Egypt: Maṭba'a al-Islamiyya. Part of his words about this hadith are as follows: "There are no beneficial proofs for Nāṣibīs in rejecting the hadith. We investigated their different books but did not find any reasonable argument. They have just taken Dhahabī's opinion about this book claiming false accusation against it."

120. In *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād*, 2nd edition, p. 180, Sayyid Sharaf al-Dīn Āmulī says that Ḥāshim has endorsed this hadith, and Imam Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ṣādiq Maghribī has written a book and named it as *Fathī al-Malik al-Ali bi Ṣiḥḥat Bāb al-Madīnat 'Ilm al-Ali*.

The Nāṣibī do not refer to it, because it refutes their invented hadith in circulation among both the Sunnis and the Shi'a. We investigated their different books but found no adequate reason, and they seem to have simply rejected the texts

with which they disagreed. This is because they have taken Dhahabī's opinion of this book and made false accusations about it.

121. The term *mukhdaram* refers to someone who has lived part of his life in ignorance and the remainder in Islam.
122. *al-Īḥāli al-Maṣnū'ah*, vol. 1, pp. 332–34.
123. *al-Īḥāli al-Maṣnū'ah*, vol. 1, p. 334; Ibn al-Ḥajar 'Asqalānī, *Lisān al-Mizān* (Beirut: Mu'assisat al-A'lamī li al-Maṭbū'āt, 1390 AH), vol. 2, p. 123.
124. Khaṭīb has a detailed explanation of A'mash's biography, which we have only briefly mentioned in the *Tarikh al-Baghdad*, vol. 9, pp. 3–13.

According to Jarīr Ibn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd Sulaymān Ibn Mahrān Abū Muhammad A'mash Mawlā Banī Kāhil was born in Danbāvand, in the mountainous area near Ray. Abbās Douri says that A'mash was born in a small village called Danbāvand, in Ṭabaristān. His father took him to Kūfa, where a man of the Banī Kāhil from the tribe of Banī Asad purchased him as a slave and subsequently freed him. It is said that Omar Ibn 'Abd al-Azīz, Hishām 'Urwah, Zuhri, Qutādah, and A'mash were all born at the time of the martyrdom of Imam Husayn in 61 AH. A'mash was a jurisprudent and a famous narrator for the people of Kūfa, and they say that he narrated four thousand narrations, but left no books. He was a chief reciter of the Qur'an and a good orator. His father was one of the captives of Daylam, and was a bad-tempered man. A'mash was very learned and an expert in Islamic law, and there was no one more knowledgeable at the time. He had deep Shi'a sensibilities and was very humble. One day he was going to the Friday prayer and was wearing his mantle inside out, with a tablecloth over his shoulders instead of a robe. 'Isā Ibn Yūnus said: "In our time, we had never seen a man like A'mash, nor had earlier men seen such a man. Although he was a poor man, I did not notice, and rich men would be humble in front of him. A'mash was very cautious at all times, and was always in the first line in the mosque to pray—he really was the most learned man of his time." Yahyā Ibn Mu'īn used to say:

كلنا لامش جليلاً جداً.

"A'mash was a really respectable person". And Ibn Aynīyah used to say:

كان أقرأهم القرآن، وأحفظهم للحديث، وأعلمهم بالقرائن.

"He used to recite the Qur'an, memorized the narrations, and was most learned in Islamic law." And when Shu'bah heard A'mash's name mentioned, he said: "This is really the Qur'an." A'mash died in 148 AH.

125. Abū Abdullah Muhammad Ibn Ahmad Dhahabī in *Mizān al-I'tidāl fi Naqd al-Rijāl* (Cairo: n.p., 1325 AH) vol. 2, p. 616, no. 5051, has mentioned details and a biography of 'Abd al-Salām Abū Ṣalt Harawī and has said:

عبد السلام بن صالح بن أبي صلت المروى الرجل الضلع، إلا أنه شيعي جلد.

He was an honest man, and was very strong in his belief in the Shi'a religion. He would narrate from Hammad Ibn Zayd, Abī Mu'āwiyah, and Ali al-Riḍā. After Abū Hātam's statement of

لربكن عندي بصديق.

Abū Zar'ah ruined his narration, and Oqaylī said that he was an extreme Shi'a.

126. Yaḥyā Ibn Mu'īn was mistakenly recorded as Yaḥyā Ibn Na'im.
127. In *Tārīkh al-Baghdad*, vol. 11, p. 51, Khaṭīb has quoted Abū al-Hasan Dār al-Quṭnī as saying that Abū Ṣalt quoted Ja'far Ibn Muhammad as narrating from his great-grandfather that the Messenger of God said: "Belief is confessing with one's tongue and acting with the limbs." Abū Ṣalt was condemned for inventing this narration, because no one else ever narrated it, unless they had taken it from him. Hence, it was said that he fabricated it.

Moreover, Dhahabī has also related in *al-Mizān al-I'tidāl*, vol. 2, p. 616, from Dār al-Quṭnī concerning Abū Ṣalt, saying that:

وقال الدارقطني: رافضى غيبث متهم بوضع حديث الإيمان إقرار القلب....

This is also believed by the Sunnis to have been invented by Abū Ṣalt. Since the narration is quite the opposite of their religious faith in "belief in the heart," they revile Abū Ṣalt for inventing it. However, this is apparently wrong, because Abū Ṣalt narrated it from Imam Riḍā back to the Messenger of God himself. Although the narration has a valid chain, no one

mentioned it before with this interpretation, but that does not prove it is false, for many narrations have not been mentioned by their predecessors, whereas later ones have.

128. Abdullah Māmqānī, *Tanqīh al-Maqāl fi Ahwāl al-Rijāl* (lithograph, 1349–52 AH), vol. 2, pp. 151–52.
129. Muḥaddith Qumī has briefly mentioned the biography and circumstances of Abū Ṣalt in Shaykh Abbās Qumī, *Safinat al-Bihār*, vol. 2, pp. 39–40, from Māmqānī, as we have already mentioned. He has added that after the martyrdom of Imam Riḍā, Ma'mūn put him in prison. He was there for a year, where he became depressed and developed a pain in his chest. He implored God through Muhammad and his descendants to rescue him, and it was then that Imam Muhammad Taqī miraculously delivered him from the prison. Abū Ṣalt was with Imam Riḍā from the time when he entered Nishābūr until he was martyred. He has narrated a great many narrations from Imam Riḍā and his father and grandfathers back to the Messenger of God, and they are worth their weight in gold. The scholars, jurists, and companions used to take part in the sessions that Abū Ṣalt directed. The late Qumī has said that in addition to the shrine dedicated to him outside the city of Mashhad, there is also another one dedicated to him in a district near Qum, the door of which is called the Door of Rey; there is a grave close to that of Khājah Aba Ṣalt called Khājah Murād, which is the grave of Harthama Ibn A'yan. It has been said in *Tanqīh al-Maqāl* vol. 3, p. 291: "It is understood from the *Uyūn Akhbār al-Riḍā* that this man had huge affection for Imam Riḍā. It is obvious that he was one of his sincere followers and a very close companion. He was well known as a Shi'a." Also, Harthama said after the martyrdom of Imam Riḍā:

At that time I suddenly noticed Ma'mūn turning to me and shouting: "Is it not so that you believe the Imam should only receive the final ablution from the next Imam? So where is Muhammad Ibn Ali?" I told him: "O Commander of the Faithful, we say that the Imams should not be washed by strangers if there is another Imam like him. However, if a man adamantly insists on washing the corpse of the Imam, in that case, the Imamate of the Imam does not become void, nor does the Imamate of the next one who is to be the Imam."

These words of Harthama clearly show that he was a Shi'a. In addition to the core of the religion, he would defend its

minor rules and laws. After explaining this in Ali Ibn 'Isā Ar-bili, *Kashf al-Ghummah fi Ma'rifat al-A'imma* (Tabriz: lithograph, 1394 AH), Māmqānī says: "However, after much discussion, there is still something on my mind concerning him, because the narrators and historians considered him to be the chief of Ma'mūn's army, and they have said that Hasan Ibn Faḍl sent him to fight with Muhammad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Zayd. He finally captured Muhammad alive and brought him to Ma'mūn, who killed him with poison."

130. Khājah Abā Ṣalt's grave is exactly 15 kilometers from the Purified Shrine, and Khājah Murād's is 20 kilometers away.

131. *al-Lā'ālī al-Maṣnū'ah*, vol. 1, pp. 335–36.

132. Muhammad, the Arab, is respected in both worlds, so he who has not fallen to dust on the threshold, may he perish.

I heard that he spoke, as Jesus did, in this narration, with his pearl-like soul.

I am the City of Knowledge and Ali is its Gate; how fine a narration it is

I should keep guard at his door like a dog.

The guardianship of the King of Men is not a job for any trifling man; a Secret Hand protected his mother that she might have such a child.

Natural purity in birth belongs to the lofty ones only, as it says in the *Ḥadith Nabawī* brought to us by Jābir: "O company of al-Muḥājir and al-Anṣār, raise your children to love Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib. (see *Kitāb al-Wilāyat*, vol. 1, p. 79 by Aqā Sayyid Mirzā Abū al-Qāsim Ibn Muhammad Nabī Husaynī Sharifī Shirazī, known as Aqā Mirzā Bābā).

The story refers to narrations concerning lawful children and those born from adultery, and expresses both affection and enmity for Imam Ali and the Muslims at the beginning of Islam. If there was any doubt, they came to know their newborn children according to this standard. These narrations refer to the Messenger of God, and both the Shi'as and the Sunnis accept them.

133. Shahāb al-Dīn Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hajar Haythamī, *al-Ṣawā'iq al-Muḥriqah fi al-Radd ala al-Bida' wa al-Zandīqah* (Najaf: Maktabat al-Hindi, 1387 AH), p. 20.

134. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 7, p. 198.

135. Ali Ibn Yūsuf Āmilī Nabāfī Bayāzī writes in *Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaḳīm* (*The Straight Path*), vol. 2, p. 20, that opponents have said: *wa aliyyun bābuha ay bābuha a'lā* (the door of that town is high). However, this interpretation is wrong, and no one of sound

reason would translate it that way. It is quite the opposite of what Ibn Maghāzili has written in *al-Manāqib* about the Prophet's saying: "I am the City of Knowledge and you are its Gate." Indeed, Ali is that Gate, and whoever supposes otherwise is mistaken. Ibn Maghāzili has written that the Prophet said: "In the Night of Ascension, I stood before God and He spoke calmly to me, and I later transferred all that God told me to Ali. Therefore, he is the gate of whatever knowledge I possess." Ibn Maghāzili asserts: "All nations agree on this hadith."

136. Ali Ibn Yūsuf Āmili Nabatī Bayāzī in *Širāṭ al-Mustaḳīm* (*The Straight Path*), vol. 2, p. 20 has said:

The opponent has said: *wa Aliyyun bābuha* meaning "the door of that town is high," but this is a wrong translation and no historians has translated this term as "high." For example Ibn Maghāzili in *al-Manāqib* has narrated from the Prophet: "I am the city of knowledge and you are its gate. Yes, you are the gate for that door. Whoever claims that he can enter the town from anywhere other than the main gate, makes a mistake." Ibn Maghāzili concerning the Prophet has written that the Holiness said: "In the night of Ascension (*Mi'rāj*), when I stood in front of my Creator, God whispered with me, and later on, I transferred all that God told me to Ali. He is the gate of whatever knowledge I possess." Here, Ibn Maghāzili says: "All nations agree on this hadith."

137. This is in the chapter *al-Taḥrim* (Qur'an 66:4): *If you two [wives] turn in repentance to God, (you have cause to do so) for your hearts are so inclined; but if you back up each other against him [Muhammad], then God is his protector, and Gabriel, and the righteous among the believers [such as Ali]; and furthermore the angels will be his supporters.*

It is written in Mahmud Omar Zamakhshari, *Tafsir al-Kashshāf* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-Arabi) that on the ḥajj pilgrimage, Ibn Abbās asked Omar: "What do these 'two wives' mean here?" Omar said: "They are Ḥafsa and 'Āyisha." It is written in Shi'a commentaries and some Sunni ones that the meaning of "the righteous among the believers" primarily indicates Imam Ali. But certain Sunnis, who decided to remove the significance of Imam Ali in this verse, have said that "the righteous among the believers" does not apply to a certain individual, but to any righteous Muslim. But even though the word for "righteous" is singular, it does not mean, as they have said, any particular man, but points to Ali, who is the

companion and friend of the Prophet. However, they have said that "the righteous among the believers" is in the plural, hence righteous people. However, this is wrong, because if it were so, it would be written in the Book as "the righteous of the believers."

138. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, pp. 69–70.
139. Kāzim Ozrī, *Divān (Elegy) of Ozrī* (Najaf: Maṭbaʿat al-Nuʿmān, 1386 AH), p. 142.
140. The preceding verse (39:8) states: *And when some hurt touches man, he supplicates his Lord, turning to Him (repentant); but when He bestows him a favour from Himself he forgets that for which he has supplicated Him before, and he sets up rivals to God that he may beguile (men) from His way. Say, "Take pleasure in your disbelief for a while; indeed, you are of the companions of the Fire."*
141. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 415, section 161, 1st Sunni narration.
142. *Ibid.*, section 416, 1st Sunni narration.
143. Apparently, the term *wa yarjū raḥmata Rabbihi* should be used before mentioning the revelation of the verse concerning Imam Ali, and after the phrase *yahdhar al-ākhirat*. However, as it was given in this way in the main copy of the commentary by Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, we have followed his style.
144. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 416, 12th narration from the Sunnis.
145. *Ibid.*, narrations 2–11 from the Sunnis.
146. *Shawāhid al-Tanzīl*, vol. 2, p. 116, narration 805.
147. *Majmaʿ al-Bayān*, vol. 4, p. 491.
148. *al-Mizān*, vol. 17, p. 260.
149. *Shawāhid al-Tanzīl*, vol. 2, p. 117, narration 806.
150. It mentions in the printed copy of *al-Manāqib* that this was from Abbās, but this seems to be a mistake, since it had to have been Abū Bakr Ibn ʿAyyāsh. They have this in the translation of his biography in *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl*, vol. 3, pp. 5–6. He lived at the time of Imam Ṣādiq and reported narrations from him. Also, he is known to have been a Shīʿa by the suspended note in the margin of *Muntahī al-Maqāl* from the narration in *Tahdhīb* concerning inheritance.
151. Referring to Qurʾan 80:31–32: *And fruits and grasses as provision for you and your cattle*; here *ab* indicates fodder to feed animals, as is clear from the verse above.
152. *Kalālāh* is a title given to the close relatives of the dead, such as brothers and sisters, and sometimes refers to the paternal relatives.

153. It states in the annotation that the word *sab* should have been used as *sabīʿ* (like *amir*) when he asked Omar about the meaning of *al-dhāriyāt*. Some people have been addressed by this word with the same pronunciation, and Ibn Hajar mentions it in *Taqrīb*, where it is probably *Sabīʿ Ibn Khālid Yashkurī*. However, as he mentions in *Bihār al-Anwār*, the first version begins with the letter *ṣād*

instead of *sin*

but I have not come across anyone addressed in this way.

154. It is hoped that this will be answered in this lesson.
 155. This is one of the subjects tackled in this lesson.
 156. See Ḥamūʿī, *Farāʿid al-Simʿayn*, vol. 1, p. 94, hadith no. 63; Khārazmī, *al-Manāqib*, section 7, p. 40; Khārazmī, *Maqtal al-Husayn*, section 4, vol. 1, p. 43 (Najaf edition); and Abū Nuʿaym Isfahani, *Hilliyyat al-Awliyāʾ*, vol. 1, p. 65.
 157. Mustashār ʿAbd al-Ḥalīm Jandī, the chief Muslim member of the Egyptian Parliament, narrates the hadith correctly in his valuable book *al-Imam Jaʿfar al-Ṣādiq*, p. 30.
 158. Shaykh Ṭūsī has the complete narration in *Thahdhīb al-Aḥkām* (Najaf: 1382 AH), vol. 6, pp. 220–21, and Muhammad Ibn Yaʿqūb al-Kulaynī mentions it in *al-Kāfi* (Tehran: Maktabat al-Ṣadūq, 1381 AH), vol. 7, pp. 408–9, saying that Husayn Ibn Saʿīd narrated it from Faḍālat Ibn Ayyūb, quoting Dāwūd Ibn Farqad as saying that a man narrated it to him from Saʿīd Ibn Abū al-Khaṭīb Bajalī, who said:

Abū Laylā and I were traveling to Medina, each of us sitting on either side of the camel litter. We reached the Prophet's Mosque just as Jaʿfar Ibn Muhammad walked in. I asked my friend Abū Laylā: "Would you come with me to him?" and he answered: "What is our business with him?" I said: "I want to ask him about some matters, and then talk with him." He agreed, and said: "Let us go," and both of us went to him. He greeted me and asked how my family was, and then asked me: "Who is this man with you?" I said that he was Abū Laylā, the Muslim judge. The Imam turned to him, asking: "Are you the judge of the Muslims?" He said: "Yes, I am." The Imam said: "Then you take the property of one man and give it to another; you order capital punishment and allow divorce. So are you not afraid for doing such things?"

He then goes on to explain the Imam's questions and Abū Laylā's answers, until the Imam asks him by what means he judges and gives verdicts. Abū Laylā replies that it is by means of what has come to him from the Messenger of God, Ali, Abū Bakr, and Omar. Then the Imam said:

Have you heard that the Messenger of God said: "Indeed, Ali is the best judge among you," and "Ali is the best judge, and his judgment is true and honest"?

The man said: "Yes, I know of that."

The Imam asked: "Then how do you judge the opposite of what Ali judged? Has it not come to you from the Messenger of God that on the Day of Judgement the earth and the heavens will shine as silver, and if the Messenger holds you by the hand and stands in the presence of God saying: 'O my Creator, this man has judged among the people contrary to how I used to judge,' what will your answer be?"

Saʿīd Ibn Abī al-Khaḍīb said that Abī Laylā's face turned as pale as saffron, and he said to him: "You should choose another traveling companion for yourself. By God, I will never say to you a single word."

159. Concerning Imam Ali's jurisprudence, Shaykh Muhammad Husayn Muzaffar writes in *Tārīkh al-Shi'a*, pp. 125–26, that the incident of which Ṣadūq speaks in *Amālī*, namely: "He lectured for the people of Yemen," is the same as that narrated by Bāqir about when the horse of a certain Yemeni man ran off, struck another man, and killed him. The relatives of the other man caught the horse and took it to Imam Ali. Although they had witnessed the accident and complained that the horse had killed their man, Imam Ali decided that it was not the fault of the owner of the horse.

The dead man's relatives then went to the Prophet, and complained about Ali's decision, saying that Ali was unjust toward them, because a horse killed one of their relatives, and Ali said that it was not the fault of the horse or its owner. However, the Prophet defended Ali by saying that Ali never makes mistakes, and whatever he says is right and is what the Prophet himself would prescribe. So they apologized and asked for his forgiveness. The Prophet also told them to ask for God's forgiveness also, that He might forgive them.

160. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *Ghāyat al-Marām* (lithograph), vol. 1, pp. 259–261.
161. Āmilī Nabāḥ Bayāḍī has mentioned in *al-Širāṭ al-Mustaḳīm ilā Musṭaḥḳaḳ al-Taḳdīm*, vol. 2, 30:

‘Abd al-Mahmūd has said:

I have looked into Ibn Mardawayh’s books and I have come across 182 virtues for Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib stated by the Prophet, as there are many words on *wilāyat* (authority) of Imam Ali.

O, Ali! Too many miracles, virtues, and signs of priorities are considered to be in favor of your greatness!

Those goodness and priorities were in such a way that the unbelievers heard them and corrected their ways, so what about those who believe you as the Guardian!

162. The late Amrīn said: “In the margin of the original copy of *The Exceptional Instructions*, Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm notes that the term *Aṣḥāq* is from an Arabic expression, *faras al-aṣḥāq*, and its feminine form is *ṣaḥḳa*. It is a kind of horse with two white marks on both ears. Also, *Aṣḥāq* was the name of the Imam’s first army chief.”
163. Sayyid Muhsin Jabal Āmilī, *‘Ajā‘ib Ahkām Amīr al-Mu’minīn* (Beirut: Mu’assissat al-‘A’lami), pp. 31–35.
164. The first is Qur’an 10:35: *Say: is there of your partners (whom you ascribe to God) one that guides to the Truth? Say, God guides to the Truth. Is He Who guides to the Truth more deserving that He should be followed, or he finds not the way unless he (himself) is guided? What is the matter with you? How do you judge?* We already discussed this verse in *Knowing the Imams*, vol. 1, lesson 12. The second one is from Qur’an 39:9: *...Say, “Are those who know equal to those who know not?” But only those of understanding pay heed.* We have briefly explained the translation of this at the beginning of this lesson, lesson 157. The third is Qur’an 2:247: *Their prophet said to them, “God has raised up Saul to be a king for you.” They said, “How can he have kingdom over us when we are more deserving of the kingdom than he is, since he has not been given wealth enough?” He said, “Indeed, God has chosen him above you, and has increased him in wisdom and stature. God bestows His sovereignty on whom He will; for Allah is All-Embracing, All-Knowing.* This is already explained in *Knowing the Imams*, vol. 11, lessons

150 and 152. Fourthly are the verses of Qur'an 2:30-33: And when your Lord said to the angels, "I will place a vicegerent in the earth," they said, "Will You place therein one who will do harm therein and shed blood, while we celebrate Your praise and sanctify You?" He said, "Surely I know that which you know not." And He taught Adam all the names, then showed them to the angels, saying, "Inform Me of the names of these, if you are truthful." They said, "Glory to You, we have no knowledge save that which You have taught us. Indeed You, only You, are the Knower, the Wise." He said, "O Adam! Inform them of their names." And when he had informed them of their names, He said, "Did I not tell you that I know the secret of the heavens and the earth? And I know that which you disclose and which you hide. Here we see that God is aware that Adam deserves to be His caliph on the earth, because he has more knowledge than the angels and a higher rank. Thus he is informed of the knowledge of the messengers, and this was a priority that the angels lacked. See Muhammad Ibn Mumammad Ibn Nu'mān Baghdadī (Shaykh Mufid), *al-Irshād fi Ma'rifat Hujaj Allah ala al-'Ibād* (lithograph, 1285 AH) pp. 106-7.

165. Ibn Kathīr also has this narration in *al-Bidāyat wa al-Nihāyat*, vol. 5, p. 107, from Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal, Ibn Mājih, and Abū Dāwūd; Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī has extracted it from Ahmad Ibn Abdullah Muhammad Ṭabarī, *al-Riyāḍ al-Nadāra fi Manāqib al-ʿAshara* (Egypt: Maktabat al-Jandī, 1391 AH), vol. 3, p. 213, from Ahmad; Ibn Hajar Haythamī mentions it in *al-Ṣawāʿiq al-Muḥriqah* (Egypt: Dār al-Ṭibāʿat al-Muhammadiyya, 1375 AH), p. 73, and says: "Ḥakīm extracted it and considered it correct." The main text of the narration exists in Ḥakīm's *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3, p. 135, and is recognized as authentic. In *Ghāyat al-Marām*, part 2, p. 529, section 39, there are five Sunni narrations (nos. 7-11) from Ahmad Ḥanbal and one from Khārazmī (no. 13) on this very subject; Sibṭ Ibn Juzī has it in his *Tadhkira Khawāṣṣ al-Ummah* (Iran: lithograph, 1287), pp. 26-27, from Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal's *Faḍāʾl*. He then states that Ahmad also quoted it in his *Musnad*; in *Mughāzī*, Ibn Ishāq and others say that the Prophet told Ali: "If two people come to you with a dispute, never doubt that you can make peace between them, and settle everyone's problem assuredly."
166. Shaykh Mufid, *Irshād*, pp. 107-8.
167. Ibid.
168. Ibn Kathīr has this narration in *al-Bidāyat wa al-Nihāyat*, vol. 5, pp. 107-8, and Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal, Nisāʾi, and Dāwūd have

narrated it through different chains. Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī has it in *Dhakhāʾir al-ʿUqbā*, p. 85, from Ahmad in *al-Manāqib*. It is in *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, p. 216, and Ḥākim Nishābūrī also has it in *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 3, pp. 136–37.

169. *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 487; Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī, *Dhakhāʾir al-ʿUqbā*, p. 85; Kulaynī, *al-Kāfi*, vol. 1, p. 55, where he narrates the case about casting lots from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, quoting his father Ibn Abī Amīr, from Hammād, from Ḥalabī, from Muhammad Ibn Muslim, back to Imam Ṣādiq, who said: "There is no feuding group who cannot trust God with their demands and remain unanswered by Him"; in *al-Istibṣār* (Najaf: Akhūndī, 1378 AH), vol. 3, p. 369, Shaykh Ṭūsī mentions this narration from Kulaynī, and Ṭūsī has also mentioned it in *al-Tahdhib*, vol. 6, p. 238.
170. *Irshād*, p. 113.
171. *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 497–98; Majlisī narrated this hadith from *al-Manāqib* and *irshād*, see *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 483.
172. *Surah al-Nabaʾ*, Qurʾan 78:17; see Sayyid Ibn Ṭāwūs, *al-Tashrif bi al-Minan fi al-Taʿrif bi al-Fitan*, known as *Malāhim wa al-Fitan* (Najaf: Maṭbaʿh Ḥaydariyya, n.d.), pp. 154–55; *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, pp. 172–73, from *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 3, p. 179; *Miṣbāḥ al-Zalām* by Jurdānī, vol. 2, p. 56, where it is narrated from Ibn Abbās, and at the end of which the author says that Omar was very surprised, and said: "O Aba al-Hasan, I do not wish to be alive when a problem comes to me if you are not with me to solve it. I do not wish for God to settle me in a town if you are not there."
173. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 498; *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 479; Shaykh Ṭūsī has narrated a similar case in *Tahdhib*, vol. 3, p. 11, from ʿĀṣim Ibn Ḥamīd, quoting Muhammad Ibn Qays from Abū Jaʿfar, at the time of Ali's caliphate. He narrates the following:

At the time of Ali, a man had two wives, and they both gave birth to a child. One was male and one was female. The woman who had given birth to the female went to the babies' cradles and changed them over, putting the male child in her own cradle, and her own female child into the other woman's cradle. They subsequently began arguing and fighting with each other. This continued until they were taken to Ali, and he settled the matter by weighing the milk of each of them.

174. Kulaynī has explained this as

قَالُوا: لقد وردت عليه قضية ما ورد عليه مثلها، لا يخرج منها فلهذا

and we have therefore translated it the same way. However, it has been translated by Shaykh Ṭūsī as

. قال: لقد وردت علينا قضية ما ورد علينا مثلها لا يخرج منها يعني

"Imam Ali said: 'We have never faced before such a case like this. By God, I will solve it if He wills.'"

175. *Furūʿ al-Kāfi*, vol. 2, p. 363; *al-Qaḍāʾ wa al-Aḥkām*, vol. 7, p. 425; *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām* (Najaf edition), vol. 6, pp. 307–8. There is a brief description of this narration by Ibn Shahr Āshūb in *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 508.
176. Shaykh al-Mufīd, *Irshād*, p. 122; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, p. 214, where p. 84 has been taken from Qalī and Ibn Ḥajar Haythamī. In *al-Ṣawāʿiq al-Muhriqah*, p. 77, it says that Madāʾinī took it from *Majmaʿ al-Bayān*.
177. *Furūʿ al-Kāfi*; see also *al-Qaḍāʾ wa al-Aḥkām*, vol. 7, pp. 427–28; Ibn Shahr Āshūb has also narrated this in *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 274.
178. *Tahdhīb*, in the section *al-Ziydāt fī al-Qaḍāya wa al-Aḥkām* (Najaf edition), vol. 6, pp. 290–91; *Tahdhīb*, vol. 8, p. 319, from the book of Nudhūr.
179. Yūsuf Ibn Abdullah Ibn Abdul al-Birr, *al-Istīʿāb* (Egypt: Maktabat al-Nihḍa, 1380 AH), the section on the life of Imam Ali, vol. 3, pp. 1105–6.
180. *al-Istīʿāb*, vol. 3, p. 1102.
181. The word *zubyah*, with the first letter pronounced zu, is a ditch for hunting lions. It is often made on a hilltop, and the name of this high ground is *zubyah*. Thus, both the place and the ditch dug within it are called *zubyah*, and *balagh al-sail al-zubā* is a maxim in Arabic that means "the flood reached over the hilltop."
182. Amīn Āmilī, *ʿAjāʾib Aḥkām Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib*, p. 37–39. In *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 15, pp. 103–4, the narrative is related from Abū Dāwūd Ṭayālīsī, Abū Shaybah, Ahmad Ḥanbal, Ibn Manīʿ, Ibn Jarīr, and Bayhaqī.
183. In Islam, in cases of unintentional killing, blood money must be paid by the killer's paternal family or relatives, not by the killer himself. These relatives are called *ʿaṣbah*, or alternatively *ʿāqilah*, which is to say that the payment of blood money devolves upon the paternal relatives.
184. *Tadhkirat al-Khawāṣṣ al-Ummah*, p. 27, from the *Musnad Ḥanbal*.

185. Ahmad Ḥanbal, *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, p. 215; Ahmad Ḥanbal, *Dhakhḥa'ir al-ʿUqbā*, p. 84.
186. Kulaynī, *al-Kāfī*, vol. 7, p. 286; Shaykh Ṭūsī has narrated it in *Tahāhib*, vol. 10, p. 239, and in *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 530, narrative 8, through a Sunni chain.
187. Muḥammad Hasan Najafī, *al-Jawāhir al-Kalām* (lithograph), vol. 6, chapter *Ḍiyāt*.
188. Zayn al-Dīn Ali al-ʿĀmilī, *al-Rawḍat al-Bahiyya fī Sharḥ Luma'ḥ al-Damishqīyya*, vol. 2, p. 356 (lithograph—Muhammad Kāzim edition) chapter *Ḍiyāt*.
189. *al-Bidāyat wa al-Nihāyat*, vol. 5, p. 108; *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 15, pp. 103–4, which also mentions the virtues of Imam Ali; in *Ghāyat al-Marām*, part 2, pp. 528–29, narrations 5 and 6 from Ahmad Ibn Ḥanbal are the two narrations from the Sunnis.
190. Ibn Shahr Āshkūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 487.
191. *Irshād*, p. 108.
192. *al-Kāfī*, vol. 7, p. 286; Shaykh al-Ṣadūq, *Man lā Yaḥḍurhu al-Faqīh* (Tehran: Maktaba-ye Ṣadūq), vol. 4, p. 86; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 239. Majlisī also mentions it with the same phraseology in *Bilḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 482.
193. *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 487 and 506. Āmilī Nabāṭī Bayāḍī in *al-Širāṭ al-Mustaqīm*, vol. 2, pp. 12–13, has narrated from Jābir, Ibn ʿAbbās, and Abī Ibn Kaʿb that the Prophet recited this verse

وَأَسْبَغَ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَهُ

and God completed His blessings for you (a part of verse 20 from chapter 31), for some people, and that Abū Bakr, Omar, and Othman were among them, and then asked the people: "Now, tell me what are God's first blessings upon you?" The companions wondered what they were, so they went on counting: clothing, valuable things in their homes, their provisions, relatives, wives, and children!

In the meantime, the Prophet turned to Ali and said: "O Aba al-Hasan, say it was Ali. Therefore, Ali said:

He created me when I was next to nothing! He did His goodness to me, created me as a thoughtful creature, a man to remember things, to have good knowledge, to be intelligent, and one mentioning God constantly. He then guided me to His religion. He did not make me turn away from His straight path and religion, and He assigned a good life for me after my death!

To every sentence that Ali said, the Messenger of God said: "I believe in what you say!"

In the meantime, the Messenger of God asked Ali: "Apart from these, what are God's blessings?" Ali said:

وَأَنْ تَعْلَمُوا أَنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَمُوتُ

"If you count God's blessings, you cannot mention all the numbers!" (Qur'an, 14:34). Then, the Prophet smiled, saying: "Let the wisdom and knowledge be happy to you! Let all wisdom be happy to you! You are the inheritor of my knowledge! And you are the clear announcer of my knowledge to my nation!"

194. A *mushtarak* narrator is a narrator who is reported both as a reliable and unreliable narrator. In order to find the real identity of such a narrator, scholars have a standard that involves his qualification, the time he lived, the shaykh who is quoted, the understanding of his students, and what those students narrate about him. Among these is Muhammad Ibn Qays, who is mentioned by five different scholars in narrations. Some of them are authentic and some are weak. However, this Muhammad Ibn Qays who is mentioned in the narration is Muhammad Ibn Qays Bajalī, who is considered one of the companions of Imam Ṣādiq. The Shaykh has said that he was from Kūfa, and ʿAṣim Ibn Ḥamīd has said that he died in 151 AH. Muhammad Taqī Shūshtarī, *Qaḍāyā Amir al-Mu'minin* (Beirut: Dār al-Shomālī, n.d.) has mentioned him, and the Shaykh refers to this in his chains from ʿAṣim Ibn Ḥamīd Muhammad Ibn Qays, back to Imam Abī Jaʿfar Muhammad Bāqir.
195. ʿĀmilī, *ʿAjāʿib al-Aḥkām*, p. 39.
196. *Jawāhir al-Kalām*, vol. 6, chapter of *Diyyāt*.
197. *Ibid.*
198. *Irshād*, p. 107; see also Majlisī, *Biḥār al-Anwār* (Company edition), vol. 9, p. 482; Zayn al-ʿĀbidīn Ali Ibn Yūnus Āmilī Bayāḍī in *al-Širāf al-Mustaḳīm*. vol. 2 p. 12.
199. The words *qaraṣa yaqroṣo qarṣā* mean to pinch someone's flesh with the fingers so that they feel pain. It is written and spoken in different ways in Persian. The names Qāriṣa, Qamiṣa, and Wāqiṣa mean "jerking" or "startling."
200. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 487–88.
201. *al-Nihāyaht fi Gharib al-Ḥadīth al-Athar*, vol. 4, p. 40.
202. *Man lā Yahḍurhu al-Faqīh*, vol. 4, p. 125, narration no. 1 in the section of Nawādir al-Diyyāt; *Tahdhīb*, vol. 10, p. 241, narration no. 960 in the section *al-Ishtirāk fi al-Janāyāt*.

203. *Irshād*, p. 109; *al-Širāṭ al-Mustaqīm*, vol. 2 p. 13.
204. *Furūc al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 352, narration no. 6; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 229, narration no. 34.
205. *Furūc al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 352, narrations nos. 6 and 7; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, pp. 229 and 530, narrations nos. 1 and 2 from the Sunnis.
206. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 488.
207. *ʿAjāʾib al-Aḥkām* Amīr al-Muʾminin, pp. 42–44.
208. *al-Šawāʿiq al-Muhriqah*, p. 73; Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥah Shāfiʿī, *Maṭālib al-Saʿūl fī Manāqib al-Rasūl* (lithograph), p. 30.
209. *Furūc al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 353, narration no. 14; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 228, narration no. 30.
210. The first is narration no. 5, p. 35, and the second is narration no. 32, p. 228. Moreover, Kulaynī and Shaykh Ṭūsī have narrated it through their chains from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, quoting Muhammad Ibn ʿIsā, quoting Yunas, saying that Abdullah Ḥillī told of a man who had narrated that Imam Bāqir said that the Prophet sent Imam Ali to Yemen, where a horse belonging to a Yemeni man was startled, freed itself from its reins, and started running. It then attacked a man, causing him to fall and die. The relatives of the dead man went to the owner of the horse and arrested him, and then took him to Imam Ali. In Ali's presence the man claimed that his horse was leashed in his house, when it suddenly released itself and ran away, causing that accident. Ali did not assign any ransom to be paid, and did not consider the man's death to be the fault of the owner of the horse. But the relatives of the dead man went from Yemen to the Prophet and said: "O Messenger of God, Ali has oppressed us and has considered the case of our dead relative invalid."

The Prophet said: "Indeed, Ali is not aggressive and he has not been aggressive. After me, the guardianship is Ali's. The command will be his command, and the promise his promise. No one denies his guardianship, his command, and his promise except the disbeliever. And no one accepts his guardianship, his command, and his promise other than the believer." When the people heard this, they said: "O Messenger of God, now we are pleased with Ali's command and judgment." The Prophet said: *howa tawbatokum mā qoltum* ("Then this satisfaction is due to your repentance of what you had said about Ali"). *Furūc al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, pp. 252–53, narration no. 8; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, pp. 228–29, narration no. 33.
211. *Furūc al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, pp. 423–24; *Tahdhib*, vol. 6, pp. 304–6.
212. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 493–94.

213. *Bihār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, pp. 487–88.
214. *‘Ajā‘ib al-Aḥkām*, pp. 57–61.
215. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 6, pp. 104–5, narration no. 11. In this narration the woman told her story as follows: “My husband, the father of this my son, was a black man from Zangbar, and my brothers married me to him. Through him I became pregnant with this child, and then my husband went to a battle and was killed there. I then took the child to a tribe and he grew up in that tribe, and I felt disdainful of regarding him as my own.
216. There is an explanation of this phrase in Muhammad Bāqir Majlisī, *Mir‘āt al-‘Uqūl* (lithograph). The Imam said: *hādhihi al-wadi‘ah ‘indi* (“This trust is with me”), where the probable meaning is “Knowledge of that trust is with me,” or possibly “This trust is with me, and it is not right to return it now, except in the presence of both witnesses.” There may have been a play on words, depending on the context.
217. *Furū‘ al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, pp. 428–29; and *Tahdhib*, vol. 9, *Istibṣār*, p. 290, where the documentation of the narration states it is from Husayn Ibn Muhammad, quoting Mu‘allā Ibn Muhammad, quoting Ahmad Ibn Ali, the author of *Istibṣār*, vol. 3, pp. 10–11; Ṣadūq, *Man lā Yaḥḍurhu al-Faqīh*, vol. 3, p. 19.
218. *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 500.
219. *Dhakhḥā‘ir al-‘Uqbā*, pp. 79–80; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, pp. 210–11; *Tadhkira Khawāṣṣ al-Omma*, pp. 87–88. At the end of the narration Sibṭ Ibn Juzī says that Saḥīb Ibn Ibād comments on it in a long elegy, beginning with:

. حب النبي وأهل البيت معتمدى إذ الخطوب أسأت رأينا

See also Khārazmī’s *al-Manāqib*, p. 60, and the Najaf edition, p. 54. In Khārazmī’s narration he says: “When they went to Ali with this particular problem, he was busy in his garden watering the trees, wearing a robe fastened at the waist.”

220. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 6, pp. 126–27, narration no. 28.
221. *Irshād*, p. 112.
222. *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 497.
223. *Istī‘āb*, vol. 3, pp. 1102–3. The beginning of this narration has been put in *Tārīkh al-Damishq*, authored by Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, vol. 3, narration no. 1072.
224. *al-Manāqib*, p. 48, and Najaf edition, p. 38; Faḍl Ibn Shādhān, *Īdāh* (Tehran: Tehran University Press), p. 194. In *Kashf al-Ghummaḥ*, the narration is from Khārazmī, who continues: “Ahmad has this narration in his *Musnad*, where, in the part

about Ali Ibn Abī Tālib, he says: 'Omar did not stone the mad-woman, and let her go. Ali spoke to Omar as he was about to stone her, and Ali narrated the words of the Messenger of God.'"

Kashf al-Ghummah, section *Munāqibah*, p. 33, and *Ghāyat al-Marām*, part 2, p. 531, narration no. 6 from the Sunnis, have the narration from Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Khārazmī. Also, in *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 530, narration no. 2, there is the same narration that Ahmad Ibn Hanbal drew from *Kashf al-Ghummah*. Ahmad Hanbal in his *Musnad* also quoting Hasan Baṣrī, said that when Omar decided to have the madwoman stoned, Ali said:

مالك ذلك، أما سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم يقول: رُفِعَ الْقَلَمُ عَنْ ثَلَاثَةِ نَفَرٍ: عَنِ الثَّمَرِ حَتَّى يَسْتَيْقِظَ، وَعَنِ الْجَنُونِ حَتَّى يَرَى، وَعَنِ الْكُفْلِ حَتَّى يَتَعَلَّمَ.

See Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, *Musnad* (Beirut: Maktabata al-Islamiyyah), vol. 1, on stoning the mad, and Muhammad Ibn Ismā'īl Bukhārī, *al-Ṣaḥīḥ* (Egypt: Ṭab'at al-Amīyya, 1312 AH), vol. 8, p. 21.

225. *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, p. 209; *Dhakhā'ir al-'Uqbā*, p. 81.
226. *al-Mustadrak alā Ṣaḥīḥayn*, vol. 2, p. 59.
227. Abubak Ibn Ali Bayhaqī, *al-Sunan al-Kubrā* (Ḥaydarābād: Majlis Dā'irat al-Ma'ārif al-Nizāmiyyah, 1344 AH), vol. 8, pp. 264–65.
228. In the section *lā yarjam al-Majnūn wa al-Majnūnah*.
229. In the book of *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād* p. 278, there is a narration from Ḥākim in *Mustadrak*, vol. 4, 389, the chapter of *Ḥudūd*, the section of *man rufi'a anhu al-qalam*. By relating to Ibn 'Abbās, he has said that:

They took to Omar a pregnant mad woman, who had committed adultery, and he ordered that they stone her. Imam Ali told him: "Did you not know that there are three kinds of commands about those who commit such crime? They are about: 1) a mad person before finding his intellect, 2) a young boy before becoming sexually mature, 3) a sleeping person before getting up?"

And then, Āyatullāh 'Āmulī has said: "In this case, it is twice banned to punish the woman: the first reason is her madness, and the second one is her being pregnant."

230. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, pp. 101–3, in the section "The Rare Effects in the Knowledge of Omar," no. 7.

231. Ibn al-Ḥajar 'Asqalānī, *Fatḥ al-Bārī fi Sharḥ al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (Beirut: Dār Iḥyā' Thurāth al-'Arabī, 1408 AH), vol. 12, p. 101.
232. Mahmud Ibn Ahmad 'Aynī, *'Omdat al-Qārī fi Sharḥ al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī* (Beirut: Dār Iḥyā' Thurāth al-'Arabī, n.d.), vol. 11, p. 151.
233. There are several examples in Abī Dāwūd Sulaymān Ibn Ash'ath, *Sunan Abī Dāwūd* (Dār Iḥyā' Sunan al-Nabawīyya, n.d.), vol. 2, p. 227.
234. *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 8, p. 265.
235. *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 2, p. 59.
236. In *Iqrār*, our jurists say that a forced confession is unreliable. In an explanation of the phrase *walu aqarra al-majnūn lan-yaṣīḥ wa kadhālik al-mukrah*, Shahīd Thānī says:

لا فرق في الكثرة بين من ضرب حتى المجنى إلى الإقرار وبين من هدد عليه بإيقاع مكروه به لا يلقى
بمثله تحت عمله عادة من ضرب أو شتم وأخذ مال ونحو ذلك...

237. *al-Manāqib* by Khārazmī, p. 48, p. 39; *Ghāyat al-Marām*, part 2, p. 531, narration no. 17 from the Sunnis, through Khārazmī.
238. *Kashf al-Ghummah*, p. 33; *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 8, p. 269.
239. This appears in five different forms in the Qur'an: 6:164, 17:15, 35:18, 39:7, and 53:38.
240. *al-Manāqib*, p. 494, vol. 1. See also Faḍl Ibn Shādhān, *Idāh*, p. 192.
241. *Dhakhā'ir al-Uqbā*, pp. 80–81; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, pp. 208–9. In both books Zayd Ibn Ali's narration is *ennahu man quyyida aw ḥubasa aw tuhuddada flā iqrāra lahu* "Whoever is under pressure or imprisoned or being threatened, his confession is not valid"). Therefore this phrase is a continuation of the Prophet's words, and not those of Ali to Omar, as it derives from the Prophet's statement.
242. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, pp. 110–11.
243. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, pp. 110–11.
244. The whole verse from Surah "The Cow" (Qur'an 2:233) reads:
And mothers shall suckle their children for two whole years: (that is) for those who wish to complete the suckling. The duty of feeding and clothing nursing mothers in a seemly manner is upon the father of the child. No one should be charged beyond his capacity. A mother should not be made to suffer because of her child, nor should he to whom the child is born (be made to suffer) because of his child. And on the (father's) heir is incumbent the like of that (which was incumbent on the father). If they desire to wean the child by mutual consent

and (after) consultation, it is no sin for them: and if you wish to give your children out to nurse, it is no sin for you, provided that you pay what is due from you in kindness. Observe your duty to God, and know that God is seer of what you do.

245. *Irshād*, p. 113–14. In the *Idāh* of Faḍl Ibn Shādhān, with a recension from *Irmāwī*, pp. 190–91, it states: "...and in the narrations, and as you explain that there is no dispute between opponents and advocates, we understand this and that...." See also Majlisī, *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 483. In *Bishārat al-Muṣṭafā*, Ṭabarī narrates it from Yunes Ibn Hasan in the same way.
246. See for example some discussion on the creation and genesis of the baby by Muslim exegetes in *Tafsīr Gharā'ib al-Qur'an wa Raghā'ib al-Furqān*, by Nizām al-Dīn Hasan Ibn Muhammad Qumī Nishābūrī (d. 728 AD) (Egypt: Maṭba'a al-Halabi, 1381 AH), vol. 26, p. 10.
247. Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, *Tafsīr Mafātīḥ al-Ghayb* (Egypt: Dār al-Ṭibā' al-Āmirān), vol. 7, p. 504.
248. *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 7, p. 442.
249. Jalāl al-Dīn Suyūṭī, *Tafsīr al-Durr al-Manthūr* (Dār al-Ma'rifa, 1404 AH) vol. 6, p. 40.
250. *al-Mizān fi Tafsīr al-Qur'an*, vol. 18, p. 224.
251. *al-Manāqib* by Khārazmī, p. 57, and Najaf edition, pp. 49–50. It is found in *Ghāyat al-Marām* from Khārazmī and Zamakhsharī, p. 531, narration no. 8 from the Sunnis.
252. *Dhakhā'ir al-ʿUqbā*, p. 82. He adds that Qalī and Ibn Salmān also have this narration, and Saʿīd Ibn Musayyib with the extraction of Ahmad and Abū Omar, who mentions:

كان عمر يتوذن من معضله ليس لما أبو حسن

It is also in *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, p. 205, where it states that ʿAqīlī and Ibn Salmān have reproduced it from Abū al-Hāzm and Abū al-Aswad.

253. *Tadhkirat Khawāṣṣ al-Ummah*, p. 87.
254. *Istīʿāb*, vol. 3, p. 1103.
255. *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 6, p. 106, narration no. 785, from ʿAbd al-Razzāq's *Jāmiʿ*.
256. Sayyed Ibn Ṭawūs, *al-Tarāʾif fi Maʿrifat Madhhab al-Ṭawāʾif* (Qum: Maṭbaʿah Khayyām, 1400 AH), p. 472, where the author has explained the hadith up to the end.
257. *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 6, p. 106, narration no. 784, from ʿAbd al-Razzāq, ʿAbd Ibn Ḥamīd, and Ibn Mundhar.

258. *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 6, p. 40, in the comment on the verse:
And We have charged the human being that he do what is best to his parents.
259. Mālik Ibn Anas, *Muwaṭṭaʿ Mālik* (Egypt: Dār Iḥyāʾ al-Kutub al-Arabiyya) with corrections and annotation by Muhammad Fuʾād ʿAbd al-Bāqī, vol. 2, p. 825, narration no. 11, from *Kitāb al-Ḥudūd*, in the section *mā jūʿa fī al-rajm*.
260. *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 7, pp. 442–43.
261. Ismāʿīl Ibn Omar Ibn Kathīr Damishqī, *Tafsīr al-Qurʾān al-Karīm* (Beirut: Dār al-Fikr), vol. 6, p. 281, in the comment on the verse *wa waṣṣayna al-insān*. After finishing the narration, the narrator says that Muʿammar Ibn Abdullah Jahānī recorded it, and said: "When the father of the child saw the boy, he said: 'O my son! By God, I have no doubt about it.'" Muʿammar says: "God afflicted the man with leprosy, which spread everywhere on his face, and ate him up until he died." Muʿammar also says: "The child was so much like his father that you could not find the slightest differences, just as you cannot distinguish between two crows or two eggs. The child was the exact copy of his father."
262. *Umdat al-Qārī*, vol. 9, p. 642.
263. *al-Mizān*, vol. 18, p. 224.
264. ʿAjāʿib al-Aḥkām, p. 52, where he says that a similar case was clear to Othman and Ibn Abbās.
265. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 6, p. 94; Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 500–1, from Thaʿlabī's *Kashshāf*; in Khaṭīb's *al-Arbaʿīn* and Mālik's *al-Muwaṭṭaʿ*, it is narrated with his master's assistance that when Ali condemned Othman, Othman said: "Bring the woman back," but it was of no use, because they had stoned her by then. See also Part 2, p. 531, narration no. 4 from the Sunnis, and the comments on the verse of *Zukhruf* in *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Muslim*.
266. In *Farāʾid al-Adab*, the chapter of al-munjid says: "There is an exemplary saying in Arabic: 'such a criminal's action must be stopped before flourishing, so as not to continue such a thing later on, and the criminal person must be controlled in a such way that no one desires to do it anymore.'"
267. *al-Manāqib*, pp. 29–30, and Najaf edition, p. 16.
268. *al-Manāqib* by Khārazmī, p. 34, and Najaf edition, p. 22.
269. *Irshād*, p. 110.
270. *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 490–91.
271. *Tafsīr al-Kashshāf*, vol. 2, p. 525.

272. *Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr*, vol. 7, pp. 216–17.
273. *Tafsīr al-Khāzimī* (Egypt: Maṭbaʿa yi Muṣṭafā Muhammad), vol. 7, p. 176.
274. Abul al-Suʿūd Muhammad Ibn Muhammad, *Irshād ʿAql al-Salīm ilā Mazāyā Qurʾan al-Karīm*, known as *Tafsīr Abū al-Suʿūd* (Riyāḍ: Maktaba Riyād), vol. 5, p. 482.
275. *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 6, p. 317.
276. On the material concerning the meaning of these verses, we translated only the following: *So let man consider his food. We poured down water [from the sky] abundantly, then We split the earth right open, and from Chapter ʿAbasa: ...as a sustenance for you and your livestock* (80:32).
277. *al-Mustadrak* of al-Ḥākim, vol. 2, p. 514, on *wa tawallā* from the translation of Chapter ʿAbasa.
278. *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 6, p. 317; Ṭabarī and Ṭabrānī have this narration in *Musnad* of Shāmīyyīn from Ibn Wahab, quoting Yunas and ʿAmr Ibn Ḥārith. Ḥākim and Bayhaqī have also narrated it in *Shāb al-Imān*, section 19, as well as Ṣāliḥ Ibn Kaysān and others, such as Ibn Mardawayh from Shuʿayb. They have all narrated from Zuhri that someone told him: “I heard Omar say such a thing, and then he began speaking about it.” Which-ever form it takes, this narration is in one way or another from Ḥamid, quoting Anas.
279. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd, in the commentary on *Nahj al-Balāghah*, says that one day Omar went to the mosque wearing a shirt with four patches on the back. First he recited a few verses of the Holy Qurʾan, and on reaching the phrase *wa fākihātan wa abba*, he paused and said: “This is a difficult phrase,” adding: “O son of Khaṭṭāb, you are not responsible for knowing the meaning of something you know not,” see *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* with ʿIzz al-Dīn Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd’s annotations (Egypt: Dār Ihya’ al-Kutub al-Arabiyya, 1378 AH), vol. 12, p. 33.
280. *al-Mizān fi Tafsīr al-Qurʾan*, vol. 20, p. 318.
281. There is a maxim in Fārsī that says: “Our donkey had no tail right from the beginning.” This is from Deh-Khodā, *Amthāl wa Ḥikamī*, vol. 2, p. 734, and is said when one faces danger.
282. *Faṭḥ al-Bārī fi Sharḥ Ṣaḥīḥ Bukhārī*, vol. 13, p. 230.
283. *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 6, p. 317.
284. In Ibn Kathīr’s *al-Tafsīr*, vol. 7, p. 216, there is a similar narration from ʿĀsim Ibn Kalīb, quoting his father, from Ibn Abbās, and in three other versions from Ibn Jarīr Abū Karīb and Abū

- al-Sāʿib. See also the narrations of ʿAwfī, Mujāhid, Hasan, Ibn Zayd, and others who have narrated this from Ibn Abbās.
285. *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 6, p. 316.
286. *Tafsīr Kashshāf*, vol. 2, p. 525; *Tafsīr* of Fakhr Rāzī, vol. 8, p. 477. The words *ab* and *am* have a technical formation in Arabic.
287. Māmqārī, *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl*, vol. 2, p. 28, where he gives his opinion on the formation of the word.
288. *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 9, p. 95; *Kitāb al-Iʿtiṣām*, section

ما يكره من كثرة التبرع والتكليف ما لا يبينه

where he narrates this hadith from Sulaym Ibn Ḥarb, Hammād Ibn Zayd, Thābit, and Anas.

289. *Tafsīr al-Kashshāf*, vol. 2, p. 525.
290. *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, Kitāb al-Farāʿid, vol. 11, pp. 75–76, narration no. 323, from Saʿīd Ibn Manṣūr's *Sunan* and ʿAbd al-Razzāq's *Jāmiʿ*. See also Ibn Abī Shaybah, Darīmī, Ibn Jarīr, and Ibn Abī Mundhar. It is also narrated from Bayhaqī in his *Sunan*, at the beginning of which he narrates the hadith about Abū Bakr in vol. 6, pp. 223, and it continues with Omar on p. 224 from Shaʿbī. The initial part is also given by Darīmī in his *Sunan*, vol. 2, pp. 365–66.
291. *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, vol. 11, pp. 73–74, narration no. 320, from Ibn Rāhwayh and Ibn Mardawayh, who said that it is correct.
292. The matter of *kalālah* occurs in the verse of *al-ṣayf*, and was revealed during the Farewell Pilgrimage, which was in a hot season. It is verse 176 of the chapter "The Women": *They ask you for a pronouncement. Say: God has pronounced for you concerning distant kindred. If a man dies childless and he has a sister, hers is half of the heritage, and he would have inherited from her had she died childless. And if there be two sisters, theirs are two-thirds of the heritage, and if they be brethren, men and women, unto the male is the equivalent of the share of two females. God expounds unto you, so that you err not, and God is Knower of all things.*
293. Abul al-Husayn Ḥājj al-Qushayrī, *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Muslim* (Egypt: Dār Iḥyāʾ al-Kutub al-Arabiyya, 1374 AH) with annotation of Muhammad Fuʾād ʿAbd al-Bāq, chapter of al-Farāʿid, vol. 3, p. 1236, narration no. 9; Ibn Mājih Qazvīnī, *Sunan Ibn Mājih* (Egypt: Dār Iḥyāʾ al-Kutub al-Arabiyya), vol. 2, p. 910, in the section on the kalala hadith, narration no. 2726; see also Bayhaqī's *al-Sunan*, vol. 6, p. 224, where he has added afterwards that Omar said: *wa huwa mā khilāl al-abb kadha aḥtasib*; Ahmad Ḥanbal, *Musnad*, vol. 1, p. 48; *Tafsīr al-Qurʿubī*, vol. 6,

- p. 29; Muhammad Ibn Jarīr Ṭabarī, *Jāmiʿ al-Bayān*, known as *Tafsīr al-Ṭabarī* (Egypt: Maṭbaʿa al-Muṣṭafā al-Bābī al-Ḥalabī, 1373 AH), vol. 6, p. 43.
294. *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 2, p. 303; *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 2, p. 249, with slight differences from *Tafsīr al-Qurṭubī*, vol. 6, p. 29; *Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr*, vol. 2, p. 464.
295. *Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr*, vol. 2, p. 466; *Tafsīr al-Ṭabarī*, vol. 6, p. 42, the same page where Ibn Sirīn narrates through his chain that the Prophet was on a journey when this verse was revealed, and with him was Ḥudhayfat Ibn Yamān. The Prophet spoke the verse to Ḥudhayfah, who told it to Omar, who was following them. Later on, when Omar became caliph, he asked Ḥudhayfah about the meaning of the verse, for Omar hoped that he knew its meaning and would teach it to him. Ḥudhayfah said: "By God, you are unable to understand the meaning of a verse like this. I gather that your position forces me to tell you something that I have not said before." Omar responded: "May God bless you, I did not mean that."
296. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd, *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1, p. 124.
297. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 38.
298. The blood money for a Muslim can be as much as a thousand gold *dirhams*, ten thousand silver *dirhams*, a hundred camels, two hundred cows, or one thousand sheep.
299. *Idāh* of Faḍl Ibn Shādhān with an excerpt with the version from Jalāl al-Dīn Ormawī Husaynī Muḥaddith, pp. 194–95. Faḍl Ibn Shādhān Azdī Nishābūrī is a great Shīʿa scholar and shaykh of the righteous tribes of Imami people. He died in 260 AH. His social standing was so impressive that Imam Muhammad Ḥasan Askarī said: "I feel jealous of the people of Khorasan, because Faḍl Ibn Shādhān is living there." His *Idāh* is one of the best Shīʿa books.
300. *al-Mizān*, vol. 4, p. 277; *al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 2, p. 133.
301. In *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, p. 96, it says that she was the daughter of Dhī al-Ghuṣṣa, that is, Yazīd Ibn Ḥaṣīn Ḥārithī. However, Allāmah Shaykh Muhammad Taqī Shūshtarī says in *Qaḍāʾ Amīr al-Muʾminīn*, p. 295, that she was the daughter of Dhī al-Ghuṣṣa. He adds that since he was the chief of the Banī Ḥārith for about a hundred years, his name should be Ḥaṣīn Ibn Yazīd, not Yazīd Ibn Ḥaṣīn.
302. Sayyid Ibn Tāwūs narrates in the *Tarāʾif*, p. 471, from Ḥamidī in *al-Jamīʿ Bayn al-Ṣaḥīḥayn*, that Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb did indeed instruct from the pulpit that the marriage portion for women

should not be increased to more than what was agreed, but a woman in another part of the mosque raised her voice, and said: "It has been said that everybody has more priority than Omar, even the women."

And Zamakhsharī writes in *Kashshāf* that ʿOmar stood up to give a sermon, and said:

أيها الناس لا تتأولوا بصالح النساء، فلو كنت مكرمة في الدنيا أو تقوى عند الله لكان أولاكم
 بهار رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم ما صدق امرأة أكثر من اثني عشر أوقية. فقامت إليه المرأة
 وقالت له: يا أمير المؤمنين! لم تمنعنا حقاً جعله الله لنا؟ والله يقول: «وأنيتم إحداهن قطارة» قال
 عمر: كل أحد أعلم من عمر ثم قال لأصحابه: تسمعون؟ أقول مثل هذا القول فلا تتكرونه على
 حتى ترد على امرأة ليست من أعلم النساء.

303. This case, in the same condition, has been mentioned by Sayyid Sharaf al-Dīn ʿĀmulī, *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād*, p. 259, saying that:

Many of the writers and those looking after the ancient works have narrated this case. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah* vol. 3, p. 96 about Omar has narrated some valid narrations. However according to Sayyid Sharaf al-Dīn ʿĀmulī, the phrase of

نَاصَلَتْ إِمَامَكُمْ فَضَلَّتْهُ

has been interpreted as "That woman started shooting with your Imam, and then she shot your Imam and won the game."

304. *al-Ghadir*, vol. 6, in the section on the effect of Omar's knowledge, pp. 95–99, narration no. 5. Bāqir Majlisī has narrated this point in *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 8, p. 294. While investigating the case, Majlisī addresses the opinions of many Sunni scholars on this matter, such as Fakhr Rāzī and Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd. There is also a complete discussion in Mīr Muhammad Qulī, *Tashyīd al-Maṭāʿin* (Indian: lithograph), vol. 2, pp. 700–814.

Quddāma was one of the well-known companions of the Prophet. In *Uṣd al-Ghābah*, vol. 4, p. 198, it says: "Quddāma Ibn Mazʿūn Ibn Wahab Ibn Ḥudhafat Ibn al-Jaḥāmī—called ʿAmr or Abū ʿAmr as well—was Othman Ibn Maznūn's brother, and the uncle of Ḥafṣa and Omar's son Abdullah. His wife was

Ṣafīyyah, the daughter of Khaṭṭāb. He and his two brothers were among the first to embrace Islam."

305. *Idāh*, pp. 195-96.

306. *Irshād*, pp. 111-12; Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 497; Sayyid Sharaf al-Dīn ʿĀmulī, after explaining the story of Quddāma Ibn Mazʿūn in annotations of *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād*, says: "Ḥākim has mentioned this news in *Mustadrak*," vol. 4, the chapter of *Hudūd*, p. 376, in the section of Ṣiḥābah in the discussion on alcoholic drink that makes clear its chain; Dhahabī has also mentioned it in his *Ṣaḥīḥ* and approved it. However, his story is different in that Omar is unable to answer Quddāma. He turns to the companions and says: "Are you not going to reject him?" Ibn ʿAbbās says:

These verses are revealed as excuses for the past generations and for the people of this era as well as the future; because God, glory be to Him, three verses prior to it says:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِنَّمَا الْخَمْرُ وَالْأَنصَابُ وَالْأَزْلَامُ رِجْسٌ مِّنْ عَمَلِ الشَّيْطَانِ

(5:90): ...O you who believe! In fact, alcohol and gambling, and idols and [illegal] diving arrows are only the filthy handiwork of Satan.

He continues reciting it until he ends the part that Quddāma was reciting:

الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَعَمِلُوا الصَّالِحَاتِ... ثُمَّ اتَّقُوا وَاحْتَسَبُوا.

"...those who believe and do the righteous things...then are afraid and do correctly."

He then says:

"God, glory be to Him, has prohibited alcoholic drinking, so how can you say the drinker of it is pious?!" Omar said: "You are quite right, you are telling the truth, now, what is your opinion?"

Ali ordered him to be lashed 80 times. So since then up to the present time, his command is being carried out.

307. *Bilḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 483. In Ibn Taymiyyah's narration he says that the respondent to Quddāma's argument was Abdullah Ibn Abbās. He says that if the case is right, then Abdullah is also a student of Imam Ali, as have Shaykh Waliallāh Dehlawī in *Qurrat al-ʿAynayn* (Lahore: Maktaba Salafiyya, 1396 AH) and Miqdād Ibn Abdullah Saywarī in *Kanz al-Irfān fi Fiqh*

- al-Qur'an* (Tehran: Maktaba Murtaḍawiyya, 1386 AH). 'Allāmah Mīr Muhammad Qulī, father of 'Allāmah Mīr Ḥamīd Husayn, has narrated this in *Tashyīd al-Maṭā'in*, and it is in Abū Layth's *Tanbih al-Ghāfilin* from 'Atā Ibn Sa'īd, back to 'Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn Salamī, who lived at the time of Yazīd Ibn Abī Sufyān and has narrated that three men drank alcohol in Sham and referred to the same verse regarding its legality. Yazīd Ibn Abū Sufyān wrote about this to Omar, who replied: "Before anything bad happens, send them to me." When they brought the men to Omar, he called the companions of the Prophet together and asked them what to do. They had different opinions, some of them saying that they should be beheaded. Imam Ali was meanwhile sitting peacefully among them, so Omar turned to him and asked: "O Abū al-Hasan, why are you sitting quiet? What is your opinion on this case?" Ali said: "Make them repent, and if they do so, then give them the required lashes; but if they do not, then kill them." Omar followed through with Ali's decision.
308. *Irshād*, p. 124.
 309. *Furū' al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 347, narration no. 15.
 310. *Furū' al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 347–8, narration no. 1; *Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām*, vol. 10, pp. 270–1, narration no. 1065.
 311. *Nahj al-Balāghah*, ed. M. Abdah, vol. 2, the section on sayings, Wisdom 270, Egypt, p. 201; Ibn Abī Ḥadīd, *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 534, narration no. 29.
 312. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 498.
 313. *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 2, p. 149, and vol. 9, p. 92.
 314. *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 19, pp. 158–59, narration no. 276.
 315. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 6, pp. 177–78, narration no. 60.
 316. Māmaqānī in *Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl*, after mentioning several names in vol. 3, in the section of al-Kunā, p. 36, about the nickname of Abū Nu'aym, has said: "Abū Nu'aym is also a nickname for the other, like Faḥl Ibn Dakkīn Ibn Ḥammād"; in vol. 2, p. 8, he has followed his translation.
 317. Ṭabarī, *Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk*, known as *Tārīkh al-Ṭabarī*, with research by Muhammad Abū al-Faḍl Ibrāhīm (Egypt: Dār al-Ta'āruf), vol. 2, pp. 105–7.
 318. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 482.
 319. The Qur'an states: *And know that whatever you take as spoils of war, a fifth thereof is for God, and for the Messenger and for the kinsman (who have need) and for orphans and the needy and the wayfarers, if you believe in God... (8:41).*

320. Qur'an 9:60: *The alms are only for the poor and the needy, and those who collect them, and those whose hearts are to be reconciled, and to free the captives and the debtors, and for the cause of God, and (for) the wayfarer: a duty imposed by God. And God is Knowing and Wise.*

321. This verse must be translated as: "It is because of the nobility of that soil that has changed into a grave for the Imam to be buried within. Then, it also became the Imam's burial place, which is another nobility." Therefore, the soil had the dignity of being a grave for the Imam, and secondly, in being the grave for the Imam it has found another dignity."

Therefore, the pronoun

اخرت

returns to the same shrine, but not to the prayer; and the first letter is an explanation for the cause and the second to specify it.

322. *Alfiyah* (lithograph) by Baḥr al-ʿUlūm is published along with his *al-Fawā'id al-Najafīyya*, ed. Sayyid Muḥsin Kāzimāvi.

323. Ibn Qulawayh, *Kāmil al-Ziyarāt* (lithograph), pp. 205–7. Majlisī in *Biḥār al-Anwār* has narrated it from Ibn Qulawayh, in the section *Mazār*, vol. 21, pp. 146–47, and the literary edition, vol. 101, p. 82. Shaykh ʿAbd al-Husayn Amīnī Tabrizi, the author of *al-Ghadr*, has written that the name Mufaḍḍal is apparently wrong in the Imam's statement, possibly due to the writers of the narrations. It should be Jābir, as Mashhadi has narrated it in *Mazār al-Kabir* through his own documents. See also the narration of Ibn Ṭāwūs in *Mazār* from Jābir, who addressed the issue.

324. Qur'an 7:172. The rest of the verse is: *(That was) lest you should say on the Day of Resurrection, Indeed, of this we were unaware.*

325. *al-Mustadrak*, vol. 1, pp. 457–58. This sentence is also in *Tārikh Damishq (The History of Damascus)* section on the Commander of the Believers, part 3, p. 39, narration no. 1070. Ibn Asākar has the complete narration in *The History of Damascus*, in the volume on Imam Ali, part 3, p. 40, narration no. 1073, where at the end of the hadith it states that Omar said: *lā baqitu fī qaḥmin laysat fīhi Abū al-Ḥasan*; see also Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 2, p. 494, from *Iḥyā' al-ʿUlūm*, where Ghazzālī gives the narration in the same way, and adds that Imam Ali said: "Therefore, the Black Stone stands as a witness to the believer having touched it, and also witnesses against the unbeliever."

It has been explained how people touch the Black Stone and say: "O our Creator, we believe in You and accept Your Book, and we are loyal to Your covenant." Abū Saʿīd Khudrī has narrated this, and Shuʿbah's narration from Qatādah states that Imam Ali said to Omar: "Do not say that the Messenger of God does anything or establishes a practice except by God's command." Imam Ali likewise spoke these words with the permission of God.

326. *Tashyid al-Maṭāʿin*, vol. 2, pp. 556–58, offset print, India.
327. *al-Ghādir*, vol. 6, p. 103, narration no. 8.
328. *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, vol. 2, the book of ḥajj (*kitāb al-ḥajj*), section of "Approaching Black Stone (*Ḥajar al-Aswad*)," p. 151; *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Muslim* with corrections by Muhammad Fuʿād ʿAbd al-Bāqī, vol. 2, the book of ḥajj, section 41, from the book of ḥajj, p. 925, narrations nos. 248–51.
329. Khārazmī, *al-Manāqib*, p. 80.
330. *al-Mizān*, vol. 2, p. 418.
331. Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Khārazmī, *Ghāyat al-Marām*, part 2, p. 528, narrations nos. 1 and 3.
332. *Ibid.*, narration no. 14, p. 529.
333. *Ibid.*, narration no. 2.
334. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, part 2, p. 529, narration no. 15, with a Sunni chain; Sayyid Hāshim Baḥrānī says: "Ibn Buṭrīq has said in *Mustadrak* that Ahmad Ḥanbal has narrated this through three chains, and Muslim narrated it once in his *Ṣaḥīḥ*."
335. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 530, narration no. 1, by a Sunni chain; *Tārikh al-Damishq*, vol. 3, the volume named *Amīr al-Muʾminīn*, p. 39, narrations nos. 1071 and 1072.
336. *Ghāyat al-Marām*, pp. 531–32, narration no. 1, by a Sunni chain.
337. *Ibid.*, p. 533, narration no. 20, by a Sunni chain; Ibn Asākar explains this narration in *Tārikh al-Damishq*, part 3, p. 51, narration no. 1086.
338. *Shawāhid al-Tanzil*, vol. 1, pp. 79–80, narration no. 117; *al-Lāʾālī al-Maṣnūʿah*, vol. 1, p. 356.
339. *al-Lāʾālī al-Maṣnūʿah*, vol. 1, p. 356.
340. *Tārikh al-Damishq*, section on the translations of al-Imam Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, vol. 3, pp. 23–24, narrations nos. 1043, 1044, 1045, and 1046.
341. The Two Tablets may mean two volumes of the Qurʾan, because the Qurʾan would initially be written on separate thick sheets of paper, which were then rolled up and placed in two cylinders of stone or wood to keep them safe. Evidence for this

is in a narrative that Abū Nuʿaym mentions in *Ḥilliyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, p. 67, where, after the Prophet's death, Imam Ali said: "I have sworn not to remove my cloak from my back until I bring forth whatever is in the Two Tablets. Therefore, I will not take my cloak from my back until I bring the Qur'an together."

342. *Tārīkh al-Damishq*, part 3, pp. 45–46, narration nos. 1074–77.
343. Muḥaddith Qumī, *al-Kunā wa al-Alqāb* (Ṣaydā: Maṭbʿat Irfān, 1358 AH) vol. 1, p. 185. In the translation it says:

ʿIzz al-Dīn ʿAbdul Ḥamīd Ibn Muḥammad Ibn Muḥammad Ibn Ḥusayn Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd Madāʾinī, a great mystic-philosopher, a poet, a commentator of *Nahj al-Balāghah*, the author of *Qaṣāʾid al-Sabaʿ*, and a follower of the Muʿtazilite creed, has written about this in one of his elegies in praise of Imam Ali. He was born in the early part of Dhul-Ḥijja, in Madāʾin, and died in Baghdad in the year 665 AH. ʿAllāmah Ḥillī has narrated about him through his father, and in *Rayḥānat al-Adab*, vol. 7, pp. 333–35, he considers him to be of the Shāfiʿī creed and having the principles of the Muʿtazilites. He also considers him a follower of the Household. His commentaries on *Nahj al-Balāghah* are considered the best. When he finished his book under the direction of his brother Muwaffaq al-Dīn Ahmad, he presented it to the library of the wise minister Ibn al-ʿAlqāmī, who then gave him gifts of a horse, precious objects, and a hundred thousand gold coins...

344. *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, with an analysis by Muḥammad Abū al-Faḍl Ibrāhīm, vol. 9, pp. 164–66.
345. *Ḥilliyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, p. 71; *Uṣd al-Ghābah*, vol. 4, p. 23.
346. It is mentioned in *al-Kunā wa al-Alqāb*, vol. 1, p. 159, by Abū Nuʿaym Isfahānī Ḥāfiẓ Ahmad Ibn ʿAbdullah Ibn Ahmad Ibn Ishāq Ibn Mūsā Ibn Mihrān, who was a widely known narrator (*muḥaddith*) and a great reciter of the Book. He learned from great scholars, and they from him. One of his books is *Ḥilliyat al-Awliyā*, which Ibn Khallakān considers the best book that is famous among his companions, who extract narrations of the virtuous from it. He also wrote *al-Arbaʿīn*, where he has gathered a considerable number of hadiths about Imam Mahdi. Mawlā Nizām al-Dīn Qurāshī, the student of Shaykh Bahʾāi, is mentioned in it, and he speaks of the status of Abū Nuʿaym in the second part of his *Rijāl*, under the title of *Nizām al-Aqwāl*, saying that he saw his grave in Isfahan, and the carving on the stone read:

قال صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم: مَكُوبٌ عَلَى سَاقِ الرِّضِيِّ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَخَدَّ لَا شَرِيكَ لَهُ، مُحَمَّدٌ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَبْدِي وَرَسُولِي، أَهْدَتْهُ بَعْلَتِي بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ رِوَاءَ الشَّيْخِ الْحَافِظِ الزُّمَنْ الْقُدَّةِ الْفَضْلِ أَبُو نُعَيْمٍ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ...

In *Rayhānat al-Adab*, vol. 7, p. 285, he says that he is not only known as Hāfiz Isfahani, but some said he is also known as Hāfiz-i Dunyā. He is of the lineage of Majlisī, and combined jurisprudence and mysticism along with his narrations. According to *Rawḍāt*, *Kashf al-Ghummah*, and Ibn Shahr Āshūb's *al-Manāqib*, as well as some other books, he held mainly Sunni beliefs, but according to Shaykh Bahā'ī, Mir Muhammad Husayn Khātūnābādī, and certain other great scholars, he was purely Shi'a, having himself obtained narrations from his great-grandfather who was a Shi'a. It was because of the adverse conditions facing the Shi'a that he disguised himself as a Sunni. Abū Nu'aym, describing Ali's position, begins by saying:

عَلَى بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ وَسَيِّدِ الْقَوْمِ، مَحَبَّةُ الْمَشْهُودِ، وَمَحَبُّوبُ الْمَعْبُودِ، بَابُ مَدِينَةِ الْعِلْمِ وَالْعُلُومِ، وَرَأْسُ السَّطَاطَاتِ، وَمُسْتَنْبِطُ الْإِشَارَاتِ، رَايَةُ الْمُهْتَدِينَ، وَنُورُ الْمُطِيعِينَ، وَوَلِيُّ الْمُتَّقِينَ، وَإِمَامُ الْعَادِلِينَ، أَقْدَمَهُمْ إِبَاهَةً وَإِيمَانًا، وَأَقْوَمَهُمْ قَضِيَةً وَإِقَانًا، وَأَعْظَمَهُمْ حِلْمًا وَأَوْفَرَهُمْ عِلْمًا. عَلَى بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ كَرَّمَ اللَّهُ وَجْهَهُ، قُدْوَةُ الْمُتَّقِينَ وَزِينَةُ الْعَارِفِينَ، النَّبِيُّ عَنْ حَقَائِقِ التَّوْحِيدِ، الشَّمْسُ إِلَى لَوَاعِمِ عِلْمِ الْقُسُودِ، صَاحِبُ الْقَلْبِ الْمُتَقَوِّلِ، وَاللِّسَانِ الْمُتَوَكِّلِ، وَالْأُذُنِ الرَّاعِي، وَالْمَهْدِ الْوَاقِي، قَاءَ عَيُونِ الْقَتَنِ، وَوَقَى مِنْ فِتْنِ الْخَمَنِ، فَدَفَعَ النَّاسِكِينَ، وَوَضَعَ الْقَاسِطِينَ، وَدَمَعَ الْمَارِقِينَ، الْأَخْيَاشِينَ فِي دِينِ اللَّهِ، الْمُسَوِّسِينَ فِي ذَاتِ اللَّهِ....

Shams al-Dīn Hāfiz Dhahabī says in *Tadhkirat al-Huffāz* (Hayrābād: 1375 AH): "At the time of the author himself, they took the book of *Hillīyyat al-Awliyā* to Nishābūr, where it was sold for four hundred dinars." Hāfiz Salafī says: "No book has been written like *Hillīyyat al-Awliyā*." Abū Nu'aym was born at the beginning of 334 or 336, in Isfahan, and died in either 401 or 402, or 415 or 444, and was buried in the graveyard of Ābpakhshān.

347. The Banū Walī'a is a tribe from Kendah.

348. *Hillīyyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, pp. 66–67; *Maṭālib al-Sa'ūl*, pp. 21–22. Both follow the same phraseology, except for

إنه سفه من البلاء بشيء لم ينض به أحدنا من أصحابي.

349. Anas Ibn Mālik, the Prophet's servant, was from the tribe of Anṣār, and he naturally wanted the man with these attributes to be from the Anṣār.
350. *Ḥilliyyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, pp. 63–64; *Farā'id al-Simṭayn*; *Maṭālib al-Sa'ādī*, p. 21; *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 16 (and p. 18 according to another chain); see also Muhammad Ibn Mas'ūd Ayāsh, *Tafsīr al-Ayyūshī* (Qum: Maṭba'a 'Ilmiyya), vol. 2, p. 262; *Tafsīr al-Burhān*, vol. 2, p. 374; *Bihār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 290.
351. *Ḥilliyyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, p. 63.
352. *Ḥilliyyat al-Awliyā*, vol. 1, pp. 65–66.
353. Qur'an 10:35. We discussed this verse sufficiently in *Knowing the Imams*, vol. 1, lesson 12, and came to the conclusion that the Imam must be immaculate and free of any sin, and that he is guided by God, without man's interference in the matter.
354. *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 9, pp. 166–75. Some believe Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd to be a Shi'a and others a Sunni, because Mu'tazila was a Sunni. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd has made it clear that he was a Mu'tazila. In his *Aynīyya*, he says:

وَرَأَيْتُ دِينَ الْعِزَّالِ وَأَنْتَى أَمْوَى لِأَجْلِكَ كُلِّ مَنْ يَشِيعُ
وَلَقَدْ عَلِمْتُ بِأَنَّهُ لَا يَدْرِي مَنْ مَهْدِيكُمْ وَلِيَوْمِهِ أَتَوْقِعُ.

In the introduction to *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1, p. 15, Muhammad Abū al-Faḍl Ibrāhīm says:

لَمْ يَجْعَلِ إِلَى الْعِتْدَالِ، وَأَصْبَحَ كَمَا يَقُولُ صَاحِبُ نَسْمَةِ السَّحَرِ فِي ذِكْرِ مَنْ يَشِيعُ وَشَعْرٌ: مَعْتَرِئًا جَاحِظِيًّا فِي
أَكْثَرِ شَرْحِهِ لِلنَّهْجِ—بَعْدَ أَنْ كُنَّ شُعْبًا غَالِيًا...

Others have considered him a Sunni because he says in the preface to *Nahj al-Balāghah*:

الحمد لله الذي تفرَّد بالكمال... وقَدَّم المفضول على الأفضل لحيلة اقتضاهما التكليف.

However, this is not a good reason for his being a Sunni, because its purpose is to bring forth an outward presentation, not a factual religious one. The very statements we have explained here stand witness to our claim and are solid reasons for denying otherwise, which is clearly blasphemy.

All 24 of these hadiths are in *Ghāyat al-Marām*, pp. 494–97, followed by Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd's comments.

355. Ibn Shahr-Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 503.

356. Mīrzā Muhammad Taqī Sepehr, *Nāsikh al-Tawārikh; Lisān al-Mulk*, the section on Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib (n.p. Maṭbaʿa Ismlamiya, 1383 AH), part 5, pp. 63–64.
357. See Shaykh Bahāʾ al-Dīn Āmilī's explanation in his *Khulāsat al-Ḥisāb* (lithograph), p. 93.
358. Ali Ibn Husayn Masʿūdī, *Murūj al-Dhihab* (Egypt: Maṭbaʿa-yi Saʿādat, 1367 AH), vol. 2, p. 380.
359. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 419; *Biḥār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 583. In *al-Manāqib* (Ibn Shahr Āshūb), it is cited from Rāqib Isfahani's *al-Muhādīrāt*.
360. This hadith is mentioned in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 12, p. 76.
361. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd at the end of *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, has added one thousand words from the sermons and wisdom of Ali in the form of short sayings; number 250 is:

قَالَ فِي الْمَتَّبِعِ: "صَارَتْ مُنْهَاسًا" عَلَى الْبَيْتِ، وَمِنْ أَمْرِ الْحَبَابِ

362. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 268–69.
363. Sayyid Muḥsin Āmilī, in the section on Imam Ali in *ʿAjāʾib al-Aḥkām*, pp. 82–83, after mentioning this question according to the Sunni opinion, which the Shiʿa do not recognize as it rejects Ali's opinion, says:

Sayyid Murtaḍā says in *Intiṣār*:

However, the opponents' claim that Imam Ali believed in excessive assistance, by referring to him saying

صَارَتْ مُنْهَاسًا

from the pulpit, is absolutely wrong, because we have him saying just the opposite of the narrations. Our proof is the shining stars among the Household, like Imam Zayn al-Ābidīn, Imam Bāqir, Imam Ṣādiq, and Imam Kāzim.

These Imams of guidance are more familiar with the religion and the thoughts of their father than those who narrate otherwise. Ibn Abbās, who was known to be quite opposed to these kinds of questions, did not think Imam Ali's answer was wrong. The Sunnis' claim that Imam Ali believed in this question of "reliance" is drawn from a narration by Shaʿbī, Hasan, ʿAmarah, and Nakhaʿī. However, Shaʿbī was born in 36 AH, and Nakhaʿī was born in 37 AH, but Imam Ali was martyred in 40 AH. So how can their narration be correct? The historians

and narrators consider Hasan's narrations weak and unreliable, because they relied on the observations of oppressed people. In this respect, Sulaymān Ibn Mahrān A'mash said: "An oppressor has authority over the oppressed." And if all these narrators are faultless and correct, they cannot be opposed to the Sayyid and the religious leaders, such as Imam Ali, who supported the idea of generous assets. However, the problem of the hadith known as *ṣāra thamnuhā tisa'a* from Sufyān is that it is narrated by an unknown man. It cannot be considered important or worthy of mention, whereas what Imam Ali's companions narrated is reliable. Among these companions were some who narrated it because of its authenticity. They considered the term *thamān aw tisa'a* correct, or alternatively, they had it in mind to form the sentence as a question, but forgot to put a question mark at the end, as they had done in many other cases.

364. Āmilī has mentioned Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd's statement in *ʿAjāʾib al-Aḥkām*, p. 83.
365. *Maṭālib al-Saʿūl*, p. 28.
366. *Maṭālib al-Saʿūl* p. 28; Ibn Shahr Āshūb has this case of the dinar in his *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 269, but there seem to be some omissions in this copy, because after *wa minhu al-masʿalah al-dināriyah*, he adds *ṣūratuhā*. There is then nothing more in that version; in *al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaḳīm*, vol. 2, p. 21, the author has mentioned the story of ʿArghafah and Dināriyyah.
367. Shaykh Ḥurr al-Āmilī, *Wasāʾil al-Shiʿa* (lithograph, Bahāduri edition), vol. 2, p. 650, and Maktabat al-Islamiyyah (Tehran: 1388 AH), vol. 13, p. 284, narration no. 2. At the end of the book he has borrowed from Muhammad Ibn Yaʿqūb Kulaynī, from a group of the companions, from Sahl Ibn Ziyād, from Muʿāwiyah Ibn Ḥakīm, and from Abū Shuʿayb Muḥāmīlī Rufāʿī. At the end he also says that Shaykh Ṭūsī narrated it through his chains from Sahl Ibn Ziyād, and that it is in *Nihāyah* from Abū Shuʿayb Muḥāmīlī.
368. The narration of the Four Hundreds contains four rules that Imam Ali gave to his companions in a meeting. Shaykh Ṣadūq mentions this narration in his *Khiṣāl* (Ḥaydari publication), in the section "One Hundred and Above," to which we have referred here. As in *Khiṣāl*, the narration is also in *Wasāʾil al-Shiʿa* as follows:

قال: لا يبولن أحدكم في سطح الهواء، ولا يبولن في ماء جارٍ فإن فعل ذلك فأسأبه شيء فلا يبولن إلا نفسه، فإن الماء أملاً، وإذا بال أحدكم فلا يطعن ببوله ولا يستقبل ببوله الريح..

This is from the Amīr Bahādur edition, vol. 1, p. 47, and from the literary edition of *Islāmiyyah*, vol. 1, p. 249. In this copy, urinating in water is prohibited, as well as urinating upward or against the wind. In *Mustadrak*, vol. 1, p. 38, it is reported to be prohibited to urinate in both running and still water. And it has been narrated in *Ghawālī al-Laʿālī* from Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn, that the Prophet is quoted as saying: "None of you should urinate in running water, a well, a spring, or any other kind of running water." It also states in the same book by Fakhr al-Muḥaqqiqīn that there is another narration where Imam Ali says: "There are residents in the water, so try not to hurt them by urinating in it."

It is also narrated from Fakhr that urinating in running water causes the loss of control over urination, and passing stools in still water prevents the act of urinating. And in Shaykh Ṭūṣī's *Tahdhib*, vol. 1, p. 34, in connection to this narration, he mentions 90 chains from Mismaʿ, from Imam Ṣādiq, where Imam Ali says: "It is indeed prohibited for a man to pass a stool in running water, except in a time of emergency," adding: "There are some living residents in the water."

369. In the 27th supplication of *al-Shāḥifa al-Sajjādiyyah al-Kāmilah* (Tehran: Intishārāt Islāmiyyah), Imam Ali prays for the guardians and soldiers of Islam, and then curses the unbelievers.
370. *Furūʿ al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 323; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 268.
371. *Wasāʾil al-Shiʿa*, vol. 3, p. 504, and *Islāmiyyah* edition, vol. 19, p. 279. Following this hadith, Shaykh Ḥurr al-ʿĀmilī says that Ṣādūq also mentions it through his chains in the cases involving Imam Ali with the same phraseology and style. The only difference is that he says: "The Imam said: 'Three complete amounts of blood money must be paid.'" The Imam states in *al-Kāfi* and *Tahdhib*: "Three times the blood money," and the rest is omitted and not clearly emphasized.
372. Husayn Ibn Muhammad Ibn Taqī Nūrī (Muḥaddith Nūrī), *Mustadrak al-Wasāʾil* (lithograph, 1321), vol. 3, p. 284.
373. *Furūʿ al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 323, hadith no. 16; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 266, hadith no. 1047; *Wasāʾil al-Shiʿa*, vol. 3, p. 504, and *Islāmiyyah* edition, vol. 19, p. 283, hadith no. 2; *Mustadrak al-Wasāʾil* in the chapter of al-Diyāt narrated from Zarīf Ibn Nāṣih, vol. 3, p. 285;

- Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 509, where it is briefly explained.
374. *Mustadrak al-Wasā'il*, vol. 3, p. 284.
 375. One *dhirā'* is the distance from the fingertips to the elbow, which is approximately half a meter.
 376. *Mustadrak al-Wasā'il*, vol. 3, p. 284.
 377. *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 263, narration no. 1039; *Wasā'il al-Shi'a*, vol. 3, p. 503, and Islāmiyyah edition, vol. 19, p. 274, narration no. 4.
 378. Ibn Tāwūs, *al-Tashrīf bi al-Minan fi al-Ta'rif bi al-Fitan*, known as *al-Malāhim wa al-Fitan*, pp. 153–54.
 379. *Furū' al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 319, narration no. 1.
 380. *Mir'āt al-'Uqūl*, vol. 4, p. 203.
 381. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 509.
 382. *Furū' al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 361; *Tahdhib*, vol. 10, p. 278, narration no. 1086; *Man lā Yahḍurhu al-Faqih*, vol. 4, p. 128.
 383. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 497.
 384. An impotent man is unable to achieve an erection and is therefore unable to have full sex. In Islam, in such situation a woman is permitted to seek a divorce. The husband is to divorce her according to Islamic law and go his own way.
 385. If a man divorces a woman with whom he has not had intercourse, the woman does not have to wait the legal waiting period before remarrying.
 386. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 492.
 387. If a married man or woman commits adultery, and there are four witnesses to the fact, the religious punishment is lashing. This applies if the married couple are together, but it is not considered the same if they are separated. If adultery is proven, both parties should be given a hundred lashes as commanded in the Qur'an.
 388. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 492–93.
 389. According to the Shi'a, if a couple marries during the restricted period, but they are unaware of the fact and the marriage is not consummated, the marriage can take place after the restricted period. However, if they are aware of the restriction and the marriage has been consummated, the marriage is unlawful. We do not necessarily agree with this explanation, as we do not believe the chains are authentic. Majlisī explains in *Bihār al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 478: "We only mention this hadith to say that after the end of the restriction for remarrying, one can marry the woman in the right way, according to the contract in

Islamic law." The Sunnis are well aware that Imam Ali knows the case better.

390. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, pp. 492–93. Most Shi'a scholars have narrated the second narration, including Khārazmī in *al-Manāqib*, p. 57, and Najaf edition, p. 50. The final part of the hadith is: "Omar's verdict was changed to Ali's, upon him be peace." See also Sibṭ Ibn Juzī, *Tadhkirat al-Khawāṣṣ*, p. 87, and Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī, *al-Riyāḍ al-Nadarat*, vol. 3, p. 208. In *Dhakhā'ir al-'Uqbā*, p. 81, it is followed by his saying that Ibn Sammān has extracted this hadith from *al-Muwāfiqah*. It is also recorded by Bayhaqī in *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 7, pp. 441–42, where there are three narrations of Omar referring to Imam Ali for correct answers. In one of the narrations, Omar asked the man and the woman whether they were aware of the case or not. They both said they were ignorant, but he had them lashed even so. And in hadiths narrated by Bayhaqī, he states that Omar took away the dowry and sent it to the public treasury. Bayhaqī has narrated a hadith where Sha'bī said: "Ali separated the two and returned the dowry to the woman, for the man had had an affair with her." Shāfi'ī says: "We refer to Ali's verdict on this issue," and the Shaykh says: "Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb changed his mind and gave the dowry to the woman, and he said they could marry after the restriction was over."
391. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 493; Majlisī, in *Bilāḥ al-Anwār*, vol. 9, p. 478, after explaining this hadith with Fiḍḍa's words, has given another probability; in *Ghāyat al-Marām*, p. 531, narration no. 11, through the chains of Khārazmī, a Sunni, it is narrated that Ibn Abbās said:

We were in a funeral procession when Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib said to the husband of a young woman: "Keep away from your wife." Omar asked why, saying: "Change your opinion on what you said." Imam Ali said: "What we want is for her to be cleansed in the waiting period, so that nothing remains within her from her ex-husband to be a brother and inheritor, for the heritage should not be his." Omar said: "I take refuge in God for such a difficult problem."

392. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 492; this case, as well as the previous one that we explained, has been mentioned in *al-Ṣirāṭ al-Mustaḳīm*, vol. 2, pp. 16 and 17.
393. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 493. The narrator mentions this case in *ʿAjā'ib al-Aḥkām* from Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, quoting

- his father, through Muhammad Ibn Walīd, then Muhammad Ibn Furāt, from Aṣḥab Ibn Nubātah. See Āmilī's *ʿAjāʿib al-Aḥkām*, pp. 55-56.
394. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 496.
 395. *Qalūṣ* is a young newly-ridden female camel, and the plural is *qalāʾiṣ*.
 396. This means that a female animal has miscarried her young, and such an animal is called *khadij* or *mukhdij*. The miscarried young is called *khadij*, *khudūj*, or *mukhdaj*.
 397. *Dhakhāʾir al-ʿUqūbā*, p. 82; *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, pp. 205-6.
 398. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 497. ʿAllāmah Amīnī has narrated this in two different ways in *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 6, p. 119, hadith no. 22, from different sources and references, such as Ibn Juzī, *Sīrat al-Omar*; Abū Omar's *al-ʿIlm*; Suyūṭī, *Jamaʿ al-Jawāmiʿ*, quoting ʿAbd al-Razzāq; Bayhaqī and Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd from *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*. See also Shaykh Mufīd, *Irshād*, p. 113.
 399. *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 1, p. 58.
 400. Kulaynī, *al-Kāfi*, vol. 7, p. 80; Shaykh Ṭūsī, *Tahdhīb*, vol. 9, p. 249; and Ṣadūq, *Man lā Yahdurhu al-Faqīh*, vol. 4, p. 188, from Zuhri, quoting ʿUbaydullah Ibn Abdullah Ibn ʿUtaba as saying:

Once I was sitting and talking with Ibn Abbās about different things, when we happened to speak about the obligations pertaining to heritage. Ibn Abbās said: "O glory be to God! Do you believe that God, Who is aware of all the little sands in the earth, is not aware of the half and one-third shares in inheritance? The two halves inherit the whole property, so what is the relationship of one-third?" And Zufar Ibn Aws Baṣrī asked: "O Ibn Abbās, who first said that canonical obligations have priority over the shares in inheritance?" Ibn Abbās said:

It was Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb who said so, when he noticed that some of the canonical obligations did not go together with others. He said that he did not understand which has priority in the sight of God, and which is secondary, and saw nothing wrong in sharing the inheritance equally. Therefore, he delivered the inheritance according to the theory that everyone's share was the same. However, if he had considered what God considers having priority, the canonical obligations would not exceed the due shares. Any canonical obligations that God does not consider less in priority means it has priority. And whatever canonical obligations seem to

have priority are right in the first place. The rest of the canonical obligations go to the inheritors, and nothing more has been assigned by God.

Then Zufar Ibn Aws asked Abbās: "Then why did you not mention this to Omar?" He answered: "I was afraid of him." Zuhri, the narrator of this hadith, said: "By God, if there had been no just Imam before Ibn Abbās, I would not doubt his knowledge, since he could solve problems without creating differences between the parties."

The Sunnis have narrated the complete hadith: see Bayhaqī, *Sunan*, vol. 6, p. 253; Hākim, *Mustadrak ala al-Ṣaḥīḥayn*, vol. 4, p. 340; Mullā Ali Muttaqī, *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, 1st edition, vol. 6, p. 7; and Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn Ali Jeṣṣās, *Aḥkām al-Qurʿan* (1347 AH), vol. 2, p. 109.

It is most strange that Omar's followers considered his appalling presence as a virtue. Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd said: "Omar Ibn Khaṭṭāb was a very frightful man. He was great in politics. He was considered noble among the companions, and it was hard to withstand his fearful look." He continues in this way up to the end of vol. 1, pp. 173–74.

401. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 500.
402. *Mawaddat al-Qurbā*, published in the book of Yanābiʿ *al-Mawaddah*, p. 254; *Mawaddat al-Qurbā*, p. 7.
403. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, p. 78, pp. 77–78.
404. *al-Ghadīr*, vol. 2, p. 299, where along with a translation of the poem *Ghadīr*, ʿAbdī Kūfī mentions this hadith.
405. This part is redundant, and is added by those who believe the Qurʿan to be uncreated.
406. Muhammad Ibn Yūsuf Ganjī, *Kifāyat al-Ṭālib fi Manāqib Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib* (Najaf: Maṭbaʿa-yi Ḥayyadariyya, 1390 AH), pp. 218–19.
407. Abdul al-Husayn Sharaf al-Dīn al-Mūsawī al-Āmilī, *Fuṣūl al-Muhimmah* (Najaf: Maṭbaʿa-yi ʿAdl), p. 17.
408. The long chapters are the seven chapters at the beginning of the Qurʿan, which the Prophet called the lengthy verses, namely, Baqara, Āl Imrān, Nisā, Māʿida, Anʿām, Aʿrāf, and Yūnus. When compiling the Qurʿan, Othman made the two chapters of Anfāl and Tawbah into one chapter, mainly because they did not commence with the Bismillāh. He took them both as a long chapter and placed them before the chapter Yūnus. But when this was questioned, and he was told that the

Prophet placed the chapter Yūnus after Aʿrāf, he said that he was unaware of the Prophet's decision. See Muhammad H. Ṭabāṭabāʾī, *Mihr-i Tābān* (Qum: Intishārāt Bāqir al-ʿUlūm, n.d.) part 2, pp. 89–90.

409. *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 12, pp. 46–47, and Beirut edition vol. 3, p. 105.
410. Ibn Shahr Āshūb, *al-Manāqib*, vol. 1, p. 499. Muḥibb al-Dīn Ṭabarī has narrated this hadith in his *al-Riyāḍ al-Naḍara*, vol. 3, pp. 208–9; Bayhaqī narrates it in *al-Sunan al-Kubrā*, vol. 8, p. 236; Shaykh Muʿīd also narrates it in *Irshād*, p. 114, where, at the end of the hadith, he says that when Omar heard the woman's claim, he set her free.
411. Tustarī, *al-Qaḍāʾ*, p. 276; Ghazzālī has narrated it in *Iḥyāʾ al-ʿUlūm*, vol. 2, 176:

On a certain night, when Omar was searching things in Medina, he suddenly saw a man committing adultery with a woman.

When morning approached, he asked the people in the town: "You tell me if an Imam saw someone committing adultery, what he should do with them. Would you object to the Imam's lashing them?" They asked: "Why? Are you the Imam?"

In the meantime, Ali said:

لَيْسَ ذَٰلِكَ لَكَ إِذَا يُعَامُ عَلَيْكَ الْحَدُّ أَنَّ اللَّهَ لَيَأْخُذُ بِهَذَا الْأَمْرِ أَقْلَ مِنْ أَرْبَعَةِ شُهَدَاءِ

"This is not your right to do! In that case, you must also be lashed, as God has assigned four witnesses for such a crime!"

After that, Omar left them on their own until God wanted to punish them. Later on, once again he asked the same question from some other people. They answered him as the others had told him before. Ali also said the same thing he had previously said.

Here, Ghazzālī says:

In this case, it points to Omar's hesitation that whether a ruler or judge has a right to make any judgment on such cases. Therefore, he put the subject forward with those about him to know that it was not his responsibility to carry it out. He wanted to show his impartiality in the case. This is a key reason that the religion considers the ugly affairs to be covered. The ugliest affair is adultery, and four witnesses are needed to bear witness that the crime has been committed. However, this kind of witnessing never

happens, and if the judge personally comes to know it, he has no right to reveal it.

412. *Tafsir al-Durr al-Manthūr*, vol. 6, p. 93, following Qurʿān 49:12: *O you who believe! Avoid much suspicion, for some suspicion is a sin. And spy not each other behind their backs. Would any of you like to eat the flesh of his dead brother? You would abhor that (so abhor the other). And fear God; for God is Relenting, Merciful;* Having explained this hadith, in *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād* p. 256, the author in the annotation says: "Kharāʾitī has mentioned this hadith in *Makārim al-Akhlaq*, and that is hadith number 3696 in *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, the second part, p. 167; Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd has mentioned it in *Sharḥ Nahj al-Balāghah*, vol. 2, 96; Ghazzālī has mentioned it in his *Iḥyāʾ al-ʿUlūm*, 137.
413. *Tafsir Majmaʿ al-Bayān*, vol. 5, p. 135; Thaʿlabī, *Tafsir Abū al-Futūḥ Rāzī* (Muzaffarī publication, n.d.), vol. 5, pp. 123–24.
414. *Tustarī, al-Qadāʾ*, p. 261.
415. In *al-Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād*, pp. 256–57, from Abū al-Shaykh, in the book of al-Qaṭʿ wa Sirqat, according to the author of *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*, p. 141, from the second section, hadith 3354 has narrated from Sudday:

Once Omar set out together with ʿAbdullāh Ibn Masʿūd, he noticed a light in a distance, and went towards it until he reached a house, went inside, and saw there was a light inside the room. While entering the room, he let Ibn Masʿūd stay outside. When he stepped in, he saw an old shaykh sitting with a goblet with some wine in front of him, and a woman also sitting next to him and singing!

The old man did not notice him until Omar attacked him all of a sudden, and said: "I have never seen before an aged man like you, who is near death, do such an ugly thing!" The shaykh raised his head, gazed at him, and said: "Yes, you are right, but this entering of you into my room, without my permission, is even worse! Now, you have interfered in someone's business, and God has prohibited entering someone's privacy!" Omar considered for a while and then said: "You are right." And then, while biting the edge of his robe, he cried and left the room! On the way back, he said to himself: "Omar, may your mother weep over your grave!"

It is narrated that since then, the old man did not take part in Omar's usual sessions. Once, when Omar was present in the session, the old man disguised himself, so as not to be recognized,

and entered the room and sat among the people. Omar saw the newcomer and told someone to bring him closer to him. They instructed the man to do what Omar said. The man stood up, and it was in his mind that Omar would do something wrong against him. In any case, he went closer to Omar, and Omar asked him to sit beside him. When he was seated, Omar whispered to him something like: "By God who has sent Muhammad, I have not revealed your secret to anyone. I have not told it to Ibn Mas'ūd, either!"

416. The complete verse is: *And We send down from the sky rain charged with blessing, and We produce therewith gardens and grain for harvests; and tall (and stately) palm trees, with shoots of fruit stalks, piled one over another, as sustenance for (God's) servants, and We give new life therewith to land that is dead: thus will be the Resurrection.*
417. The complete verse is: *And your Lord taught the bee to build its cells in hills, on trees, and in (men's) habitations; then to eat of all the produce (of the earth), and find with skill the spacious paths of its Lord: there issues from within their bodies a drink of varying colours, wherein is healing for men. Verily in this is a sign for those who give thought.*
418. The complete verse is: *And give the women (on marriage) their dower as a free gift; but if they of their own good pleasure remit any part of it to you, take it and enjoy it with right good cheer.*
419. See *Tafsīr al-'Ayyāshī*, vol. 1, p. 21; *Bihār al-Anwār*, vol. 14, p. 865; *Tafsīr al-Būrḥān*, vol. 1, p. 341; Muḥsin Fayḍ Kāshānī, *Tafsīr al-Ṣāfi* (Tab' Islamiyyah, 1384 AH), vol. 1, p. 332; *Tafsīr Majma' al-Bayān*, vol. 2, p. 7 (Ṣaydā edition); *Wasā'il al-Shi'a*, vol. 3, chapter of al-Mewar, section 25, and chapter of al-Aḥ'anna wa al-Mubāḥat, section 49.
420. *Tafsīr Majma' al-Bayān*, vol. 2, p. 7.
421. *al-Kashshāf*, vol. 1, p. 408.

INDEX

Qur'anic References

- 2:30–33, 268
2:31, 55
2:189, 35, 38, 196, 238
2:233, 276
2:246–47, 6
2:247, 267
2:269, 189
3:18, 3
3:61, 17
3:146–48, 5
4:4, 240
4:11, 113
4:12, 152
4:20–21, 158
4:54, 7
4:113, 70
4:176, 152
5:90, 283
5:93, 160
6:164, 276
7:29, 4
7:172, 285
8:41, 284
8:75, 243
9:60, 285
9:100, 240
10:35, 267, 289
13:43, 19
14:34, 272
16:43, 55
16:68–69, 240
17:15, 276
18:66, 25
18:66–67, 25
18:69, 25
18:70, 25
18:71, 26
18:72, 26
18:73, 26
18:74, 26
18:75, 26
18:76–77, 26
18:77–78, 27
20:114, 9
23:12–14, 162
30:56, 19
35:18, 276
38:26, 191
39:7, 276
39:8, 264
39:9, 99, 267
46:45, 139
48:29, 14
49:12, 298
50:9–11, 239
53:38, 276
57:25, 5
59:10, 14, 243
62:3, 243
65:12, 9
66:4, 263
69:12, 56
75:36, 112
78:17, 269
80:31–32, 264
80:32, 279
96:1–5, 9

A

- Aaron, 12
 Ābādī, Firūz, 71
 Ābādī, Mir Muḥammad
 Husayn Khātūn, 288
Abāna, 109
abb, meaning of, 145–51
 Abbād, Ṣāhib Ibn, 44, 101
 Abbās, Abdullah Ibn, 283
 Abbās, ‘Abd al-Muḥaymin, 62
 Abbās, Ibn, 17, 19, 20, 21, 22,
 24, 27, 35, 42, 48, 49, 54, 55,
 57, 58, 67, 70, 71, 72, 76, 77,
 78, 79, 80, 82, 84, 100, 101,
 134, 145, 149, 168, 191, 193,
 205, 231, 246, 253, 256, 263,
 264, 269, 271, 275, 278, 279,
 283, 290, 294, 295, 296
 Abbās, Muḥammad Ibn, 100
 ‘Abdī, Abū Hārūn, 180, 181,
 192, 232
 Abdullah, Abbād Ibn, 247
 Abdullah, Abū al-Faḍl
 Muḥammad Ibn, 62, 79,
 124, 164
 Abdullah, Ibrāhīm Ibn, 222
 Abdullah, Jābir Ibn, 71, 72, 77
 Abdullah, Jarīr Ibn, 238
 Abdullah, Maṣqalat Ibn, 232
 Abdullah, Sa‘d Ibn, 39, 179
 Abdullah, Sarī Ibn, 245
 Abdullah, Sharīk Ibn, 82
 Abdullah, ‘Umayr Ibn, 193
 Ābidīn, Imam Zayn al-, 290
 Abūdhār, 21, 62, 198
 Adam, 181, 268
 Ādam, Majdūd Ibn, 248
 ‘Addī, Haytham, 156
Adhkiyā, al-, 132
 Adi, Ibn, 82, 84
Aḥkāmi al-Qur’an, 296
 Ahmad, 109, 153, 198, 200,
 205, 206, 207, 208, 209, 277
 Ahmad, Abū Abdullah, 205,
 255
 Ahmad, Sahl Ibn, 184
 ‘Ajā‘ib Aḥkāmi Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib,
 270
 ‘Ajā‘ib Aḥkāmi Amīr al-
 Mu‘minīn, 107, 117, 127,
 131, 142, 267, 272, 273, 274,
 278, 290, 291, 294, 295
 Ajālī, 82
 ‘Ajlūnī, 91, 256
Akhbār al-Makka, 166
Akhbār al-Zurraf, 132
 Akrama, 149, 193
 ‘Alā, ‘Abd al-, 158
 ‘Alā, Shaykh Muḥammad
 Muṣṭafā Abū al-, 257
 ‘Alā‘ī, Ḥāfiz Ṣalāh al-Dīn, 71,
 81, 82
A‘lām, 258
 ‘Ālam, Mīrzā Muḥammad
 Ṣadr al-, 71
 ‘Alawī, Abū Muqātil Ibn Dā‘ī,
 20
 ‘Alāyālī, Shaykh Abdullah,
 107
Alfiyah, 285
 Ali, Abū Bakr Muḥammad
 Ibn, 77
 Ali, Ahmad Ibn, 274
 Ali, Hasan Ibn Muḥammad
 Ibn ‘Abd al-Karīm Abī, 179
 Ali, Muḥammad Ibn, 48, 88
 Ali, Shahāb al-Dīn Abū al-
 Faḍl Ahmad Ibn. *See*
 Asqalanī, Ibn Ḥajar
 Ali, Zayd Ibn, 19, 136, 276
 Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib
 answer to the Jewish
 scholar, 154–55

(Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, cont.)

as advisor to Omar, 69, 74,
75, 101, 110, 111, 132, 133,
138, 144, 221, 223, 224,
226, 227, 228, 229, 231,
235, 269, 294
as beloved, 30
as best judge, 15, 21, 42, 92,
103, 104, 105, 109, 116,
190, 191, 193, 209, 247, 266
as brother to Muhammad,
74, 94, 145, 184, 199, 207
as Chief of the Muslims, 74,
92
as Commander of the
Believers, 59, 74
as divider of Heaven and
the Fire, 196
as Emir and Commander,
46, 47, 61, 72, 202
as envoy for Muhammad,
108
as first to believe, 24, 209
as Gate of Wisdom, 58, 84
as Gate to the City of
Jurisprudence, 61, 75
as Gate to the City of
Knowledge, 15, 17, 18, 36,
39, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 48,
49, 50, 51, 52, 54, 55, 56,
57, 59, 60, 62, 63, 69, 70,
72, 73, 76, 77, 79, 89, 92,
93, 95, 184, 196, 262, 263
as Gate to the City of
Paradise, 57, 58
as Gate to the City of
Wisdom, 36, 54, 57, 58, 61,
62
as Gate to the House of
Wisdom, 57, 58, 73, 82

(Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, cont.)

as Guardian, 8, 43, 44, 53,
60, 105, 170, 185, 199, 200,
204, 267, 273
as Guide to the City of
Knowledge, 184
as Imam, 29, 30, 54, 59, 199
as inheritor of
Muhammad's
knowledge, 21, 22, 28, 69,
74, 75, 102, 196, 263, 272
as Key to the House of
Wisdom, 57
as Master and Sayyid of all
the Arabs, 50, 202
as most learned, 10, 11, 14,
15, 19, 20, 21, 22, 42, 43,
63, 69, 70, 101, 102, 103,
104, 105, 106, 108, 190,
193, 209, 239, 246, 247
as Pans of the Balance of
Wisdom, 73
as single light with
Muhammad, 205
as solver of problems, 23,
24, 74, 75, 92, 192, 268
as source of all knowledge,
68
as successor to Muhammad,
7, 14, 22, 28, 30, 45, 52, 53,
54, 60, 62, 74, 92, 105, 184,
202, 204
as Tongue of the Balance of
Wisdom, 73
attributes of, 17, 28, 184,
192, 200, 209, 210
caliphate of, 8, 15, 23, 92,
108, 113, 239
chastity of, 43, 208
door to the mosque, 208
generosity of, 93, 94, 144,
184

(Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, cont.)

- humility of, 210
- judgment of Aqaba, 227
- judgment of Fiqda, 226, 227
- judgment of the abstaining husband, 235–36
- judgment of the adulterous man, 225
- judgment of the adulterous woman, 132–36
- judgment of the adulterous woman (2), 225
- judgment of the adulterous woman (3), 236–37
- judgment of the beheading, 163–64
- judgment of the bitten man, 218–19, 219–20
- judgment of the blood money for abortion, 162–64
- judgment of the camels, 211–12
- judgment of the cow and donkey, 125–28
- judgment of the dinar, 216–17
- judgment of the five adulterers, 227
- judgment of the horse, 266, 273
- judgment of the impotent husband, 224–25
- judgment of the inheritance, 214–16
- judgment of the lion's ditch, 117–23
- judgment of the loaves, 114–16
- judgment of the loss of vision, 219

(Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, cont.)

- judgment of the loss of vision (2), 220–21
- judgment of the master and servant, 113–14
- judgment of the miscarriage, 230–32
- judgment of the murder, 222–24
- judgment of the newborn child, 110–12, 237, 269
- judgment of the ornaments of Mecca, 164–66
- judgment of the ostrich egg, 228–30
- judgment of the restricted marriage, 226
- judgment of the shortness of breath, 222
- judgment of the slave girl's child, 108–12
- judgment of the slave girl's divorce, 232
- judgment of the stoning of the adulterous woman, 142, 143
- judgment of the stoning of the mother, 138–41
- judgment of the stoning of the pregnant woman, 136–38, 275
- judgment of the three performing women, 123–25
- judgment of the well, 217
- judgment of the woman who denied her son, 128–31, 274
- judgment of the women entrusted with goods, 131–32

(Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, cont.)
 knowledge of the Qur'an,
 70, 92, 246
 miracle of the division of
 the coins, 212–14
 numerology of, 103
 obedience to, 50, 60, 75, 105,
 199, 213
 on alcohol, 160–62, 284
 on inheritance, 151
 on lust, 224
 on stomachache, 239
 on the Black Stone of the
 Ka'ba, 181
 on urination, 218, 292
 piety of, 197
 slapping the
 circumabulator, 257
 taking a slave girl, 204
 to Muhammad as Aaron
 was to Moses, 12, 28, 63
 told to pay homage to the
 usurpers, 8
Aliyyun a'lam, 105
 Ālūsī, Sayyid Muhammad,
 243
 Ālūsī, 242, 243
 A'mā, Ibn Jābir, 255
 'Amā, Zayd al-, 190
Amālī, 50, 51, 52, 57, 61, 87,
 120, 245, 253, 266
Amālī (Ibn Bābwayh), 21
Amālī (Ṭūsī), 21
 Amāma, Abū, 21, 104
 'Amarah, 290
 A'mash, Sulaymān Ibn
 Mahrān Abū Muhammad
 Asadī, 24, 48, 55, 56, 58, 76,
 77, 78, 79, 80, 82, 83, 84, 87,
 116, 226, 253, 259, 291
 Āmilī, 291, 292

Āmilī, Abdul al-Husayn
 Sharaf al-Dīn al-Mūsawī al,
 107, 258, 268, 272, 282, 283,
 296
 Āmilī, Sayyid Muḥsin Amīn
 Jabal, 107, 117, 121, 127,
 131, 267, 270, 290
 Āmilī, Shaykh Bahā' al-Dīn,
 212, 290
 Āmilī, Shaykh Ḥurr al-, 107,
 291
 'Āmilī, Zayn al-Dīn Ali al-,
 271
 Amīn, 267
 Amīnī, 182, 233, 295
 Amīnī, Allāmah, 62, 71, 91,
 107, 131, 132, 135, 138, 142,
 159, 166, 245
 Amīr, Ibn Abī, 269
Amīr al-Mu'minīn, 286
 'Ammār, 21, 213
Amthāl wa Ḥikam, 279
 Amulī, Sayyid Muḥsin Jabal,
 142, 258, 275, 282, 283
 Anas, Mālīk Ibn, 56, 89, 91,
 147, 150, 202, 278, 279, 280
 Anbārī, Ibn al-, 147
 Anbartī, Qāsim Ibn 'Abd al-
 Raḥmān, 79, 83
Ansāb al-Ashraf, 65, 86
 Anṣārī, 'Amr Ibn Āmir, 243
 Anṣārī, Ḥāfiz Jamal al-Dīn
 Muhammad Ibn Yūsuf
 Zarandī, 66
 Anṣārī, Jābir Ibn Abdullah,
 21, 46, 49, 51, 60, 61, 66
 Aqaba, 'Aqabat Ibn Abī, 227
 'Aqabat, Sa'd Ibn, 56
'Aqabat al-Anwār, 62
 'Aqīl, Yaḥyā Ibn, 213, 224
 'Aqīlī, 277

- Arabi, al-Shaykh al-Akbar al-
 Ārif bi Allah Muḥy al-Dīn
 Ibn, 65, 249
- Arbaʿin, al-*, 22, 107, 138, 236,
 278, 287
- Arbili, Ali Ibn ʿIṣā, 262
- ʿArf al-Warāʾi fī Akhbār al-
 Mahdī, 186
- ʿArghafah, 291
- ʿĀrifin, Hāfiz Shaykh ʿAbd al-
 Raʿūf Ibn Tāj al-, 69
- Arqam, Abdullah Ibn, 238
- Arqam, Zayd Ibn, 109
- Asad, 167
- Asadī, Muhammad Ibn Qays,
 107
- Asadī, Tamīm Ibn Ḥazām,
 113
- Asākar, Ibn, 46, 47, 89, 192,
 233, 249, 252, 253, 254, 285,
 286
- Aṣamm, Abdullah Ibn ʿAbd
 al-Raḥmān, 120
- Aṣamm, Abū al-Abbās, 79
- Asbaʿ, Abū al-, 116
- Aṣbaq, Ghasim Ibn, 116
- Ashʿarī, Abū Mūsā, 214
- Ashʿath, Abī Dāwūd
 Sulaymān Ibn, 276
- Āshūb, Ibn Sharh, 19, 47, 64,
 87, 88, 99, 101, 106, 107, 109,
 111, 113, 120, 121, 124, 127,
 131, 132, 133, 137, 139, 146,
 157, 161, 162, 165, 211, 213,
 214, 215, 222–33, 245, 248,
 249, 250, 251, 267, 269, 270,
 271, 272, 273, 278, 281, 283,
 284, 285, 288, 289, 290, 291,
 293–97
- ʿAṣīdat al-Shuhadā fī Sharḥ
Qaṣīdat Burda, 70
- ʿAṣīm, 71, 121
- ʿĀsimī, Abū Muhammad, 245,
 257
- Askarī, Imam Muhammad
 Hasan, 107, 281
- Aslamī, Abū Barzā, 199
- Aslamī, Burayda, 204
- Asnā al-Maṭālib fī Manāqib*, 67
- ʿAsqalānī, Ahmad Ibn Ali Ibn
 Ḥajar al-, 67, 83, 84, 135,
 148, 247, 258, 259, 276
- Astarābādī, Abū Saʿīd Ismāʿīl
 Ibn Muthannā, 89
- Aswad, Abū al-, 277
- ʿAtaʾ, 19, 35, 133, 149
- Ata Turk (Muṣṭafā Kamāl
 Pāshā), 173
- Athūr, Ibn, 150, 253
- ʿAṭīyah, 228
- Aṭṭar, Hasan Ibn Muzaffar
 Ibn Ahmad, 46
- Aṭṭar, Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn
 Khalaf, 62
- Audī, ʿAmr Ibn Maymūn, 52
- ʿAuf, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn, 16,
 23
- ʿAunī, 20, 105
- ʿAwfī, 280
- Aws, Zufar Ibn, 296
- Awwal, Shahīd al-, 119
- Ayāsh, Muhammad Ibn
 Masʿūd, 289
- ʿĀyisha, 202, 263
- ʿĀyisha, Muhammad Ibn, 16
- ʿAynī, Mahmud Ibn Ahmad,
 135, 142, 182, 276
- Aynīyah, Ibn, 259
- Aynīyya*, 289
- ʿAyyāsh, Abū Bakr Ibn, 116,
 264
- ʿAyyāsh, Ismāʿīl Ibn, 109

‘Ayyāshī, 39, 239
 Ayyūb, Ahmad Ibn Sayyār
 Ibn, 78
 Ayyūb, Faḍālat Ibn, 265
 Azīz, Ḥāfiz ‘Izz al-Dīn ‘Abd
 al-. See Shāfi‘ī, Ibn Fahd
 Hāshimī Makkī
 Azīz, Omar Ibn ‘Abd al-, 134,
 259
 Azraq, Nāfi‘ Ibn, 149
 Azraqī, 182

B

bāb (door or gate), 91, 92, 262,
 263
 Bābwayh, Ibn, 21, 58, 59, 60,
 124
 Badakhshānī, Mīrzā
 Muhammad, 71
Badī‘iyah, al-, 211
 Baghawī, 256
 Baghdādī, Ḥāfiz Abū Bakr
 Ahmad Ibn Ali Khaṭīb, 22,
 64, 71, 160, 258
 Baghdādī, Ḥāfiz Muḥibb al-
 Dīn Muhammad Ibn
 Mahmud Ibn Najjār, 65
 Baghdadī Muhammad Ibn
 Mumammad Ibn Nu‘mān,
 268
 Baghdādī, Shahāb al-Dīn
 Sayyid Mahmud Ibn
 Abdullah Ālūsī, 71
 Bahā‘ī, Shaykh, 107, 288
 Bahā’ism, 172, 175
 Bahman, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān
 Ibn, 252
Bahr al-Asānīd fi Ṣaḥīḥ al-
Asānī, 64
 Bahrānī, Sayyed Hāshim, 46,
 245, 286

Bajalī, Muhammad Ibn Qays,
 107, 272
 Bajalī, Sa‘īd Ibn Abū al-
 Khaṭīb, 265
 Bakhsh, Shams al-Dīn
 Muhammad Ibn Yaḥyā
 Jilānī Lāhijī Nūr, 67
 Bakr, Abū, 7, 11, 16, 54, 65, 89,
 90, 101, 116, 125, 127, 145,
 146, 147, 148, 150, 151, 152,
 153, 154, 155, 156, 157, 245,
 266, 271, 280
 Bakr, the son of Abdullah
 Mudhnī, 159
 Balādhārī, 23, 166
 Baladī, Nu‘mān Ibn Hārūn, 77
 Bāqī, Muhammad Fu‘ād ‘Abd
 al-, 171, 172, 173, 286
 Bāqir, Abī Ja‘far Muhammad,
 19, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 51, 60,
 100, 121, 126, 127, 191, 222,
 240, 250, 266, 272, 273, 290
 Baraqānī, 81
 Barqī, Ahmad Ibn
 Muhammad Ibn Khālīd, 36,
 100
 Baṣārī, ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd Ibn
 Baḥr, 61
Basāy’ir al-Darajāt, 100
 Bashnawī, 43
 Baṣīr, Abū, 19
 Baṣrī, Ḥāfiz Abū Bakr Ahmad
 Ibn Omar, 64
 Baṣrī, Hasan, 134, 140, 275
 Baṣrī, Mu‘allā Ibn
 Muhammad, 107
 Baṣrī, Zufar Ibn Aws, 295
 Baṭṭah, Ibn, 23, 42, 61, 109
 Bayādī, Āmīlī Nabāṭī, 267, 271
 Bayādī, Zayn al-‘Ābidīn Ali
 Ibn Yūnus Āmīlī, 272
Bayān al-Sa‘āda, 37

Bayāzī, Ali Ibn Yūsuf Āmili
 Nabāṭī, 262, 263
 Bayhaqī, Ībrāhīm Ibn
 Muhammad, 16, 24, 135,
 140, 142, 153, 182, 183, 200,
 247, 270, 275, 279, 280, 294,
 295, 296, 297
 Behbahānī, Mawlā
 Muhammad Bāqir Wāhid,
 87
Bidāyat wa al-Nihāyah fi Tārikh,
 al-, 254, 268, 271
Bihār al-Anwār, 107, 131, 162,
 219, 245, 248, 265, 269, 271,
 272, 274, 276, 277, 282, 283,
 285, 289, 290, 293, 294, 299
 Birr, Ḥāfiz Abū Omar wa
 Yūsuf Ibn Abdullah Ibn
 ‘Abd al-, 64, 116, 133, 140,
 270
Bishārat al-Muṣṭafā, 277
 Black Stone of the Ka’ba, 170,
 172, 180, 181, 182, 285
 blood money, 117, 118, 119,
 120, 121, 122, 124, 158, 162,
 163, 164, 218, 219, 220, 231,
 270, 281, 292
Book of Ḥajj, The, 166
Budūr al-Sāfirah fi al-Umūr al-
 Ākhirah, al-, 181
 Bukhārī, Muhammad Ibn
 Ismā‘īl, 71, 76, 82, 135, 150,
 166, 182, 183, 275
 Buraydah, Abū, 7, 8, 245
 Burhān, 38
 Būrīnī, Shaykh Hasan, 256
 Būshīrī, Sharaf al-Dīn Abū
 Abdullah Muhammad Ibn
 Sa‘īd Dalāshī Miṣrī, 68, 256
 Buṭriq, Ibn, 286

C

Christians, 10
 circumambulation, 163, 168,
 169, 170, 181
Commands of Imam Ali, The,
 131
 companions of the Prophet,
 13, 14, 16

D

Da‘ā’im al-Islām, 219
 Dahān, Sulaymān, 220
 Daḥlān, Ahmad Zaynī, 182
 Da‘laj, 81
 Ḍamara, ‘Āṣim Ibn, 253
 Damishqī, Ibn Asākar, 65
 Damishqī, Ibn Kathīr, 119,
 142, 254, 278
 Darāquṭnī, Ḥāfiz, 82, 86, 233
 Dardā, Abū, 192
 Darīd, Ibn, 75
 Darīmī, 280
 Darvāzeh Qur’an, 174–75
 David, Prophet, 110, 190
 Dawāniqī, Manṣūr, 163, 164
 Dawrī, Abbās Ibn
 Muhammad, 76, 80, 82, 86
 Dāwūd, Abū, 109, 135, 268
 Dāwūd, ‘Amr Ibn, 82, 226, 227
 Daylamī, 62, 255, 256
 Daylamī, Firdaws, 90
 Daylamī, Ibn Shīrūyah, 102
Death of Imam Ridā, The, 85
 Deh-Khodā, 279
 Dehlawī, Shaykh Walī Allāh,
 283
 Dhahabī, Abū Abdullah
 Muhammad Ibn Ahmad,
 48, 64, 81, 83, 84, 86, 160,
 258, 260, 283

Dhahabī, Shams al-Din Ḥāfiz, 288
 Dhakariyā, Imam, 77
Dhakhā'ir al-ʿUqbā, 66, 138, 229, 256, 269, 271, 274, 275, 275, 277, 294, 295
 Dhuḥā, Abū al-, 226
 Dihlawī, ʿAbd al-Ḥaqq, 70
 Dīn, Sayyid Shahāb al-, 74
 Dināriyyah, 291
Dirāya, al-, 255
Divān, 249
Divān (Elegy) of Ozrī, 264
Divān (Maybudī), 256
 door to the heart, 38
 Dourī, Abbās Ibn
 Muhammad, 116, 259
 Duʿailī, Abī al-Ḥarb Ibn Abī al-Aswad, 140, 141
Durr al-Maknūn wa al-Jawhar al-Maṣūn, al-, 65
Durr al-Manthūr, 36, 140, 141, 142, 148, 159, 238, 242, 243, 277, 278, 279, 280, 281, 298
Durr al-Munazzm, al-, 65

E

entering a city through its gate. *See* *bāb* (door or gate)
 entering a house from the back, 35, 36, 38, 39, 40, 72, 195, 196
Exceptional Instructions, The, 267

F

Faḍā'il al-Makka, 182
Faḍā'il al-Ṣaḥāba, 109, 191

Faḍā'il Ali Ibn Abi Ṭālib, 61, 109, 146, 198, 200, 201, 205, 206, 207, 208, 268
 Faḍḍāl, Ali Ibn, 19, 220
 Faḍl, Hasan Ibn, 262
 Faham, Husayn Ibn, 77
Fāṣiq, 64
 Faraghānī, Saʿīd al-Dīn
 Muhammad Ibn Aḥmad, 66, 256
Farā'id al-Simṭayn, 66, 74, 192, 246, 253, 255, 265, 289
 Faraj, Abū al-, 83
 Farīḍ, Ibn, 66, 255
 Farqad, Dāwūd Ibn, 265
 Fars, Ibn, 56
 Fārsī, Salmān, 10, 21, 247
 Farwah, Sufyān Ibn, 7, 116
Fatāwī' al-Ḥadithah, al-, 69, 90
Faṭḥ al-Bārī, 135, 148, 166, 276, 279
Faṭḥ al-Malik al-Ali bi Ṣiḥḥat Bāb al-Madīnat 'Ilm al-Ali, 62, 258
 Fāṭimah, 53, 168, 184, 209, 226, 247
 Faṭsā, 159
Fayḍ al-Qadīr, 69, 75
 Faydī, 84
 Fayṣal, Malik, 173
 Fazārī, Ismāʿīl Ibn Mūsā, 82
 Fiḍḍa, 226, 294
 Fidī, Muhammad Ibn Jaʿfar, 55, 64, 76, 77, 80
 Firdaws, 91, 205
Firdaws al-Akḥbār, 49, 256
 Firūzābādī, Majd al-Dīn
 Muhammad Ibn Yaʿqūb, 67, 71
 Fuʿād, Malik, 173
 Fuḍayl, Muhammad Ibn, 19

Furāt, Muhammad Ibn, 295
Furūc al-Kāfi, 270, 273, 274,
 284, 292, 293
Fuṣūl al-Muḥimmah, al-, 67,
 252, 296
Futūḥ al-Buldān, 156
Futūḥāt al-Islāmiyyah, 182
Futyāy, 226

G

Gabriel, 54, 206, 242
 Ganjī, 74, 138, 233
 Ganjī, Abū Abdullah, 74
 Ganjī, Muhammad Ibn Yūsuf,
 296
 Gate to the City of
 Knowledge. *See* Ali Ibn Abī
 Ṭālib, as Gate to the City of
 Knowledge
 Ghadā'irī, Ibn, 125
 Ghadīr, 'Abd al-, 248
Ghadīr, al-, 62, 63 107, 142, 166,
 182, 233, 250, 251, 255, 256,
 258, 262, 264, 269, 274, 275,
 276, 278, 281, 282, 284, 286,
 295, 296
Ghadīr fī al-Kitāb wa al-Sunnat
wa al-Adab, al-, 245
 Ghadīr Khumm, 53, 59
Ghadiriyyah, 250, 251
 Ghafalah, Suwayd Ibn, 82, 83
 Ghaffārī, Abūdhār, 56, 255
 Ghafla, Suwayd Ibn, 255
Gharīb al-Ḥadīth, 124, 232
 Ghaṭfānī, Abū Mālik, 226
Ghawālī al-La'ālī, 292
Ghāyat al-Marām, 57, 99, 245,
 252, 254, 255, 264, 267, 268,
 271, 275, 276, 277, 284, 286,
 289, 294

Ghayṣarī, Shaykh Sharaf al-
 Dīn Dāwūd Ibn Mahmud
 Ibn, 256

Ghazvīnī, Imam Burhān al-
 Dīn Muhammad Ibn
 Muhammad Hamedānī,
 246

Ghazzālī, 231, 256, 285, 297,
 298

Golshan-i Rāz, 67

government, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, *See*
also prophethood and
 government
 graves of the Imams, 169, 171,
 173, 175–80, 285

H

Haban, Ibn, 82

Habashī, Abū Tha'ālabā, 122,
 226

Ḥabrānī, Abū Rashīd, 192

Hadā'iq, 131

Ḥadīd, Ibn Abī al-, 156, 166,
 183, 196, 197, 210, 214, 215,
 231, 235, 249, 279, 281, 282,
 284, 289, 290, 291, 295, 296,
 298

Ḥadiqah, al-, 248

Ḥadīth al-Laṭm, 75

Ḥadīth Nabawī, 262

Ḥadiyyat al-Aḥbāb, 249

Hāfiz, 249

Hāfiz, Abū al-'Alā, 144

Hāfiz, Abū Nu'aym, 198, 199,
 200, 203, 209

Hāfiz, Ṣāliḥ Ibn Muhammad
 Ibn Ḥabīb, 76

Ḥafnī, Shaykh Muhammad,
 74

Ḥafṣa, 152, 263

- Ḥajar, Shaykh al-Islam Abū al-Faḍl Ibn, 48, 68, 71, 83, 92, 93, 148, 265
- Ḥajj, 35, 36, 40, 113, 118, 164, 170, 171, 172, 180, 229, 230, 257, 263
- Ḥajjāj, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn, 114, 115
- Ḥajjāj, Diʿbil Ibn Saʿīd Ibn, 49
- Ḥakīm, 63, 67, 70, 71, 76, 77, 82, 83, 136, 182, 183, 247, 268
- Ḥākīm, 47, 48, 63, 67, 76, 77, 83, 134, 147, 153, 180, 241, 258, 275, 279, 283, 296
- Ḥakīm, Muʿāwīyah Ibn, 291
- Ḥalabī, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad, 19, 269
- Ḥallāj, Abū Muhammad, 62
- Hamedānī, ʿAbd al-Mālik Ibn Ali Ibn Muhammad, 145
- Hamedānī, Abū al-ʿAlā, 74, 184
- Hamedānī, Amīr Sayyid Ali, 47
- Hamedānī, Banī Abbās, 156
- Hamedānī, Ḥārith Aʿwar, 107
- Hamedānī, Hasan Ibn Ahmad, 144
- Hamedānī, Sayyid Ali, 47, 66, 233
- Ḥamid, 279
- Ḥamid, ʿAbd Ibn, 140, 146, 147, 149, 159, 259, 277
- Ḥamid, ʿĀṣim Ibn, 269, 272
- Ḥamīdī, 281
- Ḥammād, Abū Nuʿaym Ibn, 45, 105, 131, 166, 269
- Ḥammād, Omar Ibn, 228
- Ḥammānī, Abū Rashīd, 192
- Ḥammuʿī, Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad, 46, 48, 58, 74, 183, 192, 246, 253, 265
- Ḥamrā, Abū, 192
- Ḥamzah, Hasan Ibn Ali Ibn Abī, 179
- Ḥamzah, ʿĀṣim Ibn, 131
- Ḥamziyya, 75
- Ḥanafī, Ḥāfiz Abū al-Muʿayyid Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad Bakri Makki, 65, 183
- Ḥanafī, Shams al-Dīn Abū al-Muzaffar Yūsuf Ibn Quzūghlī. *See* Juzī, Sibṭ Ibn
- Ḥanafī, Omar Ibn Ahmad Kharpuṭī, 70
- Ḥanafī, Shāh Valiallah, 132
- Ḥanafīyyah, Muhammad Ibn, 19
- Ḥanash, 120
- Ḥanbal, Ahmad, 42, 61, 64, 88, 109, 120, 122, 133, 183, 190, 198, 200, 201, 214, 268, 270, 271, 275, 280, 286
- Ḥanīfa, Abū, 116
- Ḥaqq al-Mubīn, 107
- Ḥarālī, 70
- Ḥaramayn, Khaṭīb al-, 233
- Harawī, ʿAbd al-Salām Abū Ṣalt, 42, 55, 76, 260, 261
- Harawī, Abū Muhammad Suwayd Ibn Saʿīd, 64
- Harawī, Abū ʿUbaydah, 196
- Harawī, Abū Saʿd Zāhir, 81
- Harawī, Muhammad Ibn ʿAbd al-Raḥīm, 76
- Ḥarb, Simāk Ibn, 120
- Ḥarb, Sulaym Ibn, 280
- Ḥarbī, Isaac Ibn Hasan Ibn Maymūn, 78

- Hārith, 'Amr Ibn, 55, 71, 253, 279
 Hārithī, Yazīd Ibn Ḥaṣīn, 159
 Hariz, 131
 Harrānī, Ibn Taymīyyah, 84
 Harthama, 261
 Hasan Ibn Ali, 23, 50, 53, 62, 71133, 135, 149, 184, 220, 230, 247, 280, 290
 Hasan, Abdullah Ibn al-, 245
 Hasan, Abdullah Ibn al-
 Hasan Ibn al-, 138
 Hasan, Yunes Ibn, 138, 277
 Hasani, Sayyid Ahmad Ibn, 62
 Hashemi, Abdullah Ibn Faql, 59
 Hāshim, Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, 102, 107, 117, 131, 258
 Ḥaṣīn, Imran Ibn, 245
 Ḥaskānī, Ḥakīm, 55, 56, 100, 183, 192, 253
 Ḥātam, Hārūn Ibn, 55, 82, 86, 141, 260
 Haytham, Abū al-, 213
 Haythamī, 270
 Haythamī, Ḥāfiz Nūr al-Dīn Ali Ibn Abū Bakr, 246
 Haythamī, Ibn Hajar, 47, 90, 91, 127, 262, 268
 Ḥayyān, Yaḥyā Ibn Sa'īd Ibn, 247
 Hāzm, Abū al-, 277
 Hibbān, Ibn, 182
Ḥilliyat al-Awliyā' wa Ṭabaqāt al-Aṣfiyā', 255
 Hillī, Abdullah, 273
 Hillī, Allāmah, 68, 85, 287
Ḥilliyyat al-Awliyā', 103, 198, 199, 200, 203, 209, 287, 288, 289, 204, 256, 265, 287
 Ḥimyarī, Sayyid Ismā'īl, 22, 44, 106, 251
 Hindī, Mullā Ali Muttaqī, 47, 71, 140, 252
 Hindī, Thanā'ullāh Pānīpatī, 71
 Hishām, Muhammad Ibn, 184
History (Balādhari), 23
History (Ibn Kathīr, 64
History (Khaṭīb), 47
History of Damascus, The, 285
 Household of Muhammad, as gate to God, 41, 195
 Hubaysh, Zirban, 116
 Hudā, Sayyid Murtaḍā 'Alam al-, 7
 Ḥudaybiyyah, 72
 Ḥudhayfah, 21, 48, 154
Ḥudūd, 135
 Ḥums, 35
 Hurayrah, Abū, 214
 Husayn Ibn Ali, 49, 50, 51, 53, 71, 88, 107, 140, 179, 184, 247, 259
 Husayn, Ali Ibn al-, 49, 88, 163
 Husayn, Mūsā Ibn Abdullah Ibn al-, 8
 Husayn, Sharīf, 172
 Husayn, Zayd Ibn Ali Ibn al-, 138
 Ḥūt, Sayyid Muhammad Darvīsh al-, 91
 Hutaynah, 157
 Ḥuthaym, Abdullah Ibn Othman Ibn, 77

 I
 Ibād, Saḥīb Ibn, 274
Ibānah, al-, 23, 104
 Ibrāhīm, 269, 273, 294

Ibrāhīm, Ali Ibn, 39, 100, 113,
 115, 128, 162, 163, 219, 220,
 222, 264, 267
 Ibrāhīm, Hāshim Ibn, 127
 Ibrāhīm, Isaac Ibn, 78
 Ibrāhīm, Muhammad Abū al-
 Faḍl, 289
 Ibrāhīm, Muhammad Ibn Ali,
 107
 Ibrāhīm, Umm, 60
 Īdāh, 274, 276, 277, 281, 283
 Ihtijāj, al-, 38, 245
 Iḥyā' al-'Ulūm, 231, 285, 297,
 298
 'Ikrama, 22, 193
 'Ilm, al-, 295
 Imām Ja'far al-Ṣādiq, al-, 265
 Imams, 41, 204, 289, 290, *See*
also graves of the Imams
 inheritance, laws of, 102, 151–
 54, 214–16, 216–17, 227, 280,
 295
 Intiṣār, 290
 Iqrār, 276
 Iraq, Ibn, 75
 Irbilī, Ali Ibn 'Isā, 137
 Irmawi, 277
 Irshād, 106, 110, 116, 120, 123,
 132, 138, 140, 151, 152, 154,
 161, 162, 268, 269, 270, 271,
 272, 273, 274, 277, 278, 283,
 284, 295, 297
 Irshād al-Sārī, 182
 Irshād al-Aql al-Salīm ilā Mazāyā
 Qur'an al-Karīm, 279
 Irshād fi Ma'rifat Ḥujaj Allah
 ala al-'Ibād, al-, 268
 'Isā, Muhammad Ibn, 162, 273
 Iṣbahānī, 42, 137, 237
 Iṣbahānī, Ibn Ṭabātabā, 250
 Isfahani, Abū Na'im, 254, 255,
 256, 265

Isfahani, Rāqib, 290
 Isfarāyīnī, Abū al-Faraj, 89
 Isfarāyīnī, Muhammad Ibn
 Ishāq, 87
 Isfarāyīnī, Nazlat Ibn Qays, 86
 Ishāq, 'Isā Ibn Yūnus Ibn Abī,
 84, 268
 Iskāf, Sa'd Ibn Ṭarīf, 124, 127
 Islāmiyyah, 292
 Ismā'īl, Ahmad Ibn Abdulizh
 Ibn Ḥakīm Omar Ibn, 55
 Israelites, 6, 10, 12, 20, 120
 Isti'āb, al-, 64, 116, 133, 270,
 274, 277
 Istibṣār, al-, 269, 274
 I'tiṣām, al-, 166
 Izālat al-Khiḍā, 132

J

Ja'ābī, Qādī, 42
 Jabbār, Qādī 'Abd al-, 135
 Jābir, 24, 36, 42, 47, 48, 51, 57,
 83, 131, 184, 252, 262, 271,
 285
 Ja'far, Imam Mūsā Ibn, 19, 58,
 88, 269
 Ja'fariyyāt, 219
 Jahanī, Mu'ammār Ibn
 Abdullah, 278
 Jāhiz, 20, 146, 226
 Jahnī, 'Aqabat Ibn 'Āmir, 56
 Jālīnūs, 140
 Jam' al-Jawāmi', 67, 295
 Jam' Bayn al-Ṣaḥīḥayn, al-, 243,
 281
 Jama' Bayn al-Gharibayn, 196
 Jāmi', 66, 82, 277
 Jāmi' al-Kabir, 182
 Jāmi' al-Ṣaghīr, 67, 69, 74
 Jāmi' al-Ṣaḥīḥ, 64, 256
 Jāmi' al-Uṣūl, 65

Jāmi' (ʿAbd al-Razzāq), 280
 Jamīlah, Abū, 124, 125
 Janābidhī, Sulṭān
 Muḥammad, 249
 Jandī, Mustashār ʿAbd al-
 Ḥalīm, 265
 Jariḥ, Ibn, 19
 Jarīr, Ibn, 67, 70, 71, 243 255,
 270, 280
 Jarrāḥ, Abū ʿUbayda Ibn al-,
 16
 Jarrāḥī, Ismāʿīl Muḥammad
 ʿAjlūnī, 255
 Jārūd, Abū al-, 35
 Jauʿfi, 86
 Jawād, Imam, 87
 Jawāhir, Ṣāhib al-, 119
Jawāhir al-Kalām, 120, 121, 122,
 271, 272
 Jazarī, Ḥāfiz Abū al-Hasan
 Ali Ibn Muḥammad Ibn
 Athīr, 65, 71, 124, 249
 Jazārī, Sayyid Niʿmatullah,
 212
 Jazarī, Shams al-Dīn
 Muḥammad Ibn
 Muḥammad, 67
 Jeṣṣāṣ, Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn
 Ali, 296
 Jesus, 18
jihād, 5, 6, 15, 180
Jilā' wa Shifā' wa Iḥān wa
 Miḥān, 105
 Jinn, Dik al-, 103
 Joseph, 18, 143
 Juʿābī, Abū Bakr Muḥammad
 Ibn Omar Ibn Muḥammad
 Tamīmī Baghdādī Ibn, 64
 Jubayr, Saʿīd Ibn, 54, 58, 72,
 149, 156, 193
 Juʿfi, Jābir Ibn, 113, 179

Juʿfi, Jaʿfar, 51
 Juḥannī, Baʿjat Ibn Abdullah,
 141, 142
 Junādah, Saʿīd Ibn, 49
 Junayd, Abdullah Ibn, 79
 Jurdānī, 269
 Juwaynī, Shaykh al-Islam
 Ibrāhīm Ibn Muḥammad
 Ḥamūʿī, 66
 Juzī, 71, 75, 81, 82, 83, 84, 86,
 132, 140, 182, 294, 295
 Juzī, Allāmah Ibn Qayyim,
 107, 131
 Juzī, Sibṭ Ibn, 61, 65, 119, 132,
 268, 274
 Juzjānī, Ibrāhīm Ibn Yaʿqūb,
 80

K

Kaʿb, 167
 Kaʿb, Abī Ibn, 21, 271
 Kaʿb, Obay Ibn, 240, 242, 243
 Kaʿba, 163, 165, 166–69, 168,
 169, 172, 176, 177, 178, 180
Kāfi, al-, 36, 100, 106, 113, 116,
 131, 162, 219, 265, 269, 271,
 292, 295
 Kāhil, Sulaymān Ibn Mahrān
 Abū Muḥammad Aʿmash
 Mawlā Banī, 259
 Kajī, Abū Muslim, 82
 Kalābazī, 69
kalālah, 151–54
 Kalīb, ʿĀṣim Ibn, 279
Kāmil al-Ziyārāt, 179, 285
 Kanānī, Saʿd Ibn Ṭarīf, 50
Kanz al-Irfān fi Fiqh al-Qurʾan,
 284
Kanz al-Ummāl, 152, 166, 252,
 253, 255, 257, 269, 270, 271,
 277, 280, 296, 298

Karb, Tubbān Asa'd Abū. *See* Tubba'

Karīb, Ibn Jarīr Abū, 279

Kāshānī, Muḥsin Fayḍ, 299

Kāshānī, Mullā 'Abd al-Razzāq, 249, 256

Kashf al-Ghummaḥ, 88, 137, 262, 274, 275, 276, 288

Kashf al-Khiḥā, 91, 255

Kashf al-Wujūh al-Hurr li al-Ma'ānī al-Durr, 256

Kashshāf, 278, 282, 299

Kashshī, 86, 87

Kathīr, Ibn, 64, 120, 146, 219, 243, 279

Kātib, Ahmad Ibn Ali, 131

Kawwā, Ibn, 38

Kaysān, Ṣāliḥ Ibn, 279

Kāzim, Imam, 107, 290

Kifāya, 138

Khaḍīb, Sa'īd Ibn Abū al-, 104

Khālid, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad Ibn, 126

Khālid, Ismā'īl Ibn, 107

Khallakān, Ibn, 287

Kharā'itī, 238, 298

Khārazm, Akhtab al-, 132, 183

Khārazmī, 46, 48, 74, 134, 136, 137, 140, 144, 145, 190, 192, 233, 247, 253, 265, 268, 274, 275, 276, 277, 278, 286, 294

Khārazmī, Abū Bakr, 225

Khārazmī, Abū Mu'ayyid, 257

Khārazmī, Daylamī, 74

Khārazmī, Khaṭīb, 45, 101

Khārazmī, Muwaffaq Ibn Ahmad, 132, 183, 184, 191

Khargūshī, 74

Khaṣā'is, al-, 20

Khaṣā'is al-A'imma, 106

Khashf al-Khiḥā, 256

Khaṭīb, Abū al-Faraj Qays Ibn Ali, 47, 63, 71, 79, 80, 81, 89, 131, 147, 236, 253, 259, 260, 278

Khaybar, 53

Khayl, Salamat Ibn, 75

Khaythamah, Abū, 116

Khazākh, 'Amr Ibn Ḥamaq, 254

Khāzim, Muhammad Ibn, 48, 55, 56, 146

Khazraj, Abī al-, 126

Khidr, 25, 41

Khiṣāl, 291

Khorāsani, Ākhund Mullā Muhammad Kāzim, 168

Khudrī, Abū Sa'īd, 19, 180, 181, 182, 190, 192, 286

Khujandī, 182

Khulāsat al-Hisāb, 212, 290

Khuthaym, Rabī' Ibn, 103

Kifāyat al-Ṭālib fi Manāqib Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib, 64, 65, 233, 296

Kindī, Ajlaḥ Ibn Abdullah, 254

Kindī, Thawr, 238

Kitāb al-Faḍā'il, 131

Kitāb al-Farā'id, 280

Kitāb al-Hudūd, 278

Kitāb al-I'tisām, 280

Kitāb al-Naqd, 245

Kitāb al-Wilāyat, 262

Kitāb Asnā al-Maṭālib, 91

Kitāb Rawḍah, 131

Knowing the Imams, vol. 1, 267, 289

Knowing the Imams, vol. 5, 172

Knowing the Imams, vol. 8, 245

knowledge, importance of, 10, 101, 189, 195, *See also* leadership, and knowledge

Kūfī, ʿAbdī, 296
 Kūfī, Aṣṣagh Ibn, 228
 Kūfī, Muḥammad Ibn
 Abduillah Ibn Numayr
 Hamedānī Khārifi ʿAbd al-
 Raḥmān, 84
 Kuhayl, Salamah Ibn, 56, 62,
 82, 255
 Kulaynī, Muḥammad Ibn
 Yaʿqūb, 100, 106, 113, 115,
 116, 119, 120, 121, 126, 128,
 131, 162, 163, 218, 219, 220,
 222, 265, 269, 271, 273, 291,
 295
Kunā wa al-Alqāb, al-, 284, 287
 Kurdī, Abū ʿAbd Husayn Ibn
 Dāwūd, 251
 Kurdī, Bashnawī, 251

L

Laʿālī al-Maṣnūʿa, 252, 253,
 255, 258, 259, 262, 286
 Lak-hanuwī, Mīr Sayyid
 Ḥamid Husayn Mūsawī
 Nishābūrī, 62
Lamaʿāt fī Sharḥ al-Mishkāṭ, al-,
 70
 Laylā, Ibn Abī, 104, 114, 115,
 116, 163, 265
 Layth, Faqīh Abū al-, 181, 284
 Lāzirqī, 166
 leadership, and knowledge, 8,
 9, 10, 92
 leadership, conditions of, 4, 6,
 7, 20, 92
Lisān al-Mizān, 67, 83, 254, 259
Lisān al-Mulk, 290
 Luʿlu, Abū, 152

M

Maʿālim al-ʿUlamā, 251
 Maʿd, 21
 Madāʾinī, 237, 270
 Madāʾinī, ʿIzz al-Dīn Abdul
 Ḥamid Ibn Muḥammad
 Ibn Muḥammad Ibn
 Husayn Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd,
 287
 Madanī, Ḥamid Ibn Abdullah
 Ibn Yazīd, 190
Madārij al-Nubuwwah, 70
Mafātīḥ al-Pjāz, 67
 Maghāzili, 46, 48, 58, 64, 183,
 252, 254, 255, 257, 263
 Maghribī, Imam Ahmad Ibn
 Muḥammad Ibn Ṣādiq, 258
 Maḥallātī, Shaykh
 Dhabīhullah, 107
 Maḥallī, Husām al-Dīn al-, 74
Maḥāsīn wa al-Masāwī, al-, 16,
 36, 100, 247, 249
 Maḥbūb, Hasan Ibn, 114, 115
 Mahdi, Ibn, 124
 Maḥmūd, ʿAbd al-, 267
 Mahzīyār, Ali Ibn, 222
Majālis al-Muʾminīn, 248
 Mājih, Ibn, 64, 109, 153, 268
 Majlisī, Allāmah 12, 107, 131,
 137, 162, 221, 248, 269, 271,
 272, 274, 277, 282, 285, 293,
 294
Majmaʿ al-Bayān, 35, 39, 240,
 249, 264, 270, 298, 299
Majmaʿ al-Zawāʿid wa Manbaʿ
 al-Fawāʿid, al-, 246
Majmū, al-, 220
Majnun al-ladhi yasri, al-, 135

- Makārim al-Akhlāq*, 238, 298
 Makkī, Ḥāfiz Muḥibb al-Dīn
 Ahmad Ibn Abdullah
 Ṭabarī Shāfiʿī, 66
 Makkī, Muwaffaq, 107
 Makkī, Nūr al-Dīn Ali Ibn
 Muhammad Ibn Sabbāgh
 Mālikī, 67
 Makkī, Shahāb al-Dīn Ahmad
 Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hajar
 Haythamī, 68
Malāhim wa al-Fitan, 269, 293
 Mālik, 86, 142, 278
 Mālik, Anas Ibn, 67, 71, 99,
 147, 149, 199, 206, 289
 Mālik, Masmaʿ Ibn ʿAbd al-,
 120, 123
 Mālik, Omar Ibn Hasan Ibn
 Ali Ibn, 79
 Mālikī, Ibn Ṣabbagh, 235, 252
 Mālikī, Shams al-Dīn, 63
 Māmaqānī, Shaykh Abdullah,
 85, 87, 261, 262, 280, 284
 Maʾmūn, 76, 78, 88, 261, 262
Man lā Yaḥdurhu al-Faqīh, 106,
 271, 272, 274, 293, 295
Manāqib, al-, 19, 46, 47, 57, 64,
 88, 106, 121, 131, 137, 161,
 162, 165, 183, 233, 245, 247,
 248, 249, 250, 251, 252, 253,
 254, 255, 263, 264, 265, 269,
 270, 271, 272, 273, 274, 276,
 277, 278, 281, 283, 284, 285,
 286, 288, 289, 290, 291, 293,
 294, 295, 296, 297
Manāqib, al- (Ganjī), 74
Manāqib, al- (Ḥanafī), 65
Manāqib, al- (Khārazmī), 74,
 137, 294,
Manāqib al-Fākhira fi al-ʿItrat
 al-Ṭāhira, al-, 49
Manāqib al-Ṣaḥāba, 58
 Manāwī, 75
 Manīʿ, Ibn, 270
 Manīḥ, Khaṭīb, 45
 Maṣṣūr, Saʿīd Ibn, 159, 280
Maqāsid, 91
Maqṣad al-Rāghib, 219
Maqṭal al-Husayn, 247, 265
Maqṭal al-Imam al-Saʿī, 65
 Mardawayh, Abū Bakr, 109,
 243, 267, 279, 280
Maʿrifat al-Ṣaḥāba, 254
 Māriqīn, 29
 Marīsī, Bishr, 78
 Maʿrūf, Abū Abdullah
 Muhammad Ibn Ahmad
 Ibn Muhammad, 256
 Marvzī, Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn
 Muhammad Ibn Ḥajjāj, 79
 Marzbān, Muhammad Ibn
 Husayn, 111, 220
Maṣābiḥ, 83
Maṣābiḥ al-Baghawī, 81
Maṣābiḥ al-Sunnah, 256
Mashāriq al-Darāri, 147, 256
 Mashhadi, 285
 Masmaʿ, 123
Masnavi, 250
 Masrūq, 153, 159, 226
 Masʿūd, Abdullah Ibn, 20, 21,
 56, 67, 71, 91, 192, 240, 298
 Masʿūdī, Ali Ibn Husayn, 212,
 290
Maṭālib al-Saʿūl fi Manāqib al-
 Rasūl, 65, 216, 273, 288
Mawaddat al-Qurbā, al-, 47, 66,
 233, 296
Mawāhib al-Laduniyya, al-, 68
 Mawirdī, Qāḍī, 42
 Mawlānā Jalāl al-Dīn, 248
 Maybudī, 256
 Maydānī, 62
 Maymiyah, 256

Maymūn, ʿAmr Ibn, 145
Mazār al-Kabīr, 285
 Maznūn, Quddāma Ibn, 160–
 62, 160–62, 160–62
 Maẓʿūn, Quddāma Ibn, 283
 Mecca, 12, 13, 24, 54, 118, 164,
 167, 168, 170, 172, 210, 242
 Medina, 17, 18, 23, 29, 88, 128,
 167, 168, 170, 214, 238, 265
 Mahrān, Muhammad Ibn
 Abdullah Ibn, 124
Mehr-i Tābān, 297
 Michael, 206
 Mihrān, Abū Nuʿaym
 Isfahani Ḥāfiz Ahmad Ibn
 Abdullah Ibn Ahmad Ibn
 Ishāq Ibn Mūsā Ibn, 287
 miracles, 5
 Mirʿāt, Ismāʿīl, 173, 174
Mirʿāt al-ʿUqūl, 274, 293
 Mirzā, Ḥājj Farhād, 212
Miṣbāḥ al-Zalām, 269
 Mismaʿ, 292
Mizān, 140, 264, 278, 281, 286
Mizān al-ʿItidāl fi Naqd al-Rijāl,
 81, 86, 260
Mizān fi Tafsīr al-Qurʾān, al-,
 249, 277, 279
 Moses, 25, 155
 Muʿallā, Abū al-, 131
 Muʿāwīyah, 12, 29, 69, 74, 75,
 78, 79, 80, 89, 90
 Muʿāwīyah, Abū, 67, 76, 77,
 80, 82, 83, 253, 260
 Mufaḍḍal, Abū, 52, 179, 285
 Muḥfid, Shaykh, 46, 51, 106,
 108, 110, 114, 116, 120, 123,
 125, 127, 132, 138, 140, 145,
 151, 154, 161, 162, 163, 268,
 270, 295, 297
Mughāzī, 268
Mughnī, al-, 135

Muḥaddith, Jalāl al-Dīn
 Ormawī Husaynī, 281
Muḥāḍirāt, al-, 290
 Muḥāmīlī, Abū Shuʿayb, 217,
 291
 Muhammad, 15, 20, 21, 22, 27,
 36, 39, 41, 42, 45, 46, 47, 48,
 49, 51, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59,
 60, 61, 62, 63, 71, 72, 74, 75,
 76, 77, 78, 79, 83, 88, 89, 102,
 103, 104, 105, 118, 120, 125,
 126, 127, 135, 152, 184, 201,
 202, 203, 204, 205, 209, 266,
 271, 273
 Muhammad, Abū al-Hasan
 Ali Ibn, 75
 Muhammad, Abū Ali Ṣālīḥ
 Ibn, 80
 Muhammad, Abul al-Suʿūd
 Muhammad Ibn, 279
 Muhammad, Ahmad Ibn, 115,
 219
 Muhammad, Ḥāfiz
 ʿUbaydallah Ibn, 64
 Muhammad, Husayn Ibn,
 131, 274
 Muhammad, Jaʿfar Ibn, 48, 83,
 88, 163, 164, 260, 265
 Muhammad, Muʿallā Ibn, 274
 Muḥaqqiqīn, Fakhr al-, 292
 Muḥraz, Muhammad Ibn
 Qāsim Ibn, 80
 Muʿīn, Ḥāfiz Ibn Yahyā Ibn,
 22, 42, 55, 63, 64, 67, 71, 76,
 77, 79, 80, 82, 83, 84, 116,
 259, 260
 Mujādi, 48
 Mujāhid, 42, 55, 58, 76, 77, 78,
 79, 82, 83, 84, 253, 280
Muʿjam al-Ausaf, 64
Muʿjam al-Kabī, 64, 253
 Mujammiʿ, Qāsim Ibn, 16

Mujtabā, Imam Hasan, 12
 Mukhḍaras, 83
Mukhtalaf al-Tawārikh, 248
 Mundhar, Ibn, 141, 148, 159,
 243, 277, 280
 Mundhar, Muhammad Ibn,
 21
 Mundhar, Zayd Ibn, 60
 Munīʿ, Ahmad Ibn, 120
 Munkar, Muhammad Ibn, 184
 Munkhal, Saʿīd Ibn, 39
Muntahā al-Madārik, 256
Muntahī al-Maqāl, 264
 Muqrī, Abū Bakr Ahmad Ibn
 [Yahyā Ibn] Mūsā Ibn
 Abbās Ibn Mujāhid, 116,
 135
 Muqrī, Hasan Ibn Ahmad Ibn
 Muhammad Ibn Qāsim,
 116
 Muqrī, Ibn, 211
 Muqrī, ʿIsā Ibn Saʿd Ibn Saʿīd,
 116
 Muqrī, Muhammad Ibn Ali,
 79
 Murtaḍā, Sayyid, 156, 290
Murūj al-Dhiḥab, 212, 290
 Mūsā, Abū, 21
 Mūsā, Ahmad Ibn Khālīd, 55
 Musa, Husayn Ibn, 163
 Mūsā, Ismāʿīl Ibn, 255
 Musayyib, Saʿīd Ibn, 133, 152,
 163, 191, 193, 233, 235, 277
 Muslim, 153, 182, 269, 286
 Muslim Ibn Ḥajjā, 183
 Muslim, Muhammad Ibn
 Abdullah Ibn Omar bin, 19,
 48, 76
Musnad, 122, 190, 198, 200,
 201, 205, 208, 209, 253, 255,
 268, 274, 275, 279, 280
Musnad al-Ḥanbal, 191, 270

Musnad Kabir, 64
Mustadrak ala al-Ṣaḥīḥayn fī al-
Ḥadīth, al-, 47, 63, 64, 67, 76,
 83, 134, 147, 153, 160, 180,
 241, 258, 268, 269, 275, 276,
 279, 281, 283, 285, 286, 292,
 296
Mustadrak al-Wasāʾil, 219, 292,
 293
 Mustarshid, 168
Muwaṭṭaʿ, al-, 278
 Muʿtamar, Ḥabish Ibn, 120
 Muʿtamar, Ḥanash Ibn, 132
 Muʿtazila, 289
Muttafiq wa al-Mutafariq, al-,
 64
 Muttaqī, Mullā Ali, 141, 152,
 296
Muwāfiqah, al-, 294
Muwaṭṭaʿ Mālik, 278
 Muwaththaq, Abū Ṣalt, 76
 Muzaffar, Abū al-, 75
 Muzaffar, Muhazzab al-
 Aʿimma Abū al-, 145
 Muzaffar, Shaykh
 Muhammad Husayn, 266

N

Nāblusī, Shaykh ʿAbd al-
 Ḥabī, 256
Nāfiʿ, 123, 149
 Nahbān, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn,
 46
Nahj al-Balāghah, 164, 166, 194,
 210, 279, 284, 287, 289, 290,
 295, 297, 298
Nahj al-Ḥaqq, 68
 Nahmān, Abdur Raḥmān Ibn,
 61
 Naḥwī, Abū Abdullah Shams
 al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn

Ahmad Ibn Abi Hawārī
 Mālikī Andalusī, 63, 255
 Nahwi, Muhammad Ibn
 Qāsim, 61
 Naʿīm, Yahyā Ibn, 74, 86
 Najafī, Shaykh Muhammad
 Hasan, 121, 271
 Najāshī, Shaykh, 85, 107, 125
 Nājī, Abū Šādiq, 190
 Nājiya, Abdullah Ibn, 61
 Najjār, Ḥabīb, 207
 Nakhaʿī, 290
 Nākisīn, 29
Naqd al-Šaḥīḥ, al-, 67, 71
 Naqqāsh, 21
 Nasafī, ʿAbd al-Muʿmin Ibn
 Khalaf, 80
 Nāsiḥ, Zarīf Ibn, 292
Nāsikh al-Tawārikh, 290
Naṣṣ wa al-Ijtihād, al-, 258, 275,
 282, 283, 298
 Naṭanzī, 20
Nawādir al-Athar fī ʿIlm Omar,
 63
Nawādir al-Diyāt, 272
Nawāsiḥ, 10
Nazhat al-Absār, 124
Nazm al-Sulūk, 256
Nazm Durar al-Sinṭayn fī
Faḍāʾil al-Muṣṭafā wa al-
Murtaḍā wa al-Batūl wa al-
Sibṭayn, 66
 Nazr, 121
 Nazẓām, 226
Nihāyah fī Gharīb al-Ḥadīth wa
al-Athar, al-, 124, 221, 249,
 272, 291
 Nirsī, Muhammad Ibn Qāsim,
 78
 Nisāʾī, 82, 183, 268

Nishābūrī, Faḍl Ibn Shādhān
 Azdī, 64, 71, 99, 140, 160,
 281
 Nishābūrī, Mīr Muhammad
 Qulī Hindī, 165
 Nishābūrī, Muhammad Ibn
 Ali, 79
 Nishābūrī, Nizām al-Dīn
 Hasan Ibn Muhammad
 Qumī, 277
 Nishābūrī, Shaykh Farīd al-
 Dīn Aṭṭār, 29
 Noah, 18, 54
 Nuʿaym, 287, 288
 Nubātah, Aṣbagh Ibn, 38, 50,
 57, 107, 124, 218, 219, 227,
 253, 295
 Nudhūr, 270
 Nufilī, 117, 127
Nukat al-Nihāyah wa al-Tanqīḥ,
 123
 Nuʿmān, Qādī, 228
 Numayr, Ibn, 80, 84
 Nūrī, Abū Sufyān, 77
 Nūrī, Husayn Ibn
 Muhammad Ibn Taqī
 (Muḥaddith Nūrī), 292

○

Omar, Abdullah Ibn, 56, 71,
 156
 Omar, Mufaḍḍal Ibn, 179
 Omar Ibn al-Khaṭṭāb, 7, 16,
 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 63, 65, 69,
 74, 75, 89, 90, 101, 102, 107,
 111, 112, 113, 116, 125, 126,
 127, 128, 131, 132, 133, 134,
 135, 136, 137, 138, 139, 140,
 141, 143, 144, 146, 147, 148,
 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 156,
 157, 158, 159, 160–62, 160,

- 164, 165, 166, 170, 180, 181,
182, 184, 191, 192, 198, 210,
220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225,
226, 227, 228, 229, 230, 231,
232, 233, 235, 236, 237, 238,
239, 240, 241, 242, 243, 245,
246, 249, 257, 263, 265, 266,
269, 271, 275, 279, 280, 281,
282, 283, 284, 285, 294, 295,
296, 297, 298
- Omayr, Muhammad Ibn Banī,
131
- ‘Omdat al-Qārī fi Sharḥ al-Ṣaḥīḥ
al-Bukhārī*, 135, 182, 276
- Oqaylī, 260
- Othman, 16, 21, 24, 65, 89, 90,
134, 141, 142, 143, 144, 221,
248, 271, 278, 296
- Othman, Abān Ibn, 219, 222
- Othman, Abdullah Ibn, 113
- Othman, Omar Ibn, 124
- Othman, Shīyat Ibn, 166
- Ottoman, Sultan ‘Abd al-
Ḥamīd, 168
- Ozrī, Shaykh Kāzim, 95, 264
- P
- Pahlavi, 174–75
- Panj, Riqā Khān Mīr, 173, 174
- Poetic Works of the Commander
of the Believers, The*, 256
- polytheism, 169, 170
- prophethood and
government, 7
- Q
- Qabīṣā, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn
Abī, 191
- Qaḍā’ Amīr al-Mu’minīnī*, 107,
272, 281, 297, 298
- Qaḍā’ wa al-Aḥkām, al-*, 270
- Qaddāḥ, Abdullah Ibn, 239
- Qāḍī, Abū Abdullah
Muhammad Ibn Ahmad
Ibn Mūsā al-, 136
- Qāḍī, Ḥajj Mīrzā Aḥī, 249
- Qāḍī, Shurayh, 111
- Qāḍirī, Shaykh Maḥmūd Ibn
Muhammad Ibn Aḥī
Shaykhānī, 70
- Qalī, 270, 277
- Qamiṣa, 124
- Qanbar, 114, 130
- Qanṭarī, Abu al-Hasan
Muhammad Ibn Ahmad
Ibn Tamīm, 77
- Qāriṣa, 124
- Qaṣā’id al-Saba’*, 287
- Qasiṭīn, 29
- Qaṣṭalānī, 182
- Qaṭ’ wa Sirqat, al-*, 298
- Qatādah, Sa’id Ibn, , 133, 140,
141, 158, 286
- Qatṭān, Abū al-Hasan, 182
- Qawl al-Jalī fi Faḍā’il al-‘Alī, al-*,
257
- Qawl al-Mustahsan fi Fakhr al-
Hasan, al-*, 71
- Qays, Muhammad Ibn, 120,
121, 122, 123, 269, 272
- Qays, Salīm Ibn, 245
- Qays, ‘Aṣīm Ibn Ḥamīd
Muhammad Ibn, 272
- Qāzī, 226
- Qazvīnī, Ibn Mājīh, 280
- Qazvīnī, Sirāj al-Dīn, 81, 82
- Qulawayh, Ibn, 179, 285
- Qulī, Allāmah Mīr
Muhammad, 181, 282, 284
- Qumī, 261
- Qumī, Ali Ibn Ibrāhīm, 107

Qumī, Muḥaddith, 249, 261, 287
 Qumī, Shaykh Abbās, 245
 Qundūzī, Shaykh Sulaymān Ibn Ibrāhīm Husaynī Balkhī, 71, 74, 252, 257
 Qurāshī, Mawlā Niẓām al-Dīn, 287
 Qurashī, Muhammad Ibn Ṭalḥa, 71
 Qurrat al-ʿAynayn, 283
 Qurtubī, 153, 243
 Qushayrī, Abul al-Husayn Hājī al-, 280
 Qutādah, 35, 259
 Qutayba, Ibn, 237
 Qutnī, Abū al-Ḥasan Dār al-, 81, 260
 Quzūghlī, Yūsuf Ibn, 71

R

Rabīʿ, Qays Ibn, 113, 163, 164
 Rabīʿ al-Abrār, 166
 Raḍī, Sayyid, 106, 164
 Rafīʿ, 74
 Raḥmān, Husayn Ibn Fahm Ibn ʿAbd al-, 75, 77
 Rāhwayah, Ibn, 280
 Rashīd, Hasan Ibn, 51
 Rawājīnī, Abād Ibn Yaʿqūb, 64
 Rawḍah, al-, 123, 221, 288
 Rawḍat al-Bahīyya fi Sharḥ Lumaʿh al-Damishqiyya, al, 271
 Rawḍat al-Nadiyyah fi Sharḥ al-Tuḥfat al-ʿAlawiyyah, al-, 70, 121
 Rawḍat al-Wāʿizīn, 99
 Rayḥānat al-Adab, 287, 288
 Rāzī, 140, 149

Rāzī, Abī Abdullah al-, 179
 Rāzī, Abū al-Faṭḥ, 224
 Rāzī, Ahmad Ibn Saʿīd, 86
 Rāzī, Fakhr al-Dīn al-, 138, 277, 282
 Razzāq, ʿAbd al-, 38, 42, 61, 77, 140, 159, 277, 280, 295
 Riḍā, Abū al-Ḥasan Ali Ibn Mūsā al-, 19, 83, 85, 87, 88, 48, 223, 260, 261
 Rijāl, 287
 Risālat al-Aqliyyah, 256
 Riyāḍ al-Naḍara, 66, 138, 166, 229, 257, 268, 269, 270, 271, 274, 275, 276, 277, 294, 295, 297
 Riyāḥ, ʿAtā Ibn Abī, 22
 robe of Khaybar, 53
 Rouz-behan, 68
 Rufāʿa, 220, 221
 Rufāʿī, Abū Shuʿayb Muḥāmīlī, 291
 Rūḥ al-Maʿānī, 71, 243
 Rūmī, Mawlawī, 250
 Rūmī, Muhammad Ibn Omar, 82, 255

S

Ṣabah, Muhammad Ibn, 163
 Sābāṭī, ʿAmmār, 100
 Sabīʿ, 102
 Sabīl al-Hudā wa al-Rushd, 182
 Saʿd, 39
 Saʿd, Aswad Ibn, 38
 Saʿd, Sahl Ibn, 62
 Saddī, Ismāʿīl, 19
 Ṣādiq, Ahmad Ibn ʿIsā Muhammad Ibn al-ʿArīḍī Ibn al-Imam Jaʿfar, 12, 19, 36, 51, 59, 100, , 100, 104, 105, 107, 113, 117, 120, 126,

- 127, 128, 131, 162, 163, 164,
179, 217, 220, 221, 222, 226,
227, 239, 252, 269, 272, 290,
292
- Şadūq (Muhammad Ibn Ali
Ibn Husayn Ibn Mūsā Ibn
Bābwayh Qumī), 46, 50, 51,
54, 87, 106, 121, 131, 222,
266, 271, 274, 291, 292, 295
- Şaffār, Muhammad Ibn
Hasan, 38, 100
- Şafinat al-Bihār wa Madinat al-
Ḥukm wa al-Athār*, 245, 261
- Şahifa al-Sajjādiyyah al-
Kāmilah, al-*, 292
- Şahih*, 66, 107, 135, 150, 166,
200, 275, 283, 286
- Şahih al-Bukhārī*, 135, 280, 284,
286
- Şahih al-Muslim*, 278, 280, 286
- Sahl, Abū Nasr Ahmad Ibn,
76
- Saʿīd, 243
- Sāʿīd, Abū al-, 120, 280
- Saʿīd, ʿAtā Ibn, 131, 284
- Saʿīd, Husayn Ibn, 121, 220,
265
- Saʿīd, Saʿīd Ibn Abī, 184
- Saʿīd, Yaḥyā Ibn, 191
- Sāʿidah, Qays Ibn, 150
- Sajī, Dhakariyyā Ibn Yaḥyā,
81
- Sajjād, Imam, 51, 218
- Sakhāwī, Muhammad, 71
- Sakrī, Abū Manşūr, 42
- Sakūnī, 117
- Salafi, Ḥāfiz, 288
- Salām, Abdullah Ibn, 19, 20
- Salām, Abū Abid Qāsim Ibn,
55
- Salām, Maşʿab Ibn, 127
- Salamah, Abū, 241
- Salamah, Umm, 27, 74
- Salami, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn,
284
- Şālih, Abū Şalt ʿAbd al-Salām
Ibn, 76, 78, 79, 80, 81, 82, 83,
84, 85–89, 253
- Şālih, Ismāʿīl Ibn, 239
- Şālih, Mufaḍḍal Ibn, 125
- Şālih, Yaḥyā Ibn, 80
- Şālihāt, Abū Ḥamīd, 74
- Şalihī, Salamat Ibn Kuhayl, 58
- Salimah, Hammad Ibn, 120
- Saljūqī, Sulṭān Sanjar, 17
- Salmān, 21, 56, 131, 190, 277
- Şalt, Khājah Aba, 262
- Salūlī, ʿĀsim Ibn Ḥamzah, 128
- Samāʿah, 220
- Samaʿānī, 42, 58, 86
- Samʿānī, Abū al-Muzaffar,
101, 191
- Samʿānī, Abū Saʿīd Abdul al-
Karīm Ibn Manşūr Tamīmī,
65
- Samarah, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān
Ibn, 78
- Samarqandī, Amīr Dawlat
Shāh, 248
- Samarqandī, Ḥāfiz Abū
Muhammad Hasan Ibn
Ahmad, 64, 66, 71
- Şāmit, ʿIbādat Ibn, 21, 228
- Sammān, Ibn, 294
- Sanaʿānī, Amīr Muhammad,
71
- Şanābijī, Abdullah, 56, 62, 82,
83, 253, 255
- Sanāʿī, 248
- Sanāʿī, Ḥakīm, 17
- Sanāʿī, Salamat Ibn Kumayl,
58

- Sanān, Abdu'llah Ibn, 162
 Sanān, Muḥammad Ibn
 Ya'qūb Ibn Ma'qil Ibn, 76,
 258
 San'ānī, Amīr Muḥammad
 Ibn Ismā'īl Ibn Ṣalāh
 Yamarī, 70
 San'ānī, Ḥāfiz Abū Bakr
 Abdual-Razzāq Ibn
 Hamām, 63
 Saud, Mālik, 172
 Saul, 6
Ṣawā'iq al-Muḥriqah fi al-Radd
 ala al-Bida' wa al-Zandiqah,
 al-, 48, 68, 69, 91, 93, 262,
 268, 270, 273
 Sawr, Ka'b Ibn, 235, 236
 Saywarī, Miqdād Ibn
 Abdullah, 283
 sense knowledge, 38
 Sepehr, Mīrzā Muḥammad
 Taḳī, 290
 Seraphiel, 206
Shā'ib al-Imān, 279
 Sha'bi, 214, 280, 290
 Sha'bi, Imam Nūr al-Dīn Ali
 Ibn Muḥammad, 246
 Shādhān, Faḍl Ibn, 49, 131,
 158, 160, 184, 274, 276, 277,
 281
Shāfi, 156
 Shāfi', 30, 294
 Shāfi', Abū al-Sa'adat
 Mubarak Ibn Muḥammad
 Ibn Athīr Jazarī, 65
 Shāfi', Abū Salīm
 Muḥammad Ibn Ṭalḥa, 65
 Shāfi', Ḥāfiz Abū Abdullāh
 Muḥammad Ibn Yūsuf
 Ganjī, 64, 65, 233
 Shāfi', Ḥāfiz Ṣalāh al-Dīn
 Abū Sa'īd Khalīl 'Alā'ī
 Damishqī, 66
 Shāfi', Ḥāfiz Shahāb al-Dīn
 Ahmad Ibn Muḥammad
 Qaṣṭalānī Miṣrī, 68
 Shāfi', Ḥāfiz Shams al-Dīn
 Muḥammad Ibn Ahmad
 Zahabī, 66
 Shāfi', Ibn Fahd Hāshimī
 Makkī, 93, 116
 Shāfi', Ibn Maghāzilī, 57
 Shāfi', Muḥammad Ibn
 Abdullah, 78
 Shāfi', Muḥammad Ibn
 Ṭalḥa, 127, 138, 216, 273
 Shahīd, Ḥabīb, 243
 Shāhīn, Ibn, 42
 Shāmī, Muḥammad Ibn 'Abd
 al-Raḥmān, 55, 182
 Shāmīyyīn, 279
 Sham'ūn, Muḥammad Ibn
 Hasan Ibn, 120
Sharḥ al-Luma'h, 120, 121
Sharḥ 'Azīz, 74, 75
Sharḥ Ibn Abī al-Ḥadīd, 166
 Sharīk, 42, 56, 58, 61, 67, 255
 Sharīk (Nakha'ī Qāḍī), 82, 83
 Shash, Imam I, 77
Shawāhid al-Tanzīl, 253, 254,
 264, 286
 Shaybah, Abdullah Ibn Abī,
 131, 270, 280
 Shaykh, Abū al-, 124, 298
 Shi'a, 10, 13, 15, 17, 46, 57, 58,
 62, 78, 79, 82, 84, 85-89, 86,
 100, 135, 161, 171, 172, 173,
 213, 215, 216, 248, 260, 262,
 263, 288, 290, 293, 294
 Shibrāma, Ibn, 163, 192

Shimr, ʿAmr Ibn, 51
 Shirazi, Aqā Sayyid Mīrzā
 Abū al-Qāsim Ibn
 Muhammad Nabī Husayni
 Sharīfī, 262
 Shirāzī, Khājah Hāfiz, 250
 Shirazi, Rūzbehān, 71
 Shuʿab, 182
 Shuʿayb, ʿAmr Ibn, 226, 279
 Shuʿbah, 131, 260, 286
 Shujāʿ, Abū Maṣṣūr Ibn, 61
 Shūshtarī, Allāmah Shaykh
 Muhammad Taqī, 272, 281
 Shūshtarī, Qādī Nūrallah, 248
 Shūshtarī, Shaykh
 Muhammad, 107
 Şihāh, 84
 Simāk, 120, 122
 Sīnā, Ibn, 140
 Sirah al-Shāmiyya, 87, 182
 Şirāṭ al-Mustaḳīm, 262, 263,
 267, 271, 272, 273, 291, 294
 Sirat al-Omar (Biography of
 Omar), 182, 295
 Şirāt al-Sawī fi Manāqib Āl al-
 Nabī, al-, 70
 Sīrīn, Ibn, 281
 Sirrī, Hannād Ibn, 184
 Sīyāsāt al-Sharʿiyyah, al-, 107,
 131
 Solomon, 111
 Subra, Abū, 232
 Sudday, 148, 298
 Sufyān, 19, 291
 Sufyān, ʿAbd al-Wārith Ibn,
 116
 Sufyān, Yazid Ibn Abī, 284
 Suhān, Zayd Ibn, 21
 Sulammī, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān,
 159
 Sulaymān, ʿAbd al-Salām Ibn
 Şālih Ibn, 78

Sulaymān, Abū Ahmad
 Muhammad, 86
 Sulaymān, Hāfiz ʿAbd al-
 Mālik Ibn, 69
 Sunan (Abū Dāwūd and Ibn
 Mājih), 109, 166, 276, 280
 Sunan (Bayhaqī), 143, 280, 296
 Sunan (Maṣṣūr), 280
 Sunan al-Kubrā, al-, 275, 276,
 277, 278, 294, 297
 Sunan Bayhaqī, 166
 Sunan Darīmī, 280
 Sunna (Ibn Shahr Āshūb), 109
 Sunnis, 10, 13, 15, 46, 57, 58,
 62, 63, 65, 71, 80, 81, 84, 85–
 89, 89, 99, 107, 116, 120, 135,
 141, 148, 151, 161, 172, 183,
 192, 197, 213, 215, 216, 260,
 262, 263, 289, 290, 294, 296
 Surūr, Mubarak Ibn, 49
 Suʿūd, Abū al-, 146
 Suyūṭī, Hāfiz Jalāl al-Dīn
 ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn Kamāl
 al-Dīn, 47, 61, 62, 63, 67, 70,
 71, 81, 83, 89, 140, 141, 142,
 146, 147, 149, 153, 159, 166,
 181, 182, 183, 192, 238, 242,
 243, 252, 253, 257, 277, 295

T

Ṭabarānī, Abū al-Qāsim
 Sulaymān Ibn Ahmad, 64
 Ṭabarī, Abū Jaʿfar Ahmad
 Muḥibb al-Dīn, 63, 64, 71,
 119, 132, 134, 138, 140, 153,
 166, 184, 229, 243, 256, 257,
 268, 269, 277, 279, 281, 284,
 294, 297
 Ṭabarsī, 38
 Ṭabarsī, Faḍl Ibn Hasan, 249
 Ṭabarsī, Shaykh, 39, 245, 100

- Tabāṭabā'ī*, 'Allāmah, 100,
 140, 142, 148, 159, 189, 249,
 297
Tabāṭabā'ī, Muḥammad H.,
 249
Tabrānī, 253, 279
Tabrizi, Shaykh 'Abd al-
 Husayn Amīnī, 285
Tabūzakī, Abū Salamah, 116
Tadhkira Khawāṣṣ al-Ummah,
 64, 65, 75, 268, 270, 274, 277,
 294
Tadhkirat al-Huffāẓ, 66, 288
Tadhkirat al-Shu'arā, 248
Tadwīn, 74
Tafsīr (Fakhr Rāzī), 280
Tafsīr (Naqqāsh), 21
Tafsīr (Qurtubī), 243
Tafsīr Abū al-Futūḥ Rāzī, 298
Tafsīr Abū al-Su'ūd, 279
Tafsīr al-Ayyāshī, 239, 289, 299
Tafsīr al-Burhān, 250, 289, 299
Tafsīr al-Kashshāf, 149, 242,
 243, 263, 278, 280
Tafsīr al-Khāzim, 279
Tafsīr al-Mizān, 36, 38
Tafsīr al-Qur'an al-Karīm, 278
Tafsīr al-Qurtubī, 280
Tafsīr al-Ṣāfi, 299
Tafsīr al-Ṭabarī, 281
Tafsīr Bayān al-Sa'ādah fi
Maqāmāt al-'Ibād, 249
Tafsīr Gharā'ib al-Qur'an wa
Raghā'ib al-Furqān, 277
Tafsīr Ibn Kathīr, 148, 243, 279,
 281
Tafsīr Kashshāf, 280
Tafsīr Maḥāṭih al-Ghayb, 277
Tafsīr Majma' al-Bayān. See
Majma' al-Bayān
Tafsīr Rawḍat al-Jinān, 224
Tafsīr Rūḥ al-Ma'ānī, 242
Tahdhīb al-, 106, 113, 116, 131,
 264, 269, 270, 271, 272, 273,
 274, 292, 293, 295
Tahdhīb al-Aḥkām, 88, 132, 270,
 284
Tahdhīb al-Āthār, 64
Tahdhīb al-Tahdhīb, 67, 84, 247,
 258, 269
Tā'ī, 'Addī Ibn Ḥātam, 107
Tā'ī, Ahmad Ibn Āmir Ibn
 Sulaymān, 223
Tā'iyah, 66
Ṭalḥa, Muhammad Ibn, 16,
 127, 153, 213
Ṭalīb, Mūsā Ibn Ja'far Ibn
 Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad
 Ibn Ali Ibn Abdullah Ibn
 Ja'far Ibn Abī, 62
Talkhīṣ al-Mustadrak, 48, 160,
 258
Talkhīṣ al-Shāfi, 245
Tamīm, Hasan Ibn, 89
Tamīmī, Ibrāhīm, 146
Tamīmī, Maṣ'ab Ibn Salām,
 126
Tanbīh al-Ghāfilīn, 181, 284
Tanqīḥ al-Maqāl fi Ahwāl al-
Rijāl, 261, 264, 280, 284
Tanzih al-Sharīah, 75
Taqī, Imam Muhammad, 88,
 261
Taqrib, 265
Ṭarā'if, 88,
Ṭarā'if fi Ma'rifat Madhhab al-
Ṭawā'if, al-, 88, 277, 281
Tārīkh (Ibn Asākar), 89
Tārīkh al-Baghdad, 64, 65, 78,
 160, 253, 258, 259, 260
Tārīkh al-Damīshq, 47, 249, 252,
 253, 254, 255, 274, 285, 286,
 287

Tārīkh al-Makka (The History of Mecca), 182
Tārīkh al-Shiʿa, 266
Tārīkh al-Ṭabari, 284
Tārīkh al-Umam wa al-Mulūk, 284
Tarīkhī, Khaṭīb, 42
Ṭarīq, Ibn, 66
Tartīb, 182
Tashrif bi al-Minan fi al-Taʿrif bi al-Fitan, al-, 269, 293
Tashyid al-Maṭāʿin, 166, 181, 282, 284, 286
Ṭassī, 149
Taḥhīr al-Janān, 69
Tawḍīḥ al-Dalāʾil, 74
tawḥīd, 3, 10
Ṭāwūs, Sayyid Ibn, 86, 111, 141, 220, 269, 277, 281, 285, 293
Ṭayālīsī, Abū Dāwūd, 270
Taymī, ʿAbd al-Raḥmān Ibn Othman, 77
Taymī, Abū Ḥayyan, 16, 247
Taymī, Muhammad Ibrāhīm, 241
Taymiyyah, Ibn, 283
Taysīr al-Wuṣūl, 69, 166
Thābi, Zayd Ibn t, 238
Thābit, 280
Thābit, Khuzaymat Ibn, 144
Thābit, Zayd Ibn, 20, 21, 210, 240, 243
Thahdhīb al-Aḥkām, 265
Thaʿlabī, Abū Ishāq, 146, 210, 238, 278, 298
Thānī, Shahīd, 87, 119, 121, 255, 276
Thaqafi, Abū Miḥjan, 238, 239
Thaqafi, Ahmad Ibn ʿUbayd, 62

Thaqafi, Ibrāhīm Ibn Muhammad, 7, 8, 42, 131, 245
Thumālī, Abū Ḥamzah, 19
Thūrī, Sufyān, 77
Tirmidhī, 65, 66, 68, 70, 82, 107, 256
Tirmidhī, Abū ʿIsā Muhammad, 64
Tirmidhī, Ali, 255
Tirmidhī, Muḥaddith Shahīr, 107
Tubbaʿ, 166–69
Ṭufayl, Muhammad Ibn, 55, 245
Turāb, Abū, 131
Ṭuruq al-Ḥukmiyya, al-, 131
Ṭūsī, Naṣīr al-Dīn Muhammad Ibn Muhammad Ibn Hasan, 21, 46, 51, 52, 57, 61, 85, 87, 106, 107, 113, 116, 119, 120, 121, 128, 131, 135, 163, 218, 219, 220, 221, 222, 245, 246, 265, 269, 270, 271, 273, 291, 292, 295
Tustarī, 297, 298
Ṭuwālāt, al-, 182

U
ʿUbayd, Abū, 23, 124, 232, 243
ʿUbayd, Yaʿlī Ibn, 56, 84
ʿUbaydah, Abū, 146
ʿUjzah, Kaʿb Ibn, 52
ʿUkbarī, Ibn Baṭṭah, 64, 75
ʿUlūm, Sayyid Baḥr al-, 177, 285
Umdat al-Qāri, 278
Umayyah, Abī, 27
ʿUrwah, Hishām, 259

Uṣd al-Ghābah, 65, 253, 282,
287
‘Uṭaba, ‘Ubaydullāh Ibn
Abdullāh Ibn, 295
‘Uyūn Akhbār al-Riḍā, 85, 87,
237, 261

V

Virtues of Ali Ibn Abī Ṭālib,
The, 214

W

Wahab, Ibn, 279
Wahhābīs, 168–74, 175
Wakī‘, 120
Walid, Khālīd Ibn, 204
Walid, Muhammad Ibn, 295
Wāqisa, 124
Wāqidī, 131
Wasā’il al-Shi‘a, 107, 219, 291,
292, 293, 299

Y

Yahyā, Imāmzādeh, 174
Yahyā, Muhammad Ibn
Ahmad Ibn, 115, 124
Ya‘la, 159
Yamān, Ḥudhayfah Ibn, 52,
71, 153, 281
Ya‘murī, Ibn Abī Ṭālib, 153
Yanābi‘ al-Mawaddah, 65, 71,
252, 257, 296
Ya‘qūb, Abū al-Abbās
Muhammad Ibn, 76, 79
Yasār, Fuḍayl Ibn, 19
Yashkurī, Sabī‘ Ibn, 265
Yāsir, ‘Ammār Ibn, 213
Yazīd, ‘Abd al-Raḥmān Ibn,
147
Yazīd, Ḥammād Ibn, 86

Yazīd, Jābir Ibn, 19
Yazīd, Omar Ibn, 131
Yunas, 273, 279
Yūnus, ‘Isā Ibn, 23, 56, 83, 162,
259
Yūsuf, Abū, 226

Z

Zāghūnī, 255
Zahḥak, 21, 149
Zahr al-Rabi‘, 212
Zakariyā, Yahyā Ibn, 140
Zamakhsharī, Abū al-Qāsim,
64, 124, 146, 149, 150, 151,
166, 233, 242, 243, 277, 282
Zamakhsharī, Mahmud Ibn
Omar, 134, 136, 263
Zamān, Mawlawī Hasan al-,
71
Zarabī, Muhammad Ibn
Yahyā Ibn, 77
Zar‘ah, Abū, 82, 220, 260
Zarīr, Abū Mu‘āwīyah, 84
Zarkalī, 258
Zarhashī, 71
Zarqānī, 68
Zayd, Hammād Ibn, 260, 280
Zayd, Ibn, 280
Zayd, Muhammad Ibn
Muhammad Ibn, 262
Zayn al-Fatā fi Sharḥ Sūrat hal
Atā, 245, 257
Zaynī, Imam Najm al-Dīn
Abū Manṣūr Abū
Muhammad Ibn Husayn
Ibn Muhammad Ibn Ali,
184
Zāzān, 131
Zibyan, Abū, 134
Ziyād, ‘Abd al-Wāḥid Ibn,
116

Ziyād, Muhammad Ibn, 257
Ziyād, Sahl Ibn, 120, 291
Zubayr, 16, 213
Zubayr, Muhammad Ibn, 229
Zubayr, Urwat Ibn, 99

Zuhayr, Abū Bakr Ahmad
Ibn, 116
Zuhri, 259, 279, 295, 296

